"INTEGRATING FAITH AND LEARNING AT A PRIVATE CHRISTIAN UNIVERSITY IN NIGERIA: PATTERNS OF INSTITUTIONALIZATION"

by

Israel Bamidele Olaore

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF HIGHER EDUCATION

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

In the Graduate College

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

2007

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA GRADUATE COLLEGE

As members of the Dissertation Committee, we certify that	we have read the dissertation
prepared by Israel Bamidele Olaore	
entitled "Integrating Faith and Learning at a Private Christi	an University in Nigeria:
Patterns of Institutionalization"	
and recommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the disserta	tion requirement for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy	
Dr. Gary Rhoades	Date: December 8, 2006
Dr. John Cheslock	Date: December 8, 2006
Dr. Alma Maldonado-Maldonado	Date: December 8, 2006
Final approval and acceptance of this dissertation is conting submission of the final copies of the dissertation to the Gra I hereby certify that I have read this dissertation prepared urecommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the dissertation	duate College.
Dissertation Director: Dr. Gary Rhoades	_ Date: December 8, 2006

STATEMENT BY AUTHOR

This dissertation has been submitted in partial fulfillment of requirements for an advanced degree at The University of Arizona and is deposited in the University Library to be made available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

Brief quotations from this dissertation are allowable without special permission, provided that accurate acknowledgment of source is made. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this manuscript in whole or in part may be granted by the head of the major department or the Dean of the Graduate College when in his or her judgment the proposed use of the material is in the interests of scholarship. In all other instances, however, permission must be obtained from the author.

.

SIGNED: Israel Bamidele Olaore

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

To Dr. Gary Rhoades, my mentor, friend, committee chair and pastor who made the graduate school experience one to treasure and enjoy, destroying all the myths in the book about graduate school. You have taken me to a place I want to be as I go into academic teaching. What you have been to me I will endeavor to be to my students. To Sylvia Mahon the giant in the Center for the Study of Higher Education, College of Education, University of Arizona office, you have been a kind friend and helper even when there seems to be no way. To my committee members, Dr. John Cheslock, Dr. Alma Maldonado-Maldonado and Dr. Sheila Slaughter, who helped shape the direction of this dissertation. To you all I say thank you and may God richly bless you.

DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to God, the Father, Son Jesus Christ, and the Holy Spirit. Thereafter dedicated to my parents, the Olaores and the Banjokos for the support that only parents could have given in the pursuit of a doctoral degree. To my wife and friend, Augusta Yetunde Olaore for her push and pull with me through it all. To my children, Tim, John, Ope, Enoch and a host of others. To by friend and big brother Elder Bill Taylor who believed with me for a doctoral degree and gave me my first seed money towards the venture. To "mom" Eunice Winston and all the churches that supported me, Altadena SDA Church, Altadena CA, University SDA Church, Los Angeles CA, Sharon SDA Church, Tucson AZ.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Tables	8
Abstract	9
Chapter One – Introduction	11
The Research Purpose	12
The Research Problem	
The Significance of Research	
The Limitations of Research	
Theoretical Traditions	
Conceptual Framework	
Research Questions	22
The Researcher	
Organization of the Dissertation	
Chapter Two – Survey of Related Literature	
Institutional Theory	
Institutionalization of Curricular Innovation and Refo	
Higher Education	
History of Christian Higher Education in the United S	States
And Africa	
Integration of Faith and Learning	38
Chapter Three – Methodology	
Site and Population Selection	
Data Collection Procedure	50
Data Analysis and Coding	54
Chapter Four – Findings – Five Emerging Themes	68
Fear of God	
Seventh-day Adventist view of Fear of God	76
University as a Cultural Universe	
Teaching both Good and Bad	
Religion should not Influence Scholarship	
Blending	98
Chapter Five – Discussion	104
Levels of Institutionalization of Integration of Faith a	
Learning at Ebony University	
Conclusion and Recommendations	
APPENDIX: A – SUBJECT'S CONSENT FORM	126
APPENDIX: B - RECRUITMENT MATERIAL/COVER LI	
APPENDIX: C – QUESTIONNAIRE FOR SURVEY	129
APPENDIX: D – PERMISSION FROM AUTHORS OF	

TABLE OF CONTENTS - continued

QUE	STIONNAIRE	141
REFERENCES		147

LIST OF TABLES

Table1:1	21
Ream, Beaty, and Lyon (2004) Eight-Pattern Typology of	
Integration of Faith and Learning	
Table 3:1	57
Qualitative Responses to Question 8	
Table 3:2	58
Responses to Qualitative to Open-ended Question 29b	
Table 3:3	65
Qualitative Responses to Question 50	
Table 3:4	67
Matrix of Emerging themes from Question 29b	
Table 4:1	80
Distribution of Denominational Affiliation among Faculty member	er
At Ebony University	
Table 4:2	91
Distribution of Faculty members at Ebony University by Academ	ic
Ranking	
Table 5:1	105
Typology of Integration of Faith and Learning at Religious Resea	rch
Universities	
Table 5:2	107
Convergence Points between Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) Typo and Olaore (2006) Typology	logy

ABSTRACT

Institutionalization of curricular or pedagogical innovation or reform occurs at three different levels in an organization, the regulative institutionalization which occurs as compliance by expediency, normative institutionalization which occurs as compliance by moral or legal appropriateness and cognitive institutionalization which occurs as compliance by conceptual correctness. The cognitive level is most the desirable because at that level the values and norms of the organization are manifested in the beliefs and behaviors of individuals in the organization.

This research study examined the patterns of institutionalization of integration of faith and learning as a curricular and pedagogical model among faculty members at a private Christian liberal arts university in Nigeria, West Africa. Five patterns of integration of faith and learning emerged from the study compared to eight patterns of institutionalization that emerged in a similar study of four religious research universities in the United States by the team of Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004). The findings suggest that the level of institutionalization manifested and perceivable in the Nigerian study is at the regulative institutionalization level due to the fact that the beliefs and the behaviors of the faculty members are non-congruent to the expected beliefs and behaviors compatible with the institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model. Even though the 'fear of God' emerged as one of the dominant themes articulated by some of the faculty members in the study, four other emergent themes articulated the need to find a balance between religious integration and academic excellence. The findings suggest Seventh-day Adventists faculty members struggle

between the need to subscribe to the fear of God as a measure for integration and the need to maintain a separation between faith and learning for objectivity in the academy. Being a Seventh-day Adventist male lecturer over the lecturer II rank was found to be a dominant factor in the institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model at a regulative level at the institution in the study.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this explorative case study (Tashakkori and Teddlie, 1998) is to analyze the institutionalization of "integration of faith and learning", a curricular and pedagogical model among faculty members at a private Christian university in Nigeria. In the literature various approaches have been proposed for analyzing institutionalization of innovation and change in colleges and universities. Starting with a broad understanding according to Clark (1971), "Institutionalization, most broadly conceived, is the process whereby specific cultural elements or cultural objects are adopted by actors in a social system" (p. 75). Further, institutionalization has also been defined as the incorporation of programs or innovation into the formal structure of the university or college (Ross, 1976). More recently, Scott (1995) proposes three processes of institutionalization: regulative, normative, and cognitive, addressing the fact that institutionalization can take place at different levels. For the purposes of this study, given the substantive focus on the integration of faith and learning in a Christian university, the cultural and cognitive elements of institutionalization will particularly be considered.

This research study is placed in the context of Council for Christian Colleges and Universities, (CCCU) institutions operating within North America with registered affiliates around the world who work within the curricular and pedagogical framework of the intentional integration of scholarship with biblical faith and service also referred to as "the integration of faith and learning." More than 170 intentionally Christ-centered

institutions, of which 105 are in North America, are fully-accredited comprehensive colleges, and universities with curricula rooted in the arts and sciences. There are 74 affiliate campuses from 25 countries that belong to the CCCU. "The Council's mission is to advance the cause of Christ-centered higher education and to help its institutions transform lives by faithfully relating scholarship and service to biblical truth." (Council for Christian Colleges and Universities Official Website, 2006) In addition the website states that individual members of CCCU must: articulate a public, board-approved institutional mission or purpose statement that is Christ-centered, rooted in the historic Christian faith; have curricular and extra-curricular programs that reflect the integration of scholarship, biblical faith, and service; and hire as full-time faculty members and administrators only persons who profess faith in Jesus Christ (CCCU, 2006).

The Research Purpose

The purpose of this research study is to utilize the "Institutionalization Process Model" (Colbeck, 2002) to study the levels of institutionalization of "integration of faith and learning" among faculty members at a Christian university in Nigeria. My intent is to provide a diagnostic analysis and understanding of change at the university in question, and in the process to connect the findings of the study to the utility of the conceptual framework. This research asks the questions: "To what extent is the 'integration of faith and learning' curricular reform model engaged in by this institution impacting the faculty members?" "To what extent is the impact felt in the overall functioning of the institution, both by faculty members and the institution?" The analysis of the answers to these questions should generate a theory for responding to similar situations and circumstances

that arise within Christian higher education in particular and higher education in general.

The assumption that the faculty members are doing what they are paid to do because they signed statements of belief that bind them to implement the curricular model does not translate to "institutionalization" of the model at levels desired by the proprietors of the institution

Institutionalization of innovation or reform occurs at three distinguishable levels: regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization, and cognitive institutionalization (Colbeck, 2002, Scott, 1995). Regulative institutionalization is the process whereby reforms are accepted because the individuals believe "the rules are right and fair, will be enforced and that the penalties for disobeying the rules are sufficient deterrent" (p.417) Normative institutionalization is a process whereby the individuals accept the reforms because "they believe the rules are morally right or to the extent they fear social ostracism if they disobey" (p.418). Cognitive institutionalization is the process whereby the individuals comply with the reforms because "they find it hard to conceive of any other alternatives" (p.418). The intention of this study is to examine the extent of regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization, and cognitive institutionalization or "diffusion" of the "integration of faith and learning" curricular model among faculty members at the site chosen for this study.

The Research Problem

Faculty members in institutions within the Council of Christian Colleges and universities are required to sign a statement of faith before they are hired and given a contract (CCCU, 2006, Benne, 2001). They are also required to follow the mandated core

curriculum structure that seeks to integrate the academic disciplines with the Christian world view in what is referred to as the "integration of faith and learning." Therefore the recourse to academic freedom for not engaging fully in the institutional requirement of integration of faith and learning is not tenable. The Supreme Court and other appellate courts have more often than not ruled in favor of institutions when it comes to the question of implementation of curriculum reform and classroom practice (Pullin, 2004).

This research seeks to measure the levels of institutionalization of "integrating faith and learning" by members of the faculty in three colleges (or faculties in British terminology) within a Nigerian university. I will measure the level of institutionalization of integration of Christian faith with academic reasoning in order to reveal the reaction of faculty members to the requirements of the institution that they emphasize spiritual and faith focused teaching more than scholarship and service. There needs to be a majority of the organization who adopt the belief and behaviors consistent with the curricular reform. According to W.R. Scott (1995), cognitive institutionalization involves a widespread acceptance and practice of the curricular reform or activity in question by members of the organization. Regulative or normative institutionalization of reform or innovation reflects a fear of negative consequences for non-compliance.

Working in a Christian academic environment, where the sense of mission and evangelism is assumed to be a primary motive for seeking employment, also presents other kinds of tension in the measurement of institutionalization. Institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model occurs along the same lines as the institutionalization of service learning in higher education. "Among faculty, evidence of

the institutionalization of service learning can be found in course and curriculum development, faculty development activities, expectations for recognition and rewards, broad faculty understanding of and support for service learning, and scholarship on service learning." (Bringle & Hatcher, 2000, p. 274.) The expectations of the integration of faith and learning as a mode of operation at an institution can manifest along the same lines as the integration of service learning.

The Significance of Research

Previous research in this area had focused on the practices and implementation of the integration of faith and learning by professors at different Christian colleges and universities in the United States (Stevenson and Young (1995); (Lutheran Educational Conference of North America, 1998); (Hardin, Sweeney, & Whitworth, 1999); (Nwosu, 1999). Burton and Nwosu (2003) studied the perspective of students on integration of faith and learning. Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) studied faculty members of four Christian research universities. This study will focus on the levels of commitment to the requirement of institutional expectations on faculty members at a Christian liberal arts university in Nigeria, one that is not considered a research institution but rather a teaching institution. The ranking of institutions like the US News and World Report ranking and the Carnegie Foundations classification of institutions by levels of Research Scholarship or endowment funds is not applicable to Nigerian higher education. Therefore, the institution being studied is not ranked but is comparable to a comprehensive university in the United States that, like the Nigerian university, offers both bachelors' and masters' degrees.

Lattuca and Stark (1994) observed that faculty members' disciplines and educational beliefs are more influential than contextual factors in the instructor's specific settings, such as college goals, available services, student characteristics, or student goals. Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004), in a study of four Christian research universities, also suggest that "faculty at these institutions may experience a measure of conflict between the professionalism demanded by their academic disciplines and their allegiance to a particular religious tradition." (p.3) Glanzer, Beaty and Lyon (2005), in a similar study, concluded that faculty members "would likely experience a tension between adopting faculty attitudes at research universities who downplay the importance of moral and civic learning and exhibiting faculty attitudes of religious liberal arts faculty who show greater sympathy to the goals of moral and civic learning." (p.390).

The current study is about institutionalization and not integration.

Institutionalization speaks of entrenchment and acceptance of a belief or behavior into the cultural fabric of an organization. Institutionalization is the point at which an innovative practice loses its "special project" status and becomes part of the routine behavior of the system. (Berman and McLaughlin, 1974) Integration is the merging of two or more ideas and concepts into a seamless unit that functions for the good of the organization. The goal of the study is to examine the experiences of the faculty members at a Christian liberal arts university to test whether the curricular template approved for use by the University Council and Board of Trustees is thought to be practicable and user-friendly.

The first significance of this study is its focus on gauging the curricular and pedagogical "temperature" of the institution through the eyes of the faculty members.

This is not an examination of "how to" integrate faith and learning but rather of how things are going for this curricular model. The second significance of this study is that it focuses on the responses of the faculty members at a Christian university and not on the students or the administrators. Faculty members in a Christian university have a different kind of burden than faculty members at any other kind of private university. Faculty members are thought to be "ministers in the classroom" and therefore have a parish in every class they teach. The question is, Is there pressure or pleasure in carrying out the expectations of the administrators of the institution? The third significance of this study is that it opens the way for the consideration of other curricular innovations and reforms, using the same or similar variables as those employed by this study. The faculty member's length of employment at the institution, academic rank, disciplinary area, religious background, degree attainment, and academic qualifications, and many other variables inform the level of a faculty member's reaction and response to a curricular model adopted by an institution. The fourth significance of this study is that, this study will provide data for future studies in the field of higher education and private universities in Africa, and in Nigeria in particular. The fifth significance of this study is the contribution that it will make to Christian higher education scholarship in Africa and the world in general. The current study will be relevant for its contextual setting and regional application. It will also be relevant for Church leaders to examine and conduct similar case studies on individual campuses that utilize the same curricular model. This study will be relevant for boards of trustees who need to know how and whether to

response to comments by faculty members that suggest possible changes in policy for the institution.

The Limitations of Research

According to Robert Yin (2003), case studies help to answer the question "how" and this is what this current study set out to find. It is intended that this case study will shed more light on the subject of institutionalization of a faith and learning curricular model among faculty members at a Christian liberal arts university in Nigeria. The sample size of 150 faculty members out of 164 is a fairly large one for this site. The limitation to this study is that it represents a single institution out of twenty-six private universities in Nigeria. At the same time, this method limits the ability to generalize the findings from the study across institutions similar in size and scope to the institution in the current study. The second limitation is the fact that the questionnaire methodology does not allow for an in-depth analysis of the views of the faculty members on the issues under examination, which leaves many questions unanswered at this point. Limitations of time and financial resources force the study to focus on data that can be collected within a short amount of time. Data for a comparative study would have been possible but for the institutional leaders at one site refusing to grant permission for the study. The data was gathered in Nigeria at a private university that is relatively "young," hence the limitation on comparing the findings at this site with other Christian universities. The current study will be however relevant for its contextual setting and regional application. It will also be relevant for church leaders who may wish to examine and conduct similar case studies on individual campuses that utilize the same curricular model.

Theoretical Traditions

"Institutional theory traces the emergence of distinctive forms, processes, strategies, outlooks, and competences as they emerge from patterns of organizational interaction and adaptation" Selznick (1996 p.2). According to institutional theory, change in educational institutions is largely "isomorphic" in nature. Drawing on DiMaggio and Powell's "Institutional Isomorphism," Levitt and Nass (1989) conclude that "isomorphism" is the essence of institutional theory. DiMaggio and Powell (1983) describe three forms of isomorphism. Coercive isomorphism is the form of pressure from state or state-like bodies through laws and imposed structural changes; mimetic isomorphism describes the tendency of organizations faced with environmental uncertainty to imitate other organizations perceived as successful; and normative isomorphism describes a voluntary seeking of approval of an authorizing agent, such as an accreditation agency, for inclusion and a sense of belonging Levitt and Nass (1989); Scott (1987). Institutional theory therefore provides an explanatory tool for understanding and explaining the processes taking place with regard to curricular and pedagogical reform within the institution.

Conceptual Framework:

The conceptual framework used for this dissertation is the "Institutionalization Process Model" (Colbeck, 2002) developed from the literature on institutional theory by Carol L. Colbeck and tested in her research on curricular and pedagogical reforms funded by the National Science Foundation at seven engineering schools within the Engineering Coalition for Excellence in Learning and Leadership (ECSEL). According to the

"institutionalization process model," institutionalization occurs at three distinguishable levels: regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization, and cognitive institutionalization (Colbeck, 2002). Regulative institutionalization is the process whereby penalties for disobeying the rules are sufficient deterrent. Normative institutionalization is a process whereby the individuals accept the reforms because "they believe the rules are morally right or to the extent they fear social ostracism if they disobey." Cognitive institutionalization is the process whereby individuals comply with reforms because "they find it hard to conceive of any other alternatives" (Colbeck, 2002, p.417).

Another theoretical framework that guides this study is the Ream et al typology of religious universities (Ream, Beaty and Lyon, 2004). This eight-step typology is derived from a study of faculty members at four religious research universities: Baylor University, University of Nortre Dame, Brigham Young University and Boston College. The study explored the perspectives of faculty members at these universities regarding the relationship between faith and learning. The results show a typology of eight patterns of acceptance of the integration of faith and learning curricular model: Table 1.1

Table 1.1

Ream, Beaty, and Lyon (2004) Eight Pattern Typology of Integration of Faith and Learning

- i. Pattern I Faith and Learning are Separate and Independent
- ii. Pattern II Limited Integration: Integrated in Campus Environment butNot Curricula
- iii. Pattern III Limited Integration: Individual and Private but Not Curricular
- iv. Pattern IV Limited Integration: Individual and Public but not Curricular
- v. Pattern V Limited Integration: The Place of Faith in Curriculum Very Limited
- vi. Pattern VI Limited Integration: The Place of Faith in Curriculum –

 Limited and Specified
- vii. Pattern VII The Place of Faith in the Curriculum Virtually Unlimited because of Ethics
- viii. Pattern VIII Complete Integration

These two conceptual frameworks form the basic structure for this study, providing the backdrop for acquiring meaning and significance upon which the study proceeds. The Colbeck (2002) Institutionalization Process Model is derived from the work of Scott (1995) which describes institutional change as one of three possible outcomes during the process of institutionalizing reform in higher education institutions: regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization, and cognitive institutionalization. The Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology provide more detailed

categories for sorting faculty members in the course of understanding the institutionalization levels of a particular institution or group of institutions. The difference between the two frameworks is the institutional focus on the Scott and Colbeck scale and the individual focus on the Ream, Beaty and Lyon scale. The similarity of the two is that they both seek to highlight the existence of marked differences in responses of Christian faculty members to something that seems too obvious to require a test. The confluence of the two frameworks is identified as the emergence of characteristics from the contextual values of faculty members. One purpose of this study is to determine what it is that tilts a person or a group of people into one category or another.

Research Questions

- a. To what extent, if at all, are faculty members at Ebony University (pseudonym) internalizing the integration of faith and learning curricular model according to the Ream, Beaty, and Lyon (2005) eight-patterns typology?
- b. To what extent and at what level is "institutionalization" perceptible at Ebony University through the eyes of faculty members according to the Scott (1995) model of regulative, normative and cognitive institutionalization?
- c. To what extent are the responses shaped by religious affiliation, academic rank and gender of the faculty members?

The first research question seeks evidence that validates the typology patterns developed by Ream et al.(2004) to measure individual faculty members' internalization

of the integration of faith and learning pedagogical and curricular model. The second research question seeks evidence that validates Scott (1995) and Colbeck (2002) institutionalization process model by measuring the institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning pedagogical and curricular model. The third research question seeks to discover contributing factors in the context of the institution through such variables as religious or denomination affiliation of faculty members, among other things that shape the decisions of individual faculty members at Ebony University.

