

## **INFORMATION TO USERS**

**This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.**

**The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.**

**In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.**

**Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.**

**Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.**

# **U·M·I**

University Microfilms International  
A Bell & Howell Information Company  
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA  
313/761-4700 800/521-0600



**Order Number 1356795**

**Early conservation by the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs  
from 1900 to 1932**

**Johnson, Sandra Jeanne, M.S.**

**The University of Arizona, 1993**

**Copyright ©1993 by Johnson, Sandra Jeanne. All rights reserved.**

**U·M·I**  
300 N. Zeeb Rd.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106



EARLY CONSERVATION BY THE  
ARIZONA FEDERATION OF WOMEN'S CLUBS  
FROM 1900 TO 1932  
by  
Sandra Jeanne Johnson

---

Copyright © Sandra Jeanne Johnson 1993

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of the  
SCHOOL OF RENEWABLE NATURAL RESOURCES  
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
For the Degree of  
MASTER OF SCIENCE  
In the Graduate College  
THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

1 9 9 3

## STATEMENT BY AUTHOR

This thesis has been submitted in partial fulfillment of requirements for an advanced degree at The University of Arizona and is deposited in the University Library to be made available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

Brief quotations from this thesis are allowable without special permission, provided that accurate acknowledgement of source is made. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this manuscript in whole or in part may be granted by the copyright holder.

SIGNED: Sandra J. Johnson

## APPROVAL BY THESIS DIRECTOR

This thesis has been approved on the date shown below:

<u>Hanna J. Cortner</u>	<u>12/3/93</u>
Hanna J. Cortner Professor of Renewable Natural Resources	Date
<u>James O. Klemmedson</u>	<u>12/3/93</u>
James O. Klemmedson Professor of Renewable Natural Resources	Date
<u>Douglas R. Weiner</u>	<u>12/3/93</u>
Douglas R. Weiner Professor of History	Date

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my appreciation for the cooperation and enthusiasm of the women of the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs and the assistance of the General Federation of Women's Clubs, for without them, there would be no study. I also wish to acknowledge the help and encouragement of my committee members: Professor Hanna Cortner, Professor James Klemmedson, and Professor Douglas Weiner.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION . . . . .	6
II. ENVIRONMENTAL HISTORY . . . . .	13
III. TURN OF THE CENTURY WOMEN'S CLUB MOVEMENT . . . . .	34
The General Federation of Women's Clubs . . . . .	34
IV. THE ARIZONA FEDERATION OF WOMEN'S CLUBS . . . . .	44
Natural Resource Interests of the AFWC . . . . .	46
Conservation . . . . .	48
Water Interests . . . . .	49
Wildlife Interests . . . . .	56
Forestry - Land Interests . . . . .	60
Preservation . . . . .	70
Civic Improvement . . . . .	78
Nature Study . . . . .	90
Recreation . . . . .	98
V. DISCUSSION . . . . .	104
Conclusion . . . . .	114
NOTES . . . . .	128
Abbreviations . . . . .	128
REFERENCES . . . . .	129

## ABSTRACT

Women have been historically written out of human achievement. This is especially true in organized conservation. Historical analyses of the Progressive conservation era and the period following to the New Deal have understated women's organized participation in conservation. Through an analysis of Women's Clubs' records, newspapers, and magazines from 1900-1932, Arizona clubwomen's activities regarding natural resources are examined.

The clubwomen are found to have been mutually and simultaneously supportive of conservation, preservation, civic improvement, nature study, and recreation - antagonistic issues at differing times. They reconciled those conflicts by advocating management solutions based upon resource renewability. Behind a shield of patriotism, maternalism, and housekeeping, the clubwomen used resource conservation to encourage a healthy future for humans and the environment. Conservation also served to advance their status as women through community service and self-education.

## CHAPTER I

## INTRODUCTION

Women, historically, have been one of the forgotten participants in recorded human achievement. Their work and contributions have been marginalized or co-opted by the men who dominated their lives, time and interests. The realm of science and more specifically, conservation of natural resources, are no exception to the seemingly unwritten standard.

If one examines the written literature regarding conservation history, one could make the erroneous assumption that conservation was mostly a male sphere of interest and accomplishment. There are numerous famous male names that can be easily recalled for their ideologies and promotion of conservation of natural resources. In Pioneer Conservationists of Western America, Peter Wild chronicled fifteen noted Western conservationists. Of those 15 individuals, only one is a woman. Mary Austin is the sole female mentioned in the company of such men as John Muir, Gifford Pinchot, John Wesley Powell, and Stephen Mather.<sup>1</sup> The American Environment, by Roderick Nash, contains numerous historical essays regarding the environment. The authors include male philosophers,

---

<sup>1</sup>Peter Wild. Pioneer Conservationists of Western America. Missoula: Mountain Press Publishing Co. 1979.

explorers, and bureaucrats such as George Catlin, Henry D. Thoreau, George Perkins Marsh, Federick Law Olmstead, and Robert Marshall.<sup>2</sup>

Women appear to have been absent from the historical roots of environmentalism based on a review of much of the literature. However, scholars of women's history have been slowly and steadily granting women some of the attention and credit they deserve. According to Marcia Myers Bonta, women were involved in the early underpinnings of environmental science. In the 18th and 19th centuries, women were involved in nature and natural sciences through gardening, art, and writing. A knowledge of gardening was useful for household needs and gave women a refuge into the beauty of nature. Drawing and painting were acceptable pastimes for women and nature provided motivation and subjects. During the 19th century, with newly growing educational possibilities for women, some women became naturalists themselves instead of merely supporting their husband's work.<sup>3</sup>

However, women's contributions were not limited to only the 19th century. Women were quite active during the

---

<sup>2</sup>Roderick Nash. The American Environment. Reading: Addison-Wesley Publishing co. 1976.

<sup>3</sup>Marcia Myers Bonta. Women in the Field. College Station: Texas A & M University Press. 1991. See pages 30, 49, 212 for Western examples of women naturalists.

turn of the century and the Progressive conservation movement. Samuel Hays mentioned the enthusiasm with which the General Federation of Women's Clubs (GFWC) and the Daughters of the American Revolution participated in conservation during the Progressive era.<sup>4</sup> Stephen Fox dedicated a portion of a chapter in his book to the efforts of women, remarking: "Women in particular, working as supporters and helpmates in the background, are invisible to history..." and this is why "most accounts of American conservation... have understated the participation of women in the movement."<sup>5</sup> According to Fox, women were involved throughout the ranks of wilderness societies, outdoors clubs, and conservation and preservationist societies, but rarely were they the leaders.<sup>6</sup>

Like women, Arizona as a state has been given little attention in conservation history. In conservation history texts, Arizona is usually only mentioned in context with Herbert Hoover's Colorado River Compact of the 1920s, the Kaibab Plateau wolf extermination, and the Grand Canyon. Furthermore, in the GFWC's own history books, Arizona is

---

<sup>4</sup>Samuel Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1959. p. 142.

<sup>5</sup>Stephen Fox. John Muir and His Legacy. The American Conservation Movement. Boston: Little, Brown & Co. 1981. p. 341.

<sup>6</sup>Ibid., p. 341-345.

overshadowed by the conservation achievements of its western sister, California, and the efforts of some of the more-populated, eastern states.<sup>7</sup> Moreover, in the article, "Women of the Progressive Conservation Movement, 1900-1916", Carolyn Merchant examined the conservation ideology of the GFWC by highlighting the activities of some of the eastern states and California, with no mention of Arizona.<sup>8</sup> But, Arizona is the site of many reclamation projects and home to several unique natural attractions.

Therefore, the goals of this thesis are as follows. Through examination of a local historical group of Arizona women, the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs (AFWC), from 1900-1932, I wish to first, fill in another piece of women's history, giving credit to a deserving part of the populace. Women's contribution to conservation during this time is important to single out because women were disenfranchised until the end of the Progressive era; (the 19th amendment passed in 1920) and therefore, were forced to find means other than the vote to influence governmental policy. However, I do not claim that the ideology of the AFWC is representative of all Arizona women or all

---

<sup>7</sup>See Mary Wood's The History of the GFWC for the First 22 Years of Its Organization. New York: GFWC, 1912; Mildred Well's Unity in Diversity. Washington, DC: GFWC. 1953.

<sup>8</sup>Carolyn Merchant. "Women of the Progressive Conservation Movement: 1900-1916". Environmental Review 8(1984):57-85.

Arizonans. Second, I plan to place the AFWC's activities in the context of Arizona's natural resource history. Arizona presents an interesting backdrop because it was not granted statehood until 1912. Third, the AFWC was an organization that advocated both preservation and conservation depending upon the resource and the issue. The clubwomen reconciled those competitive interests and others by appearing to examine natural resources individually and to choose their solutions based on perceived resource scarcity and renewability. In contrast, many resource-oriented associations of the time supported either rational management of resources or their explicit exclusion from exploitation. The Progressive era was full of contradictory impulses demonstrated by the variety of special-interest organizations of the time. Federal agencies and their representative with differing views on natural resource exploitation vied for popular support of their management ideas.<sup>9</sup> Organizations that supported preservation ideals, in general, would be forced to oppose utilitarian management of a resource, and vice versa.<sup>10</sup> Furthermore, many associations were formed with a specific resource interest in mind (e.g., wildlife or water),

---

<sup>9</sup>Ronald Foresta. America's National Parks and Their Keepers. Washington, DC: Resources for the Future. 1989.

<sup>10</sup>Fox. American Conservation Movement.

focusing their attentions elsewhere could weaken their potency; concentrating all energy on one subject could ensure greater chances of success than applying limited amounts of time to many subjects.

This study was conducted by examining Arizona federation and individual club records across the state from 1900 to 1932. Local newspapers and magazines were also examined for articles written by or about the federation's activities. Documentation of past activities was limited and written records could not always be located. Moreover, some records have been lost or destroyed through the passage of time. Unfortunately, verification of the contents of some speeches, other than title and author, was not always possible.

This study is divided into five chapters. Following this introduction is an outline of American environmental history (Chapter II) with an emphasis on the Progressive conservation movement. Chapter III is a brief examination of the women's club movement around the turn of the 19th century. This is followed by a thorough description of the AFWC's activities (Chapter IV) by category: conservation; preservation; civic improvement; nature study; and recreation. A discussion (Chapter V) of the clubs' impact and significance of accomplishment, namely affecting public

policy and changing women's public roles, concludes this paper.

## CHAPTER II

## ENVIRONMENTAL HISTORY

In order to understand the time period that the AFWC worked in and to understand what the woman's club was and meant to its members, it is first necessary to become acquainted with conservation history leading up and into the 20th century. It is further necessary to outline the importance of the Progressive era to natural resource conservation.

The 1800s were known as a period of waste of natural resources of the U.S. and its territories. The Industrial Revolution pushed settlement across the American continent where the wilderness encountered was seen as a stock of resources ready for taking and exploitation. Those who moved West believed that natural resources were inexhaustible and few considered the concept of waste. Furthermore, wilderness was viewed as hostile and the embodiment of evil, and thus was to be conquered. By the 1880s, most of the wild land had disappeared. Farms were now on the most fertile land and only marginal lands were left for future homesteaders.<sup>11</sup> The soil was mistreated, the timber wastefully cut, and the water polluted in the belief that resources were unlimited or at least self-

---

<sup>11</sup>Wild. Pioneer Conservationists. p. 3-7.

renewing. A few people of the time promoted restraint in the use of some natural resources, but mostly in the fear of certain commodity scarcity or certain species extinction, such as a declining mineral stock or population decline of furred wildlife.<sup>12</sup>

Much of the American settlers' disregard for caution was fueled by the Agrarian Myth. This myth encompassed a complex set of ideals whose foundation was the belief that God's chosen people (Americans) must live off the land as farmers. In the agrarian economy, nature and her resources were gifts from God for the advancement of civilization.<sup>13</sup> At the same time, some Americans were followers of the Romantic movement (mostly literary) that viewed nature not as a commodity but as a source of spiritual healing from the rigors of civilization. Romantics were committed to the picturesque landscape, the pastoral, thereby redefining the value of nature outside of the Agrarian Myth.<sup>14</sup>

By the end of the 19th century, Americans were beginning to respond to and think of wilderness and nature differently. The American lifestyle had changed significantly: agriculture was made easier and more

---

<sup>12</sup>Hans Huth. Nature and the American. Berkeley: University of California Press. 1957. p. 167.

<sup>13</sup>Peter Schmitt. Back to Nature. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. 1990. Introduction.