Lattuca and Stark (1994) observed that faculty member disciplines and educational beliefs are more influential than contextual factors in the instructors' specific settings, such as college goals, student characteristics, available services or student goals. Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004), in a study of four Christian research universities, also suggest that "faculty at these institutions may experience a measure of conflict between the professionalism demanded by their academic disciplines and their allegiance to a particular religious tradition" (p.3) Glanzer, Beaty and Lyon (2005), in a similar study, concluded that faculty members "would likely experience a tension between adopting faculty attitudes at research universities who downplay the importance of moral and civic learning and exhibiting faculty attitudes of religious liberal arts faculty who show greater sympathy to the goals of moral and civic learning" (p.390). Contextual characteristics play a critical role in the decision making process of faculty members, as evidenced by the literature on the subject.

The Researcher

I was appointed the university pastor at the institution at which the study was conducted after the data was gathered and analyzed for this dissertation. Thirteen years prior to being appointed the university pastor I was a lecturer at the institution for a few months before proceeding to the United States. My undergraduate academic training was received from a public government university prior to coming into the ministry. My bachelors degree was in Philosophy with the focus of studying law, which also introduces a dimension of critical reasoning and questioning to my acceptance of religious practice both as a participant and observer. I am the first of a sizable number of pastors who were brought into the pastoral team of the organization who studied in academic disciplines other than Theology. The trend has since caught on, with the result of pastors who reflect the various academic disciplines intersecting and engaging the diverse congregation with positive results.

During the process of data gathering, there was the bias of being known by some of the respondents from my past interaction with the institution. This position gave me access to the institutional administrators, many of whom were my previous pastors or mentors. This gave me an entrée to the institution as a member of the denominational and as an insider to some degree. The challenge that this presents seems to be that of objectivity on the part of the respondents who may know me and how their responses are influenced by the previous acquaintance.

My interest in this research study arises from my being a Christian educator who has spent the last twenty years in the pulpit as a preacher-educator. Part of that time has

also been spent in college classrooms instructing young adult students. I am not fully aware of the realities of what it takes to educate students in the various disciplines of the academy from a truly Christian perspective. I have engaged in college teaching in the past, but only as a Bible and history teacher. For me integrating my faith with these subject areas was not difficult to do. But I could not help wondering what will a Mathematics or Chemistry professor have to do, beyond praying with his or her students at the beginning of each class, to integrate faith into the class?

My personal question is, what does it take for this "integration of faith and learning" to happen on these campuses? Does the need to integrate faith with learning put undue pressure on the faculty members who implement the curricular requirements of the institution? Are faculty members shortchanged in the process of integrating faith and learning so that they are not able to devote adequate time to research and service?

I perceive myself as a conservative Christian who has liberal views of many things that others might take very seriously. I come to this study from standpoint of one who is connected to the institution as a Nigerian Seventh-day Adventist, yet removed from the real issues that faculty members deal with in a conservative Christian institution. The tension between the need by a faculty member to tow the line of the institutional administrators and their demands for compliance with organizational standards of educational practice and the reality of functioning as a free agent who is loyal to an academic discipline or the profession is ever present in the results of this study. As a pastor who is working to mentor and train individuals for a better life in this world and the afterlife, I see my responsibility as that of creating balance between the expectations

of the institution and the liberation of the soul of the individual. Seeing the data for what it is as opposed to seeing it as what it should be from the angle of the institutional administrators is a current challenge that must I overcome. The question I battle with the most is: "Is the point of view expressed by this respondent real or contrived by the prevailing demands of the environment?" To answer this question I have to search for meanings beyond the obvious to accomplish my proposed task of studying the level of institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model at this institution in Nigeria.

Organization of the Dissertation:

The remaining chapters of this dissertation are organized to present the relevant topics in a logical and organized manner. In chapter two I present the literature review, a detailed elaboration of the conceptual framework, and the theoretical traditions guiding the dissertation. The research methodology, design and the data analysis and the coding strategies are detailed in chapter three. In chapter four I present the research findings and the five emerging themes at Ebony University. In chapter five I present the discussion from the data relating to the three research questions. The conclusions and recommendations that arise out of this research are also part of chapter five.

CHAPTER TWO

SURVEY OF RELATED LITERATURE

Four bodies of literature inform this research study: literature on institutional theory, on institutionalization of curricular innovation and reform in higher learning, on the history of higher education in Nigeria, and on the integration of faith and learning form the basis for the research.

Institutional Theory

Zucker (1987) argues that institutional theories provide an explanation of how organizations are influenced by both external and internal pressures that forces them to adapt to their environment. Yet it is a well-known reality that institutional theorists admit the challenges and difficulties associated with arriving at a definite explanation of institutional theory (Scott, 1987, Zucker, 1987, Selznick, 1996). Scott (1987) identified four sociological formulations claiming institutional focus and grouped them into four categories of institutional theory. The first category views institutionalization as "a process of creating reality in an organization" the third category describes institutional systems "as a class of elements," and the fourth category describes institutions as "distinct societal spheres" (p.493-511). Zucker (1988) organizes institutional theory along geographical regional lines implying a west coast and east coast classification of institutional theory. The west coast classification of institutional theory focused on the process of institutionalization within organizations, while the east coast classification of institutional

theory emphasized the institutional environment of the organization. Selznick (1996) argues that "institutional theory traces the emergence of distinctive forms, processes, strategies, outlooks, and competences as they emerge from patterns of organizational interaction and adaptation" (p.271). Institutional theory provides the framework for identifying and emphasizing the possible forces within and outside organizations that constrain them from changing (Hanson, 2001). According to this view of institutional theory, change in educational institutions is not easily perceptible because it is "isomorphic" in nature. Levitt and Nass (1989) drawing on DiMaggio and Powell conclude that "isomorphism" is the essence of institutional theory. DiMaggio and Powell (1983) identify three forms of isomorphism; the first being coercive isomorphism which takes the form of pressure from state or state-like bodies through laws and imposed structural changes; the second form is mimetic isomorphism which describes the tendency of organizations faced with environmental uncertainty to imitate other organizations perceived as successful; and the third, normative isomorphism which can be defined as a voluntary seeking of approval of an authorizing agent, such as an accreditation agency, for inclusion and a sense of belonging. Viewing institutional theory as a process of instilling value and dealing with adaptive change provides a modality for understanding the processes involved in institutional innovation and reform (Scott, 1987). The similarities and differences in institutional theorists are best observed along the lines of their adaptation theories of organizational change. Scott (1995) in *Institutions and* Organizations, synthesizes the many years of discourse on institutional theory into three pillars of institutional theory; regulative institutional theory, normative institutional

theory and cognitive institutional theory. Scott's delineation of institutional theory into three areas or pillars supports the need to separate the causes and consequences of institutionalization into external and internal actors that result in adaptation or survival of an institution in the desired social or organizational environment in question. The next section will address the effects of institutionalization of curricular innovation and reform within higher education institutions.

Institutionalization of Curricular Innovation and Reform in Higher Education

Ross (1976) defined institutionalization as the incorporation of programs or innovation into the formal structure of the university or college. According to Curry, (1991) institutionalization occurs at three levels: structural, procedural, and incorporation. The structural level is the level at which the basic knowledge of the behaviors associated with the innovation is held and performed by those involved in the innovation. The procedural level is the level at which the behaviors and policies associated with the innovation have become standard operating procedure at the organization or institution in question. The incorporation level is the level at which the values and norms associated with the innovation are incorporated into the organization's culture. This is the most indepth level of institutionalization in any organization. Three models of curricular innovation and reform institutionalization is presented in this section.

Colbeck (2002) presents a three point process to curricular reform. First, internal and external forces are felt as pressures to implement curricular change. Next the university, college or department plans a solution for the requested change. This stage of the process involves considerable conflict between different interest groups within and

outside the unit. The final stage is occurs when the reform becomes part of "business-as-usual". This is called the "institutionalization" or "internalization" of the reform (p.397-398). Colbeck describes the phases of the curricular change as moving through "regulative" or imposed and enforceable regulative requests for reform to the "normative" phase where participants know that the rules are morally right and the sanctions for not following through are socially enforced. The final phase or the "cognitive" phase is reached when the participants believe that the rules demanding the change are not only good but are the best and only way. This is the stage of "Institutionalization by diffusion" whereby the faculty members and students are all engaged in the new way (p.417).

Colbeck's (2002) assessment of the institutionalization of curricular reform in undergraduate engineering among seven member schools of the Engineering Coalition for Excellence in Education and Leadership (ECSEL) indicated a cognitive institutionalization of the proposed reforms. The reforms focused on increased active-collaborative learning, team based design projects and increased participation of women and underrepresented minorities in engineering. The findings of the study indicated that there was a 63 percent increase in the use of design projects in undergraduate engineering among respondents. There was a 64 percent increase in the use of group projects in undergraduate engineering among respondents. There was a 50 percent increase in sensitivity to women's needs in undergraduate engineering and a 50 percent increase in sensitivity to undergraduate minorities in engineering. After controlling for ECSEL involvement in the schools the findings show that cognitive institutionalization indicators

had stronger influence that regulative or normative indicators on increase in acceptance of teaching practice in ECSEL design goals.

Fuller (1976) suggests a set of steps to be taken when pursuing strategic shift in curriculum development. The first is an assessment of fundamental values and assumptions; asking the questions, "What are the core values of the organization?" "Can these core values be maintained in light of the proposed change or will they be sacrificed to accommodate the change?" "Can the basic assumptions of the organization be questioned in the process of bringing about the proposed change?" The second involves defining the operational objectives of the organization. "Can the organization move towards these objectives?" "What incremental actions or steps can the organization take within the limits of available resources to achieve the stated objectives?" Third the organization embarks on a process of data collection and analysis to justify the curricular change proposed. Adequate research must be done to support the need for the change and the current program must be evaluated to see if it is serving the need for which it was instituted. Fourthly, there must be a determination of priorities and strategies for implementation. "What is the level of priority of the program change in the context of the institution, the state and other constituents?" "Are the academic planners in touch with legislative decision makers?" "Will the new program receive funding? Is it perceived as necessary in the list of priorities in the state?" Finally, the change must be a continuous and open process. Even though academic planning and reforms may be initiated by demands from foundations and other external bodies, it is necessary that institutions have a continuous process for program evaluation and restructuring. (Colbeck, 2002)

Fedorowicz and Gogan (2001) suggest the "Fast-Cycle Curriculum Development Strategy." This model is drawn from the implementation strategies utilized in instituting E-Business programs at Bentley College outside Boston. In 1994 the institution responded to the introduction of the World –Wide Web by embarking upon a research-driven curriculum change exercise. This was different from the traditional institutional posture of a teaching business school as opposed to research-driven at the time. The other part of Bentley College's two-pronged approach to curricular change was the stakeholder-driven curriculum change process, which was initiated due to the needs expressed by industry experts for some competences in the business school's graduates.

The acronym Q-U-I-C-K summarizes the steps necessary to be taken in this model:

- (Q) Question what is happening. "Are new skills needed?" Faculty members and administrators ask this question to drive different interdisciplinary teams into dialogue and research.
- (U) Use flexible, field–based research strategies. Fedorowicz and Gogan (2001) report that the institutional leaders used the grounded-theory case-study approach in their research because they were able to generate teaching courses and refereed publication out of the research findings.
- (I) Identify key trends, best practices, and pitfalls.
- (C) Collaborate with those who bring complementary skills and resources. This is a reference to the interdisciplinary collaboration and inter-institutional collaboration that was encouraged throughout the process.

(**K**) Know yourself as an institution. Be true to both your core competencies and your strategic vision. Providing a steady diet of clearly defined vision and objectives on how to achieve the vision was crucial to Bentley College's transformation.

The focus of the literature has been to outline the steps and processes involved in implementing curriculum reform in a higher education institution and also make provision for how to evaluate the reform. The focus of the current study in this dissertation is to provide a model or template for testing the level of institutionalization or adaptation by faculty members of the curricular model that is already in use at the institution in the study. The research by Carol Colbeck provides the template for executing the desired evaluation or study of the faculty members at a private West African university, while checking for regulative, normative or cognitive institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model.

History of Christian Higher Education in the United States and Africa

Harvard University, Yale University, Princeton University, and many other prominent private universities in the United States, started out in the 1600s as Christian institutions founded by the early pioneers on the east coast (Burtchaell, 1998). These institutions were primarily established to train clergy, teachers, lawyers and government administrators to run the daily lives of the new settlers. Many of institutions had only schools of Theology, Medicine and Law (Burtchaell, 1998). It was not until after 1870 that institutions started to move away from the Christian principles of the founders.

Anthony Campolo (2003) referring to sociologist Robert Merton (1973) suggests that the

imperatives given by the Protestant Work Ethic was taken by the early academicians to be a God-given calling to expand all fields of knowledge through research and logic. This move toward research and independent thinking encouraged scholars to question the tenets of their belief systems. This questioning eventually led to the abandonment by some of Protestant Christian dogma in the course of their intellectual pursuit (Campolo, 2003). The result of this shift is the ultimate move to a secular stance that reduced the explicit influence of Protestant Christianity in these early colleges and eventually led to independence from many forms of Christian influences in some public universities (Marsden, 1994).

There has been a recent move to make Christian institutions more aware of the historical process of the secularization of American universities and to find ways of avoiding the development of the same characteristics that led early Protestant institutions down the path of secularization. The move to bring Christian institutions back to the purpose of their founders, or to the purposes currently believed to underlie the aims of the founders has been reflected in the literature in the last thirty years by Christian scholars who believe it is possible to be a Christian and still be a rational academic espousing the values of the academy (Marsden, 1994, Benne, 2001 Burtchaell, 1998). These authors cite examples of schools that have succeeded in maintaining their Christian stance without losing their scholarly and academic edge. The examples include University of Norte Dame in South Bend Indiana, Baylor University in Waco Texas and Wheaton College in Wheaton Illinois (Benne, 2001).

The history of higher education institutions in Africa have followed a pattern similar to that of American universities that were founded in the early seventeenth century. Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone which was started in 1827 by the Christian Missionary Society of the British Empire, is a prime example of missionary efforts in starting higher education institutions as a training school for priests and teachers (Nwauwa, 1996); (Fafunwa, 1971, 1974). For more than a century this was the only institution in the western part of Africa to offer any kind of higher education to the African natives. In the southern part of Africa, South African College of Cape Town was founded in 1829, Lovedale Institution in 1841, and the University of the Cape of Good Hope in 1873. These institutions even though located on the African continent were not geared towards the native Africans but rather the children of the British and the Dutch colonizers (Lulat, 2005).

Apart from Fourah Bay College, the British colonizers were indifferent to education that might lead to progress in the region. They only offered education that would train the people to improve the production of raw materials from continent for European markets (Fafunwa, 1974). Spreading western civilization was perceived by the colonizers as an essential element in the educational process of Africa. The aim was to end barbarism and ignorance in Africa, hence, the efforts to bring enlightenment to the "dark" continent (Mazrui, 1978). Many public universities have been started since African nations gained independence in the late 1950s and early 1960s, but over time they have become neglected and impoverished due to government abandonment and lack of adequate funding. The current wave of private universities in Africa, which started in

the 1990s, is a response to the need for sustainable and viable higher education systems for the upcoming generation of African leaders. Churches and private individuals have participated in the new wave of university establishment in an effort to salvage higher education from the twin problems of secularization and economic neglect (Levy, 2002, Tilak, 1991, Geiger, 1988); (Altbach, 2002).

According to Geiger (1988) the opportunity for private investors to participate in funding higher education initiatives arise when there is "public-sector failure" (p.701). Geiger's analysis of the forms and structures of higher education institutions globally reveals three types: first, the mass private and restricted public sectors which is exemplified in Japan, Philippines, South Korea, Brazil and to some extent in Indonesia; the parallel public and private sectors which is exemplified in Belgium and the Netherlands and finally, the comprehensive public and peripheral private sectors which is exemplified in Mexico and some African countries such as Nigeria. In the mass private and restricted public sector type, the system is hierarchical with the highest status accorded the oldest and established institutions. The state sponsors both the private and the public universities in this type. The parallel public and private sectors type of higher education, results from the need for national degrees leading to the need for the provision of education of equivalent value. In places such as Belgium and the Netherlands the state sponsors private schools to ensure equality and quality of higher education. In the comprehensive public and peripheral type public universities are expected to provide the higher education needs of the population while the private institution exist to fill the gaps and provide niche specialization areas. In Nigeria as well as other countries where this

type is prevalent, the private universities do not just cover niche markets but rather pick up the slack of public universities that current are not equipped to adequately meet the demand for education by the public. Hence, the creation just recently of a number of private universities in Nigeria and some other African countries such as Ghana.

Benne (2001) affirms that different Christian denominations have been seeking ways of mitigating the influence of secularization and theological drift in their higher education institutions. One such example is the Seventh-day Adventist Church, an international denomination with over fourteen million members worldwide. The General Conference of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, at its fall council in September 2003, received the report of the Commission on Higher Education, which was set up in the fall of 2000 to find out the state of its higher education institutions. The focal point of the report centered on the fact that the institutions (universities and colleges) were drifting, ideologically and theologically, from the values and tenets of the Church. This drift was perceived to be towards a secularization of the institutions, moving them away from the theological positions of the Church and toward the position of public institutions that have limited religious affiliations (General Conference of SDA, Commission on Higher Education, September, 2003).

The report cites the effects of inadequate funding from the founding organizations to the institutions as a major factor in the drift, so that the colleges and universities have instead pursued tuition money and other funds for fiscal survival. They have gone after rich and affluent students who were not from the same religious tradition as the Church that established the institution. Benne (2001), suggests that when a large number of

students in an institution are not from the religious tradition of the founders of the institution, there is a tendency for them (students from other religious traditions) to shift the moral and religious climate of the institution away from the theological position of the founders. The same is true of faculty members, administrators, and board of trustees of the institution. This statement is re-affirmed in the Seventh-day Adventist Commission on Higher Education report that states that more than fifty percent of ninety-four institutions around the world have manifested of this problem. Examples include such institutions as Loma Linda University and La Sierra University, both in Southern California, and Andrews University in Berrien Springs, Michigan. (Report of Commission on Higher Education General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, 2003).

Integration of Faith and Learning:

Implementing the integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model has been recommended as the means of steering Christian institutions away from secularization. What is the integration of faith and learning curricular model? Defining the integration of faith and learning has been considered an ambiguous task since academic practitioners offer various definitions that can be grouped around intellectual, lifestyle and discipleship categories (Nwosu, 1999, 2003). As generally defined, integration of faith and learning is a concept that encourages making Christian values a part of learning and introducing these values into curriculum development in all academic programs and disciplinary specializations (Hughes, 2001). Integration of faith and learning remains the distinctive task of the Christian liberal arts college (Holmes, 1987). It is the belief of the proponents of this concept that a deliberate infusion of a Christian

lifestyle in academics will influence faculty members and students, as they interact with each other, to make choices that will value others and their needs above selfish monetary benefits. This view is only practical in a setting where the critical mass of the institution is in favor of upholding explicit Christian values in an academic environment.

The Council for Christian Colleges and Universities is an organization comprising institutions operating within North America who work within the curricular and pedagogical framework of the intentional integration of scholarship with biblical faith and service, a concept also referred to as "the integration of faith and learning." "There are 105 intentionally Christ-centered institutions of higher learning in the U.S. and Canada qualified for membership in the CCCU [Council for Christian Colleges & Universities]. According to the U.S. Department of Higher Learning our campuses represent a distinct segment of 900 'religiously affiliated' colleges and universities" (Council for Christian Colleges & Universities website, 2005). Members must have a public, board-approved institutional mission or purpose statement that is Christ-centered and rooted in the historic Christian faith; curricular and extra-curricular programs that reflect the integration of scholarship, biblical faith and service; and hire as full-time faculty members and administrators only persons who profess faith in Jesus Christ (CCCU, 2006).

Examples of Christian institutions that incorporate the integration of faith and learning model include Calvin College in Grand Rapids Michigan and Wheaton College in Wheaton, Illinois. Calvin College espouses what is called the "Christian academic-discipline model." This model "introduces students to the academic disciplines

themselves, all the while struggling to integrate the discipline in question with one's own Christian faith" (Benne, 2001, p.100). Calvin also requires all permanent members of the faculty and administration to be members of the Reformed tradition and also requires them to sign the "Form of Subscription", which commits them to "apply the principles of God's Word as interpreted by Our Reformed standards in the teaching of the subjects assigned to us" (p.101).

Wheaton College in Wheaton Illinois, provides another example of the active integration of faith and learning by a Christian college. A new faculty member must attend ten sessions on how to integrate faith and learning offered by the Wheaton College Faculty Seminar in Faith and Learning. Sessions include the biblical and theological foundations of the Christian account; Christianity and the liberal arts; forms and problems of knowledge; ethics; and exercises in integrating the Christian vision with various disciplines. The Center for Faith and Learning also makes funds available to Wheaton faculty to take courses in theology and to construct interdisciplinary courses that incorporate the Christian vision (Benne, 2001, p.108). Students at Wheaton College take a heavy load of theology and biblical courses to get them well grounded in biblical truth. The theology department is well staffed to take care of the responsibility of teaching the Bible to faculty and students.

Leonard, in *Models for Christian Higher Learning: Strategies for Success in the Twenty-First Century*, offers what is referred to as the "Cornerstone Curriculum" model, which is an approach to curriculum development that emphasizes introducing subject matter to students through the multiple lenses of various academic fields. This curriculum

was introduced in 1991 at Samford University, a Christian university which has a focus on integrating faith and learning while maintaining high academic standards and regional competitiveness. The academic material is presented over a three-semester period in modules taught by faculty members from different academic backgrounds. (Leonard, 1997).

The first module is the Personal Wholeness module, which incorporates studies in scriptures, faith, Christian ethics, and other religious components. The second module the Cultural Legacies module, which is also taught over three semesters through the presentation of history, literature, arts, and music. This curriculum blended religion with other disciplines to give students a clear Christian worldview and an understanding of different disciplines in the light of Christian values. The outcome being a student who understands the purpose of Christian higher education as opposed to secular higher education. The intentionality of Christian higher education administrators and faculty to preserve Christian values at great costs of time and financial resources call to question the rationale of such actions.

The current focus of this dissertation is studying the impact if any that the faculty members have on the efforts of the institutional administrators to implement the integration of faith and learning curricular model at a private university in Nigeria West Africa. The literature on institutional theory provides that framework for understanding institutional adaptation and survival in environments exerting external as well as internal pressures on the institution. Institutionalization is the ability of an organization to take any given structural or ideological change and make it work for the benefit of all the

actors in the organization. Understanding the different degrees and types of institutionalization provides the tools for critically examining the levels at which any given change or reform introduced into an organization is being accepted or rejected for that matter.

The historical survey of higher education in the United States, Africa and Nigeria in particular provides a springboard from which to understand what led up to the establishment of private universities in Nigeria. The failure of some of the public institutions in Africa to meet the needs of some sectors of the society prompted the rise of private universities especially in Nigeria. Certain Christian groups in Nigeria such as the Catholics, Baptists, Seventh-day Adventists and independent Pentecostal churches have started their own private universities in response to the federal government's call for the private sector to supplement the efforts of the federal and state governments in providing post-secondary education to the general public. Higher education requires a high degree of objectivity and academic freedom to be able to function at a premium level for the benefit of the sectors served by any given institution. The ability to do this while maintaining the integrity of the intent of the founders of the institutions is the primary purpose of this dissertation.

CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY

This is a qualitative case study design. According to Tashakkori and Teddlie (1998), this is an explorative case study. I have chosen to use a case study approach because "a case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not closely evident" (Yin, 2003, p.13).

Site and Population Selection

Site selection was made by the process of purposeful sampling (Creswell, 1998) after considering two other institutions of similar characteristics in West Africa one in Cameroon and the other in Ghana. The institution had to be a Seventh-day Adventist Church affiliated co-educational, with a minimum of 1000 students, and based in West Africa. There also had to be a minimum of 50 faculty members on the academic staff of the institution, with a minimum of two colleges making up the university. There are currently three universities operated by the Seventh-day Adventist Church in West Africa. Two of these have a total student population of less than one thousand student and a faculty of less than fifty in each. For the purpose of this study which focused on Seventh-day Adventist higher education in West Africa, an institution with a sizable representation of both students and faculty members will adequately represent the data that is sought for analysis. All three institutions are accredited by the Adventist

Accrediting Association based in Silver Springs, Maryland with the same modalities of operating a curriculum based on the integration of faith and learning. (AAA, 2005)

Ebony University fit the selection criteria with 3546 students enrolled in predegree, undergraduate, and graduate programs and an academic staff population of 164 faculty members (COMPU Report, 2004). Three colleges make up the academic structure of the university; the College of Education, Art and Humanities; the College of Science and Technology; and the College of Management and Social Sciences. Ebony University was established in 1959 by Seventh-day Adventist missionaries as an institution to train clergy for the denominational work of the Seventh-day Adventist Church in Nigeria. It operated for the first twenty years as a four college awarding bachelors degrees in majors such as Theology, Religious Studies, Biology and History. The federal government of Nigeria attempted to close all private degree awarding institution which prompted the institution to change its status into purely a Theological Seminary with majors in Religion and Theology and minor offerings in other subject areas. In 1999, the federal government of Nigeria decided to remove the ban on private entities operating degree awarding institutions at which time Ebony applied for and was awarded the accreditation to become a four-year degree awarding university with three colleges, twelve academic departments and thirty-three majors offered. The students are drawn from all the major ethnic groups in Nigeria and belong to different religious affiliations.

Ebony University is located in the Southwestern region of Nigeria, the most populous country in Africa with a population of about 130 million people. The region of Nigeria where Ebony University is located has a tropical climate and a mountainous

topography. There are four major public universities run by the federal and states governments within one hour's drive of the university which gives the university access to professors and faculty members who can provide academic services when needed. Of the twenty four private universities in Nigeria that have been approved by the National Universities Commission, Ebony University was one of the first three to be accredited by the federal government.

All academic institutions within the Seventh-day Adventist church structure are accredited by the Adventist Accrediting Association (AAA). This fact alone puts the structure of the institution on an international as well as local template as far as expectations and standards are concerned. The Adventist Accrediting Association handbook states the aim, mission and philosophy of Adventist education as:

Adventist education prepares students for a useful and joy-filled life, fostering friendship with God, whole-person development, Bible-based values, and selfless service in accordance with the Seventh-day Adventist mission to the world... The Seventh-day Adventist philosophy of education is Christ-centered. Adventists believe that, under the guidance of the Holy Spirit, God's character and purposes can be understood as revealed in the Bible, in Jesus Christ and in nature. The distinctive characteristics of Adventist education—derived from the Bible and the writings of Ellen G. White—point to the redemptive aim of true education: to restore human beings into the image of their Maker (AAA Handbook , p. I-3).

This statement puts the emphasis on the integration of faith and learning in its proper perspective as being something expected by the denominational hierarchy and not something contrived by the local institutional leaders. Ebony University is one of 106 colleges and universities owned and operated by the Seventh-day Adventist Church around the world (General Conference of SDA, Education Statistics). Therefore, the question of how to implement the Adventist philosophy of education that is focused on making joyful Christians out of the students becomes the overriding focus of the institutional administrators and academic staff members.

The Adventist philosophy of education is a balanced ideological position that focuses on how to give the best spiritual service to the students while at the same at the same time preparing them for meaningful and useful lives in their communities. The handbook of the accrediting association provides insight on the goals of the Seventh-day Adventist church as a whole on post-secondary education or higher education:

Adventist institutions of higher education provide students a unique environment needed in pursuit of learning in the arts, humanities and religion, sciences and various professions, within the perspective of the Adventist philosophy of education and spiritual commitment. Adventist higher education:

- 1. Gives preference to careers that directly support the mission of the Church.
- Recognizes the importance of the quest for truth in all its dimensions as it affects the total development of the individual in relation both to God and to fellow human beings.
- 3. Utilizes available resources such as revelation, reason, reflection, and research to discover truth and its implications for human life here and in the hereafter, while recognizing the limitations inherent in all human endeavors.

- 4. Leads students to develop lives of integrity based upon principles compatible with the religious, ethical, social, and service values essential to the Adventist worldview.
- 5. Fosters—particularly at the graduate level—the mastery, critical evaluation, discovery and dissemination of knowledge, and the nurture of wisdom in the community of Christian scholars (AAA Handbook, p. I-4)

Given this background one is able to understand why an Adventist university will by course work at implementing the integration of faith with learning at its institution. Individual institutions are left with very few options except to declare independence from denominational affiliation, which some have done in situations when they felt the denomination was not adhering strictly to the tenets of the faith and what it takes to be a Seventh-day Adventist. Ebony University's administrators and faculty members have chosen to operate the institution according to the guidelines of the Adventist Accrediting Association. Therefore this study is focused on how the integration of faith and learning model is working judging from the responses of faculty members, 70 percent of whom are Seventh-day Adventists and 30 percent non-Seventh-day Adventists. 70 percent of the faculty members are male and 30 percent female, serving students who are 35 percent Seventh-day Adventists and 65 percent non-Seventh-day Adventists.

The decision to use a survey method in this study arises out of pragmatic reasons of distance from the source of the data and the financial constraints involved in traveling back and forth to Nigeria from the United States to gather data while holding down a full-time pastoral job in the United States. I was able to travel twice to Nigeria in a space of

six months in an attempt to gather the necessary data using in-depth interviews and observations. These attempts were met with limited responses on the part of the participants due to conflicting schedules and therefore leading to inadequate and insufficient data for the research project. One may suggest that the lack of interviews can be interpreted as a form of resistance on the part of the respondents. Not knowing the faculty members well enough and not establishing sufficient rapport prior to seeking interview was a possible reason for not getting interview. On the other hand my availability at the time was based on a very tight schedule between work, which place pressure on me as well as on the respondents. Resistance was expressed in other ways by respondents in other ways in the process of gathering data through the survey instrument.

The particular questionnaire survey used in this study had been used in a previous study of four religious research universities in the United States by researchers based at Baylor University and Indiana Wesleyan University. The team of Michael Beaty, Larry Lyon, Todd Ream and Perry Glanzer, studied faculty members at University of Nortre Dame, Baylor University, Brigham Young University and Boston College examining the relationship between faith and learning in the experiences of the faculty members. The results of the studies have been published the Journal of Religious Education and the Christian Higher Education Journal in 2005 and 2004 respectively. The findings revealed that faculty members expressed different positions on the relationship of faith and learning in an academic environment. The resulting typology of the integration of faith and learning has eight patterns or categories ranging from "faith and learning are separate and independent" in pattern one to "complete integration" in pattern eight.

The design of the instrument was with the express intention of gathering different kinds of data from the same document. Open-ended written responses as well as closedended responses were gathered with this instrument to facilitate both a quantitative utility of the survey for descriptive data on the respondents as well as a qualitative utility through the written responses for linguistic analysis. With the knowledge that the total number of the faculty members at Ebony University was 164 a total of 150 questionnaires were administered through the office of the Vice-Chancellor or President. The actual breakdown of the number of faculty members in each college was not known at the time of sending the questionnaires. It was the reasoning that since there are three colleges in the university assigning 50 survey questionnaires to fifty individual faculty members in the College of Arts and Humanities, 50 in the College of Management and Social Sciences, and 50 in the College of Science and Technology will be the equitable thing to do. The selection of who will participate was random and left to the discretion of the deans of the individual colleges. The allocation of fifty questionnaires to each college was in an attempt to get maximum participation without excluding anyone who could participate.

Male and female faculty members at Ebony University belong to different

Christian denominations ranging from Seventh-day Adventist, Baptist, Pentecostal,

Anglican and the Roman Catholic Church. They possess a diversity of academic

qualifications, ranging from bachelor's degrees, masters degrees professional degrees and
doctoral degrees in various academic disciplines. The academic classification of faculty
members includes the ranks of Graduate Assistant, Lecturer I Lecturer II, Senior

Lecturer, Assistant Professor, Associate Professor and Full Professor (Academic Staff Handbook, 2002-2005). The differences in length of service at the university as well as in the academic disciplines taught by the faculty members present a range of variables that are reflected in the responses of the faculty members to the survey.

Data Collection Procedure:

The mixed model research design was the method used in this study (Creswell, 1998). This is because there was a quantitative component to the questionnaire for gathering data that was of a descriptive and purely statistical nature. The other portions of the questionnaire were designed to gather data that were qualitative in nature since the answers were open ended and unrestricted in nature. Data was collected from individual male and female faculty members from the three colleges of the institution using a questionnaire survey instrument. The survey instrument was adapted for use in this research study from previous studies done under the leadership of Dr. Michael Beaty and Dr. Larry Lyon, both of Baylor University in Waco Texas. There was a need to adapt the question to the situation of Ebony University since there were questions that were directed towards institutions that had particular denominational terminologies. For example the adapted questionnaire from the BrighamYoung University study had a reference to "ward" and "stake" meetings which were transferred wholesale into the Ebony University study and did not make any sense to the respondents. The components of the study that referred to the prominent founders and leaders in the denominations in

¹ See Appendix D for statements from authors granting permission to use the survey instrument.

the Ream, Beaty and Lyon study had to be readapted to insert Seventh-day Adventist leader and founder Ellen G. White.

The literature review for this study noted recent research done in this area at religious research universities using the survey instrument adapted for this current study (Ream, Beaty and Lyon, 2004; Glanzer, Beaty and Lyon, 2005). This study will focus on a Christian liberal arts university in Africa with the goal of discovering the ways faculty members respond to the institutional expectations that they integrate Christian faith with academic learning in the institution.

The questionnaire used in this study combines closed- and open-ended items and includes multiple-choice items (Tashakkori and Teddlie, 1998). Another aspect focused on gathering and analyzing written responses in a space provided in the questionnaire to respond to the following open-ended question:

A major question confronting a school like Ebony University is the degree to which faith and learning should be related. (For example, should religious beliefs influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research?)

Please provide a brief explanation of your perspective on faith and learning.

Responses to this question and other open ended questions were analyzed in what is identified as the phenomenological tradition (Creswell, 1998). The analysis of these written responses was conducted with the intent of identifying linguistic themes and

patterns that emerge for the purpose of grouping. Linguistic expressions that reflect the relationship between faith and learning for the individual respondents were grouped together to form emerging patterns of perception among the respondents. This form of analysis is inspired by Wittgenstein's suggestion in his *Philosophical Investigations* (1953/1958) that the employment of language conforms to certain rules and "that individuals learn these rules by virtue of their interaction with other individuals. The public character of language makes it possible to identify different phrases that share the same meaning (or not)" (quoted in Ream, Beaty, and Lyon, 2005, p.6). This analysis will help in developing a typology of the perceptions of faculty members on the relationship between "faith" and "learning."

Appendix C shows the questionnaire protocol that was used in the process of data gathering for this research. To address the differences between the three different types of institutionalization, I asked questions of the following sort:

Questions 1-8 deal with the general academic and religious mission of this institution. These questions also address the issues of the goals and objectives of the institution as it relates to serving the needs of the students. These types of questions relate to mandatory functions of the institution, hence the regulative institutionalization expectations that the responses to these questions invoke.

Questions 9-29 deal with the direction the institution should go and seek the moral judgment call of the respondents in issues such as hiring practices, academic freedom, admissions and the things that should be required of both faculty members and students by the administration of the institution. These questions are personal preference

questions that reveal the respondents opinion in the related issues. The answer options are; strongly agree, agree, disagree, and strongly disagree. They are of a normative institutionalization nature which deals with compliance based on the moral or legal appropriateness of an issue.

Question 29b is an open-ended question that seeks the respondent's view of what integration of faith and learning is all about. This is the main focus of this research as it gives a voice to the faculty member's opinion of the curricular model in question. The response will reveal the conviction of the respondent one way or another on the subject of integration of faith and learning and is therefore a cognitive institutionalization question. It is cognitive because it reveals the beliefs of the respondent as well the feelings on a conceptual level relative to integration of faith and learning.

Question 30-43 deal with the respondent's opinions on what the institution should do just as questions 9-29 and are mainly of a normative institutionalization nature.

Questions 44-50 deal with behaviors in the academic environment and therefore are of a cognitive institutionalization nature.

Question 51-56 deal with academic freedom and the respondent's view of the appropriateness of the institution's way of encouraging and advancing the cause of academic freedom at this institution. They are questions aimed at gauging the normative institutionalization level of the institution.

Questions 57-63 are of a biographical nature and are therefore regulative institutionalization and objective in nature. Appendix D shows the process of the correspondence that led to the permission to use the instrument for this research study.

The questionnaire from the Baylor University team of Dr. Michael Beaty and Dr. Larry Lyon formed the basis for this research study for the purpose of data gathering and analysis. The areas similarity was in the data on faculty biographical data and the general sense of integration of faith and learning possibilities stated in the qualitative written responses. The areas of differences include the number of institutions studies and the size of the sample studied. Additional differences include the countries and contexts of the studies. The current study was conducted in Nigeria while the past studies were conducted in institutions of higher education in the United States.

Data Analysis and Coding:

One hundred and fifty questionnaires were administered at the research site at 50 questionnaires for each of the three colleges that made up the university. Of the 150 questionnaires, 75 were returned to the researcher. Of the 75 questionnaires 11 were blanks, 8 had whole sections not completed at all and 11 falsified questionnaires. One could tell these were falsified because one individual filled out 9 questionnaires by haste expressed in the pen marks, the type of pen used and the brevity of the responses in the written sections. Another individual filled out 2 questionnaires which were also identifiable through the handwriting style and the pen used in writing the responses.

Looking over the falsified questionnaires, it was discovered that 9 were all from the same college and that the viewpoint that was advocated by the individual who submitted all nine was that faith and learning should be integrated. The individual who submitted two falsified questionnaire was also from one college. It is the researcher's opinion that the individuals felt under pressure to produce completed questionnaires that

would make his or her college look good with the Vice-Chancellor who had requested that the surveys be completed within a certain amount of time. White-out was employed to mask some of the already written responses in order to vary the flow of the responses. These practices suggest a sense of coercion on the part of the respondents who even though were teachers in a Christian institution were using dishonest means to achieve seemingly noble objectives. Institutionalization of any form or practice in a work environment is perceived in the responses of the members of that community to day to day expectations as proposed or imposed by internal and external actors within and from outside the community. In this instance the evidence begins to indicate that expectations such as honesty and integrity were not forth-coming from the respondents rather resistance expressed in falsification and withholding of survey instruments.

A total of 45 questionnaires were completed as directed by the instructions on the cover page and this formed the core of the questionnaires that were analyzed for the purpose of this research study. The response rate was 25 percent of the total 150 questionnaires sent to the institution for distribution within the three colleges. 40 percent of the questionnaires returned were from the College of Management and Social Sciences, while 33.3 percent of the questionnaires returned were from the College of Science and Technology and the remainder 26.7 percent of the questionnaires returned were from the College of Education and Humanities. In an institution that has a total faculty population of 164 faculty members, a sample of 45 faculty members represents a quarter of the total academic staff population. This response rate indicates resistance on the part of faculty members, since out of 150 faculty members only 45 were willing in a

Christian institution to participate in a survey on institutionalization. Time constraints and workload realities in an academic environment may be responsible for the low response rate. As noted earlier, the number of questionnaires that were filled by a single individual indicates the possibility that time did not allow for a fair distribution of the questionnaires hence their being filled by one person.

The quantitative section of the survey contained open-ended and closed-ended responses. The closed-ended responses were analyzed statistically (Tashakkori & Teddlie, 1998). Units of analysis emerge from the questions in the questionnaire and they are directly related to the research questions (Yin, 2003). The research questions inform the questions that elicit the relevant data for inclusion in the analysis. Based on a typology of patterns of integration of faith and learning derived by Ream et al (2005), the first research question seeks to develop a similar typology of patterns. The second research question pursues the development of a process of institutionalization similar to W. R. Scott's (1995) processes of institutionalization. The third research question examines the influence of contextual characteristics in shaping patterns and processes. The use of data display through matrixes, charts and networks has been suggested by Siedman (1991) and Miles and Huberman (1994). Table 4:1 shows the open-ended responses to Question 8 in the survey questionnaire:

Table 3:1

Qualitative Responses to Question 8

Open-ended qualitative answers to #8 other goals of the institution

- 1. Ensuring that students have at least a fair knowledge of God.
- 2. Maximum welfare scheme for staff training and development
- 3. Develop the spirit of love for God and men in the students
- 4. Empowering students to meet the challenges of marital life and unemployment
- 5. Extending knowledge via spirituality
- 6. Preaching the gospel to make both the members of academic staff and students to be genuinely born again
- 7. Encourage moral development through mentoring
- 8. Grooming them(students) to be good leaders
- Developing the student's ability for independent study and thinking; maximum possible emphasis
- 10. Providing holistic education maximum possible emphasis
- 11. Develop the students commitment to their Creator and His principles and laws
- 12. Developing the students spiritual values
- 13. Empowerment program for self actualization
- 14. Provide students with high quality education
- 15. Nurture spiritual, physical, mental sensitivity and awareness Impress upon the students a sense of Good citizenship

Out of the 45 questionnaires that were considered usable of the 75 returned, 15 respondents gave their responses in written form in the questionnaires to question 8.

There were two more open-ended qualitative response questions in the survey, question 29 and question 50. Table 4:2 shows the responses to question 29 and Table 4:3 shows the responses to question 50. Overall, the rate of response was very limited compared to the population of faculty members at this institution which currently stands at 164. For question 8 the three colleges were evenly represented in the responses, with 33.33 percent from the College of Management and Social Sciences, 33.33 percent from the College of Science and Technology and 33.33 percent from the College of Education and Humanities.

Table 3:2

Responses to Qualitative – Open-Ended Question 29b

Question 29b

A major question confronting a school like Ebony University is the degree to which faith and learning should be related. (For example, should religious beliefs influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research?)

Please provide a brief explanation of your perspective on faith and learning.

 Knowledge of good and evil exists. I believe we must strive to promote and impact knowledge that is of maximum benefit to man and glory of God, our source. Any education that does not have its anchorage in the reality of God's

- existence will be an effort knowingly or unknowing calculated at undermining the purpose of the Creator for His created world. Sound doctrines therefore should influence pedagogy here.
- 2. Spirituality is the foundation of all human endeavors, just as the fear of God is the beginning if wisdom. Spirituality and education should blend into an inseparable hybrid entity and should remain as such under all conditions. Consequently knowledge and understanding should be integrated and concretized into the fabric of religious principles and practices.
- 3. Spirituality should be moderately emphasized.
- 4. The fear of God is the beginning of wisdom. All learning revolves around the above passage and any program without God is bound to fail. Therefore emphasis must always be placed on God, then other knowledge will follow.
- 5. If education and plus morals is good then education and spirituality must co-exist because education without the knowledge of the true God is zero.
- 6. Really the school should moderate the integration of faith and learning because the university is a universe on its own a cultural universe of all learning. A conventional university ought to be a laboratory for experimenting all types of ideas. More so university scholars ought to be able[sic] to articulate their thoughts and freely express them. This is the essence of a university.
- 7. Not necessarily. The important thing is to be able to infer spiritual lessons from the topics treated as much as possible.