<sup>14</sup>Ibid., p. 4-5.

efficient by technology, industry was steadily advancing, and the overall population was growing. Little land remained that had been untouched by American settlement or progress. America's attention shifted from the country to the city. As a consequence, the wilderness lost its prior mystery as the unknown, wild, and untamable.<sup>15</sup>

Those living in the East, in densely populated cities, felt the squeeze of advancing industrialization and urbanization. They recognized that the frontier was disappearing forever. The last remnants of wilderness began to acquire a new image. Wild nature was no longer evil and dangerous. Instead, it embodied the savage spirit, was home to the pioneer, and replaced industrialization as the symbol of the nation. These qualities attracted city people, and their hostility; once aimed at nature, was transferred to the stifling city.<sup>16</sup> No longer did the American citizen have to conquer nature; (s)he could now enjoy it. This new attitude led to the birth of outdoor recreation. According to Roderick Nash, this was a time of intellectual revolution that echoed the Romantic movement and allowed the valuation of nature. Nature was the antithesis of civilization and, thus, was

---

<sup>15</sup>Roderick Nash. Wilderness and the American Mind. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1982. p. 143.

<sup>16</sup>Ibid., p. 143.

endowed with all the virtues that the city lacked. Nature was associated with the qualities of innocence, purity, cleanliness, and morality. These characteristics, it was feared, would be overrun by the wave of progress and materialism.<sup>17</sup>

"As it became fashionable to be interested in nature, many voices were raised in its praise",<sup>18</sup> leading to a variety of urban-based movements. The late 1800s witnessed a rise in interest in improving city and village environments. Civic associations were formed with the goal of correcting prior unplanned development of urban areas. Women's garden clubs were introduced and the members mobilized to improve the appearance of residential sections of the city.<sup>19</sup> Many garden clubs participated in the conservation movement by publishing literature and attempting to acquaint the general public with their principles. Garden clubs and civic associations worked to place greenbelts around cities and their parks.<sup>20</sup>

By 1900, the "back to nature" movement, identified by Peter Schmitt, had slipped into the middle and upper classes of the cities. This nature lovers' movement,

---

<sup>17</sup>Ibid., p. 156-159.

<sup>18</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 180.

<sup>19</sup>Ibid., p. 184-185.

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., p. 185.

strongest in Eastern cities from 1840-1900, was an effort to escape the irritants of city life by returning to nature, but was not a wholesale rejection of the benefits of urban life. On the contrary, those espousing the reliefs of nature also approved of the modern city's opportunities to provide economic, social, educational, religious, and cultural benefits. Yet, they maintained a longing for contact with nature.<sup>21</sup> Due to the influence of the romantic movement and the disappearance of the wilderness, the Arcadian Myth was overtaking the agrarian foundations of American culture. The Arcadian Myth was an urban response that valued nature's spiritual impact above its economic importance. Arcadia came to symbolize a scene of simple pleasure - the pastoral. It was an attempt to redefine nature's role in an industrial society. Arcadia lay on the edges of urbanity, was accessible, but still somewhat wild.<sup>22</sup>

Because wild nature was often inaccessible to city dwellers, urbanites sought to at least surround themselves with nature's symbols to satiate their hunger for nature's healing effects. The nature lovers' movement manifested itself through literature, gardens, parks, landscape

---

<sup>21</sup>Schmitt. Back to Nature. p. 3-4.

<sup>22</sup>Ibid., Introduction.

design, nature study, and sportsmen's organizations.<sup>23</sup> It provided the foundation for the preservationist movement, created the playground movement, redefined landscape architecture, and was part of the impetus for scenic tourism.

During the second half of the 19th century, there was a rise in nature-oriented literature that celebrated the wild land found beyond the city. This genre of art sought to bring nature and its solace to the urbanite exhausted with modern industrialization. Its plethora of volumes covered topics such as birds, flowers, and trees, treated them with mystic awe and gave these natural objects aesthetic/alternative value.<sup>24</sup>

During this time, ornithology took on Christian undertones - judging bird species with Victorian morality. "Good" birds were those that had musical songs and pretty plumage; they ate only weeds or insects, thereby being of some service to humans. "Bad" birds and animals who served no "useful" purpose whether aesthetic or utilitarian, were to be punished; for example, raptors preyed on the weak and the English sparrow was alien and unAmerican.<sup>25</sup> Preservationists acted to save the birds with beautiful

---

<sup>23</sup>Ibid., p. 15.

<sup>24</sup>Ibid., p. 20-21,30,33-34.

<sup>25</sup>Ibid., p. 36-38.

plumage or innocuous lifestyles from human encroachment or consumption.<sup>26</sup>

The landscaped garden of the early 20th century, an island of nature in the industrial world, took its design from the pastoral landscape painters of the time.<sup>27</sup> However, landscape designers were defining the landscape to fit their own artistic ideals rather than to preserve any semblance of or value undisturbed nature.<sup>28</sup> City parks were clear, grassy expanses designed for serene strolling, and cemeteries became a landscaped "confusion of peace and serenity" combined "with rural scenery and perpetual care".<sup>29</sup> By the late 1800s, nature lovers had convinced city planners to join the city park movement which was more a tribute to Romantic ideals and the pastoral landscape than wild nature.<sup>30</sup> In 1904, J. H. McFarland founded the American Civic Association which sponsored city and neighborhood improvement, preservation of landscapes, and "city beautiful" campaigns which sought to replace the ugly

---

<sup>26</sup>Ibid., p. 40.

<sup>27</sup>Ibid., p. 57.

<sup>28</sup>Ibid., p. 63.

<sup>29</sup>Ibid., p. 67.

<sup>30</sup>Ibid., p. 70.

leftovers of city development with parks and playgrounds as new symbols of American progress.<sup>31</sup>

The amateur playground movement underwent several transformations. It first replaced the spiritual healing of nature with the physical pleasures of the country, then the play theme itself dropped the country influence, becoming urbanized and more professional. Play was no longer a form of outdoor exercise, rather a social activity where children could be taught urban culture while outside in fresh air.<sup>32</sup>

Scenic appreciation was probably the most recognizable form of the "back to nature" movement. Landscape photography advanced the genre of pastoral art. Stereoscopic slides offered a "real" image of nature in three-dimensions.<sup>33</sup> However, these scenic compositions were designed to fit the needs of the common urban resident. They provided the romantic ideal of splendid and panoramic scenes of nature's finest, grandest wonders.<sup>34</sup>

Those people of the middle and upper classes who could afford vacationing became a class of tourists seeking the same grandeur they had viewed in magazines and photos.

---

<sup>31</sup>Ibid., p. 70.

<sup>32</sup>Ibid., p. 74-75.

<sup>33</sup>Ibid., p. 146-148.

<sup>34</sup>Ibid., p. 153.

Basic wilderness did not suit their needs of spiritual healing. They sought the most spectacular or unmarred of nature's resources to alleviate their urban malady and to reinforce, to themselves, the scenic value of nature.<sup>35</sup> The pilgrimage to view majestic nature aided the preservation and development of the national parks. The National Park Service (NPS) was formed in 1916 with one of its goals being the accessibility of nature to the public and its interpretation to those who were not wholly familiar with its meaning.<sup>36</sup> Director Stephen Mather set about making tourism of the parks their reason for existence and their breadwinner for management.<sup>37</sup>

Scenic attraction visitation grew with highway accessibility, advances in personal travel, and the desire to escape the city. In 1919, a national highway act was passed to allocate funds to aid the building of national highways. It was pushed by the needs of tourists for good roads into the national forests and parks. With this great road plan, many scenic drives were built to permit the public to leisurely enjoy the scenery on route to their

---

<sup>35</sup>Ibid., p. 154-155.

<sup>36</sup>Ibid., p. 155.

<sup>37</sup>Ronald Foresta. America's National Parks and Their Keepers. Washington, DC: Resources for the Future. 1984.

destinations.<sup>38</sup> Highway construction led to conflict between scenery and advertising billboards placed along the roads. Many associations organized opposition to the unsightly advertisements. Apparently, the public had become more sensitive to the value of scenery and abhorred the neglected appearances of city fringes and exploited areas.<sup>39</sup>

The late 19th century also witnessed a growing influence of science and an understanding of natural resources and their interrelationships. For example, the disappearance of once grand forests, lauded by Romantic writings, spurred a general wave of tree plantings. The custom of tree planting, celebrated in most states as Arbor Day, started with Nebraskan, J. Sterling Morton, in 1872.<sup>40</sup> Furthermore, the American Forestry Association, founded in 1875, took up the call for the protection of forests in 1882.<sup>41</sup> In 1879, the U.S. Geological Survey was established, followed by the creation of the Division of Forestry in the Department of Agriculture in 1881. Numerous other societies and organizations were founded in response to the growing interest in natural resources: the

---

<sup>38</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 202.

<sup>39</sup>Ibid., p. 202.

<sup>40</sup>Ibid., p. 171.

<sup>41</sup>ibid., p. 175.

New York Audubon Society in 1886, the Boone and Crockett Club in 1885, the National Irrigation Congress in 1891, the Sierra Club in 1892, the American Scenic and Historic Preservation Society in 1895, and the Society of American Foresters in 1900.<sup>42</sup> This was coupled with an increasing distaste for free enterprise in natural resource usage and a suspicion of materialism. Capitalists of the time were portrayed as blind to alternative values of nature and were exploitive of the public domain in line with free enterprise. This was in contrast to and in conflict with a new group of scientific men who believed that the harvesting of natural resources must be done only in harmony with nature, requiring planning and forethought.<sup>43</sup> Therefore the battle lines were already drawn by the turn of the century: industrialism and free enterprise versus the aesthetics of nature's wonders. This was illustrated by conservationists saving the visual integrity of Niagara Falls from water power interests during the 1870s.<sup>44</sup> This was the forerunner to the preservation/utilitarian conservation split regarding the public domain.

---

<sup>42</sup>Nash. The American Environment. Chronology of important events.

<sup>43</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 172.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., p. 171-173. In the 1870s, Niagara Falls was threatened by water power interests. Early conservationists came to its rescue and preserved the fall's aesthetic integrity.

During the 1890s, the federal government and its newly forming agencies began to put into practice what its experts had learned about nature. Western irrigators were credited with pioneering the theory that watershed vegetation affected water supplies. Their efforts played a major role in the establishment of national forests.<sup>45</sup> In 1891, Congress passed the General Land Law Revision Act which gave the President the authority to create forest preserves by withdrawing land from the public domain.<sup>46</sup> Some preservationists viewed this as a first step toward reserving some resources from development.<sup>47</sup> This was followed by the Forest Management Act in 1897 which gave the Secretary of the Interior the power to regulate the forest reserves and paved the way for rational development and multiple-use management on public lands.<sup>48</sup> Again, those supporting preservation hoped this act would protect the reserves from commercial development.<sup>49</sup> At the same time, the organized forestry movement shifted its goal from saving trees from destruction to sustained yield forest

---

<sup>45</sup>Samuel Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 22.

<sup>46</sup>Ibid., p. 36.

<sup>47</sup>Ibid., p. 190.

<sup>48</sup>Ibid., p. 36.

<sup>49</sup>Ibid., p. 190.

management.<sup>50</sup> Multiple-use proponents were given their official opportunity to implement resource management when Gifford Pinchot was made Chief of the Division of Forestry in 1898.<sup>51</sup> Pinchot, stressing utilitarian value, believed the forest reserves should be developed for commercial use rather than preserved from it.<sup>52</sup>

The rise in scientific understanding of natural resources eventually led to conservation characterized by wise use. With the creation of federal agencies to deal with the governing and distribution of natural resources, those professionals who fostered an attitude of scientific management, expertise, and planning came into influence and power. Progressive government, around the turn of the century, was concerned with issues such as efficiency, equity, and stability of the economy. According to Samuel Hays, conservation became a scientific movement supported by technicians who believed that they, as technocrats, and not legislators should deal with the distribution of natural resources.<sup>53</sup>

The term "conservation" originated over the movement to construct reservoirs to save flood-waters for use in the

---

<sup>50</sup>Ibid., p. 28.

<sup>51</sup>Ibid., p. 29.

<sup>52</sup>Ibid., p. 41.

<sup>53</sup>Ibid., p. 2.

dry seasons<sup>54</sup> and once referred to cautious management of resources including some preservation. However, it eventually became associated with Gifford Pinchot's philosophy of "the greatest good of the greatest number in the long run".<sup>55</sup> Pinchot, who was made the first chief of the U.S. Forest Service, favored a more efficient use of natural resources and not their preservation or exclusion from human use.