- 8. Whatever the level of education a person has it must be turned toward religious beliefs. This is because religious beliefs and practices refine one's behaviors, particularly in the classroom, office and outdoor activities. Education without spirituality is incomplete education and this should not be encouraged. Education without spirituality is one of the causes of Nigeria's greed and many other malpractices for which most countries or nations hate Nigeria and Nigerians.
- 9. I don't think, spirituality should choose the topic that will be discussed in the class because if you should do so the students will not be complete in their learning but rather student should be taught but [sic] both the good and bad as required by the court and allow them to choose the right from the wrong.
- 10. Education should be influenced by religion (if that is what you refer to as spirituality) but not to the extent of limiting students and lecturers' access to information/knowledge. The university, as an institution, has a culture and standard. Therefore nothing should adversely affect the quality or standard of teaching, research and service.
- 11. As far as I am concerned, spirituality cannot be divorced from education. They are coterminons [sic] companions. Religious beliefs as propagated by the Adventist movement should influence the choice of topics teachers explore in their class, the way they teach the material or the way they do their research.
- 12. Religion is a personal relationship with God. However, the "atmosphere" should be such as encourage constant devotion to the Almighty God.

- 13. Spirituality means being sensitive to the teachings and instructions of God. The instructions of the bible gave about the worship and service to God is that God is Spirit and they that must worship/serve Him must do so in spirit and in truth. Also the Bible say, the fear of God is the beginning of wisdom. If that is so then all things must be put in place to make since God takes the center stage.
- 14. Should be complimentary.
- 15. Jesus Christ is the author if wisdom and knowledge. The Scripture says "Does anybody lack knowledge let him ask of Him that gives liberally and does not reproach." Any education without Jesus Christ is valueless. Since the students are the future leaders their education should be based on the pillar of ages; the rock of ages, the I am that I am, Jesus Christ, our Lord and Savior. The Scripture says "First seek ye the kingdom of God and all its righteousness and all other things shall be added unto you."
- 16. Yes! This approach seems the best way to realize the institutional goal.
- 17. Not really, all topics should be taught, giving the world view and the Christian perspective however there should be emphasis on the Christian perspective because all true knowledge comes from God. This is integration of faith and learning in the true sense.
- 18. In America, one of the most liberal societies of the world, the need for religious and moral instruction has once again taken the front-burner. It is imperative that spirituality and education should be blended to provide students with the right kind of instruction. This is with a view to preparing them to meet the challenges

- of the world pervaded by evil and moral decadence. The teacher must know how to integrate faith with learning and explain the biblical truths to the students inspite of the theories they must have taught the students.
- 19. Spirituality and education must be related that is the concept known as integration of faith and learning in Ebony University. In every subject morals and religious beliefs can be applied.
- 20. Religious beliefs should be employed in the style on imparting knowledge in a subtle manner albeit.
- 21. There should be a blending of spiritual principles and academic/subject content in such a way that both perspectives of relevant knowledge being explored in the classroom is clear and balanced bring [sic] bringing out its value so that the philosophy of Ebony University is achieved as in Questionnaire items 12-21.
- 22. Spirituality should be the foundation of successful educational foundation. Thus, spirituality and education are significantly and positively related. However, topics to be taught should always be within the confines of the regulatory authority's [NUC] minimum academic standards. To this extent, they should not strictly be influenced by religious beliefs. What is needed is that the teacher ought to trace and link them to spiritual foundations. Above all, BU [sic] operates within the Nigerian Universities system. The difference, I feel, should be the spiritual impact, from Christianity perspective, on the quality of educational services delivered.

- 23. The worship of God is a spiritual reality, out of one's free will and accord. The degree to which spirituality and education should be related is out of the question since no one is being forced to worship God. Therefore religious beliefs should not in any way influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, etc.
- 24. Christ should be brought into the classroom, no matter the type of course being taught.
- 25. Religious beliefs should not absolutely influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research. But that not withstanding, there should be a little reflection especially on religious issues relating to moral building so as to benefit both the students and the nation at large.
- 26. Religious beliefs should not influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach their material or the way they do research.

 Minimum emphasis should be placed on religion because God does not recon [sic] with religion. A person's belief in Jesus Christ and His work of redemption is what God is interested in. we should all manifest Christ in our individual lives rather than carry religion in the hypocritical way that is being done right now.
- 27. In all we do lecturers should have and teach (influence) students in spiritual matters. But they (lecturers) should not forget the principle of "choice" students alike should be able to make their choice. Lecturers should therefore not be overbearing and should lead by example.

28. Knowledge of good and evil exists. I believe we must strive to promote and impact knowledge that is of maximum benefit to man and glory of God, our source. Any education that does not have its anchorage in the reality of God's existence will be an effort knowingly or unknowing calculated at undermining the purpose of the Creator for His created world. Sound doctrines therefore should influence pedagogy here.

Out of the 45 questionnaires that were considered usable of the 75 returned, 28 respondents gave their responses in written form in the questionnaires to question 29b.

This represents about 62.5 percent of the total number of respondents in the study. 43 percent of the responses came from the College of Management and Social Sciences, 31 percent from the College of Science and Technology and 26 percent from the College of Education and Humanities. Of these, 83 percent were males and 17 percent were females. The total number of males in the study was 34 or 75 percent of the total population of the respondents in the sample, while the number of females in the study was 12 or 25 percent of the total population of the respondents in the sample. This response pattern suggests that the members of the faculty from the College of Management and Social Sciences are more responsive to Social Science research than their counterparts in the College of Science and Technology and they, more than their counterparts in the College of Education and Humanities.

Table 3:3

Qualitative Responses to Question 50

Question 50 – Other Practices of what you do with the students to integrate faith and learning (education and spirituality)

- 1. Pray before and after class
- 2. Counseling students on various areas of life.
- 3. I pray with my students at the beginning of lectures
- 4. Currently fast and pray along with some students privately as needs arise from the students
- 5. Offer counseling on religious issues outside of class
- 6. Counsel students on their personal problems
- 7. Relate news and currents affairs issues to course and Christian worldview
- 8. One-on one counseling
- 9. The wonders of prayer especially when in a fix
- 10. Encouraging weak students and building up their faith that they can still make it whatever their current academic performance
- 11. Assist them(students) financially
- 12. Advising the students

Out of the 45 questionnaires that were considered usable of the 75 returned, 12 respondents gave their responses in written form in the questionnaires to question 50. For question 50 the College of Education and Humanities had 50 percent of the

responses, while the College of Management and Social Sciences had 40 percent and the College of Science and Technology had 10 percent of the responses. 50 percent of the activities that were indicated for this question were in the area of advising, encouraging and counseling of students which falls within the area of the College of Education and Humanities. This pattern may suggest that institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model is more conceptually adaptable to the Humanities than to the Sciences or the Social Sciences.

In the process of reading through the questionnaire responses several times, codes were assigned to different themes that seem to feature repeatedly in the reading and arranged in columns in tables and matrices. These codes were named to reduce their number and regroup them for easier analysis in the process of data reduction (Miles and Huberman, 1994). The themes arising from the coding were used to generate typology patterns and institutionalization processes that describe faculty perceptions and views on the integration of faith and learning. Descriptions of a few themes synthesized from the whole are rendered in a narrative that addresses the research questions, providing answers from the findings or discoveries that deviate from the research questions (Creswell, 2003; Siedman, 1991). This will be discussed in the next chapter. The emerging themes were synthesized into typological patterns, matrixes, visual displays and networks that reflect the complex workings of the phenomena being studied. (Miles and Huberman, 1994) (Waggoner, Metcalfe and Olaore, 2005). The Ream et al typology of eight patterns of integration of faith and learning transposed over the Scott (1995) and Colbeck (2002) institutionalization process model of regulative, normative and cognitive integration to

develop a new way of visually representing what is taking place in the integration efforts at the institution in the study. Narrative of relationships of percentages of responses and values and their implication for faculty work at the institution will be rendered chapter five.

Table 4:4 shows the matrix of the emerging themes from question 29b and the relationship of the themes to the research questions and theoretical frameworks of the research study.

Table 3:4

Matrix of Emerging Themes From Question 29b

Emerging	Fear of God	University	Teaching	Religion	Blending
Theme:		as a cultural	both good	should not	
		universe	and evil	influence	
				scholarship	
Parallel in	Pattern VIII	Pattern III	Pattern VI	Pattern I	Pattern VII
Beaty &	Complete	Limited	Limited	No	Unlimited
Lyon	Integration	Integration	Integration	Integration	Integration
Typology					
Parallel in	Regulative	Cognitive	Normative	Normative	Cognitive
Scott &	Institu	Institu	Institu	Institu	Institu
Colbeck	tionalization	tionalization	tionalization	tionalization	tionalization
Process					
Model					

CHAPTER FOUR

FINDINGS – FIVE EMERGING THEMES

This research project has been designed to examine the levels if any, of institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model among faculty members at a private university in Nigeria. The preceding chapters have introduced the research project, the bodies of literature that inform the project and the methodology that has been used to gather and analyze the data. In this chapter, the data resulting from the different parts of the questionnaire will be utilized in generating the findings for this research project.

This chapter presents the findings of the research that resulted from the thematic analysis of the written responses of the faculty members in the study. First I present the themes that emerged from the analysis by order of the frequency of use of terms in five sections. In presenting the themes, I present selected narratives of written responses from respondents that describes the theme that is featured. Following the presentation of the narratives, I discuss the relationship of the theme to the subject of institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model. Finally I discuss the interpretation of the faculty members of the theme.

Five major themes emerged from the main open-ended qualitative question in the survey instrument in this research study. Statements of perspectives of faculty members expressing their feelings and opinions on integration of faith and learning at the institution are rendered as short narratives in sections and subsections that emerge from

the coding strategy. In this chapter responses to Question 29b that was designed to elicit from the respondents their opinions and thoughts about the relationship that should exist between faith and learning if any, in the major activities faculty members had to perform in higher education, are rendered as narratives for analysis.

A major question confronting a school like Ebony University is the degree to which faith and learning should be related. (For example, should religious beliefs influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research?)

Please provide a brief explanation of your perspective on faith and learning.

In analyzing the responses to this question, five themes that emerged are: the fear of God, the university as a cultural universe, teaching both good and bad, religion should not influence learning, and blending or co-existing.

There were 28 written responses to this question and the theme that emerged as the most prominent one was "the fear of God." Of the 28 responses, 6 were assigned to this theme because of the strong references to the fear of God and the centrality of Christ in education and the acquisition of knowledge. This theme emerged the most pre-eminent of all others, with the greatest weight in number of references and language. In this chapter, I will treat each of the themes in relation to the subject matter of the integration of faith and learning and the implications for the level of institutionalization the institution maintains from the perspective of the faculty members.

Fear of God

The idea of the fear of God evokes different feelings in anyone who has some measure of understanding of spirituality. For some it evokes dread and trepidation for God as someone to be scared of or to be afraid of. For others the fear of God is about reverence and awe that has nothing to do with being scared or afraid. Still for some the fear of God is about expressing one's love for God in submission to His revealed will. In the references cited in this section, there is a diversity of meanings that seems to be pointing to the fact that God needs to be the central theme or focus in Christian higher education to get the desired results of integrating academic learning with the Christian faith.

Spirituality is the foundation of all human endeavors, just as the fear of God is the beginning if wisdom. Spirituality and education should blend into an inseparable hybrid entity and should remain as such under all conditions.

Consequently knowledge and understanding should be integrated and concretized into the fabric of religious principles and practices. Respondent #2.

A second respondent indicated that...

The fear of God is the beginning of wisdom. All learning revolves around the above passage and any program without God is bound to fail. Therefore emphasis must always be placed on God, then other knowledge will follow. Respondent #5. Following a similar pattern, another respondent states,

Jesus Christ is the author if wisdom and knowledge. The Scripture says 'Does anybody lack knowledge let him ask of Him that gives liberally and does not reproach.' Any education without Jesus Christ is valueless. Since the students are the future leaders their education should be based on the pillar of ages; the rock of ages, the I am that I am, Jesus Christ, our Lord and Savior. The Scripture says "First seek ye the kingdom of God and all its righteousness and all other things shall be added unto you. Respondent #15.

The absolute nature of these responses put them in the realm of what Benne (2001) refers to as "orthodoxy". This is a situation where the institution is overtly fundamentalist Christian and unashamedly so to the point of requiring faculty members and in some cases students subscribe to a statement of beliefs they must sign to become a part of the academic community. This corresponds to Litfin (2004) "systemic model" and "affirming colleges" a category that emerged after the 1966 Report of the Danforth Commission, Church-Sponsored Higher Education in the United States, came out with four categories, Defender of the faith college, non-affirming college, free Christian college and the church-related university. The affirming college category was a creation of some evangelical churches who felt their strong position of orthodoxy was not adequately represented in the preceding categories. I have chosen to refer this as "absolute integration" or "the fear of God factor" in Christian higher education.

The reason why this category was chosen is the absolute nature of the responses that refers to the Judeo-Christian God as the final authority in matters of education. "The fear of God is the beginning of wisdom. All learning revolves around the above passage

and any program without God is bound to fail". There seems to be no middle ground with this position in the minds of the respondents. The following statement expresses the severity of this position: "Education without spirituality is incomplete education". Yet another respondent provides a definition for spirituality as follows: "spirituality means being sensitive to the teachings and instructions of God". This is an all or nothing proposition in the minds of those who favor this position in the relationship between faith and learning in higher education. This position is fundamentalist and to some degree extreme in its portrayal of the involvement of God in higher education.

The impression one gets from all these statements is that God, the Judeo-Christian Supreme Being, who is co-equal and co-eternal with Jesus Christ in Christianity, is the creator of all that is seen, known and done on earth. "Education without the knowledge of God is zero". "Any education without Jesus Christ is valueless". One draws the inference from these statements that God, and Jesus Christ constitute the Source and the Fountain head of all knowledge. This means that God knows science, history architecture, literature and even astronomy, since he made all things and in Jesus Christ all things hold together. It can be safely concluded that the 'fear of God' supercedes any other thing in the minds of some of the respondents in this study. They have so indicated in their responses that God comes first and foremost in their process of assessment and assimilation of any thing in the realm of academics and spirituality. The curriculum of Ebony University is not all religion and no objective academic subject matter content. The faculty members who teach at this institution are qualified to teach different subject areas of disciplinary specialties. The focus of this research is to discover how the faculty

members feel about the requirement by the university administration to include or encase their subject matter in a spiritual garb that will remain faithful to the academic discipline in question as well as transmit moral values and critical thinking skills to the students. The tone of several respondents who articulated this theme of the fear of God seem to be suggesting that a fundamentalist position of viewing the requirements of God to teach the fear of God is the best way to do Christian higher education. Other respondents take a different view on this position, as will be shown later.

What is the fear of God? As defined by the Meriam Webster's On-line Dictionary (2006), 'fear' is "to have a reverential awe of". 'Reverence' is "honor or respect felt or shown: Deference; especially: profound adoring awed respect" and 'Awe' is "an emotion variously combining dread, veneration, and wonder that is inspired by authority or by the sacred or sublime." These definitions expose the underlying assumptions that form the foundation of the 'fear of God' train of thought among the faculty members.

God is not only reverence and held in highest honor, he is the reason for all human existence and all human endeavor. Therefore all efforts at acquiring and transferring knowledge through education is God's idea and he has the template on how it can be best carried out.

Absolute integration of faith with learning that is predicated by the fear of God may seem extreme for academics to accept. The issue of academic freedom in such an environment may raise questions that imply an imbalance between fairness to academic disciplines and Christian beliefs. Is it possible to objectively tackle the complexities of any given academic discipline when seemingly saddled with the weight of Christian

values and allegiances to God? Russell Kirk (1955) compares the level of academic freedom that exists in universities in his day to that of the medieval times and concluded that,

Far from repressing free discussion, this framework (Christian framework) encouraged disputation of heated intensity almost unknown in universities nowadays...They were free from a stifling internal conformity, because the whole purpose of the university was to search after an enduring truth...They were free because they agreed on this one thing, if on nothing else, that the fear of God is the beginning of wisdom (p.18).

Defining the fear of God to mean the freedom to express one's opinion without the fear of condemnation is definitely a welcome position for faculty members who believe in God yet are not convinced that everything they teach must be translated into *Christianese* in order to pass as integration of faith and learning. A level of integration of faith that starts with the individual faculty member's posture of relating to the students from a humane behavioral standpoint speaks volumes to the issue of integrating faith with academic learning. To be treated shabbily and in a dishonoring fashion by a professor who brandishes the Bible in his or her Chemistry class is an abuse of the fear of God and would not pass for the integration of faith and learning. In the eyes of these faculty members, being a Christian faculty member who values the place of God in scholarship does not exempt one from the values of the academy which advocates responsibility to the truth, scholarly integrity and responsibility to one's students (Holmes, 1975). Christian orthodoxy and fundamentalism are definitely not

the yardstick for measuring the level of an individual's alignment with the principle of integrating faith with learning. This principle can be taught as is the case in some institutions including the one in this research project, yet it is better caught with the heart than with the head. It is not unusual for faculty members seeking employment at a Christian institution to be required to sign a statement of beliefs or a creed. The American Association of University Professors asks that the conditions of employment that includes signing a statement of beliefs be clearly stated at the time of appointment. However, signing such documents does not necessarily make one committed to the institutional goal of seeking to integrate the Christian faith with academic learning.

In the next section, the idea of the fear of God in a Seventh-day Adventist institutional context will be discussed to reveal the theological mindset of the average Seventh-day Adventist with regard to the idea of the fear of God. It is intended that this section will inform on the importance and impact of the fear of God in Adventist theology since 64 percent of the total respondents in this research project are self-reporting Seventh-day Adventists.

In the analysis of the data 15 percent of the respondents, self-identified Seventh-day Adventists, articulated the fear of God theme as compared to the 64 percent Seventh-day Adventists in the study. This creates a category that is worthy of further examination to explain the reason for so few individuals articulating a view that is supposed to be a cardinal belief of Seventh-day Adventists. One possible explanation

² See the American Association of University Professor' 1940 statement reprinted in Academic Freedom and Tenure, ed. By Louis Joughin (University of Wisconsin Press, 1967), p. 33-39.

is that Seventh-day Adventists in academe are not as fundamentalist as those in the mainstream.

Seventh-day Adventist View of the Fear of God

Teaching at an Adventist institution of higher education comes with its own peculiar slant on the 'fear of God'. The creed of the Seventh-day Adventist Church is deeply rooted in the prophetic books of Daniel and Revelation which forms the basis of the main doctrines of the denomination. One of the cardinal teachings of the Seventh-day Adventist Church is the 'three angels messages' of Revelation 14:6-12. The Church sees as its mandate from God the preaching of these unique messages which are self-described as the 'everlasting gospel'. This passage forms the bedrock of the mission of the Seventh-day Adventist Church (Ministerial Association, 2005).

Then I saw another angel flying in the midst of heaven, having the everlasting gospel to preach to those who dwell on the earth—to every nation, tribe, tongue, and people saying with a loud voice, "Fear God and give glory to Him, for the hour of His judgment has come; and worship Him who made heaven and earth, the sea and springs of water. And another angel followed, saying, "Babylon is fallen, is fallen, that great city, because she has made all nations drink of the wine of the wrath of her fornication. Then a third angel followed them, saying with a loud voice, "If anyone worships the beast and his image, and receives *his* mark on his forehead or on his hand, he himself shall also drink of the wine of the wrath of God, which is poured out full strength into the cup of His indignation. He shall be tormented with fire and brimstone in the

presence of the holy angels and in the presence of the Lamb. And the smoke of their torment ascends forever and ever; and they have no rest day or night, who worship the beast and his image, and whoever receives the mark of his name." Here is the patience of the saints; here *are* those who keep the commandments of God and the faith of Jesus.³

The first angel calls on all the inhabitants of the earth, specifying the reference to language groups, nations, people groups and tribes as a means to emphasize the international nature of the reach of the 'everlasting gospel'. The Seventh-day Adventist Church is an international Church that has a presence in 198 of the 207countries recognized by the United Nations. The message of the first angel in Revelation 14:7 opens with the phrase 'fear God' which is the most prominent theme in the findings of this research study.

To 'fear God' or to hold God in reverential awe is taught at all levels of Seventh-day Adventist education and extra curricular activities from the 'cradle to the grave'. Revelation 14: 6-12 is required as a memory text for different levels of Christian education work with the Seventh-day Adventist Church educational structure. Creatorship is given as the reason for the call to fear God. If God made all things that we see and know then it stands to reason that he knows them well and can give human beings insight on how to best understand these things and pass our understanding to others. It out of the theme of Creatorship as expressed in this passage that Seventh-day Adventist derive the mandate for the seventh-day Sabbath which forms the first part of

³ Revelation 14:6-12. New King James Version © 1982 Thomas Nelson

their name. An extension of the theme of Creatorship in this passage is the theme of Lawgiver that is connected to the fourth commandment of the Ten Commandments of Exodus 20. From the foregoing the basis for fearing God or giving him reverential awe begins to take shape in an understanding of God as Creator and Lawgiver. The idea of an Investigative Judgment, the Cleansing of the Sanctuary and the Close of Probation are denominational symbols and artifacts derived from this Bible passage. Another view of God as our High Priest or Advocate in the investigative judgment increases the sense of awe for God among Seventh-day Adventists.