The growing appreciation for nature's beauty during the late 1800s ultimately led to the antagonistic preservation movement. However, the preservationists were originally members of the conservationist camp as it was defined before the turn of the century. Utilitarian conservation was Gifford Pinchot's plan for the distribution of the natural resources in the public domain. In contrast was John Muir's preservation movement that favored sparing some resources (e.g., scenery) from human exploitation, except for recreation. Preservationists finally splintered off from the utilitarian conservation ideology over the issue of whether Yosemite National Park's Hetch-Hetchy Valley and the aesthetics of nature that it came to symbolize were worth preservation in their own right or should be sacrificed for a "higher good" - San

---

<sup>54</sup>Ibid., p. 5.

<sup>55</sup>Fox. The American Conservation Movement. p. 111.

Francisco's need for a dependable water supply. Preservationists lost their bid for the valley in 1913 when Congress finally authorized a dam for Hetch-Hetchy, after ten years of delays, dooming the valley to a future under water.<sup>56</sup>

Regardless of this fateful split in ideology, utilitarian conservation became a powerful philosophy and practice from 1900 to about 1920, the period of the Progressive era in government. Progressives, represented by President Roosevelt, were also concerned with economic justice and democracy in the handling of natural resources and not just mere waste prevention. Roosevelt's concerns coupled nicely with those of his chief forester, Pinchot. The Progressive conservation program involved federal control over the public domain in the public interest. The Progressive era was also one of growing social consciousness and a decline of laissez-faire business philosophy.<sup>57</sup> Through strong leadership and expert advice, Roosevelt and Pinchot sought to enlarge the public control over natural resources and to conserve and use wisely the

---

<sup>56</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 195.

<sup>57</sup>J. L. Bates. "Fulfilling American Democracy. The Conservation Movement, 1907 to 1921." The Mississippi Valley Historical Review 44(1957):29-57. p. 30-31.

public domain (and other reserved lands) that still remained.<sup>58</sup>

By 1908, conservation was known as "the use of foresight and restraint in the exploitation of the physical sources of wealth as necessary for the perpetuity of civilization, and the welfare of present and future generations".<sup>59</sup> What was formerly a concept associated with flood water reservoirs now connoted "efficiency in the development and use of all resources".<sup>60</sup> The 1908 Governor's Conference focused on this new federal resource ideology spurred by the rising danger of exhausting the country's natural resources.<sup>61</sup> The participants included the state executives, their aides, and representatives from over 70 national organizations who met with the purpose to consider a proposal for a national resource inventory.<sup>62</sup> Gifford Pinchot directed that the discussion be confined to only the utilitarian aspects of conservation and not preservation or the protection of natural resources.<sup>63</sup>

---

<sup>58</sup>Ibid., p. 38.

<sup>59</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 123.

<sup>60</sup>Ibid., p. 123.

<sup>61</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 186.

<sup>62</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 129.

<sup>63</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 186.

Proponents of conservation also practiced some resource preservation, proving to be as multifaceted as the Progressive period. Conservationists declared some natural areas too beautiful to mine, log, or dam, to be used only for enjoyment of aesthetics - recreation. Under pressure from the Society for the Preservation of Historical and Scenic Spots (founded in 1900),<sup>64</sup> Congress passed the Antiquities Act of 1906 to aid preservation of some areas as national monuments. Spurred by fears that the Grand Canyon would become too commercialized and Congress' lack of desire to establish a national park, President Roosevelt availed himself of this act in 1908 to declare the Grand Canyon a national monument.<sup>65</sup> Under USFS pressure for control over the national parks and disagreement over appropriate uses of park resources, Congress formed the National Park Service in 1916 under the Department of the Interior.<sup>66</sup> Preservationists, backed by the tourist industry, rejoiced at their victory, three years too late for Hetch-Hetchy.

Conservation ideology generally took hold with more of the general populace during the Progressive era, and the

---

<sup>64</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 190.

<sup>65</sup>Huth. Nature and the American. p. 181-182.

<sup>66</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 197.

movement broadened due to that popular support. Previous advocates of Pinchot's style of conservation were special interest groups (e.g., American Forestry Association), but by 1908, others joined in the crusade to save America from materialism and its resources from unchecked commercial development. This new moralistic interest in conservation came from the middle and upper class urbanites who were also active in social reforms characteristic of the time.<sup>67</sup> Women's organizations such as the General Federation of Women's Clubs (GFWC) and the Daughters of the American Revolution became especially concerned about and active in conservation.<sup>68</sup> A scent of morality wafted into the movement because groups such as these tended to view growing industrialization with alarm. They saw huge urban areas sprawling with decay replacing "sobriety, honesty, and hard work with disease, immorality, and squalor".<sup>69</sup> Traditional American virtues were on the brink of extinction. Conservation would be the cure.

Conservation generally symbolized the antithesis to urbanity: it was oriented toward the country and nature with the values inherent in nature rather than toward the

---

<sup>67</sup>Ibid., p. 141. The Progressive era is known for social reforms such as labor laws and children's welfare in addition to resource management reform.

<sup>68</sup>Ibid., p. 142.

<sup>69</sup>Ibid., p. 142.

artificial and materialistic, characteristics of the city.<sup>70</sup> The movement, supported by groups such as the GFWC, gave urban support to national forests and parks, recreation, the removal of billboards along scenic highways, and federal irrigation programs especially for rural homesteading.<sup>71</sup>

The Taft Administration did not follow the same conservation ideology as Roosevelt. President Taft did not make use of interdepartmental coordination as Roosevelt had, thereby partially dismantling comprehensive management.<sup>72</sup> Furthermore, the advent of World War I (WWI) heightened conservationists' worry about special interests using the event to exploit the public domain. However, in recognition of this concern, President Wilson opened the western lands to private exploitation but prevented profiteering.<sup>73</sup> Nevertheless, by WWI, federal support of conservation ideals shrank to a small group of men, influenced by Pinchot.<sup>74</sup>

---

<sup>70</sup>Ibid., p. 143.

<sup>71</sup>Ibid., p. 143-144.

<sup>72</sup>Ibid., p. 172.

<sup>73</sup>Bates. "Fulfilling American Democracy: The Conservation Movement". p. 49.

<sup>74</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency, p. 172,175-176.

The second decade of the 20th century was highlighted by eventual settlements over water power and land withdrawals for public or private development.<sup>75</sup> Land withdrawals were made for the purpose of utility development. Interested in hydroelectric development, Secretary of the Interior Richard Ballinger, under President Taft, withdrew lands, excluded from national forests, from entry by individuals and private corporations.<sup>76</sup> Under President Wilson's administration, Westerners called for the release of those withdrawn lands for private water and energy development. Eventually, the Federal Water Power Act of 1920 was passed allowing for 50 year occupancy by private firms and a leasing system for water power development.<sup>77</sup>

Conservation in the 1920s under President Coolidge (1923-1929) and President Hoover (1929-1933) placed a new emphasis on wildlife protection and conservation as well as a continuation of water reclamation projects, especially in the West. "Conservation became a large, diverse and institutionalized influence on governmental policy by the

---

<sup>75</sup>Ibid., p. 161.

<sup>76</sup>Ibid., p. 163.

<sup>77</sup>Joseph Petulla. American Environmental History. Columbus: Merrill Publishing Co. 1980. p. 318-320.

1920s".<sup>78</sup> Both the American public and the government showed increasing involvement in conservation in its diverse forms. However, this time period is not given as much attention by historians for its contributions to national conservation as the period from 1900-1916 and the 1930s under President F. Roosevelt. Nevertheless, wildlife organizations pushed for bag limits, national refuges, licensing, and protection of species.<sup>79</sup> Hoover's influence, echoed by Coolidge, emphasized efficiency, sustainability, reforestation, waste elimination, conservation of nonrenewable natural resources, and reclamation.<sup>80</sup>

The first two decades of popular conservation centered around land, trees, and water. The 1920s demonstrate the broadening emphasis from trees towards an increasing concern for wildlife protection and conservation, supported by both preservation societies and hunters alike.<sup>81</sup> However, water and reclamation projects in the West continued to be central to the institutionalized conservation ideology.

---

<sup>78</sup>Kendrick Clements. "Herbert Hoover and Conservation 1921-1933". American Historical Review 89(1984):67-88. p. 67.

<sup>79</sup>Fox. The American Conservation Movement. p. 168, 172.

<sup>80</sup>Clements. "Herbert Hoover and Conservation".

<sup>81</sup>Fox. The American Conservation Movement. p. 148.

## CHAPTER III

## TURN OF THE CENTURY WOMEN'S CLUB MOVEMENT

By the late 19th century, women's societies and associations proliferated. Membership of such associations consisted of relatively privileged, white women. Their economic status and educational opportunities were greater than most, yet they too were disenfranchised from the political process.<sup>82</sup>

At this time, changes in the division of labor, growth in the market for consumer commodities, and a rise in women's education led to increased amounts of time for middle and upper class women to be free from their household duties.<sup>83</sup> Conditions at the turn of the century seemed to favor a sort of women's gender consciousness. Distinct gender-based division of labor and Protestant evangelism encouraged these women to form voluntary associations to deal with concerns regarding their own well-being and social welfare.<sup>84</sup> Among the most active of the club members were wives and mothers. Some professional

---

<sup>82</sup>Elisabeth Clemens. "Organizational Repertoires and Institutional Change: Women's Groups and the Transformation of U.S. Politics, 1890-1920." American Journal of Sociology 98(1993):755-798.

<sup>83</sup>Ibid.

<sup>84</sup>Theda Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. Cambridge: Belknap Press. 1992. p. 318.

women, some unmarried with independent wealth, and some childless also joined the women's clubs; however, the clubs were primarily the domain of married mothers.

Women's clubs evolved beyond mere reflections of men's clubs. They had not banded together for social or economic purpose; instead, they became a center for woman-performed altruism and public activity.<sup>85</sup> Women's "natural" domestic nature (attributed with moral superiority) entailed certain responsibilities that might justify occasional altruistic expeditions beyond the family circle.<sup>86</sup>

The ideology of the "lady" was the belief that every woman was a moral and domestic creature who was characterized by the traits of loving maternity, intuition, and sensitivity.<sup>87</sup> Ladies were the moral caretakers of the family as well as the domestic caretakers of the home. Men were in charge of the public arena and the marketplace, and responsible for spreading industrialization.<sup>88</sup> With advancement in civilization, male and female spheres grew apart, distinctly earmarking women for nonpublic caretaking

---

<sup>85</sup>Clemens. "Organizational Repertoires and Institutional Change".

<sup>86</sup>Karen Blair. The Clubwoman as Feminist. True Womanhood Redefined. 1868-1914. New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, Inc. 1980.

<sup>87</sup>Ibid., p. 1.

<sup>88</sup>Ibid., p. 3.

duties. Wealthier women, by the 1800s, struggled to leave the confines of the home without abandoning their domestic values and duties.<sup>89</sup> They were able to surreptitiously accomplish this liberation through the women's club movement close to the turn of the century.

Clubwomen met regularly, developing their confidence and knowledge; they demanded respect for the "natural" traits of the "lady", and eventually enlarged the woman's sphere. From 1870-1900, the largest proportion of American women confined their community participation to clubs promoting their own self-culture and education. These women met to practice public speaking by giving reports and holding discussions on "intellectual" topics.<sup>90</sup> Cultural concerns were not as traditional as the study of the home or child care but they also were not as radical as suffrage either.<sup>91</sup> Women's clubs had the power to give women a more complete and authentic self-expression.<sup>92</sup>

By the 1880s, the concept of municipal housekeeping, as defined by Karen Blair, arose. It was built on the ideology that women's special moral qualities ought to be applied outside the home, but not satisfied with

---

<sup>89</sup>Ibid., p. 4.

<sup>90</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. p. 328.

<sup>91</sup>Blair, Clubwoman as Feminist. p. 57

<sup>92</sup>Ibid.

association only with the arts. Therefore, women club members turned to civic reform. Community became a natural extension of the home, and women would thus apply their sensibilities to its problems. Men were presumed to have no time for community problems. Women became responsible for community study and left the men to execute the solutions.<sup>93</sup>

#### The General Federation of Women's Clubs

Women's clubs formally started with Sorosis, founded in 1868 as a literary club.<sup>94</sup> After 1890, many literary and special purpose clubs coalesced into the General Federation of Women's Clubs (GFWC) - a national network. The federation soon spread into less industrial/urban areas of the country with the purpose of member women to "civilize" their respective communities.<sup>95</sup>

By 1900, the GFWC began to concern itself with more than just education, art, and literature. It added civil service, home economics, pure food, public health, labor legislation, and forestry to its topics of discussion and action.<sup>96</sup> The GFWC encouraged its many individual clubs to

---

<sup>93</sup>Ibid., p. 74.

<sup>94</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers, p. 328.

<sup>95</sup>Ibid., p. 329.

<sup>96</sup>Ibid., p. 329.

get involved in the public sphere and expand the domain of women.<sup>97</sup> The GFWC originally accepted membership judged on the purpose of the club and its democratic structure. The purpose was not philanthropic or technical, but rather literary, social, artistic, or scientific. However, there was a call for broader activities and a "finer civic spirit".<sup>98</sup> About 1900, anxious for social and legislative reform, the GFWC began accepting nonliterary clubs into the federation if they were already emphasizing civic projects.<sup>99</sup> The federation proved eager to include other activities along with their self-education studies. They chose to examine township affairs (sanitary, educational) in the Progressive movement's quest for decency and order.<sup>100</sup>

GFWC clubwomen also steadfastly believed in their duties as women and touted their "natural" maternal instincts as the basis for their desired public activism. Woman was naturally the "conserver and preserver and helpmeet" of man. She was to follow closely behind, supplementing his work with her own, conserving and

---

<sup>97</sup>Ibid., p. 331.

<sup>98</sup>Mary Wood. The History of the GFWC for the First 22 Years of its Organization. New York: GFWC. 1912. p. 46.

<sup>99</sup>Blair. Clubwoman as Feminist. p. 97.

<sup>100</sup>Wood. History of GFWC. p. 46.

preserving much of that which his haste had passed by, making it perfect.<sup>101</sup> The Woman's Club based its foundation on maternal duties and made service its motive.<sup>102</sup>

Buoyed by maternalism and municipal housekeeping ideology, clubwomen expanded the "home" to naturally include the community.<sup>103</sup> Clubs were bodies of trained housekeepers, who were the guardians of civic housekeeping, social welfare, and their communities,<sup>104</sup> The early 20th century, the Progressive era, was also a time of "educated motherhood". The future's children needed guidance and if their mothers were to perform their duties appropriately, they would require training and expert guidance themselves.<sup>105</sup> Thus, they consulted with professional experts on the issues that concerned them.<sup>106</sup> The concept of education for service, not self, took hold by the 3rd biennial meeting of the GFWC in 1897.<sup>107</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup>Ibid., p. 6.

<sup>102</sup>Ibid., p. 4

<sup>103</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. p. 331.

<sup>104</sup>Ibid., p. 332.

<sup>105</sup>Ibid., p. 332.

<sup>106</sup>Ibid., p. 331.

<sup>107</sup>Wood. History of GFWC. p. 86.

GFWC members channeled their energies into informing themselves about the key issues of the time and consulted experts prior to endorsing any reforms or legislation.<sup>108</sup> They established committees to investigate problems and come up with solutions. Their proposed public reforms included legislation for public health, civil service, and conservation or forestry.<sup>109</sup> Their activities evolved around gathering information, compiling reports, studying laws and legislation, and lobbying at home and nationally. They also claimed to influence voting male family members and state legislators. Their educational responsibilities also included public campaigns to influence public opinion.<sup>110</sup>

The clubwomen's maternalist rhetoric appeared to be very effective with civic leaders and legislators, perhaps because it seemed to rise above partisan loyalties.<sup>111</sup> Furthermore, the clubwomen tended to rely on their home duties and family devotion to protect themselves from criticism of the public work that now absorbed them and

---

<sup>108</sup>Blair. Clubwoman as Feminist. p. 103; Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. p. 362.

<sup>109</sup>Blair. Clubwoman, p. 103.

<sup>110</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers. p. 362.

<sup>111</sup>Ibid., p. 368.

brought them out of their female-oriented sphere of action.<sup>112</sup> Women had long been viewed as the guardians of morality and when they spoke with unanimous conviction about certain issues, it was difficult for legislators to ignore their demands.<sup>113</sup>

The GFWC's civic concerns spilled over into the new topic of conservation of natural resources. As early as 1896, the federation passed a resolution recognizing that nothing was more important than the preservation and economic development of the nation's resources. But they also were aware of the "wicked and wasteful" destruction of the forest and declared it robbery that should be checked by private and legislative action. The members thus pledged themselves to the study of forest conditions and resources and to "further the highest interests of our several states" in respect to the issue.<sup>114</sup> In 1898, the GFWC passed resolutions recognizing the deplorable destruction of "natural beauties" and resources. They urged study of the National (American?) Forestry Association's work and for all citizens to help preserve forests. Individual state federations were requested to study their own geographies to identify and prevent loss of

---

<sup>112</sup>Blair. Clubwoman. p. 105.

<sup>113</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. p. 368.

<sup>114</sup>Wood. History of GFWC. p. 88.

the national heritage.<sup>115</sup> Their resolutions of 1900 echoed the preservation call and added a plea for intelligent tree planting and legislation to prohibit river bank dumping.<sup>116</sup> By 1902, the federation had established a Forestry and Irrigation Committee. They passed a resolution asking Congress to construct reservoirs and irrigation works for the reclamation of public lands with the goal of settling the desert. The GFWC is credited with helping to secure the 1902 National Reclamation Act.<sup>117</sup>

Other activities included support for the NPS created in 1916. The GFWC is also credited with passage of an amendment to the Federal Water Power Act in 1922 that made it impossible for an individual or corporation to file water rights claims in national parks or monuments.<sup>118</sup> The federation is also on record opposing billboards along scenic highways, and supporting bird and wildflower protection.<sup>119</sup> Throughout the early 20th century, the conservation committee supervised tree plantings, celebrated Arbor Day, supported the Audubon Society, and

---

<sup>115</sup>Ibid., p. 118.

<sup>116</sup>Ibid., p. 134-135.

<sup>117</sup>Mildred White Wells. Unity in Diversity. Washington, DC: GFWC. 1953. p. 192-197.

<sup>118</sup>Ibid., p. 196.

<sup>119</sup>Ibid., p. 196.

helped to preserve specific woodlands across the United States.<sup>120</sup> In 1908, member Sarah Platt Decker was the only woman invited to the Governor's Conference held at the White House to discuss conservation.<sup>121</sup>

Therefore, the GFWC was quite active with conservation during the Progressive era. "The textbooks would have us believe... that conservation was a one-man campaign of President Theodore Roosevelt. In fact, these measures... were supported by the hundreds of thousands of active clubwomen who made it their business to transform America and the notion of what a responsible government should provide".<sup>122</sup>

---

<sup>120</sup>Blair. Clubwoman as Feminist. p. 103.

<sup>121</sup>Ibid., p. 106.

<sup>122</sup>Ibid., p. 102.

## CHAPTER IV

## THE ARIZONA FEDERATION OF WOMEN'S CLUBS (AFWC)

The Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs (AFWC) was founded in 1901, in Phoenix, by Mrs. Anna D. McClatchie. Mrs. McClatchie originally became interested in the women's club movement in California where she occasionally addressed clubs on biological topics. She worked on bacteria, fungi, and algae in Southern California with her husband. When her husband, Professor Alfred McClatchie, was appointed in 1898 to the position of Agriculturist and Horticulturist at the University of Arizona, Anna went with him to Phoenix. She helped to launch the Phoenix Woman's Club in 1900 to stimulate cultural development and study public affairs.<sup>123</sup>

In 1901, Mrs. McClatchie began correspondence and planning to create the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs. Its goals would include promotion of civic, social, and educational interests. Its chief aim would be the development of the woman herself. Mrs. McClatchie desired to unite the women's clubs in the Arizona territory to meet its urgent cultural needs.<sup>124</sup> The women members of the AFWC "were interested and enthusiastic about" Arizona

---

<sup>123</sup>Margaret Wheeler Ross. The Tale Is Told. Phoenix: AFWC. 1945. p. 39.

<sup>124</sup>Ibid., p. 39.

statehood ten years prior to its attainment.<sup>125</sup> In 1902, the AFWC was admitted to the General Federation and was represented at the GFWC Biennial held in Los Angeles.<sup>126</sup> By this time, the AFWC had mimicked the official form and maintained six standing committees: Education, Civics, Forestry, History (Arizona), Traveling Libraries, and a Bureau of Reciprocity.<sup>127</sup>

The archetypical woman who joined the Arizona federation reflected the national trend in membership characteristics. She was white, of middle or upper class, somewhat educated, and usually married with children. Some professional women joined, as did some childless, and some spinsters. They were also the wives of mining executives, ranchers, businessmen, judges, educators, and development-minded men supportive of irrigation and reclamation of the arid lands.

The five original clubs (1901) spanned the territory: Bisbee Woman's Club; Florence Ladies Village Improvement Club; Phoenix Woman's Club; Prescott Monday Club; and Tucson Woman's Club. Individual clubs met to discuss current topics, study history, and promote education and

---

<sup>125</sup>Margaret Wheeler Ross. "The Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs". Arizona 6(1916):3-4,14.

<sup>126</sup>Ross. Tale is Told, p. 40.

<sup>127</sup>Ibid., p. 44.

literacy. Many member clubs built their own clubhouses and provided funds and books to start local libraries. Clubhouses were often rented out to serve as meeting places for other local organizations and to house social events. Membership with the GFWC required ideals of service which the Arizona federation accepted graciously and enthusiastically. The federation made it their business to be informed and active throughout the state. The women were involved in home and business, schools, town and country, the state and federal legislature, parks, national monuments, and forests. However, the AFWC's activism in conservation and other natural resource issues from 1900-1932 is of particular interest here.

#### Natural Resource Interests of the AFWC

The AFWC's concern in natural resources can be roughly divided into five categories based on the general definitions of the times: conservation, preservation, nature study, recreation, and civic improvement. However, many of the federation's activities overlapped and served more than one purpose. Furthermore, the AFWC did not appear to make such delineated distinctions among resource-activity categories, often interchanging or not defining terms. However, it should not be misconstrued that the Arizona federation was uninformed or ignorant of the

pertinent facts and meanings regarding natural resources and the federation's interests.

The clubwomen wrote and published their own articles regarding their activities. They submitted articles to several Arizona state promotional magazines: Arizona: The New State; Progressive Arizona; and Yavapai magazine. Arizona, the New State (also known as Arizona) was a Phoenix monthly, family publication designed to assist state development and to educate nonresidents about the benefits of life in Arizona. Etta Gifford Young, an AFWC member, served as associate editor. The magazine published the AFWC's history, goals, meeting schedules, activities, and opinions. Progressive Arizona was a Tucson monthly magazine; its purpose also was to create interest in Arizona. Yavapai magazine, published in Prescott, was dedicated to the "best interests of Northern Arizona and outdoor life". Grace Sparkes served as its editor for the early 1930s. All three magazines ran articles concerning agriculture, business, government, mining, ranching, recreation, women's issues, stories, poetry, and photographs.

The clubwomen also printed articles in magazines published by the AFWC. Western Woman magazine was the official outlet of the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs, the Arizona Federation of Music Clubs, and the California

Women of the Golden West. It was published in Phoenix; in 1930 it was renamed Arizona Woman to reflect its emphasis on Arizona clubwomen. Although this magazine announced club news and meetings, it also printed articles of household interest, business news, essays, stories, poetry, as well as messages of federation opinion and activity.

Local newspapers also announced club meetings and biennial schedules. Some papers, such as the Arizona Republic from Phoenix or the Tucson Citizen featured either a women's section or a federation section for such news. However, the articles tended to present only meeting topic titles or to announce club election results. Occasionally, a federation opinion on some upcoming legislation appeared in the AFWC section or on the editorial pages.

### Conservation

Conservation came to represent an ideology of efficiency and rational management of natural resources. It implied an anthropocentric valuation of nature (resources), i.e., domination of nature for human-use. It was practiced by the U.S. Forest Service and Gifford Pinchot, and the U.S. Reclamation Service. They cut timber, dammed rivers, built flood-water reservoirs, and managed wildlife based on the then current scientific understanding of nature. The clubwomen's interest in

conservation can be divided into three major areas: water, wildlife, and forestry and land.

### Water Interests

Government leaders in Washington, D.C. were excited about the possibility of vast economic growth in the West if the federal government could plan regional development of the public domain on a large-scale.<sup>128</sup> Although Arizona was still a territory in the first decade of the 20th century, it was included in federal planning for water power and, especially, irrigation.

By the turn of the century, Arizonans had been agitating for a federally funded irrigation project along the Salt River. Local work already had begun to fund a dam at the Tonto Basin site in 1901. The project advanced rapidly under President Roosevelt's sanctioning. Roosevelt had previously visited the West and was cognizant of the importance of water and irrigation to agricultural prospects in the arid lands. Thus, he signed the 1902 National Reclamation Act that in addition to providing the means for funding projects, made the U.S. Reclamation Service an official branch of the U.S. Geological Survey.<sup>129</sup> Congress passed the act inspired by a vision of

---

<sup>128</sup>Hays. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. p. 66.