Others teachings within this passage and that have a very strong influence on the lifestyle and worldview of Seventh-day Adventists include, the fall of Babylon, the Mark of the Beast, the number of the Beast and the lake of fire. These symbols and concepts hold a lot of awe and respect among devout Seventh-day Adventist Christians, hence they contribute significantly to their understanding of the phrase 'fear God'. To be considered a matured Seventh-day Adventist Christian, an individual needs to understand and be able to articulate clearly the three angels' messages of Revelation 14:6-12. Of the 45 questionnaires analyzed in this research project, 64.4 percent of all the respondents self-identified as members of the Seventh-day Adventist Church. The next group that self-identified as Pentecostal Christians formed 22.2 per cent of the total number of respondents. The numbers indicate a majority of the respondents (faculty members) are members of the Seventh-day Adventist Church. All 45 respondents agreed with the mission statement of the institution, which uphold Christian standards in the exercise of academic duties at the institution. In the findings

of this research project, 60 percent of those responding to the fear of God theme self-reported as Seventh-day Adventists, while 15 percent reported as Pentecostals, 8.5 percent reported as Baptists, 8.5 percent as Roman Catholics and another 8 percent as Anglicans. It is therefore logical to conclude that the fear of God that informs the position of the respondents is one of a judge who will hand down judgment to those who are not compliant to set rules and standards. This kind of fear of God will not be well received in an academic environment where religious freedom and academic freedom provide the objectivity needed in the pursuit of academic excellence.

Table 5.1 shows the distribution by denominational affiliation among the faculty members at the Ebony University.

Table 4.1

Distribution of Denominational Affiliation among Faculty Members at

Ebony University

Denomination	Number Present	Percentage
Seventh-Day	29	64.4
Adventist		
Baptist	1	2.2
Pentecostal	10	22.2
Non-	2	4.4
Denominational		
Methodist	0	
Anglican	1	2.2
Catholic	1	2.2
Muslim	0	
Other-Evangelical	1	2.2
Total	45(n)	100

An observation from the data that balances out the denominational affiliation question is the number of individuals who received their Bachelors degree from Ebony University. Out of 45 respondents 6 received their Bachelors degree from Ebony University and 38 received their Bachelors degrees from public universities and non-

Seventh-day Adventist institutions. The impression that this presents is one of balance to the image of indoctrinated and narrow minded individuals coming from just one perspective in their approach to life and teaching. The data also indicates that 75.6 percent of the faculty members have been employed at Ebony University for between one to five years while 22.2 percent had been employed at the institution for between five to ten years and 2.2 percent have been employed at the institution for over eleven years. This data indicates a heavy infusion of new blood, hence new ideas into the veins of the institution in recent times. Religious allegiance and practice hold a very high place in the Nigerian society that is not inhibited by the academic or social standing of the individual. Hence, the posture of the fear of God is not restricted to Seventh-day Adventists at Ebony University or any other university. The idea of the separation of church and state is not enforced in the universities and colleges as it is in the United States. Teachers are allowed to proselytize in the classroom in public schools and particularly private Christian colleges and universities. It is necessary to note that six of the respondents had references to the fear of God in their answers. This is the largest group of responds yet not in the majority as twenty-two other respondents gave a variety of answers that differed from the fear of God.

The fear of God position reveals a level of adherence to orthodoxy on the part of few of the members of the academic staff of the university, hence a tendency for proselytizing among the students by such staff members. The framing of the responses of these staff members articulate an advocacy for overt parochial practices that will give the institution an obvious religious outlook. Dress code and other forms of

Christian standards of outward behavior and conformity become very important and prominent in institutional life.

God holds a very prominent position in the theology, worldview and the mandate of Seventh-day Adventists to preach the everlasting gospel as presented in Revelation 14:6-12 to the whole world which includes academic institutions. Colleges and universities are perceived as ripe evangelistic fields from which a harvest of converts can be reaped. By God we refer to the Deity, Father, Son Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit. Liftin (2004) refers to the lordship of Jesus Christ as being the driving force for institutions in the systemic model of Christian higher education. By the lordship of Jesus is meant a total declaration that Jesus Christ is Creator of all things, Sustainer of all things, the Goal of all things; Redeemer of all things, and Judge of all things. The goal of institutions in the systemic model is "to make Christian thinking systemic throughout the institution, root, branch and leave (p. 18)." From the positions held by some faculty members who can be described as "absolute integrationists" Ebony University can be described as a systemic model institution that puts the lordship of Jesus Christ foremost above every other thing. This is the image portrayed by those respondents categorized under the fear of God theme, but heavily challenged by other faculty members in their responses.

It is evident from the data analysis that less than 15 percent of the respondents support the fear of God position even though that theme emerged as the largest single grouping of ideas presented by respondents. The emergence of five themes from 28 written responses indicates that there were a diversity of opinions and positions held by

the faculty members. The next four themes that will be presented and discussed reveal the other positions held by faculty members relative to the integration of faith and learning at this private Christian university in Nigeria.

In the next section the position of other faculty members that balance out the absolute integration position is presented. This position is labeled, "university as a cultural universe." The position held by the respondents in this theme reveals the thought pattern of individuals who recognize the place of the academy as a sociocultural entity that has some unique features that are worth honoring.

University as a Cultural Universe

This section is a presentation of the views of respondents who believe in the principles that distinguish higher education institutions from all other educational and social entities. The proponents of the view of a university as a cultural universe suggest that there are certain cultural conventions that are unique to a university and that these cultural conventions of an academic environment should be respected and protected from erosion from outside and inside sources. The narratives that are presented in this section portray the views of the respondents on the perspective that the university is a cultural universe.

Really the school should moderate the integration of faith and learning because the university is a universe on its own a cultural universe of all learning. A conventional university ought to be a laboratory for experimenting all types of ideas. More so university scholars ought to be able[sic] to articulate their thoughts and freely express them. This is the essence of a university. Respondent #6.

Education should be influenced by religion (if that is what you refer to as spirituality) but not to the extent of limiting students and lecturers' access to information/knowledge. The university, as an institution, has a culture and standard. Therefore nothing should adversely affect the quality or standard of teaching, research and service. Respondent #10.

Four of the 28 respondents who provided written responses presented positions similar to the ones expressed above. Of these four respondents two self-reported as Pentecostals, one as a Seventh-day Adventist, and one did not declare his or her religious affiliation. Two of the respondents were from the College of Education and Humanities, one from the College of Science and Technology and one from the College of Management and Social Sciences. Three of the respondents were males and one was female. Three of the respondents were Masters degree holders and one a doctoral degree holder. These responses represent less than 10 percent of the whole data, yet significant in its acknowledgement of the conventions of universities as a socio-cultural entity that needs to be viewed in its uniqueness.

In the literature, universities have been described variously by organizational theorists as an 'organized anarchy' (Cohen and March, 1974), 'loosely coupled systems' (Weick, 1976), 'a professional bureaucracy' (Mintzberg, 1979), and as a complexity of a professional bureaucracy, a university collegium and a political system (Baldridge, Curtis, Eker, and Riley). Some of the characteristics that mark a university are goal ambiguity, client service orientation, problematic technology, professionalism,

and environmental vulnerability. These characteristics form the cultural lenses through which higher education institutions are generally viewed. The culture of an institution is described as the dominant behavioral or belief pattern that holds the institution together or that reflects what the institution looks like (Kuh & Whitt, 1988). Widely held institutional values that are acknowledged in academic environments include, academic freedom, tradition of collegial governance, academic integrity, honesty, intellectual achievement through research and the student's social-emotional well-being. The dominant value of research universities is the culture of inquiry in research while the dominant value of liberal arts colleges is the commitment to undergraduate teaching.

The culture of a Christian colleges and universities vary from what Robert Benne (2001) has described in a typology of Christian universities and colleges as: orthodox, critical mass, intentionally pluralist and accidentally pluralist. In his view, Christian universities and colleges move within a continuum of very sectarian to very secular. The position of these institutions as far as Christianity and the Christian cultural lifestyle and value system, depends on what the sponsors of the institution deem as being authentic and useful for the cause they are pursing.

According to Benne(2001), the institutions described as fitting within the orthodox category are those who insist on the Christian lifestyle and ethos being the rallying point for their engagement in the academic enterprise. The lordship of Jesus Christ is the first and foremost motif for recruitment of faculty and staff and the training of Christian young adults to a commitment to Christ is the ongoing purpose of

the institution. The faculty in the orthodox institutions is required to sign a statement of beliefs by the administration in order to be extended a teaching contract by the university. The Council of Christian Colleges and Universities (CCCU) with their headquarters based in Washington D.C. fit in this first category of the culture of Christian colleges and universities. Their mission is "to advance the cause of Christ-centered higher education and to help its institutions transform lives by faithfully relating scholarship and service to biblical truth (CCCU Website)." This description takes into account the intentionality on the part of the institutions to pursue what is defined as a "Christ-centered" higher education. Faculty members are recruited for their academic abilities but more so for their desire to pursue a vocation of scholarly ministry to their students. Students are recruited with the intention of transforming their lives through academic and spiritual tools skillfully handled by well-informed and willing faculty members.

Liftin (2004), differentiates between the orthodox institutions and the critical mass institutions by applying two models, systemic and umbrella models. The systemic model is one where all the different branches of the institution are poised to advance the cause of the lordship of Jesus Christ through sound intellectual pursuits as well as integration of spirituality with the learning on the part of the faculty members. The umbrella model on the other hand provides and environment where different world views are allowed to thrive side by side under a Christian canopy of acceptance and dominance. That is the Christian worldview is the dominant view expressed and favored by the institution but tolerant of other views on campus because the sponsoring

organization of the institution have a critical mass of presence and influence in the running of the institution. Critical mass institutions focus on providing an environment where students are free to embrace Christianity in the face of other competing views and therefore believed to be able to make a more intelligent and genuine choice of faith.

The intentionally pluralist institutions are Christian institutions that have a presence in the leadership of the institution who are in the minority as far as influence and direction of the institution. This position assumes neutrality regarding the integration of faith and learning with the faculty taking no position at all as far as Christianity is concerned. "Faced with competing ideologies, students will be victimized by the most outspoken and persuasive" (Mannoia, 2000. p.117). The dominant factor is usually a secular humanist view of higher education that seeks to be tolerant of all other views yet not partial to the Christian worldview. The continued Christian allegiance is only a formal effort to acknowledge the sponsoring organization which has become irrelevant to the educational process on the university campus. The president and some board of trustees represent the voice of the sponsoring organization in the running of the institution (Benne, 2001). Accidentally pluralist institutions are secular institutions that have a Christian past that they are still holding on to for appearance. They are not in touch with the wishes of the sponsoring and are keener on following the wishes of rational academic excellence over any appearance of Christianity.

The theme of "university as a cultural universe" seeks to present an argument for protecting the institution from itself, in a sense that will make the university deviate from the original purpose of objective academic excellence in an environment of academic freedom. The narratives seem to suggest that the respondents are asking for freedom to innovate and experiment with every kind of human endeavor without the fear of reprimand or censure. The current challenge for this position may lie in where to draw the line between academic freedom and indiscretion on the part of faculty members or students. Respondent #6 again,

Really the school should moderate the integration of faith and learning because the university is a universe on its own a cultural universe of all learning. A conventional university ought to be a laboratory for experimenting all types of ideas. More so university scholars ought to be able[sic] to articulate their thoughts and freely express them. This is the essence of a university. Respondent #6.

The fear of lose of academic freedom and free expression of ideas in research topics that are chosen for experiments and further exploration seems to be the concern that echoes from this statement. To the question "Do you have more freedom at Ebony University to teach your subject matter in a way you feel is appropriate than you would at other universities, or do you have less freedom here than you would have elsewhere?" The options were: 1. more freedom and 2. less freedom. 87 per cent of the respondents said they had more freedom while 13 per cent said they had less freedom. To this question respondent #6 said he has less academic freedom while respondent #10 said he has equal academic freedom, hereby introducing a new category that was not included in

the questionnaire. The two respondents have been at Ebony University for less than five years. Respondent #6 self-identified as being from the College of Education and Humanities while respondent #10 self-identified as being from the College of Science and Technology. What seems to emerge from these responses, in the fact that some faculty members feel a pressure from the university administration to implement a curricular model that is basically foreign to their academic orientation. The tension is therefore between remaining faithful to their respective academic disciplines and complying with the institutional expectations.

To the question "the current approach to academic freedom and religious devotion (institutional values) at Ebony University is: 1. About right, 2. Leans too much in favor of academic freedom, and 3. Leans too much in favor of religious freedom." 67 per cent expressed that it was about right, 11 per cent indicated that it leaned too much toward academic freedom, while 22 per cent indicated it leans more toward religious devotion. It seems that a significant number (almost a quarter of the respondents) among the faculty members are of the opinion that there is something wrong with the position of the institution relative to religious devotion. It is therefore necessary to examine the reasons behind these feelings.

To the question "During the last decade, has the emphasis shifted concerning the concepts of academic freedom and commitment to faith." The options are 1. No, it has not changed 2. Yes, it had shifted towards community service and 3. Yes, it has shifted towards greater commitment to faith. The responses reflect lack of a shift in emphasis in the concepts of academic freedom in favor of religious commitment. 80 per cent of

respondents maintained the lack of a shift, while 12 per cent indicate a shift towards community service and 8 per cent indicate a shift towards greater commitment to faith. The evidence favors academic freedom and spirituality co-existing side by side in Christian university without a loss of momentum for either one. The 12 percent who indicated a shift toward community service may be actually reflecting a concern relative to the institution's neglect of academic freedom in favor of community service which they (faculty members) may have interpreted as face-saving efforts on the part of the institution. It is also possible that the 8 percent that indicated a greater shift toward commitment to faith may be actually presenting a position that indicates a reduction in academic freedom in favor of commitment to faith. Overall 20 percent of the respondents indicate that the institutional values take precedence over academic freedom and that is significant.

Of 45 faculty members in the study, 84 per cent earned their bachelors degrees and graduate degree in other institutions other than Ebony University. 13.3 per cent earned their degree from Ebony University. This indicates to a large degree, the position of some of the faculty members with regards to conventional university values and how they should be enforced at Ebony University. This data suggests that these faculty members who earned their degrees from other public universities have no experience with private Christian university environments, since the phenomena of private universities is relatively new to Nigeria. Private universities were approved for operation in 1999 with three institutions granted accreditation to operate universities.

It is noteworthy that 57.8 percent of the faculty members in the study possess their Masters degrees from public universities in Nigeria, while 24.4 percent possess their PhD or doctoral degrees to teach at Ebony University. 11.1 per cent of the faculty members possess their Bachelors degrees and mostly work as graduate assistants at the institution. This ratio gives the relatively young university the leverage to appreciate the values of the academic environment through the lenses of the faculty members who teach there. Of the faculty members in the study 11.1 per cent are graduate assistants, 13.3 per cent are lecturer III, 31.1 per cent are lecturer II, 13.3 are lecturer I, 22.2 per cent are senior lecturer rank, 4.4 per cent are associate professor rank and 4.4 per cent are full professor rank. 26.7 per cent are in the College of Education and Humanities, 40 per cent are in the College of Management and Social Sciences, and 33.3 per cent are in the College of Science and Technology.

Table 4.2

Distribution of Faculty Members at Ebony University by Academic Ranking

Rank	Number	Percentage
Graduate	5	11.1
Assistant		
Lecturer III	6	13.3
Lecturer II	14	31.1
Lecturer I	6	13.3
Senior Lecturer	10	22.2
Associate	2	4.4

Professor		
Full Professor	2	4.4
Total	45	100

In the next section, the views of respondents who believe that the students in a university are short-changed if given a Christian perspective to issues are expressed under the theme, "teaching both good and bad."

Teaching Both Good and Bad

This theme comes across as a reaction to the institutional mandate for faculty members to implement the integration of faith and learning curricular model. This position may be understood as one that is suggesting that students be exposed to the whole spectrum of thought and opinions without censorship, allowing the students to pick and choose from whatever they are given by faculty members in class.

I don't think, spirituality should choose the topic that will be discussed in the class because if you should do so the students will not be complete in their learning but rather student should be taught but [sic] both the good and bad as required by the court and allow them to choose the right from the wrong.

(Respondent # 9)

Not really, all topics should be taught, giving the world view and the Christian perspective however there should be emphasis on the Christian perspective

because all true knowledge comes from God. This is integration of faith and learning in the true sense. (Respondent # 17)

The emphasis of the respondents indicates a desire for neutrality in the materials taught to the students. The language used by respondent #9 reflects a duality of purpose which may be born out of a desire to be fair to the students by presenting all sides of an issue even if that means exposing students to questionable material. The intent of the respondents may be to allow a free flow of information, similar to the theme that emphasized that the university is a cultural universe of its own and therefore there should not be any interference with academic freedom. The phrase "as required by the courts" introduces the element of compliance to certain legal requirements that are possibly well known to members of the faculty. If the institution by not introducing certain topics for inclusion in the curriculum is running afoul of the law, then there should be measures taken to assure appropriate compliance.

Respondent #9 suggests students will be short-changed if faculty members hold back some things in the teaching or research process. Every subject or topic can be presented as long as there is discretion shown in the areas of cultural and moral sensitivity. This definitely would include subject areas such as evolution, abortion, and areas that may be deemed controversial in Christian circles. The academic brief that forms the basis of the curriculum of the institution is approved by the National Universities Commission, which has oversight on all universities in Nigeria. The 2004 annual academic audit by the Committee on Monitoring of Private Universities

(COMPU) of the National Universities Commission gave Ebony University the following commendations:

Large-scale infrastructural development generally and improvement in the quality and quantity of academic staff; furnishing the laboratory complex with state-of the-art equipment; entrenching academic and moral discipline among its staff and students; effectively deploying ICT in registration exercise; effectively deploying the interest of parents and alumni in the development of the university (COMPU, Report 2004, p.vii.).

Therefore the possibility of sliding under the bar for non-compliance is checked by the external governing agency from the federal government. On the other hand, the forthrightness displayed by the respondents in declaring that there should be freedom on the part of the faculty members to expose the students to divergent views as presented by different authors without the fear of censorship or criticism from the university administration is desirable in a university setting. Faculty members do not have to look over their shoulders or fear being reported by students if they present views that are somewhat divergent from the mainstream views in class. Their research work may also have controversial topics as long as they respect the rules of academic decency and decorum.

To the statement, "If conflicts develop between academic freedom and fundamental SDA doctrines, Ebony University should, in most cases, preserve academic freedom even if it reduces SDA support, financially and otherwise, for the University."

26.6 percent of the respondents agreed with the statement, which is a very significant

number of faculty members indicating that academic freedom is more important than organizational financial support. The fact that faculty members responding in this theme also indicated a need that "emphasis should be on the Christian perspective" shows a normative or even cognitive institutionalization mode relative to these faculty members. This is because this position is a balanced position that allows the faculty members to be themselves as they carry out their duties in the institutional environment holding a position that morally sound and conceptually correct.

In the next section, the position of faculty members who differ completely in their views from that of the institutional expectation is expressed. This theme is presented as "religion should not influence scholarship," which implies a separation of both categories from each other into different independent compartments.

Religion Should Not Influence Scholarship

This theme presents the views of faculty members who believe that the realm of academics and the realm of spirituality should remain separate and distinct. This position seeks free those who are not fully convinced about God and the need to worship him from a sense of feeling forced to worship God.

The worship of God is a spiritual reality, out of one's free will and accord. The degree to which spirituality and education should be related is out of the question since no one is being forced to worship God. Therefore religious beliefs should not in any way influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, etc. (Respondent #23.)

Religious beliefs should not absolutely influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research. But that not withstanding, there should be a little reflection especially on religious issues relating to moral building so as to benefit both the students and the nation at large. (Respondent #25.)

Religious beliefs should not influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach their material or the way they do research.

Minimum emphasis should be placed on religion because God does not recon [sic] with religion. A person's belief in Jesus Christ and His work of redemption is what God is interested in. we should all manifest Christ in our individual lives rather than carry religion in the hypocritical way that is being done right now. (Respondent #26.)

The positions expressed in the narratives suggest the respondents are opposed to the idea of integration of faith and learning as a wholesale curricular strategy in higher education. There are two strands or thought patterns presented in the narratives; the first suggests the teaching of moral values, but recognizing the need for refraining from forcing the worship of God on members of the academic environment; and the second strand differentiates between Christianity as a concept to be considered carefully and religion as a separate entity. In the first strand the teaching of moral values is encouraged, but as sideline and not a main focus for the institution. As respondent 23 noted "The worship of God is a spiritual reality, out of one's free will and accord." "Freewill" as

applied in this statement refers to an individual's ability to make decisions about spiritual things without external cohesion of any kind on the part of the institution. The focus in this theme could be seen as "the separation of church and school," borrowing from the idea of "separation of Church and State" as it occurs in religious liberty situations.