<sup>129</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona, p. 310-311.

fertile lands where there was once desert. Since Arizona was one source of initial promotion of the Reclamation Service, it was given priority in project development.<sup>130</sup>

Soon after, the Salt River Valley Users Association was formed, headed by B.A. Fowler (husband of an AFWC member), to mediate between the government and the locals on details of the Roosevelt Dam project. Judge J.H. Kibbey who drew up the articles of the organization for the Salt River Association, is also credited with establishing the western water principle of priority rights based on beneficial use.<sup>131</sup> In view of this cooperation, Secretary of the Interior E.A. Hitchcock gave final project authorization in 1902.<sup>132</sup> Project construction began in 1905 and Roosevelt Dam was planned for the Tonto Basin where Tonto Creek joined the Salt River. The dam was completed and formally dedicated by former President Roosevelt as Roosevelt Dam in 1911.<sup>133</sup> The Reclamation Service funded three other major projects in Arizona from 1900-1930: the Salt River Project (1905-1911); the Yuma

---

<sup>130</sup>Ibid., p. 312.

<sup>131</sup>Ibid., p. 312.

<sup>132</sup>Ibid., p. 315.

<sup>133</sup>Odie Faulk. Arizona. A Short History. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 1970 p. 171.

Project on the Colorado River (1904-1909); and Coolidge Dam on the Gila River (1924-1929).<sup>134</sup>

The years after WWI into the early 1920s were a time of hardship for Arizona which was recovering from an influenza epidemic. Furthermore, the state was suffering a decline in production in its three main industries: copper, cattle and cotton.<sup>135</sup> However, despite periodic crises, Arizona had done fairly well by itself. It was producing alfalfa, cotton, lettuce, cantaloupes, corn, wheat, grains, and citrus fruits. Cattle, sheep, and dairying were also successful in the reclaimed desert state, especially in the Salt River Valley which produced the bulk of crops from 1910-1930; Yuma was the runner-up.<sup>136</sup>

According to records, water conservation became a major interest of the AFWC around 1922 up to the 1930s. Conservation of the child and humanity took a back seat to natural resources, wildlife, flood control and reclamation projects. At their 20th annual convention, in Kingman, the clubwomen passed a resolution regarding the Colorado River and what would become Hoover Dam. The resolution was published in a 1922 edition of Arizona magazine, to

---

<sup>134</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 324.

<sup>135</sup>Margaret Wheeler Ross. The Tale is Told. p. 103. She mentioned an influenza epidemic; however, other AFWC materials refer to tuberculosis during this time.

<sup>136</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 329.

advertise the federation's position concerning Colorado River development. "The federation endorsed and approved the construction and operation of the control of the Boulder Canyon dam and its ownership by the federal government to the exclusion of all interests".<sup>137</sup> Prior to its passing the women were addressed by Judge K.E. Rollinger on "An Empire in the Building" in which he presented "such interesting data concerning the Colorado River...", a copy of which was to be placed in the club bureau, available for personal perusal.<sup>138</sup> The year 1922 witnessed Herbert Hoover's attempt to have the seven western states sign the Colorado River Compact to allocate water rights. Arizona Governor Hunt opposed the compact in 1925 and urged the state legislature to refuse to ratify it, unless a separate agreement was arranged with California and Nevada.<sup>139</sup> Governor Hunt also considered the Boulder Canyon Dam project (Hoover Dam) to be uneconomic because it would submerge other dam sites on the Colorado River and would threaten irrigation and hydropower possibilities in Arizona.<sup>140</sup>

---

<sup>137</sup>Kathryn Haughtelin. "Twentieth Annual Convention of AFWC". Arizona 12(1922):9.

<sup>138</sup>Ibid.

<sup>139</sup>Faulk. Arizona. A Short History. p. 225.

<sup>140</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 251.

The Arizona clubwomen did their best to study the facts regarding development of the Colorado River. Listed under scheduled programs for the Tucson Woman's Club, in their publication, Tucson Club Woman, was a presentation by Miss Estelle Lutrell on "The Colorado River" about its beauty, history, romance, and the possibility of water power generation.<sup>141</sup>

The Colorado River was considered a vital subject to Arizona, its clubwomen, and clubwomen in general. At the GFWC biennial held in 1922, the clubwomen approved several measures to be discussed by clubs: (1) the intelligent use of the Muscle-Shoals Plant on the Tennessee River in Alabama; (2) construction of flood-control and deep waterways transportation for the Mississippi River and its tributaries; and (3) legislation that favored early action to harness the Colorado River.<sup>142</sup>

Both the General Federation and the Arizona Federation published their resolutions in newspapers to influence the public. Tucson Woman's Club printed the resolutions in an October edition of their magazine. Sometime after the 1922 biennial, an article was written publishing the federation's support of river development: "The GFWC was

---

<sup>141</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Tucson Club Woman 1(1922):Oct. 30.

<sup>142</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925, Meeting on November 6, 1922; Tucson Club Woman 1(1922):Oct. 30.

today on record favoring development of the natural resources of the Colorado River, a comprehensive system of waterways for the United States...conservation of the national parks and improvements in rural education". The article also suggested that clubwomen demand proper development of the nation's natural resources under the principles of conservation.<sup>143</sup>

Soon after, the Northern Arizona District Federation of Women's Clubs passed a resolution to take up the study of the Colorado River Compact so that they would "be able to form an intelligent opinion on the subject".<sup>144</sup>

The Arizona Federation also concerned itself with Indian affairs, especially social welfare; however, most of their activities were beyond the scope of this study. But, at the 1924 state convention, the clubwomen passed a resolution calling for not only the building of the San Carlos Dam, but also for the impounded water to go to the Pima Indians.<sup>145</sup>

The 1927 convention hosted several conservation addresses. Mrs. Dugal Stewart gave the report on

---

<sup>143</sup>"Biennial Backs Colorado River Project". Scrapbook, Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. 1922-1924. Monday Club of Prescott.

<sup>144</sup>"Northern Arizona District Federation of Women's Clubs Holds Eighth Annual Meet with Clarkdale and Clemenceau Members". Scrapbook, Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. 1922-1924. Monday Club of Prescott.

<sup>145</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 115.

conservation of natural resources. Mr. Dwight B. Heard spoke about "An Arizona Plan for Colorado River Development". Dr. Charles Vohrees, of the University of Arizona Biology Department, followed with "Wildlife Resources of Arizona".<sup>146</sup> The clubwomen responded with passage of a resolution supporting the resolutions adopted by the Arizona Colorado River Development Association, for the protection of Arizona's rights in the Colorado River. The federation further recommended that Arizonans attempt to lay aside party politics in the interest of the "beloved" state.<sup>147</sup>

A year later, the AFWC passed a resolution asking the federal government to pass the Boulder Dam bill,<sup>148</sup> which was actually opposed by the Arizona Congressional members. Eventually, that same year, President Coolidge signed the Swing-Johnson Act, still opposed by the Arizona delegation. The act authorized the building of Boulder Dam on the Colorado River and the allotment of the water trapped behind it, according to the Colorado River Compact. Boulder Dam was completed in 1936 and named Hoover Dam.<sup>149</sup>

---

<sup>146</sup>AFWC. AFWC Executive Committee Records 1925-1932. 1927 Convention, Nogales.

<sup>147</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 133.

<sup>148</sup>Ross. Tale is told. p. 140.

<sup>149</sup>Faulk. Arizona. A Short History. p. 225.

Although individual state federations were supposed to follow the national example, occasionally they were forced to dissent. At the biennial in 1931, controversy erupted surrounding a resolution drafted by the Committee on Water and Waterways. It urged the adoption of a national policy to prevent Mississippi River Valley floods. But, as it was presented, it brought opposition from the Arizona delegates led by President Kitt due to a generalization of water and waterways. The resolution was seen as a Trojan horse to divert the waters of the Colorado River to the needs of California through operation of the Boulder Canyon Project. Despite its innocent title: "To Prevent Mississippi Valley Floods", authorship was traced to a California member of the federation. Mrs. Arkills, Arizona President, asked for the withdrawal of the original resolution to avoid embarrassing Arizona in the prosecution of its suit before the Supreme Court. A substitute resolution was offered limited to "flood control in the Mississippi Valley" and was unanimously endorsed.<sup>150</sup>

#### Wildlife Interests

Approximately nine years after federation, the clubwomen became interested in protecting bird life. In 1911, Mrs. L.M. Cady, one of the founders of the

---

<sup>150</sup>Ross, Tale is Told. p. 181-182.

Conservation Club, published an article in Western Woman, the publication of the California Women's Clubs, Arizona Music Clubs, and AFWC, asking for the preservation of desert songbirds. Based on her belief that birds were beneficial, she proposed that there be no open season on any species except the English sparrow. She claimed only a few species were injurious to ranchers; singling out the great horned owl, goshawk, duck hawk, sharp shinned hawk, copper hawk, crow, linnet, and common blackbirds. Apparently some birds of prey were not marked for protection since they were not of some human benefit. She praised enforcement of the 1900 Lacey Act prohibiting interstate commerce of birds killed in violation of local law and suggested an Audubon Society for Phoenix. Mrs. Cady recommended the desert as a good place for an introduction to the bird world due to its sparse vegetation and clean air. She also described some songbirds for identification purposes.<sup>151</sup>

Conservation of wildlife and birds was certainly a topic of the federation and it was also the activity of individual clubs, either to educate under federation standards or as more personal interest. In 1913, the Tucson Woman's Club reported that it would be hearing a

---

<sup>151</sup>Mrs. L.M. Cady. "The Conservation of Bird Life". Arizona The New State 1(1911):18-19.

presentation by Mrs. J.W. Wheeler on "Conservation of Birds". Mrs. Wheeler also planned to bring along her collection of mounted birds as visual aids.<sup>152</sup> Between 1913-1914, the federation passed a resolution calling for the conservation of birds and natural resources, after hearing an address on "The Gospel of Conservation" by Mrs. Emmons Crocker, chair of the GFWC Conservation Committee.<sup>153</sup> Programs of each state federation echoed, in local contexts, the national outlines for issues and projects.

Conservation of birds is one of the cross-over topics of the federation. Throughout this study, the literature interchangeably referred to conservation or preservation of birds. In either case, the unnecessary killings of birds concerned the clubwomen. Activism against wearing bird plumage was a popular theme during the Progressive era among many women's organizations.<sup>154</sup>

In 1924, the GFWC reiterated the federations' view regarding bird protection. Stressing the need for general public education on birds, the federation suggested ways to interest the public, such as lectures and slide shows with

---

<sup>152</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1900-1919. Meeting on March 31, 1913.

<sup>153</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 79-80.

<sup>154</sup>Merchant. "Women of the Progressive Conservation Movement".

emphasis on the birds' value based on their insect-predation. Individual clubwomen received this information through pamphlets that listed bibliographies and expert sources of help and information. The publications also discussed the meanings and efficacies of various laws.<sup>155</sup> Similar publications were distributed about wildlife and wild flower protection.

The 24th annual convention held in 1926 focused the women's conservation activism toward wildlife. The AFWC wished to go on record in favor of H.R. 7479 (S. 2607) the Migratory Bird Refuge and Marsh Land Conservation Bill before Congress at the time. The object of the bill was to better conserve migratory water fowl and other valuable wildlife, in line with careful management of natural resources, "a principle the organized clubwomen of America are (were) committed to". The women urged the Arizona delegation in Congress to help pass the bill and sent them copies of their resolution. This bill was also endorsed by the Natural History Society of Arizona and the Government Workers Along Natural History Lines in Arizona.<sup>156</sup> The Arizona clubwomen also believed that then current Arizona game laws were inflexible, ambiguous, unscientific, and

---

<sup>155</sup>AFWC. "Birds". 1924. Scrapbook, Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. Monday Club of Prescott.

<sup>156</sup>AFWC. AFWC Executive Committee Records 1925-1934. 1926.

threatened the welfare of wildlife resources that were of "inestimable" value, financially and attractively. They urged every voter to go to the polls in November 1926, to vote for Senate bill 21 to repeal Title 18 of the 1913 Arizona Penal Code and direct the legislature to enact the Fish and Game Code. They planned to send copies of their resolution to the press and other clubs to get full publicity for the bill.<sup>157</sup>

#### Forestry - Land Interests

Lumbering began in Arizona around 1881 when a mill was opened in Flagstaff and eventually named the Arizona Lumber and Timber Company in 1883. It originally produced ties for the Atlantic and Pacific Railroads being built at the time. After their completion, the mill continued operation.<sup>158</sup> Most of the Arizona timber cut between 1900-1930 was done in USFS forests and under their regulations. Due to concern over clear cutting and waste in the East and South, the federal government decided to retain what was left through forest reserves (1891 General Land Law Revision Act) and Arizona was the site of several national forests. Because of this, and the USFS's conservation

---

<sup>157</sup>Ibid., 1926.