Respondent #26 puts a different twist on the statement by introducing the element of salvation through Jesus Christ as the focus of Christianity rather than "religion." There seems to be a differentiation in the mind of the respondent between the terms "Christianity" and "Religion." A definition from an internet source that fits the definition of the respondent states: "Christianity is not a religion; it is a personal relationship with Jesus Christ." Religion, on the other hand, is defined by Meriam-Webster as: the service and worship of God or the supernatural or commitment or devotion to religious faith or observance. From the definitions and statements on both Christianity and Religion, it is evident that Christianity is about the person of Jesus and devotion to his person, whereas religion is ardent belief or faith in anything including but not restricted to the deity, God.

For respondent #26, his or her response is more about a war of words than about the integration of faith and learning as a curricular and pedagogical model for institutions, Christian or otherwise. The reference on the response to the "hypocritical way" in which integration of faith and learning is accomplished suggests that the effort to implement the integration of faith and learning has met with some opposition, based on faculty behavior that is unchristian and which casts a shadow on the ongoing effort to pursue the integration of faith and learning. Hence the evidence of an existing struggle among

⁴ This definition of Christianity was taken from: http://www.religioustolerance.org/christ.htm

faculty members to maintain a Christian stance yet to avoid an empty profession of Christianity which amounts to hypocrisy and insincerity at best.

The "Religion should not influence scholarship" position, in a general sense, represents an opposition to the integration of faith and learning that challenges the position of the university's mission statement. The individuals who hold this position must feel tension of having to maintain a pretense of complying with the expectations of the institution which conflicts with the sense of wanting to follow their consciences. It is evident from the small number of respondents that answered this way that they are in the minority yet not insignificant when the purpose of this study project is considered. Three out of 27 written respondents expressed the opinion that "religion should not influence" what is taught or choice of research work. This represents 11.3 per cent of the total responses submitted for analysis. This number when considered in light of the previous theme that suggested that the university should teach both good and bad presents a normative institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model at Ebony university, since we have faculty members who are operating the curricular model from a moral and conceptual position.

In the next section the position of faculty members who believe that academic learning can be infused with Christianity without injury to either concepts is expressed. The proponents of this position take the view that both faith and learning have their values that need to be acknowledged and empowered in the institution of higher education.

Blending

This is the fifth and last of five themes that emerged in the coding and analysis of the data. The heading or title of this theme "Blending" represents a value system that expects the existence of spirituality and academic integrity side by side in the university or college set-up. This implies a desire to see faith and learning inter-mingled in a way that allows students the benefit of both worlds. This is different from the fear of God theme in its rather laidback and balanced approach to the integration of faith and learning in an academic environment without rupturing either one. "If education and plus morals is good then education and spirituality must co-exist because education without the knowledge of the true God is zero" (Respondent #5). This faculty member conveys the thought that an institution that expects its students to develop morally as well as intellectually must include spirituality in its overall strategy. Another faculty member viewed education and spirituality as companions:

As far as I am concerned, spirituality cannot be divorced from education. They are coterminons [sic] companions. Religious beliefs as propagated by the Adventist movement should influence the choice of topics teachers explore in their class, the way they teach the material or the way they do their research" (Respondent #11).

This view that sees education and spirituality as companions distributes the weight of value equally to both education as intellectual pursuit and spirituality, a pursuit of the knowledge of God. A student choosing to attend a Christian university is expecting to find evidences of moral influences that are present in the atmosphere due to the posture of the institution as a Christian institution. The same goes for faculty members who apply

to work in this environment, who should expect to find Christian artifacts, customs and norms practiced and upheld in the institution.

Another faculty member compares the current trend of integration of faith and learning that is practiced by some Christian institutions in the United States and advocates the benefits of this practice for other institutions including the university in this study:

In America, one of the most liberal societies of the world, the need for religious and moral instruction has once again taken the front-burner. It is imperative that spirituality and education should be blended to provide students with the right kind of instruction. This is with a view to preparing them to meet the challenges of the world pervaded by evil and moral decadence. The teacher must know how to integrate faith with learning and explain the biblical truths to the students in spite of the theories they must have taught the students (Respondent #18).

The expectation of this respondent is that faculty members in the institution of higher education must make the effort to learn and master the art of integrating faith with learning not minding the subject matter that was being considered. Another faculty member suggests how this can be carried out. "Spirituality and education must be related that is the concept known as integration of faith and learning in Ebony University. In every subject morals and religious beliefs can be applied. Religious beliefs should be employed in the style on imparting knowledge in a subtle manner albeit" (Respondent #19). The position proposed by the respondents in this category suggests a balance between spirituality and Christian expectations and academic integrity in the classroom.

The terms "co-exist," "blended," "related," and "cannot be divorced" suggest a respect for the function of each aspect of the relationship. These respondents believe that spirituality has a legitimate role to play in the educational process and therefore cannot be relegated to the back burner. The role of spirituality in this category is to provide the moral compass for the students' character development while they are in the academic environment. The function of the academic subject matter is to impact the students' intellectual lives and provide the knowledge base they will need to function in the world of work. Hence, spirituality provides a philosophy of living while academics provides the knowledge and functional capacity to survive in the real world. Mannoia (2000) advocates a blending of spirituality with scholarship that results in students who can tackle real life problems from a Christian perspective as a result of the quality of education they have received.

Liberal education that produces sound and balanced students, like love, has to be free and not forced (Holmes, 1975). There must be a sense of freedom to express one's self without the fear of repression and reprimand. At the same time faculty members are acting responsibly in guiding the students in the quest for knowledge without violating boundaries of propriety and sensitivity to their (faculty member's) environment and audience. Duane Liftin (2004), in *Conceiving the Christian College*, suggests a voluntary principle for achieving this balance between institutional expectation and individual conviction:

In the case of Christian colleges, the assumption is not that an individual's affirmation of the institution's statement of faith produces the conviction; in fact,

it is critical for the institution's identity that this emphatically not be the case. The sincerely held conviction must predate the affirmation, with the affirmation serving merely as a vehicle of its heartfelt expression. This is the Voluntary Principle at work (p. 223).

The choice of any faculty member to work at a Christian institution is a freewill decision to contribute to the lives of people in the next generation coming behind. A Christian university should of necessity provide an environment for this to occur without the pressure of overt Christian behavior being enforced on the faculty member. By the same token any faculty member signing a statement of beliefs to teach in a Christian institution should of necessity understand the responsibility placed on him or her to pursue an orderly conduct that is devoid of vulgarity, obscenity and inappropriate decorum. This charge is placed on anyone in the academic community regardless of race or creed. The American Association of University Professors' statement on professional ethics informs on the expected standards practiced by professors everywhere:

As teachers, professors encourage the free pursuit of learning in their students. They hold before them the best scholarly and ethical standards of their discipline. Professors demonstrate respect for students as individuals and adhere to their proper roles as intellectual guides and counselors. Professors make every reasonable effort to foster honest academic conduct and to ensure that their evaluations of students reflect each student's true merit. They respect the confidential nature of the relationship between professor and student. They avoid any exploitation, harassment, or discriminatory treatment of students. They

acknowledge significant academic or scholarly assistance from them. They protect their academic freedom.⁵

This statement that calls faculty members to order as far as their conduct is concerned moderates the need for a religious injunction to treat students with respect and fairness. The position of the respondents in this theme of blending academic learning with Christian faith presents a view of a cognitive institutionalization of the integration of faith curricular model at Ebony university since faculty members advocating this view see the need to allow the institutional values to exist side by side with the faculty members personal efforts with their academic disciplines and their religious faith.

_

⁵ Retrieved from: http://www.aaup.org/AAUP/pubsres/policydocs/statementonprofessionalethics.htm

CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION

Levels of institutionalization of integration of faith and learning at Ebony University

The purpose of this confirmatory case study research is to use the "institutionalization process model" (Colbeck, 2002) to study the levels of institutionalization of integration of faith and learning among faculty members of three colleges at a private Christian university in Nigeria. Colbeck (2002) analyzed the steps in the process of the institutionalization of any curricular reform or innovation in higher education categorizing such processes as regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization, or cognitive institutionalization. Regulative changes occur in organizational structures because compliance to particular rules is expedient with sanctions for non-compliance; normative changes occur in organizational values because compliance to the changes is deemed to be morally and legally appropriate; and cognitive changes occur in the beliefs and behaviors of the participants and these impact the fundamental aspects of social life.

Pfeffer (1982) suggests that institutionalization theory addresses how and why meanings, forms, and procedures come to be taken for granted in an organization. In this study, the form that is taken for granted is the integration of faith and learning curricular model adopted by some Christian higher education institutions. Just as the integration of service learning has become a large part of higher education in general (Bringle and

Hatcher, 2000), the integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model is prevalent among those Christian universities and colleges intent on establishing the lordship of Jesus Christ over every dimension of their academic enterprise.

The purpose of the first research question was to establish from the findings how the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology finds a correlation in this research study at Ebony University, a liberal arts university in Nigeria, i.e., "How are faculty members at Ebony University internalizing the integration of faith and learning curricular model according to the Ream, Beaty, and Lyon (2004) eight-pattern typology?" The Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology focuses on a gradual progression from no integration to limited integration then on to complete integration categories at four religious research universities in the United States of America. Table 6.1 shows the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology of Integration of Faith and Learning at Four Religious Research Universities.

Table 5.1

Typology of Integration of Faith and Learning at Religious Research Universities

- i. Pattern I Faith and Learning are Separate and Independent
- ii. Pattern II Limited Integration: Integrated in CampusEnvironment but Not Curricula
- iii. Pattern III Limited Integration: Individual and Private but NotCurricular

- iv. Pattern IV Limited Integration: Individual and Public but notCurricular
- v. Pattern V Limited Integration: The Place of Faith in Curriculum– Very Limited
- vi. Pattern VI Limited Integration: The Place of Faith in Curriculum– Limited and Specified
- vii. Pattern VII The Place of Faith in the Curriculum Virtually
 Unlimited because of Ethics
- viii. Pattern VIII Complete Integration

(Ream, Beaty and Lyon, 2004)

In the research project conducted at Ebony University in Nigeria, five themes emerged from the data analysis and a correlation was sought between the themes and the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology. The "Fear of God," "University as a cultural universe," "Teaching both good and bad," "Religion should not influence scholarship," and "Blending" emerged as themes from the data analysis and they compare to some degree with the categories in the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology. Table 6.2 shows the areas of convergence between the two typologies.

Table 5.2

Convergence points between Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) Typology and

Olaore (2006) Typology.

Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004)Typology	Olaore (2006) Typology
Pattern I – Faith and Learning are Separate	No integration – Religion Should not
and Independent	Influence scholarship
Pattern II – Limited Integration: Integrated	
in Campus Environment but Not Curricula	
Pattern III – Limited Integration: Individual	University as a Cultural Universe
and Private but Not Curricular	
Pattern IV – Limited Integration:	
Individual and Public but not Curricular	
Pattern V – Limited Integration: The Place	
of Faith in Curriculum – Very Limited	
of Future in Curriculum Very Emineu	
Pattern VI – Limited Integration: The Place	Teaching Both Good and Bad
of Faith in Curriculum – Limited and	
Specified	

Pattern VII – The Place of Faith in the	Blending
Curriculum – Virtually Unlimited because	
of Ethics	
Detterm VIII Commiste Interrustion	From of Cod. Complete Internation
Pattern VIII – Complete Integration	Fear of God - Complete Integration

In the course of the data analysis, three reasons for variance in the outcomes were observed and identified. The first variance in the results points to the fact that five patterns emerge from the study of this particular small liberal arts university in Africa as compared to eight patterns that emerged from the previous study of University of Nortre Dame, Baylor University, Brigham Young University and Boston College, four highly successful religious research universities in the United States. The size of the sample and the context of the sites play a key role in determining the results arrived at by the research project in Nigeria. The Nigerian research project started out with 150 questionnaires distributed at Ebony University which has a total faculty membership roll of 164, with 75 questionnaires returned and 45 being usable for the research.

The second variance to consider is that the first study took into consideration three different Christian denominations, Baptist (Baylor University), Roman Catholic (University of Notre Dame and Boston College) and Latter Day Saints (Brigham Young University). The current study considers only one Christian denomination, the Seventh-

day Adventist Church. This factor of multiple denominations introduces an element of diversity of views and a broader range of possible responses from which to select themes and emerging patterns. It therefore stands to reason that eight patterns could emerge in the United States study compared to five in the Nigerian study. The five themes reflect the limited range that is possible with 45 respondents, compared to 1,728 respondents in the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) study.

The third variance in the outcomes is that the current study was conducted in Nigeria, West Africa, while the comparative study it confirms was conducted in the United States. The differences in the general cultural climate towards Christian values and norms impacts the results of both studies. The Nigerian Christian environment is generally considered more conservative and more tolerant of Christian values than the United States. There is more freedom to express one's Christian beliefs on a secular university campus than there is in the United States, where there can seem to be outright hostility against Christian values on secular university campuses (Mannoia, 2000). The perceived conservatism on the part of African scholars in general tends to indicate a higher sense of commitment to Christian values than elsewhere, particularly when compared to the United States. Seventh-day Adventists in Africa are considered more conservative than the Seventh-day Adventists in the United States. Therefore, it is no wonder that the responses from the survey in Nigeria echo strong absolutes of what should obtain in the institutional setting as indicated by some of the respondents. Words such as "all," "must," "should," and "always" indicate a strong expression of the absolute nature of the belief system of what should obtain in the institution. These expressions

appear under the heading of "the fear of God." These absolutes also illuminate the cultural climate in which the institution operates and the expectations to which students and faculty are held.

In addition, the level of importance attached to the fear of God in the Nigerian higher education sector is also underscored by the reality of secret cults whose activities include ritual killings and sexual harassment that occur on some of the university and college campuses in Nigeria. Rotimi (2005) traces the history of cults in Nigerian universities to the 1953 establishment of the Pyrates Confraternity at the University College Ibadan, with noble laureate Professor Wole Soyinka as the first Captain. The group was formed to provide an avenue for training young African students about the values of chivalry, anti-colonialism and anti-tribalism, ideals which were much needed at that time in the history of Nigeria as a nation. Within two decades of its founding, the group was high-jacked by individuals and functionaries in the university and government establishment for private, selfish, and evil ends. Currently there are male and female cults that engage in various nefarious activities that lead to intimidation, maiming, killing of students and lecturers on university campuses around Nigeria.

As part of the effort to curtail the activities of these cults, decrees have been promulgated by the previous military government of Nigeria and legislation to that end passed at the federal House of Representatives. The resultant effect is that the groups have gone further underground to perpetrate their activities. The Nigerian Tribune (2003) reported that Moshood Abiola Polytechnic, a non-sectarian school held a retreat that brought together Christians and Muslims on campus to pray and seek God for the

deliverance of their institution from the grapple hold of cults. Ogunbameru (2004) identifies the lack of parental involvement and neglect as one of the main causes of these cultic activities among university students. It is believed that low morality and low self-esteem make students who are depressed and lonely easy prey for recruitment into cults.

Despite these three variances, there is a strong correlation between this study and the findings of the Ream, Beaty and Lyon (2004) typology of patterns of integration of faith and learning among Christian faculty members in research universities in the United States. There are strong reasons to affirm that the analysis of the data bears out the belief that there are faculty members at Christian universities who are working from a sense of commitment to a cause, such as integrating the Christian faith with academic learning. The majority of the faculty members in the Nigerian study were very expressive about the need to separate religious faith from academic learning without infringing on academic freedom and without loosing a commitment to Christian faith. The assertion of Colbeck (2002) that cognitive institutionalization of a curricular reform occurs when the members of the organization express the values of the reform through their beliefs and behaviors holds true in the case of Ebony University. The challenge to this position would be the fact of faculty members who falsify data and tamper with survey materials in the interest of boosting numbers. These behaviors indicate a regulative or resistive stance on the part of the faculty members in the study.

The second research question examined the levels of institutionalization of integration of the faith and learning curricular and pedagogical models observable among faculty members at Ebony University i.e., "At what level is 'institutionalization'

perceptible at Ebony University through the eyes of faculty members according to the Scott (1995) model of regulative, normative and cognitive institutionalization?" In this chapter we will examine the impact of the findings of the research study on the institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model at Ebony University. The data indicates that the beliefs and behaviors of the faculty members at Ebony University reflect a cognitive level of institutionalization. 100 per cent of the respondents indicated a positive support of the institution's mission statement. This, according to Colbeck (2002), is an indication of regulative institutionalization since the mission statement constitutes an integral part of the structures of the organization. The institutional staff handbook also forms another element in the structures of the organization, with its injunction t the faculty that they are "To provide students, in the context of the Biblical world view, with the knowledge and skills they need to live a useful, life discovering and realizing their vocation, achieving self-sufficiency, contributing to the well-being of society and the progress of Ebony University, and committing themselves to their God-given talents throughout their lives."

The level of normative institutionalization is reflected in the jointly held institutional value systems shared by the 64.4 per cent of faculty members who indicated their denominational affiliation as Seventh-day Adventist. The National Universities Commission Committee on the Monitoring of Private Universities (COMPU) report for 2004 indicated that the institution had a critical mass of faculty members who held to the same Christian value system that informs their compliance to the prescribed curricular

-

⁶ Ebony University Staff Handbook, p. 198, section D, subsection 1, 2002-2005.

model: "It is observed that the University had restricted itself to recruiting academic staff from the Seventh-day Adventist community." ⁷ In response to the statement: "Ebony University guarantees its academic staff the freedom to explore any idea or theory and to publish the results of those inquiries, even if the ideas question some fundamental SDA beliefs and practices" 74 per cent of the respondents disagreed while a total of 26 per cent agreed. This data indicates a sense that a sizable percentage of the faculty members were willing to defend the need for academic freedom to foster the academic responsibilities they were charged with as faculty members. As have been presented in the previous chapter on the findings, the majority of faculty members responding to the questions indicated a need to uphold academic freedom through the themes of "religion should not influence scholarship," "blending," and "teaching both good and bad."

The third and final step, cognitive institutionalization, takes into account the beliefs and the behaviors of the participant. The beliefs and the behaviors held and demonstrated by the members of the faculty of Ebony University indicate cognitive institutionalization, that is, the level at which the reform or practice is taken for granted or is perceived as business as usual. This level indicates diffusion of the practice to all levels of the organization, with activities that indicate that the practice is accepted and is being taught as the culture of the organization. This is the case with faculty members at Ebony University. The behaviors of the faculty members indicate a genuine appreciation and engagement in the institutional values and norms of integration of faith and learning from a genuine and authentic moral and conscientious standpoint. A statement from the

_

⁷ National Universities Commission, State of Private Universities in Nigeria, Report of 2004, Annual Monitoring and Quality Assurance of Private Universities in Nigeria, Executive Summary, Page vii.

Ebony University Academic Brief indicates a philosophy of Christian discipleship of the student population by the teachers:

To develop genuine Christian character motivated by love and controlled by steadfast principle, thus preparing the individual for self-government and self-discipline. To nurture spiritual sensitivity and awareness. To teach and encourage internalization of Christian doctrine and practice as believed and taught by Seventh-day Adventists.⁸

The other side to this claim is the evidence of corrupt and dishonesty practices in research administration demonstrated by the faculty members in earlier part of this study. An effort to balance out this situation is the expression of a desire to maintain academic freedom at a high cost and the expression of a need for members of the university community to be free to express themselves without the fear of sanctions.

A statement made by one of the respondents about creating an atmosphere where religious devotion can be nurtured speaks to the sentiments of the faculty members about what should operate at Ebony University. "Religion is a personal relationship with God. However, the "atmosphere" should be such as to encourage constant devotion to the Almighty God." Respondent #12. The responsibility of the faculty is to create a conducive atmosphere through their own lifestyle choices and the students will pick up on that rather than overt Christian preaching or teaching.

The third research question asks "To what extent are the responses shaped by religious affiliation, academic rank and gender of the faculty members?

⁸ Ebony University Academic Brief – 25 Year Development Projection – 1996-2021. Proposal for the establishment of Private University, June 1996. Page. 7.

It is believed that providing an enabling environment in which faculty members who are committed to the cause of a morally focused and critically challenging higher education can operate without feeling tied up or at risk of loosing their jobs is a good place to start. An enabling environment is a conducive atmosphere for achieving the desired purpose of functioning as a faculty member in a given educational institution of higher learning.

There are different ways in which this can manifest in an organization, on a corporate or structural level or on personal individual level. Pfeffer (1982) suggests that some employment practices and organizational arrangements become culturally accepted and come to be defined as good; they therefore lead to expectations that condition employees to respond in certain prescribed ways to certain contexts. Such practices and arrangements can be described as the corporate or structural level of an enabling environment that is in place before an employee is hired to the organization. In the case of Ebony University, there are at three levels at which this enabling environment is created and maintained in order to contribute to the internalization or institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model. The first level is the Federal Ministry of Education in Nigeria acting through the agency of the National Universities Commission that gives affirmation to the integration of faith and learning through the official report of the Committee on Monitoring Private Universities (COMPU). The report affirms the production of graduates who are disciplined and have the fear of God (COMPU Report, p.iii). Empowerment at the highest level of educational

oversight in Nigeria definitely provides encouragement to the faculty members who are working at mentoring and training students to become good and morally upright citizens.