<sup>158</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 335.

policies, many Arizonans believed lumbering would continue as a permanent industry.<sup>159</sup>

The federation's interest in conservation began with the creation of a Forestry committee in 1901, which mimicked the General Federation's standing committees. Mrs. J.H. McClintock, of Phoenix, served as the first chair.<sup>160</sup> In 1905, Mrs. McClintock presented "Forestry as an Aid to Irrigation" at the 4th annual convention. Mrs. E.W. Kendrick presented the GFWC's Forestry Committee report. It was further reported that a federation club in Palanthea, Florida requested a copy of Mrs. McClintock's paper through the Reciprocity Bureau.<sup>161</sup> But, the forestry Committee was abandoned in 1905 and the subject referred to the Civics Committee.<sup>162</sup>

The topic of forestry was not lost however; between 1908 and 1910 the federation revived its focus by creating the Standing Committee of Forestry and Children's Gardens. At the 8th convention in 1910, Miss Lucy T. Ellis presented "The Garden and the Forest".<sup>163</sup> Miss Ellis was a kindergarten teacher in Phoenix and one of the founding

---

<sup>159</sup>Ibid., p. 335.

<sup>160</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 44.

<sup>161</sup>Ibid., p. 51.

<sup>162</sup>Ibid., p. 56.

<sup>163</sup>Ibid., p. 66-67.

members of the Conservation Club that originated in Phoenix in 1910. The Club was organized and federated in 1910 and evolved from the Phoenix Spinsters' Club. Explaining the founding members' interest in conservation, Miss Ellis noted they were "all awake to the real meaning of womanhood; all breadwinners conscientious in the work they do; all believing that in work for children or humanity, school or city, national or natural resources, that the time has come when politics and sex must be eliminated; that women and men must walk side by side unselfishly and unflinchingly, when we take up a world-wide conservation". Ellis reiterated the overall clubwoman's sentiment when she stated that "The greatest things that men have ever done might have been done better with women beside them at the wheel."<sup>164</sup>

Lucy Ellis was quite an active member regarding conservation. She served as the Department of Conservation chair from 1911-1912.<sup>165</sup> Arizona was represented by Ellis as the State President of the Woman's National Rivers and Harbors Congress.<sup>166</sup> At the 1911 AFWC convention, Ellis

---

<sup>164</sup>Ibid., p. 323-324.

<sup>165</sup>Ibid., p. 72.

<sup>166</sup>Ibid., p. 73.

volunteered what she believed the term "conservation" should include.<sup>167</sup>

Through individuals such as Ellis, the federation used its maternalism to stretch the ideology of conservation to include more than the traditional concepts of what were resources and for whom they were being conserved. The federation included humanity, especially children, as a resource worthy of the same deliberate management and care. For example, Miss Ellis reported to the 10th federation convention on the National Education Association (NEA) and the Conservation Club's work with the conservation of the child.<sup>168</sup>

The state legislature created, in 1917, the Arizona Resources Board, which consisted of five members, to gather data on the state's resources and devise a means of conserving them. A Water Code that defined water rights, demarcated districts, created a water commissioner's office, and covered every phase of water problems in Arizona was also passed.<sup>169</sup>

The record does not show whether or not the AFWC was active concerning conservation during WWI. In 1918, the Tucson Woman's Club received a letter from the Federal Food

---

<sup>167</sup>Ibid., p. 75.

<sup>168</sup>Ibid., p. 76.

<sup>169</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 242-243.

Administrator in Phoenix recognizing its contribution to the goals of conservation: "We thank you for your letter of December 19th with report of the resolutions adopted by the Women's Club and for the active support your organization has given to the cause of continued conservation".<sup>170</sup>

Four years later, the GFWC was given credit in a Ladies' Home Journal article as one of five women's organizations that participated in conservation. The article discussed conservation, natural resource waste and exploitation, utilitarianism, Gifford Pinchot, and scientific forest management.<sup>171</sup> In 1923, the Woman's Club of Globe was educating itself with several programs: "Our Relation as Citizens to the Conservation of Our Nation's Resources"; "Our Own Plants and Trees"; and "Some of the Resources of our State".<sup>172</sup> The same year, the state legislature passed a resolution urging the construction of highways through the national forests as fire prevention measures.<sup>173</sup>

---

<sup>170</sup>Timothy A. Riordan, Federal Food Administrator, Phoenix. To Mande Smith, Corresponding Secretary, Tucson Woman's Club. in Tucson Woman's Club Minutes 1900-1910, 1918-1919. Tucson Woman' Club, 1918.

<sup>171</sup>Alice Amer Winter. "We and the Land God Gave Us". Ladies Home Journal. Scrapbook, Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. 1922-1924. Monday Club of Prescott.

<sup>172</sup>The Woman's Club of Globe. Yearbook 1923-1924. Civics Department Program: Oct. 12.

<sup>173</sup>History of Arizona, p. 247.

Oddly, in 1925, there was no mention of a Conservation Department, only Fine Arts; Legislation; Press and Publication; Anti-Tuberculosis; Indian Welfare.<sup>174</sup> Nevertheless, conservation topics (whether water, wildlife, or forestry) may have fallen into several of these departments.

Mrs. Mary Emma Christy, AFWC President, published an article in a 1928 edition of Progressive Arizona urging her sister clubwomen to preserve and conserve Arizona's resources. She first pushed for continuance of the federation's self-appointed job of preserving Arizona's "personality", followed by a description of the state's riches. She then asked for protection of the desert growth so that future generations could enjoy them. Mrs. Christy wanted the clubwomen to study their land: "To the end that conservation may be made of all these assets of our great state - and they are worth dollars and cents, as well as riches of the spirits to her people - we are asking each woman's club in the state to search for the things in their own loyalty that should be conserved, and guard and protect them".<sup>175</sup> Mrs. Christy was evidently aware of the commodity definition of resources as well as the concept

---

<sup>174</sup>AFWC. AFWC Executive Committee Records 1925-1934. 1925 Convention, Flagstaff.

<sup>175</sup>Mary Emma Christy. "Preserving Arizona's Personality". Progressive Arizona 5(1927):5.

of conservation for future use. She also appeared cognizant of alternative valuations of nature.

Conservation appeared to become a stronger passion for the Arizona federation than it was during its heyday in the Progressive era. President Christy published again in a 1928 edition of Progressive Arizona, urging the clubs to work with men for the advancement of the state: "...we are putting our united efforts into the work of conservation that is becoming a passion with us, for the preservation of the history and romance of Arizona". Men's work was building dams and cities. Women's duties included schools, clean-up campaigns, culture, and general community housekeeping.<sup>176</sup> At the 1928 convention, Mrs. A.J. Chandler gave an address on the flowers of the desert and stressed the need for legislation to help conservation of desert growth, with special emphasis on the state flowering plant, the saguaro. The women then discussed the "necessary zeal" for conservation.<sup>177</sup>

The following four years proved to be even more eventful than times leading up to them. During this time, Mrs. J.M. Greer, chair of conservation, kept the GFWC

---

<sup>176</sup>Mary Emma Christy. "The Arizona Clubwoman". Progressive Arizona 6(1928):26.

<sup>177</sup>AFWC. AFWC Executive Committee Records 1925-1934. 1928 Convention, Globe.

apprised of the Colorado River situation.<sup>178</sup> At the GFWC meeting held in Denver in 1930, the Arizona delegates provided a display of Arizona's resources: Arizona mining, copper products; pictures of Coolidge and Roosevelt Dams; literature on San Carlos and Salt River projects; agriculture; scenery; Indian history.<sup>179</sup>

In 1931, Phoenix was the host of the 14th biennial council of the GFWC. The Arizona clubwomen provided another special display on conservation of natural resources, with chair Mrs. D.I. Craig and Mrs. J.M. Greer in charge. They brought in several local experts to provide a scientific and factual foundation to the presentation. Superintendent of Grand Canyon National Park, M.R. Tillotson, brought a collection of 87 plants from the canyon and explained the National Park System. Miss Mead, a ranger, described Arizona flora and the part desert plants played in the lives of the human inhabitants of the desert, accompanied by a slide-show. John Jones, assistant regional forester out of Albuquerque, brought a display on forest conservation and waste from forest fire. Director of Boyce-Thompson Southwestern Arboretum, Dr. D.J. Crider, presented "Plants as a Factor of Conservation". He

---

<sup>178</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 142.

<sup>179</sup>Mrs. S.H. Bowyer. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 2(1930):6.

described the role of plants and trees in erosion prevention and pleaded for plant conservation for erosion control and beauty. There was also a collection of poisonous grasses hazardous to cattle and a variety of mounted wildlife.<sup>180</sup>

One year later, Arizona was seeking a copper tariff to help its economy. Although copper mining was the impetus for the granting of territorial status to Arizona, it did not become large-scale until around 1875.<sup>181</sup> Between 1870-1910, during the electrical revolution, copper was a critical resource and Arizona's mines quickly developed. WWI boosted the price of copper and once again, production increased.<sup>182</sup> However, by the 1930's, the entire nation was suffering economically. Arizona Governor Hunt urged the AFWC, in a special edition of Yavapai magazine that featured federation news, to support the copper tariff and to contact Congress.<sup>183</sup> The AFWC formally did so with a resolution at the 1932 convention in Prescott. Due to the decline in the copper industry, which also would affect the state's economy, health, and education, the clubwomen's specific concerns, the AFWC chose to endorse a copper

---

<sup>180</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 179, 182.

<sup>181</sup>Faulk. Arizona A Short History. p. 216.

<sup>182</sup>Ibid., p. 219-220.

<sup>183</sup>Governor Hunt. "Greetings". Yavapai 22(1932):2.

tariff.<sup>184</sup> Many of Arizona's small towns were founded by mining interests, e.g., Globe and Bisbee.

The same year, the clubwomen published their working definition of conservation in Arizona Woman magazine, the official publication of the AFWC: "Conservation today means the saving of forestry, water, soils, minerals, desert growth, animal life, and human life". President Arkills warned, however, while conserving natural resources to not forget about the children, reminiscent of Lucy Ellis' concerns 20 years earlier. Maternal housekeeping needed to be practiced at home as well as in the public sphere, to provide future generations with the "proper equipment for tomorrow, physically, mentally, morally, spiritually".<sup>185</sup> Securing their descendants' futures was always paramount to the clubwomen's maternalism. Chair of Conservation, Mrs. Craig, wrote in Arizona Woman that clubwomen realized that the "wastefulness and thoughtlessness of mankind" would soon leave their country "stripped" of its "richest heritages". This was the motive behind the women's division of conservation in the departments of education, because education must come first. They felt that "...preservation of the wild bird

---

<sup>184</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee Records. 1932 Convention, Prescott.

<sup>185</sup>Mrs. S.T. Arkills. "The President's Message". Arizona Woman 3(1932):13.

and animal life and the indigenous plant life is (was) becoming a national problem of more than passing moment". They pledged to fight to conserve the country's treasures for their children: "Yes, we still have our ruins, we have our cacti, we have our deserts, we have our lovely blue mountains, we have our forests, our birds and our wild animals. We have our history...all these we must keep with us yet, and we must keep them just as they are, or Arizona will cease to be Arizona".<sup>186</sup> The federation, at times, interchanged pleas for conservation and preservation.

#### Preservation

The preservation movement split off from the conservation movement over the issue of utilitarianism versus exclusion from use. Preservation implied protection of resources from human use, an exclusion from traditional marketability. Preservation was often aimed at specific species or land sites. It suggested a less materialistic view of nature, but allowed for nontraditional use, such as recreation which was seen as non-consumptive. Preservation activism was aimed at plant species, scenic attractions, parks, historical sites, and historic place names.

The AFWC often interchanged conservation and preservation, perhaps implying they had similar goals

---

<sup>186</sup>Mrs. D.I. Craig. "Conservation". Arizona Woman 3(1932):13.

instead of being mutually exclusive. However, the clubwomen did appear to be aware of the finer distinctions between the respective ideologies, specifically calling for one or the other depending on the situation and the natural resource.

The Arizona clubwomen got their first taste of preservation versus conservation during the controversy in California, around 1908-1910, about the Hetch-Hetchy Valley. The federation promised to cooperate with the GFWC in the interest of protecting the national parks to oppose efforts to dam Hetch-Hetchy Valley. At the request of John Muir, President of the Society for the Preservation of National Parks, the Phoenix Women's Club drew up and adopted resolutions supporting preservation of the valley and sent copies to President Roosevelt, the Interior Secretary, and Congressional members.<sup>187</sup>

The clubwomen were steadfast supporters of the national park system. In 1915, the federation passed a resolution urging combining the Grand Canyon National Monument, Kaibab National Forest, and Tusayan National Forest into a public park known as the Grand Canyon Park.<sup>188</sup> The clubwomen further urged the U.S. Department

---

<sup>187</sup>Ross. Take is Told. p. 68.