On the institutional level, there are three stages at which the structural enabling environment can be realized and effected. The first is the sponsoring organization or denomination that operates the institution. The second level is the university administration that is on site to carry out the wishes of the sponsoring organization. The third level is the department that oversees the day to day affairs of its faculty members. These three levels together make up the corporate or structural level of the enabling environment in which faculty members nurture the desire and commitment to integrate faith and learning. In the case of Ebony University, the denomination or sponsoring organization is set up to provide evangelism and enlightenment through higher education. The sponsoring organization, in this case the Seventh-day Adventist Church, working through its standards and accreditation agency (Accrediting Association of SDA Education Institutions), sets the standards for its baseline expectation for the delivery of quality Christian higher education and expects the various institutions under its jurisdiction to comply with these standards. Its stated purpose is to evaluate the quality of the denominational institutions' academic programs, financial structure, physical facilities, student services and their implementation of the Seventh-day Adventist philosophy in order to foster the unity and mission of the Church." In addition, it "evaluates the quality of the process of the integration of faith and teaching methodology" (Ebony Staff Handbook, 2002, p. 200).

Clearly the expectation from the highest regulating body for the sponsoring organization is qualitative integration of faith and learning. This, according to Colbeck (2002) constitutes the regulative institutionalization of the innovation. There is no way around it, if one plans to remain at the institution, then one will need to meet the expectations of the institution, in this case Babcock University. The local institution's administration has a mandate to carry out the wishes of the organization if the institution is to remain part of the larger body. To dissent is to alienate oneself from the denomination. This is a price too high to pay; hence, the general practice of staying in compliance. The governing board or the board of trustees is chaired by the highest ranking church officer in the geographical region where the institution is located; the board itself is made up of sub-regional leaders, both lay and professional clergy. To say there is a high expectation that the institution will to comply with the wishes of the denomination would be an understatement. At that level, the enabling environment is also regulative, demanding compliance and enforcing it through sanctions against and consequences for non-compliance. The institution's departmental level deals with faculty evaluations and recommendations for tenure and promotion, which means that for faculty members there is another layer of expectation to deal with. For a person who wants to be in that environment these layers are not a problem; the challenge lies in knowing how to implement and meet the expected standards. The next level to consider is the personal or individual level of enabling environment.

Individuals who apply to teach in a Christian liberal arts university are aware of the peculiarities of the environment. Some apply with the intention of teaching from a Christian perspective; others apply just because they need a faculty job in their subject area (Wagner, 2006). Those who take such a position because they are committed to the philosophy of Christian education are willing to submit themselves to the philosophy of, in the case of Ebony University, Seventh-day Adventist education. The staff handbook spells out the details of this philosophy:

It [Ebony University] is a community of learners committed to the truth and guided by a statement of philosophy, mission, vision and objectives congruent with the Seventh-day Adventist message and mission, crafted jointly by Administration, faculty and board, and reflected in all the programs and activities of the University (Staff Handbook, 2002, p.196).

The statement on teaching and non-teaching staff notes that:

Ebony University has a professionally qualified faculty and staff committed to the Seventh-day Adventist message, mission, lifestyle, and to the education of young men and women for a useful life "in this world and in the world to come." The institution implements an initiation program for new faculty; promotion in academic rank follows a clear process (Staff Handbook, 2002, p. 196).

The expectations as spelt out in the Staff Handbook implies a consensus in understanding on the part of faculty members who desire to join the institution.

In theory the personal or individual enabling environment level is self-crafted and developed for the benefit of both the individual and the institution. The vision of the individual to make a difference in lives of his or her students as a representative of God in the classroom should be the driving force for the individual or personal enabling

environment level. Many already share this vision before coming to the institution and the institutional staff development plan only serves as an enhancement to a person who is already self-motivated. The focus in the personal or individual enabling environment is the desire to find satisfaction in a vocation and not just the need for a job. The work environment becomes a mission field and the faculty member a missionary. The students are co-actors in the drama of discovery and learning. The learning process becomes a two-way street, where teachers and learners are taught at the same time, one by giving and the other by receiving in a continuous cycle of learning. Integration of faith and learning is therefore not simply about the students, but also about the teacher who is committed to the mission of making disciples, replicating the Christian virtues of faith and love in a laboratory of human subjects through divine objects.

Some of the statements of faculty members on what they believe the goals of the institution should be shed light on their commitment to preserving an enabling environment for Christian growth and maturity and the integration of faith and learning among both students and teachers. The following answers to question #8 - "What should be some other goals of the university?" - reflect some of the thought of faculty members:

- "Ensuring that students have at least a fair knowledge of God",
- "Maximum welfare scheme for staff training and development",
- "Develop the spirit of love for God and men in the students",
- "Empowering students to meet the challenges of marital life and unemployment", "Extending knowledge via spirituality",

- "Preaching the gospel to make both the members of academic staff and students to be genuinely born again",
- "Encourage moral development through mentoring",
- "Grooming them(students) to be good leaders",
- "Developing the student's ability for independent study and thinking; maximum possible emphasis",
- "Providing holistic education maximum possible emphasis"
- "Develop the students commitment to their Creator and His principles and laws",
- "Developing the students spiritual values"
- "Empowerment program for self actualization"
- "Provide students with high quality education",
- "Nurture spiritual, physical, mental sensitivity and awareness Impress upon the students a sense of Good citizenship".

These statements reflect a personal commitment on the part of faculty members to seeing that the mission of the sponsoring organization to disciple the students into fully matured adults who can function effectively in the society is fulfilled.

Other contributing factors enhancing the institutionalization of integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model include, religious or Christian denominational affiliation of faculty members. 64.4 per cent of the faculty members indicated in the survey that they are Seventh-day Adventists, 22.2 per cent indicated that they were Pentecostal Christians, 4.4 per cent indicated they were Baptists, 4.4 per cent

indicated they were Anglican (Church of England) while another 4.4 percent indicated they were Catholics. The data reflects that everyone has a Christian confession of one version or another hence the predominant religious affiliation is Christian with the majority being Seventh-day Adventists. The gender makeup of the individuals in the study indicates that 77.8 percent are male while 22.8 percent are female. The data also reveals that 75.4 percent of the respondents in this study are between the academic classification of lecturer II and full professorship. Therefore being a Seventh-day Adventist male lecturer over the lecturer II rank is a dominant factor in the institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model at a regulative level at Ebony University.

Conclusions and Recommendations:

As previously stated, the purpose of this research study is to utilize "Institutionalization Process Model" (Colbeck, 2002) to study the levels of institutionalization of integration of faith and learning among faculty members at a Christian university in the Nigeria with the intent of providing a diagnostic analysis of the institution in response to the findings of the study. One of the goals of this research was to standardize a survey instrument that will be useful in higher education institutions for measuring the levels of institutionalization of curricular innovation and reformation. In my opinion the purposes of the research study have been met in the process of the study. This research has shed light on the thought patterns of faculty members relative to the free exercise of their academic roles in teaching, research and service in a Christian

university as well as gauging the level of institutionalization of the existing institutional curricular model, integration of faith and learning.

The emergence of five categories of thought and response to the existence of the integration of faith and learning curricular model for the institution reveals the richness in the divergent view points held by Christian faculty members, the majority of whom are from the same faith community, the Seventh-day Adventist Church. The emergence of the 'fear of God' as one of the dominant expressions of some of the faculty members' position on the reason for integration of faith and learning, presents a dynamic tension of views on what is actually going on in the minds of the faculty members. Other faculty members expressed through their written responses that a fundamentalist or absolutist position is not the only opinion held among faculty members at the institution in this research project. Even though the data indicates that those who presented a view on "the fear of God" are in the majority as far as coding grouping and sorting is concerned, the majority of faculty members favored a more balanced approach to academic freedom and expressions of spirituality.

The instrument used in this study was developed by a team of scholars at Baylor University in Waco Texas. They had employed this instrument at four religious research universities to collect data relevant to the measurement of the levels of operation of the integration of faith and learning curricular model. The results from Baylor University team's study generated a typology that was used as a standard of measurement in the Ebony University study. The findings indicate that given the unique nature of the current

study and the limited scope of the sample, there are some variants in the results. These variants have been discussed in the previous section.

The following recommendations are suggested as a result of the findings and conclusions drawn from this study. The first recommendation is that the Baylor University questionnaire be employed as a diagnostic tool for studying any Christian institution of higher education interested in knowing the levels of institutionalization of the integration of faith and learning curricular model as the case may be. This will bring out the levels of comfort or discomfort felt among faculty members on specific issues relative to the operations of their respective institution. It is evident from this study that the integration of faith and learning curricular model has its strengths and weaknesses as far as implementation and operations are concerned. It is therefore imperative that steps be taken to find out how the faculty members are doing without necessarily putting any particular individual on the spot. The scope of the instrument (Baylor University Questionnaire), covers a wide enough range of areas within higher education and spirituality so as to capture a wide range of responses and reactions to issues such as; academic freedom, diversity, practices of spirituality in academia, and expressions on hiring practices among many others.

The second recommendation will be to acknowledge the introduction of the "fear of God" as a relevant factor in higher education in Nigeria. Given the cultural significance of the fear of God and other religious themes among some African cultures such as the Yorubas of southwestern Nigeria, it is reasonable to propose that the question of the 'Fear of God' be given serious thought and attention during curricular and

pedagogical design and implementation within higher education. The fear of God is valued in the Nigerian academic environment because of the need to instill in the academic community the dependence of human beings on the creator and sustainer of all life and activities. This is corroborated by a statement published in the 2004 report of the Committee on Monitoring of Private Universities, the National Universities Commission, the regulating agency for universities in Nigeria, affirmed the place of the fear of God in higher education in Nigeria:

Quality Graduates: The Committee noted that the private universities have all it would take to produce quality graduates that are disciplined, have the fear of God, possess leadership qualities and are job creators and not job seekers (COMPU Report, 2004, p. iii.).

The statement attributed to the Committee on Monitoring Private

Universities about the fear of God and discipline observable on private university

campuses deserves commendation and follow-up by the university authorities around

Nigeria. Phenomena that may pass for the fear of God may differ from one campus to

another or from one religious tradition to another, yet the fear of God or respect for God

is recognizable in any language and tradition.

The third and final recommendation deals with the need to allow the fifth emergent theme "blending" to inform the decisions of the institution's administration in the balance they need to strive for in academic excellence and spiritual excellence.

Academic excellence should not be allowed to languish at the expense of spiritual excellence. A statement from the Holy Bible, the sacred scriptures of Christian states:

"So that you may approve the things that are excellent, in order to be sincere and blameless until the day of Christ." ⁹ There is a need to be viewed by both the internal and external constituencies as being a place that values academic excellence and academic integrity as well as spiritual excellence and spiritual integrity. One way to achieve this is to create an environment where faculty members are constantly affirmed for their effort by the university administration through newsletters and personal letters of commendation that acknowledge their efforts at academic excellence and the infusion of an atmosphere of spirituality and critical thought in the classroom. The offices of the university pastor, quality assurance and academic planning working together are able to create a teacher-friendly yet student sensitive model of integrating faith and learning in the challenging environment described in this study.

Implications for future research include the need to conduct a similar research project among faculty members at a Roman Catholic institution. Given the frequency of the fear of God in this project, a Seventh-day Adventist linguistic skewing of the data may be occurring, based on the heavy usage of the fear of God language in Seventh-day Adventist theology. Other possible future study sites may be among faculty members at an Islamic or Jewish College.

⁹ Philippians 1:10. New American Standard Bible. (1995)The Lockman Foundation.

APPENDIX A: SUBJECT'S CONSENT FORM

SUBJECT'S CONSENT FORM

Project Title: Using "Institutionalization Process Model" (Colbeck, 2002) To Measure The Institutionalization Of "Integration Of Faith And Learning" Among Faculty Members Of Three Colleges At A Private Christian University In Nigeria.

You are being asked to read the following material to ensure that you are informed of the nature of this research study and of how you will participate in it, if you consent to do so. Signing this form will indicate that you have been so informed and that you give your consent. Federal regulations require written informed consent prior to participation in this research study so that you can know the nature and risks of your participation and can decide to participate or not participate in a free and informed manner.

PURPOSE -You are being invited to participate voluntarily in the above-titled research project. The purpose of this project is to determine the level at which integration of faith and learning is operating at Ebony University (pseudonym) among faculty members of three colleges at the institution.

SELECTION CRITERIA - The Principal Investigator or a member of his/her study staff will discuss the requirements for participation in this study with you. To be eligible to participate, you must be academic staff member. A total of 150 individuals will be enrolled in this study locally.

PROCEDURE(S) - The following information describes your participation in this study which will last up to forty five minutes [45minutes]

RISKS -None

BENEFITS- There is no direct benefit to you from your participation.

CONFIDENTIALITY- All participants are anonymous. All the information gathered for this research will be under secure lock and key in the Center for the Study of Higher Education for the next three years after this project and subsequently shredded and burnt after that time.

PARTICIPATION COSTS AND SUBJECT COMPENSATION -There is no cost to you for participating except your time.

CONTACTS

You can obtain further information from the principal investigator Israel Olaore PhD Candidate, at (520) 977-6724. If you have questions concerning your rights as a research participant, you may call the University of Arizona Human Subjects Protection Program office at (520) 626-6721. (If out of state use the toll-free number 1-866-278-1455.)

AUTHORIZATION

Before giving my consent by signing this form, the methods, inconveniences, risks, and benefits have been explained to me and my questions have been answered. I may ask questions at any time and I am free to withdraw from the project at any time without causing bad feelings. My participation in this project may be ended by the investigator or by the sponsor for reasons that would be explained. New information developed during the course of this study which may affect my willingness to continue in this research project will be given to me as it becomes available. This consent form will be filed in an area designated by the Human Subjects Committee with access restricted by the principal investigator, Israel Olaore PhD Candidate. I do not give up any of my legal rights by signing this form. A copy of this signed consent form will be given to me.

Participant's Signature	<u>Date</u>
-	
Signature of Investigator	Date

APPENDIX B: RECRUITMENT MATERIAL/COVER LETTER

Israel Bamidele Olaore 588 East Sterling Canyon Dr. Vail AZ 85641 520-977-6724

Sunday, April 02, 2006

Dear Member of Academic Staff

My name is Israel Bamidele Olaore, a PhD candidate at the Center for the Study of Higher Learning at the College of Learning, University of Arizona. I am collecting data towards my PhD dissertation in Organization and Administration. My dissertation topic is:

Using "Institutionalization Process Model" (Colbeck, 2002) To Measure The Institutionalization Of "Integration Of Faith And Learning" Among Faculty Members Of Three Colleges At A Private Christian University In Nigeria.

I am humbly requesting your participation in this study which I believe will benefit the purpose of Ebony University which says: "Ebony University is established as a tower of truth and knowledge, to offer high quality professional, pre-professional, general and vocational learning to prepare men and women for responsible, dedicated and committed service to God and humanity.

Please take some moments out of your busy academic and personal schedule to help me fill out this questionnaire and give it back to the designated Research Associate at Ebony University within the next three to four days.

Please sign the consent form attached to this document.

Thank you. May the Lord continue to bless your unique work at Ebony University.

Yours Sincerely,

Israel Olaore

APPENDIX C: QUESTIONNAIRE FOR SURVEY

FAITH AND LEARNING¹⁰

A SURVEY OF EBONY UNIVERSITY ACADEMIC STAFF MEMBERS

 $[\sqrt{\ }]$ Please put a $[\sqrt{\ }]$ at the beginning of the statement that best represents your response to each question. [Example: As appears in at the beginning of this statement]

- I. According to the Ebony University Mission Statement (*Ebony University Staff Handbook*, 2002-2005) "Ebony University is established as a tower of truth and knowledge, to offer high quality professional, pre-professional, general and vocational learning to prepare men and women for responsible, dedicated and committed service to God and humanity.
- 1. Do you endorse the mission statement?

Yes

No

To What Extent Should Ebony University Emphasize the Following Goals?

2. advancing knowledge through research

maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

3. extending knowledge through undergraduate teaching

maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

4. extending knowledge graduate teaching

maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

-

¹⁰ The format and basic outline of the survey instrument was developed by Dr. Michael Beaty and Dr. Larry Lyon both of Baylor University. Adapted by permission of the authors.

5. training students for productive careers maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

6. encouraging the students' moral development maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

7. developing the students' sense of civic responsibility maximum possible emphasis moderate emphasis minimum emphasis should not be a goal

8. other goals: (Please write)

To Meet its Academic and Faith-Related Goals, Ebony University Should:

9. hire academic staff who have achieved a high degree of academic prominence, and whose religious

commitments are deeply significant to them.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

10. search for and hire academic staff who share the institution's religious commitments and have achieved academic promise or prominence, even if it means that the department may have to functions short-handed until such a candidate is found:

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree 11. hire academic staff who have achieved the highest levels of academic prominence, regardless of

religious beliefs or commitments:

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

12. guarantee its academic staff the freedom to explore any idea or theory and to publish the results of

those inquiries, even if the ideas question some fundamental SDA beliefs and practices:

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

13. admit students without preference based on their religious beliefs or commitments strongly agree

agree disagree strongly disagree

14. actively strive for a diverse ethnicity in students.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

15. allow the academic staff to read and discuss anything in the classroom they believe pertains to what they are teaching even if the material questions some fundamental SDA beliefs and practices:

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

16. require specific academic courses designed to help students to think more critically about their moral commitments:

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

17. require specific academic courses designed to help students to think more

critically about their moral commitments and to help them live more virtuous lives:

```
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly disagree
```

18. require specific academic courses designed to help students think critically about their civic responsibilities.

```
strongly agree
agree
agree disagree
strongly disagree
```

20. require specific academic courses designed to help students think critically about their civic responsibilities and to help them be good citizens.

```
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly
disagree
```

20. require courses that provide technical, work-related skills relevant to a successful career.

```
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly disagree
```

21. require religion courses in the scholarly study of the scriptures.

```
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly disagree
```

22. provide an academic environment that encourages students to develop a well-thought-out

```
philosophy of life.
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly disagree
```

23. provide an academic environment that encourages students to develop a well-thought-out

Christian philosophy of life.

```
strongly agree
agree
disagree
strongly disagree
```

24. encourage students to attend university devotionals.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

25. encourage academic staff to attend university devotionals.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

26. require students to attend university devotionals.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

27. require academic staff to attend university devotionals.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

28. require students to attend ward and stake meetings.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

29. require academic staff to attend ward and stake meetings.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree. 29b. A major question confronting a school like Ebony University is the degree to which faith and learning should be related. (For example, should religious beliefs influence the choice of topics teachers explore with their class, the way they teach the material, or the way they do their research?)

Please provide a brief explanation of your perspective on faith and learning.

30. At Ebony University,

faith and learning issues

need more discussion.

faith and learning issues are

discussed sufficiently.

faith and learning are

the focus of too much discussion.

33. Ebony University's distinctive task is: (check all those with which you agree) to offer the best possible learning in a caring environment.

to provide an atmosphere congenial to authentic faith - that is to encourage faith and learning.

to prepare students for service within the SDA Church

to consider Christian perspectives more than others in the core curriculum.

to integrate faith and learning - that is, to identify and develop the relationships that exist between the Gospel and secular knowledge as expressed in various academic disciplines.

32. Since Ebony University strives to be a Christian university, the encouragement of both faith and learning are important tasks; but theses are separate tasks and ought not to be integrated.

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

34. To help integrate faith and learning, Ebony University academic staff should use the resources of their academic disciplines to illuminate religious issues. (e.g., an anthropologist discusses cultural relativism in a World Religions class, or a psychologists discusses Freud's account of wish fulfillment in a religion class).

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

34. To help integrate faith and learning, Ebony University academic staff should use the truths within the Gospel to illuminate issues in the disciplines other than religion. (e.g., an academic staff member discusses E.G. White's concept of time with a physicist).

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

35. Some academic staff have had little experience in relating faith to learning. If Ebony University were to offer a seminar on faith and learning issues, would you be willing to participate? (Choose the one response that best fits your view)

would like to participate. would be willing to participate. would not be willing to participate

36. To help integrate faith and learning, some courses in Ebony University's core curriculum, beyond those in religion, should include discussions of Christian perspectives: (Check all those with which you agree)

on God,

on the nature of the universe,

on society,

on human beings,

as opportunities arise in the various disciplines, but not systematically, in most disciplines.

37. If I wished to do so, I could create a syllabus for a course I currently teach that includes a clear, academically-legitimate, Christian perspective on the subject.

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

38. If conflicts develop between academic freedom and fundamental SDA doctrines, Ebony University should, in most cases, preserve academic freedom even if it reduces SDA support, financially and otherwise, for the University.

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

39. It is possible for Ebony University to achieve academic excellence and maintain a Christian identity.

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

40. It is possible for Ebony University to achieve academic excellence and maintain a SDA identity.

strongly agree

agree

disagree

strongly disagree

41. Some church-related universities require academic staff to subscribe to doctrinal affirmations or creeds. Do you think Ebony University's SDA identity requires adherence to certain fundamental or doctrinal affirmations (such as the existence of God and Christ as our Lord and Savior) by; (Choose one.)

all academic staff
majority of academic staff
significant number of academic staff
no particular percentage of Ebony University academic staff

42. My Christian beliefs are relevant to the content of my discipline.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

43. My Christian beliefs are relevant to way I teach my discipline.

strongly agree agree disagree strongly disagree

The following are sometimes mentioned as appropriate practices at other Christian University. (Please mark those you currently practice as a teacher; those that you would be willing to experiment with; and those you would not be willing to adopt.)