<sup>188</sup>Ibid., p. 86.

of the Interior to hasten the creation of the Grand Canyon National Park in 1916.<sup>189</sup>

The clubwomen's concerns also involved historical preservation of archaeological sites and places in Arizona. At the 14th annual convention held in 1916, the clubwomen listened to a presentation by Professor Byron Cummings, University of Arizona, on "The Preservation of Our Prehistoric Ruins".<sup>190</sup> The women were concerned with saving the state's character for future generations. In 1922, 20 years after federation, they passed a resolution against vandalism of Arizona's scenic and historic spots.<sup>191</sup> Furthermore, they printed another resolution in Arizona, The New State magazine so that every club in the state would make an effort to "preserve spots of scenic, historic and scientific interest, with the further view of forming town, county and state parks".<sup>192</sup>

The years from 1927-1932 appeared to be most prolific for the Arizona federation and its preservation ideology. Over concern for the state's rich human history, the women passed resolutions in 1927 calling for the retention of the

---

<sup>189</sup>Ibid., p. 88.

<sup>190</sup>Ibid., p. 86.

<sup>191</sup>Ibid., p. 106.

<sup>192</sup>Haughtelin. "Twentieth Annual Convention of AFWC". P. 9.

name "San Carlos" for the Coolidge Dam. The following year, the women endorsed a resolution recommending that the water impounded by Coolidge Dam be officially named "San Carlos Lake". Retention and emphasis of the historical background of this section of the state was a pet measure of the Globe Woman's Club. It influenced the U.S. Geographical Association in that direction and the lake was so named.<sup>193</sup>

The federation also deemed the preservation of Arizona's distinctive features (wildlife, desert growth, forests, antiquities) a worthwhile objective and requested specific action to forestall the loss of other historic place names.<sup>194</sup> According to President Christy, in Progressive Arizona: "Our desert growth and native shrubs must be protected, or future generations will know nothing of them. Unless we preserve the remaining evidences of our early history...much of it will fade and be gone".<sup>195</sup> The clubwomen did not appear to be very confident with all conservation efforts, or with industrialization and civilization of their state. Apparently, they felt some distinct set-asides were necessary and felt it was their

---

<sup>193</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 134.

<sup>194</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee. 1927 Convention.

<sup>195</sup>Mrs. Mary Emma Christy. "Preserving Arizona's Personality". Progressive Arizona 5(1927):5.

duty to support such measures and seek out areas that needed protection: "As in everything done in the right spirit, the benefit derived from this work will not all go to those who live after us. The better we know our own state, the more we shall love her; and there is nothing so thrilling as patriotism".<sup>196</sup> President Christy is notable for emphasis on the preservation of Arizona's chief assets - archaeological fields, fauna, flora, natural scenic localities, and original place names. She helped secure legislation for preservation of all desert plants.<sup>197</sup>

Dorothy McClintock, past chair of conservation, published an article in a 1929 edition of Western Woman, supportive of desert plant protection. She described some of the most common and spectacular of the cacti concluding: "These are only a few of the plants that Arizonans are trying to protect. These plants are an asset to Arizona because of the interest they arouse in visitors here, to say nothing of the charm they lend to the landscape for the delight of every beholder. Without our vision they will surely perish, so let us save what we can now. We'll be sorry if we don't".<sup>198</sup> The clubwomen also appeared to be

---

<sup>196</sup>Ibid., p. 5.

<sup>197</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 129,136.

<sup>198</sup>Dorothy McClintock. "Arizona - Land of Interesting Plants:." Western Woman 1(1929):7,11.

cognizant of the value of resource preservation for tourism.

The Tucson Woman's Club voted to support Senate Bill No. 3, Arizona Flora, and to send letters announcing that fact.<sup>199</sup> Chapter Eight Senate Bill No. 3 was an act to "protect native Arizona plants from destruction, mutilation and removal; to prescribe penalties for violation, and declaring an emergency". It listed protected plants and permitted takings for scientific or educational purposes. It was passed on Feb. 15, 1929.<sup>200</sup> The federation women supported the sponsors of the Arizona Flora law; thus, they attended the opening of Boyce-Thompson Southwestern Arboretum in Superior. Director Dr. F.J. Crider was active in writing and passing the flora law.<sup>201</sup> He was also a regular lecturer to the AFWC. The federation also thanked the state legislature for guarding the preservation of natural desert growth (which they felt was an echo of President Christy's administration).<sup>202</sup> The clubwomen kept the issue alive after passage of the law. During a speech to the Liberty Club, President Kitt "eulogized the beauties

---

<sup>199</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1925-1931. General Business Meeting Feb. 4, 1929.

<sup>200</sup>"Chapter Eight Senate Bill No. 3". 1929. in AFWC Executive Committee Records.

<sup>201</sup>"News". Western Woman 1(1929):9.

<sup>202</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 142-143.

of natural desert growth and deplored the cruel manner in which it is being destroyed".<sup>203</sup> Perhaps the federation was not completely convinced in the ability of the law to protect all resources.

At the 1930 GFWC convention held in Denver, AFWC President Arkills spoke, lauding Arizona clubwomen's achievements in preservation: "it was here that the women, as citizens, brought their forces to bear for the preservation and conservation of its natural resources. The women were instrumental in having a bill passed prohibiting the destruction and removal of our cactus and desert growth which was being pulled up root and branch, and taken out of the state by the carloads, only to wither and perish in foreign soil". Much of their time had been given to restoration and retention of names, landmarks, and footprints left in the state.<sup>204</sup>

In 1932, the AFWC reiterated its support of the Arizona Flora bill, pledging to help prevent destruction, mutilation, and removal of native flora.<sup>205</sup> A January edition of Arizona Republic's AFWC Section published topics

---

<sup>203</sup>Arizona Republic. "Mrs. George Kitt Talks to Members of Liberty Club". March 3, 1929. AFWC Section 2. p. 4.

<sup>204</sup>Mrs. S.R. Arkills. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 2(1930):6.

<sup>205</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee Records. Council Meeting Jan. 7, 1932.

to be considered by the clubs. One topic was the protection of native Arizona plants. The federation women reaffirmed their previous action in regard to flora conservation. Other topics included child welfare and interestingly, a proposal for building "typical Indian villages" for the Indians to sell crafts. The women desired preserving traditional artisanship while providing tourists with a taste of Arizona history.<sup>206</sup> Furthermore, Mrs. Dale Bumstead, President of the Phoenix Garden Club, published an article in Arizona Woman expressing concern over a new highway between Phoenix, Wickenburg, Salome, and Blythe. It bisected a diverse cacti area, allowing access to cacti collectors who "may travel and hunt with ease". She mentioned that the 1929 flora law had no money appropriated to fund enforcement. Out of concern for their descendants' quality of life, Mrs. Bumstead urged saving Arizona's heritage before it was gone and the state would have to act to replace the loss. She believed it was the clubwomen's duty to their children "to pass on to them a state fairer, richer, cleaner, more fruitful - with ancient landmarks preserved, old forests cared for, plants and

---

<sup>206</sup>Arizona Republic. "Club Reports are Discussed by Members". January 10, 1932. AFWC Section 2. p. 2.

animals that add so tremendously to the esthetic and economic values...".<sup>207</sup>

Although the women were champions of history and preservation, they could not always accomplish their goals. The Tucson Woman's Club had expressed interest in 1929 to give funds to help preserve Fort Lowell in Tucson. However, they were not able to do so because of a shortage of funds.<sup>208</sup>

#### Civic Improvement

The category of civic improvement is a somewhat arbitrary distinction in the attempt to catalog the federation's interests. However, because civic improvement was such an important movement in Eastern cities prior to and during the time of this study, it appeared appropriate to examine whether the Arizona clubwomen were influenced by its ideals. Civic improvement was an attempt to bring nature's ideals and perceived benefits into urban areas. It was a simultaneous national effort to clean up the residues of industrialization and return to nature to receive its ameliorating effects. Because nature was so

---

<sup>207</sup>Mrs. Dale Bumstead. "Let Us Stand by". Arizona Woman 3(1932):5-6.

<sup>208</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1925-1931. Executive Board Meeting Dec. 4, 1929.

distant to centers of civilization/industrialization, urbanites were often forced to settle for its symbols.

Supporters surrounded themselves with nature through civic activities and campaigns, nature study, and outdoor recreation, especially if travel was an option. Specifically, civic improvement involved activities such as gardening, landscaping, and tree-planting. It also covered trash removal and garbage dumping sites, opposition to billboards, and support of the highway movement. The latter two areas also can be placed under support of recreation; many of the federation's activities can be cross-referenced into other categories.

The club program of the Twentieth Century Club of the Warren District stated that the club's object was to be an intellectual center and "assist in the betterment of physical, intellectual and moral conditions of the community".<sup>209</sup> Symbols of nature were being combined with maternal housekeeping of the community. Several civic clubs joined the federation and civics was often its own department or committee.<sup>210</sup> However, the women also coined

---

<sup>209</sup>Twentieth Century Club of the Warren District, Bisbee. Yearbook 1922-1923.

<sup>210</sup>Ross. The Tale is Told. Florence Ladies Village Improvement Club; Wickenburg Civic League; Phoenix Civic League; Tucson Civic League; Mesa Civic League.

the term "civics" to imply patriotism and political studies, areas outside of this study.

By the second half of the 19th century, much of the American frontier was rapidly disappearing. Arizona was declared a territory of the U.S. separate from New Mexico in 1862, amid fervor to protect the prospects of the Sonora Exploring and Mining Co. of Cincinnati from Indians in the area. President Lincoln signed the bill with the desire to continue the development of the nation's wealth, regardless of the Civil War. Based upon a report to the House of Representatives, Arizona was advertised as a land potentially wealthy in silver and copper ore.<sup>211</sup>

The same year, 1862, the Homestead Act was passed to encourage settlement of the West. Throughout the 1870s and 1880s, Arizona was settled and developed economically by mining, some ranching and agriculture. Mineral strikes contributed significantly to the prosperity of the region, and towns with all the civil accoutrements were eventually built, transforming the wild frontier into civilization. Ranches and farms dotted the countryside to provide for the miners in the area. After the Civil War, competition for land with water was fierce between homesteaders and cattle barons lured to Arizona by California's demand for beef.<sup>212</sup>

---

<sup>211</sup>Faulk. Arizona, A Short History. p. 113-119.

<sup>212</sup>Ibid., p. 150-151.

Arizonans believed agriculture would eventually contribute as much to the future of the territory as mining. In 1873 Congress passed the Timber Culture Act which promised a settler an additional 160 acres if he planted 40 acres of trees. In 1877, Congress again encouraged settlement in the arid region with the Desert Land Act that gave title to 640 acres of land if the settler would irrigate the land.<sup>213</sup> By the 1880s, irrigation was recognized as the savior of the arid lands and water was considered the "most precious element for the farmer in Arizona".<sup>214</sup>

By 1908-1909, there were several natural resource factors working in favor of the territory's petition for statehood. The silver issue lost its significance to Arizonans since silver mining became less profitable.<sup>215</sup> However, the copper mines were producing increasing wealth; irrigated farming and ranching also were promising; and Eastern investments in the territory were high.<sup>216</sup> Past

---

<sup>213</sup>Ibid., p. 166.

<sup>214</sup>Ibid., p. 169. Statement of P. Hamilton, hired by Congress in 1881 to investigate and extol the virtues of Arizona.

<sup>215</sup>B. Mason and H. Hink. Constitutional Government in Arizona. Tempe: Arizona State University. 1972. p. 11.

<sup>216</sup>Faulk. Arizona A Short History. p. 197.

driving forces for statehood, railroad, mining, farming, were now joined by a new interest group, organized labor.<sup>217</sup> A powerful group, organized labor wanted the Arizona Constitution to be favorable to their labor interests. Their leader was George W.P. Hunt, who served as the first state governor.<sup>218</sup> The Arizona territorial legislature and the voters had previously rejected an offer of statehood in 1906, due to the stipulation of joint statehood with New Mexico.<sup>219</sup> Furthermore, Arizonans were busy showing their "civility" by building towns and cities, planting lawns and gardens in those cities, adding libraries and churches, literary clubs, etc. In addition, the telegraph and railroad, encouraged by mining and some timbering in the north had long been present in the territory.<sup>220</sup> Arizonans were increasingly aware of their maturity and started agitating for statehood around the turn of the century. Arizona's population in 1900 was 122,931; by 1910 it jumped to 204,353.<sup>221</sup>

---

<sup>217</sup>Mason and Hink. Constitutional Government in Arizona. p. 11.