44. Treat my students with respect

currently practice
willing to experiment
would not be willing to adopt

45. Discuss, when appropriate, personal beliefs with students outside of class currently practice willing to experiment

would not be willing to adopt

46. Discuss faith-related questions raised by class material

currently practice willing to experiment would not be willing to adopt

47. Share personal religious experiences in class

currently practice willing to experiment would not be willing to adopt 48. Lead class in public prayer currently practice willing to experiment would not be willing to adopt

49. Bear testimony in my class currently practice willing to experiment would not be willing to adopt.

50. Other practices.(Please indicate)

51. Based on your understanding of Babcock's procedures and policies for interviewing and hiring new academic staff:

Too much emphasis is placed on the candidate's religious views. About the right emphasis is placed on the candidate's religious views. Not enough emphasis is placed on the candidate's religious views.

52. During the last decade, the role of religion at Ebony University has: (Choose one)

Become prominent Become less prominent Remained the same

53. The current approach to academic freedom and religious devotion (institutional values) at Ebony University is:

About right

Leans too much in favor of academic freedom Leans too much in favor of religious devotion

54. During the last decade has the emphasis shifted concerning the concepts of academic freedom and commitment to faith?

No, it has not changed

Yes, it has shifted towards greater academic freedom Yes, it has shifted towards greater commitment to faith

55. Do you have more freedom at Ebony University to teach your subject matter in the way you feel is appropriate than you would at other universities, or do you have less freedom here than you would have elsewhere?

more freedom

less freedom

56. What level of stress (if any) do you associate with the need to integrate faith and learning at Calvin College?

No stress

Minimum stress

Medium stress

Maximum stress

57. I have been an academic staff member at Ebony University for

less than 5 years

5-10 years

11-20 years

More than 20 years

58. My Faculty is:

Learning and Humanities

Management and Social Sciences

Science and Technology

59. My rank is:

Full Professor

Associate Professor

Senior Lecturer

Lecturer I

Lecturer II

Assistant Lecturer

Graduate Assistant

60. I received a degree from Ebony University.

Yes

No

61. The highest degree I have earned is:

Bachelor's

Master's

Doctorate

Professional Qualification

Other

62. My religious affiliation is:

SDA

Baptist

Pentecostal

Non-denominational Born-again Christian

Methodist

Anglican

Catholic

Muslim

Other

63. 1 am:

Female

Male

APPENDIX D: PERMISSION FROM AUTHORS OF QUESTIONNAIRE

Israel,

You have the permission of Profs. Beaty and Lyon (the creators) to use the instrument. All they ask is that you give them access to the data. As a result, I would ask that you send the results of your survey to all three of us. I assume you do not have a copy of the instrument. Is that correct? We'll send you a copy if you do not have a copy.

Prof. Glanzer

Perry Glanzer

Assistant Professor

Baylor University

School of Education

One Bear Place 97314

Waco, TX 76798-7314

Perry_Glanzer@baylor.edu

Phone: 254-710-7581

Fax: 254-710-3265

From: Lyon, Larry

Sent: Saturday, March 04, 2006 8:40 PM **To:** Beaty, Michael; Glanzer, Perry L.

Subject: RE: request from doctoral student at Arizona State U

sure

From: Beaty, Michael Sent: Sat 3/4/2006 7:53 PM

To: Glanzer, Perry L. **Cc:** Lyon, Larry

Subject: RE: request from doctoral student at Arizona State U

Sorry, I have been very busy this week. I am fine with his/her using the same questionnaire as long as we have access to the data as well. What about you, larry?

Michael D. Beaty

Professor and Chair

Department of Philosophy

Baylor University

One Bear Place #97273

Waco, Tx 76798-7273

254-710-4806

From: Glanzer, Perry L.

Sent: Tuesday, February 28, 2006 4:47 PM

To: Beaty, Michael; Lyon, Larry

Subject: request from doctoral student at Arizona State U

Mike and Larry,

I received the following letter from a doctoral student at Arizona State University (see below). He's read the article that we co-authored as well as the article you wrote with Todd Ream and it has actually influenced the direction of his research. He also would like to do his dissertation research on Calvin College looking at related questions. His main question is:

What will it take for me to use the same instrument [questionnaire] your team used with the four religious research universities [Baylor, BYU, Boston College and Nortre Dame] at Calvin College among three distinct disciplinary areas?

Since I assume you are the owners of the survey, I told him I'd need to talk to you. Do you have any thoughts?

Perry

Dear Dr. Glanzer,

I read the journal article "Moral Education at Religious Research Universities: Exploring Faculty Attitudes" and discovered that the questions you set out to answer are similar to the ones I am seeking to answer with my research study at Calvin College. Quoting from page 387:

"We examine three major issues among faculty at a select group of religious research universities:

- a. The level of general support for the goals of moral and civic education
- b. The degree of support for specific methods of integrating moral and civic education in the curriculum
- c. The reasons why faculty might disagree with making moral and civic education a university priority or curricular component."

Another statement that caught my attention, found on page 390:

"With regard to moral and civic education, faculty at religious research universities we hypothesized would likely experience a tension between adopting faculty attitudes at research universities who downplay the importance of moral and civic education and exhibiting faculty attitudes of religious liberal arts faculty who show greater sympathy to the goals of moral and civic education."

The literature suggests that faculty will give more allegiance to their disciplines than to the institution and its demands. Ream, Beaty and Lyon, (2004) suggest that "faculty at religious institutions experience a measure of conflict between the professionalism demanded by their disciplines and their allegiance to a particular religious tradition."

(Ream, Beaty and Lyon, 2004. P. 3). Lattuca and Stark [2] (1994) observed that faculty member disciplines and educational beliefs are more influential than contextual factors in the instructor's specific settings such as college goals, student characteristics, available services or student goals. It is therefore incumbent on Christian institutions to evaluate or measure the levels of institutionalization of the curricular and pedagogical models in use at the institutions. This is with the view to addressing the areas of tension that may become evident and to find ways and means to minister to the faculty members affected.

The following questions are the focus of my research study:

- a. To what extent is "institutionalization" of integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical model perceptible among faculty members using the W. Richard Scott institutionalization process model of regulative, normative and cognitive institutionalization? (Scott, 1995)^[3] (Colbeck, 2002)^[4]
- b. To what extent do faculty members express dissatisfaction about institutional expectations resulting from the integration of faith and learning curricular and pedagogical reforms instituted at the college? (Massey and Colbeck, 1994)
- c. In what ways do institutional administrators verify the compliance to the expectations of the institution in the integration of faith and learning by faculty members?

In "Towards a Typology of Faculty Views at Religious Research Universities" (Ream, Beaty and Lyon, 2004), eight patterns emerge to form a typology of faculty perspectives on moral and civic education at religious research universities. The most instructive outcome or result of this typology is that it reveals the levels of faculty receptivity to the notion of integration of faith and learning at the particular institution concerned. Measured on a continuum and weighted for statistical significance in the respective institution, one can draw some conclusions about percentages of "institutionalization" on the integration of faith and learning at different institutions.

I see a connection between the T.C. Ream et al. eight patterns typology and the W. R. Scott three stages institutionalization process model. The Ream et al. typology forms the measuring makers/independent variables while the W.R Scott process model forms the standard/dependent variables.

My question is: What will it take for me to use the same instrument [questionnaire] your team used with the four religious research universities [Baylor, BYU, Boston College and Nortre Dame] at Calvin College among three distinct disciplinary areas?

Please let me know what you think.

Thank you and may God's grace and mercy be with you	•
Yours truly,	
Israel Olaore	

Perry Glanzer

Assistant Professor

Baylor University

School of Education

One Bear Place 97314

Waco, TX 76798-7314

Perry_Glanzer@baylor.edu

Phone: 254-710-7581

Fax: 254-710-3265

Ream, T.C. Beaty, M and Lyon, L., 2004. "Towards a Typology of Faculty Views at Religious Research Universities" Christian Higher Education, 3:1-24.

^[2] Lattuca, L.R. and Stark, J.S. 1994. "Will Disciplinary Perspectives Impede Curricular Reform?" Journal of Higher Education. Vol 65, No 4. (Jul-Aug 1994) 401-426.

According to the "institutionalization process model", institutionalization occurs at three distinguishable levels; regulative institutionalization, normative institutionalization and cognitive institutionalization. (Colbeck, 2002) Regulative institutionalization is the process whereby penalties for disobeying the rules are sufficient deterrent". Normative institutionalization is a process whereby the individuals accept the reforms because "they believe the rules are morally right or to the extent they fear social ostracism if they disobey". Cognitive institutionalization is the process whereby the individuals comply with the reforms because "they find it hard to conceive of any other alternatives". (Colbeck, 2002 p.417)

[4] Colbeck, C. 2002. "Assessing Institutionalization of Curricular and Pedagogical Reform." Research in Higher Education. Vol. 43. No. 4 August 2002.

REFERENCES

American Association of University Professors: Retrieved from: http://www.aaup.org/aaup

Abbot, A. and Chuse, M. 2001. Curriculum Enrichment Strategies For Social Work. Education, Vol.104. No.1

Altbach, P., 2002. Centers and Peripheries in the Academic Profession: The Challenges of developing countries. P.1-23. In P.G. Altbach (ed). The decline of the Guru: The Academic Profession in the Third World. New York, Palgrave.

Baldridge, J., Curtis, D., Ecker, G., and Riley, G., 1977. "Alternative Models of Governance in Higher Education" – Governing Academic Organizations. McCuthan Publishing Corporation.

Benne, R. 2001. Quality With Soul: How Six Premier Colleges and Universities Keep Faith with Their Religious Traditions. Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Berman, P., and McLaughlin, M. W. 1974. Federal programs supporting educational change: Vol. 1. A model of educational change. Santa Monica, CA: Rand Corp.

Bogue, E. and Hall, K. 2003. Quality and Accountability in higher Education: Improving Policy and Enhancing Performance. Praeger Publishers. Westport, CT.

Bringle, R. G. & Hatcher, J. A., 2000. Institutionalization of Service Learning in Higher Education. Journal of Higher Education, May 2000 v71 i3 p273

Budde, M and Wright, J. (Editors) 2004. "Who invited Mammon?" Professional Education in the Christian College and University. By Robert Brimlow in Conflicting Allegiances: the Church-Based University in a Liberal Democratic Society. Brazos Press, Grand Rapids MI.

Burtchaell, J. 1998. The Dying of the Light: The Disengagement of Colleges and Universities from their Christian Churches. Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Burton, L and Nwosu, C. 2003. Student Perceptions of the Integration of Faith, Learning, and Practice In an Educational Methods Course. Journal of Research on Christian Learning v 12 no2 Fall 2003. p. 101-35

Clark, T. 1968. Institutionalization of Innovations in Higher Education: Four Models. Administrative Science Quarterly, Vol. 13, #1 (Jun., 1968) 1-25.

Clark, T. N. 1971. Institutionalization of innovations in higher education: Four models. In J. V. Baldridge (Ed.). Academic governance: Research on institutional politics and decision making (pp. 75-96). Berkeley, CA: McCutchan.

Cohen M, and March J., 1986. Leadership in an Organized Anarchy. Harvard Business School. Publishing.

Colbeck, C. 2002. Assessing Institutionalization of Curricular and Pedagogical Reform. Research in Higher Education. Vol. 43. No. 4 August 2002.

COMPU Report, 2004. National Universities Commission, State of Private Universities in Nigeria, Report of 2004, Annual Monitoring and Quality Assurance of Private Universities in Nigeria, Committee on Monitoring Private Universities

Council for Christian Colleges & Universities, 2005 & 2006. From the website: http://www.cccu.org/about/about.asp

Creswell, J. W. 1998. Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions. Sage Publications. Thousand Oaks, CA.

Creswell, J. W. 2003. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches, _{2nd} Edition. Sage Publications. Thousand Oaks, CA.

Curry, B. K. 1991. Institutionalization: The final phase of the organizational change process. Administrator's Notebook, 35(1).

Efunuga, W., 2003. MA Poly Seek Divine Intervention over Cultism. Nigerian Tribune, June 16, 2003. p. 40.

Fafunwa, A.B. 1971. A History of Nigerian Higher Education. Macmillan and Co. Ltd, Ilupeju, Nigeria.

Fafunwa, A.B. 1974. History of Education in Nigeria. George Allen and Unwin Ltd, London.

Ferdorowicz, J. and Gogan, J. 2001. Fast-Cycle Curriculum Development Strategies for E-Business Programs: the Bentley College Experience. Journal of Education for Business: July/August 2001.

Fuller, B. 1976. A Framework for Academic Planning. The Journal of Higher Education Vol. 47, No 1 (Jan-Feb., 1976), 65-77.

Geiger, R., 1998. Public and Private Sectors in Higher Education: A Comparism of International Patterns. Higher Education, 17 (6) 699-711.

General Conference of Seventh-day Adventist Church. 2003. Report, Commission on Higher Education.

Glanzer, P. L., Beaty, M., & Lyon, L. 2005. Moral Education at Religious Research Universities: Exploring Faculty Attitudes. Religious Education. Vol 100, No. 4 Fall 2005.

Hanson, M. 2001. Institutional Theory and learning Change. Educational Administrative Quarterly. Vol. 37 No. 5(December 2001) 637-661)

Hanson, K and Meyerson, J. Editors 1990; Higher Education in the Changing Economy. American Council on Learning, Macmillan Publishing Company, New York.

Hardin, J., Sweeney, J., & Whitworth, J. (1999). Integrating Faith and Learning in Teacher Education, Paper presented at the Extended Annual Meeting of the Association of Independent Liberal Arts Colleges for Teacher Education, (February 24, 1999).

Hart, D. 1992. The Troubled Soul of the Academy: American Learning and the Problem of Religious Studies_Religion and American Culture > Vol. 2, No. 1 (Winter, 1992), pp. 49-77.

Henry, D. and Agee, B. Editors. 2003 Faith and the Christian Scholarly Vocation. Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Holmes, A. 1975. The Idea of a Christian College. Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Holmes, A.1987. The Idea of a Christian College. Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Hughes, R. 2001. The Idea of a Christian University..; Current Issues in Catholic Higher Learning, v21 n2 p83-94 Spring

Kirk, R. 1955. Academic Freedom. Chicago. Regnery.

Kraatz, M. and Zajac, E. 1996. Exploring the Limits of the New Institutionalism: The Causes and Consequences of Illegitimate Organizational Change. American Sociological Review, 1996, Vol. 61 (October: 812-836).

Kuh, G., and Whitt, E., 1988. The Invisible Tapestry: Culture in American Colleges and Universities. ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report No.1 Washington, D.C.

Kushner, R. 1999. Curriculum as Strategy: The Scope and Organization of Business Learning in Liberal Arts Colleges The Journal of Higher Education > Vol. 70, No. 4 (Jul., 1999), pp. 413-440

Lattuca, L.R. and Stark, J.S. 1994. Will Disciplinary Perspectives Impede Curricular Reform? Journal of Higher Education. Vol 65, No 4. (Jul-Aug 1994) 401-426.

Levitt, B and Nass, C. 1989. The Lid on the Garbage Can: Institutional Constraints on Decision Making in the Technical Core of College-Text Publishers. Administrative Science Quarterly, 34 (1989): 190-207.

Levy, D., 2002. Unanticipated Development – Perspectives on Higher Education emerging roles. Unpublished PROPHE Working Paper No 1. Program for Research on Private Higher Education (PROPHE) State University of New York at Albany. Retrieved From: www.albany.edu/~prophe/publication/unanticipated.htm

Liftin, Duane., 2004. Conceiving the Christian College. William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company. Grand Rapids MI.

Lulat, Y. G. M. 2005. A History of African Higher Education from Antiquity to the Present: A Critical Synthesis. Praeger. Westport, Connecticut

Lutheran Educational Conference of North America. (1998). The Outcomes of a Lutheran Learning. Accessed online at http://www.collegevalue.com/forparents/outcomes.htm, January 29, 2003.

Mannoia Jr., 2000. Christian Liberal Arts: An Education that Goes Beyond. Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, Inc. Lanham.

Marsden, G. 1994. The Soul of the American University: From Protestant Establishment to Established Nonbelief. Oxford University Press. New York.

Marsden, G. and Longfield, B. Editors. 1992. The Secularization of the Academy. Oxford University Press. New York.

Massy, W. F., Wilger, A. K., and Colbeck C., 1994. Overcoming "Hollowed" Collegiality. Change v26 p10-20 July/August 1994.

Mazrui, A. A. 1978. Political Values and the Educated Class in Africa. Heinemann, London.

Merton, R., 1973. The Puritan Spur to Science, in The Sociology of Science: Theoretical and Empirical Investigations (Chicago: University of Chicago, pp.228-53

Miles, M. and Huberman, A. 1994. Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook. 2nd Edition. Sage Publications. Thousand Oaks, CA.

Mintzberg, H., 1979. "The Professional Bureaucracy," The Structuring of Organizations – A Synthesis of the Research. Pretince-Hall, Inc.

Nwauwa, A.O. 1996. Imperialism Academe and Nationalism: Britain and University Education for African 1860-1960. Frank Cass. London

Nwosu, C. C. 1999. Integration of Faith and Learning in Christian Higher Education: Professional Development of Teachers and Classroom Implementation, Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Andrews University, Dissertation Abstracts International Accession Number AAG9929070.

Nwosu, C. C. 2003. Student Perceptions of the Integration of Faith, Learning, and Practice In an Learning Methods Course. Journal of Research on Christian Education v 12 no2 Fall 2003. p. 101-35

Ogunbameru, O. A., 2004. Personality Dimension to Cultism in Nigerian Tertiary Institutions: A Sociobiological Perspective. Journal of Human Ecology. 16(2): 91-98. (2004).

Pfeffer, J., 1982. Organizations and Organization Theory. Pitman Books. Boston.

Pratt, D 1994. Curriculum Planning: A Handbook for Professionals. Harcourt Brace College. Forth Worth, TX.

Pullin, D. 2004. Accountability, autonomy, and academic freedom in educator preparation programs. Journal of Teacher Learning, Sept-Oct 2004 v55 i4 p300(13)

Ream, T.C. Beaty, M and Lyon, L., 2004. "Towards a Typology of Faculty Views at Religious Research Universities" Christian Higher Education, 3:1-24.

Rotimi, A., 2005. Violence in the Citadel: The Menace of Secret Cults in the Nigerian Universities. Nordic Journal of African Studies. 14(1): 79-98(2005).

Ross, R.D. 1976. The Institutionalization of Academic Innovations: Two Models. Sociology of

Education. Vol. 49, No. 2 (April, 1976), 146-155).

Selznick, P. 1996. Institutionalism "Old" and "New". Administrative Science Quarterly. 0001-8392, June 1, 1996, Vol.41, Issue 2.

Scott, W.R. 1987. The Adolescence of Institutional Theory. Administrative Science Quarterly, 32 (1987) 493-511.

Scott, W.R. 1995. Institutions and Organizations. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks CA.

Schwandt, T.A. 1997. Qualitative Inquiry: A dictionary of terms. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks CA.

Siedman, I. E. 1991. Teachers College, Columbia University, New York.

Spradley, J. 1979. The Ethnographic Interview. Holt, Rinehart and Winston, New York.

Stevenson, D. H and Young, P. D. (1995). The Heart of the Curriculum? A Status Report on Explicit Integration Courses in Christian Colleges and Universities, Journal of Psychology & Theology, 23(4), 248-260.

Staff Handbook, 2002-2005. Ebony University* A Seventh-day Adventist Institution of Higher education.

Tashakkori, A. and Teddlie, C., 1998. Mixed Methodology. Combining Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks CA.

Tilak, J., 1991. Privatization of Higher Education. Prospects, 21, (2) pp. 227-239.

Wagner, K. 2006. ACADEME: Bulletin of the American Association of University Professors. January/ February 2006.

Webster, Meriam. 2006. Webster On-line. Retrieved from: http://www.m-w.com/dictionary/fear/reverence/awe

Waggoner, R., Metcalfe, A., Olaore, I., 2005. Fiscal Reality and Academic Quality: Part-Time Faculty and the Challenge to Organizational Culture at Community Colleges. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 29: 25-44.

Weick, K., 1976. "Educational Organizations as Loosely Coupled Systems." Adminstrative Science Quarterly, Vol. 26, No. 1, March 1976.

Wittgenstein, L. 1953/1958. Philosophical Investigation. Anscombe, G. E. M. (Trans.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ; Prentice Hall.

Yin, R., 2003. Case Study Research: Design and Method. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks CA.

Zajac, E. and Kraatz, S. 1993. A Diametric Forces Model of Strategic Change: Assessing the Antecedents and Consequences of Restructuring in Higher Education Industry.

Strategic Management Journal, Vol 14, Special Issue: Corporate Restructuring. (Summer, 1993), 83-102.

Zucker. L. G., (Editor) 1988. Institutional Patterns and Organizations: Culture and Environment: Cambridge, M.A. Ballinger.

Zucker. L. G., 1987. Institutional Theories of Organization. Annual Review of Sociology. Vol 13 (1987) 443-464.