<sup>218</sup>Ibid., p. 12.

<sup>219</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 197.

<sup>220</sup>Faulk. Arizona. A Short History. p. 186-188.

<sup>221</sup>Mason and Hink. Constitutional Government in Arizona. p. 44.

The Arizona Enabling Act was passed by Congress in 1910. The act required that Arizona elect delegates to the Arizona Constitutional Convention to propose a constitution. The constitution would have to be ratified by the people, then sent to Congress for approval. After this process, Arizona could hold elections for its officers. Arizona statehood was caught as a pawn between Democratic and Republican party wishes. Arizona Republicans desired a joint bipartisan slate of delegates for the convention. But, the Democrats wanted the Republicans to commit to support of the initiative, referendum, and recall, characteristics of Progressive government, which the Republicans refused to do. Furthermore, the Republicans favored a short, flexible Constitution and shied away from innovations upon the republican form of government. In contrast, the Democrats, especially labor, desired innovations such as the initiative, referendum, and recall, including judges. The Democrats won overwhelming representation at the convention, especially the liberals who supported Progressive ideals.<sup>222</sup>

In 1911 Arizona voters passed the Constitution that included the Progressive ideals of initiative, referendum, and recall. Congress and President Taft were opposed to

---

<sup>222</sup>Ibid., p. 12-14.

the recall of judges, which they saw as incompatible with the "republican form of government". In order to obtain statehood, Arizonans were coerced into passing an amendment that excepted judges from recall. It was known that President Taft had criticized Progressive measures in the recently adopted Oklahoma Constitution and it was feared Taft's opposition to such a radical constitution as Arizona's may cost the Territory its statehood. After Congress approved Arizona's Constitution, President Taft issued a proclamation admitting Arizona as the 48th state on February 14, 1912. However, at the first general election held in Arizona later that year, Arizonans restored the judicial recall provision to the Constitution.<sup>223</sup> Thus, after a long, politically-tinged battle, the mood of the new state residents was still Progressive.<sup>224</sup> Furthermore, Arizonans were quite enthusiastic about proving their worth to the nation through development of their state's resources and "civilizing" it to the best of their ability. The first state legislature voted to enfranchise women and passed a fish and game code.<sup>225</sup> Democracy, equitable resource development, conservation, the back to nature movement, and

---

<sup>223</sup>Ibid., p. 18-20.

<sup>224</sup>Ibid., p. 201.

<sup>225</sup>Sloan. History of Arizona. p. 235.

civilization of the West were synthesized through the Progressive clubwomen's interest in civic improvement. Furthermore, the clubwomen's pursuit of the Progressive urban ideals of decency and order led to their examination of township affairs.

The same year as statehood, Mrs. Sidney Newsom, president in 1912, reported in Arizona, The New State that some of the civic activities the federation had participated in included municipal cleaning day, a house to house canvass, and tree planting. At that time, approximately 22 clubs, with a total membership of 800 women, were federated in Arizona.<sup>226</sup> The earliest recorded reference to tree-planting was 1908, when the Forestry Department reported planting trees for "civic" beauty and shade around homes, schools and city streets.<sup>227</sup>

In 1916, the oldest club in the federation, the Monday Club of Prescott, reported in Arizona, The New State magazine that its past activities included planting shade trees on school grounds and city streets; they beautified the city plaza which used to be "piles of rock, cacti, weeds, and sandy stretches".<sup>228</sup> Three years later, in

---

<sup>226</sup>Mrs. Sidney Newsom. "Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs". Arizona 2(1912):4-5.

<sup>227</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 68.

<sup>228</sup>Margaret Wheeler Ross. "The Oldest Woman's Club in Arizona". Arizona 6(1916):5-6,9,16.

1919, the federation passed a resolution to plant trees along the Lincoln Highway, Borderland route, state highways, and public parks as memorials to the dead in WWI.<sup>229</sup> The same year, the Casa Grande Woman's Club convinced their city council to purchase grounds for a park with the understanding the Woman's Club would eventually erect a building in the center.<sup>230</sup>

Between 1922-1927, the federation was involved in several activities. In 1923, they reported additional tree planting and city beautification.<sup>231</sup> They sponsored Arbor Days and Bird Days. The 21st convention adjourned for a "Federation Tree Planting" to observe Arbor Day.<sup>232</sup> President, Mrs. T.H. Cureton, reported in Arizona, The New State magazine that homemaking and plain housekeeping could be found in disguise at regular club meetings. The clubwomen were trying to rid the world of "vice, illiteracy, graft, and unrighteousness" so that they could live better in their own homes. They listened to talks pertinent to home, children, citizenship, education, and

---

<sup>229</sup>Ross. The Tale is Told. p. 99; Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925. Meeting April 7, 1919.

<sup>230</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925. Meeting Oct. 27, 1919.

<sup>231</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Tucson Clubwoman 1(1925):April 23, 1923.

<sup>232</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 110.

public welfare. These women were covertly working for the advancement of their state's natural resources and natural attractions and desired sharing the "gifts that Nature has bestowed with such a lavish hand". "Through the women's clubs", according to Mrs. Cureton, their "towns have been made cleaner, ...homes more attractive, vacant lots improved and trees and flowers have been planted. Where these improvements greet the eye, the visitor may be sure a progressive Woman's Club exists". The state federation pledged its assistance with promotion of state progress and expansion.<sup>233</sup>

In 1925, the Tucson Woman's Club drafted a resolution endorsing the movement to preserve Sentinel Peak as the property of the City of Tucson to be used for public purposes.<sup>234</sup> At the 1926 convention, Mrs. Albert Smith of Phoenix, presented "The Valley Beautiful" - a discussion of how Phoenix people had become interested in community beautification, followed by other valley towns, resulting in great "improvement" everywhere.<sup>235</sup> A year later, because the Tucson Woman's Club believed that "good roads

---

<sup>233</sup>Mrs. T.H. Cureton. "The Part That Women's Clubs Play in the Life and Upbuilding of the State". Arizona 13(1924):1, 11.

<sup>234</sup>Tucson's Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925. Special Board Meeting Oct. 7, 1925.

<sup>235</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 123.

contributed to the development and prosperity of Arizona", and because the federation had requested that individual clubs interest themselves in the better highways movement, they passed a resolution supporting House Bill 127, the Highways Bill.<sup>236</sup>

The years from 1929-1932 proved to be as fruitful for civic improvement as they had been for preservation. The Phoenix Woman's Club, largest in the federation, desired to go on record as having accomplished something worthwhile in the development of better parks for the city. They were also planning a Park and Playground Association.<sup>237</sup> At the 27th convention in Casa Grande, Miss Francis Brown, chair of the American Homes department, presented "Some Simple Principles of Home Beautification" and conducted a landscaping demonstration for the desert home.<sup>238</sup> This was also announced in the AFWC section of the Arizona Republic.<sup>239</sup> In addition, the President of State University, Dr. Homer Shantz, spoke to the convention about building homes in the desert and gave suggestions for saving water and land conservation. Afterwards, the

---

<sup>236</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925. Special Board Meeting Oct. 7, 1925.

<sup>237</sup>AFWC. Western Woman 1(1929):15.

<sup>238</sup>AFWC News. Western Woman 1(1929):8.

<sup>239</sup>Arizona Republic April 14, 1929. AFWC Section 2. p. 12.

federation passed several resolutions. Because the state invested taxpayers' money into state highways, the clubwomen felt that one return should be the "full enjoyment of outdoor beauty..."; therefore, billboards should not be allowed to detract from scenic areas. The federation declared that signs which interfere with this right should be restricted to the commercial district. The clubwomen vowed to individually and collectively protest billboards in scenic areas to the advertisers.<sup>240</sup>

The Arizona Federation's opposition to billboards grew even stronger in 1930. The GFWC conservation slogan, "Favor the firms which favor the scenery", became the rallying cry of the Arizonans. Each club was urged in an Arizona Woman Article to recommend three methods of action to fight billboards. They could pledge to favor products not advertised on the landscape; publish that action in the local press; or send a statement of opposition to every firm using the rural billboards in their area.<sup>241</sup>

During this time, the clubwomen published a couple of articles regarding gardening. They focused on specialty gardens such as rock gardens and lily ponds, accompanied by

---

<sup>240</sup>AFWC. AFWC Executive Records. 1929 Convention, Casa Grande.

<sup>241</sup>Mrs. C.H. Prather. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 1(1930):10.

descriptions and how-to information.<sup>242</sup> They also listened to presentations: Miss Josephine Wallace spoke on gardens accompanied by illustrations<sup>243</sup> and Mrs. Dale Bumstead, President of the Phoenix Garden Club, read a paper titled "Gardens".<sup>244</sup>

The federation had been active in the beautification of their communities, America Beautiful campaigns, and highways. They were concerned with the welfare of the children of the state, better homes and community life, and protection of the motherhood of the state.<sup>245</sup>

#### Nature Study

Nature study is the most comprehensive categorization of the federation's natural resource activities. Studying nature and specific issues served to educate the women regarding conservation, preservation, civics, etc. It also provided the women with a means to bring them closer to the world of nature, perhaps as the escape that nature study was said to be.

---

<sup>242</sup>Elizabeth Schofield. "The Alluring Lily Pond". Western Woman 1(1929):14; Mrs. A.C. Armbruster. "Rock Gardens". Arizona Woman 1(1930):6,15 and Arizona Woman 1(1930)6; Mrs. A.J. Chandler. "Origin and History of the Garden Club of America". Arizona Woman 3(1932):11.

<sup>243</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes. Meeting Nov. 2, 1931.

<sup>244</sup>AFWC. Executive Records. 1932 Convention, Prescott.

<sup>245</sup>N. Bess Prather. "Short History of the Arizona Federation". Arizona Woman 1(1930).

Nature study connoted many things to the federation. It meant self-education and preparation for public education. It was a means for the women to apprise themselves of current legislation and influence future law; it also was pertinent to GFWC projects and AFWC state projects. Furthermore, nature study was engaged in for mere enjoyment of nature. For this study, nature study was identified by essays, presentations, photos, and poetry covering natural resource topics. The women tended to favor agriculture, forestry, scenic attractions, mining, conservation, preservation, and reclamation. Special speakers were brought in and scientific experts consulted.

Nature study fit "naturally" into the clubwomen's efforts to educate themselves about their environment. At the first state convention, 1902, the clubwomen listened to two presentations: "Forestry" by Mrs. J.H. McClintock and "Mining in Arizona" by Miss Fish.<sup>246</sup> Several years later, a female representative of the USFS, Mrs. C.T. McGlone, spoke at the 1907 convention on "Our Forests".<sup>247</sup>

Etta Gifford Young, a federation member, published several natural resource-oriented articles as associate editor of Arizona, The New State between 1912-1913. It is unclear whether she published these articles under the

---

<sup>246</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 317.

<sup>247</sup>Ibid., p. 57.

auspices of the federation. However, mention of her provides an excellent example of the fact that Arizona clubwomen were interested in this genre of writing and reading. Some examples of Young's writing were: "Agriculture in the Mining Counties";<sup>248</sup> "The North Dominion Copper Mining and Development Corporation";<sup>249</sup> "White Mountains are Angler's Paradise";<sup>250</sup> "San Xavier del Bac".<sup>251</sup>

In 1913, the Tucson Woman's Club reported hosting a lecture by Dr. Pearson from the Audubon Society.<sup>252</sup> Some clubwomen had expressed a desire to start a local Audubon Society. A few years later, 1916, the delegates to the federation convention enjoyed "More Interest in the Natural Wonders of Arizona", by Mrs. George Juleff of Bisbee.<sup>253</sup> They also heard a presentation on prehistoric ruins preservation.

---

<sup>248</sup>Etta Gifford Young. "Agriculture in the Mining Counties". Arizona 3(1912):8.

<sup>249</sup>Ibid., "The North Dominion Copper Mining and Development Corporation." Arizona 6(1912):9.

<sup>250</sup>Ibid., "White Mountains are Angler's Paradise". Arizona 3(1913):8.

<sup>251</sup>Ibid., "San Xavier del Bac". Arizona 3(1913):4.

<sup>252</sup>Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes. Meeting Dec. 1, 1913.

<sup>253</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 86.

In 1921, the Monday Club of Prescott examined the most scenic places in the country by using magazine pictures, "The Beauty Spots of America". They dedicated the whole afternoon to the subject of natural scenery.<sup>254</sup> Ordinary wilderness did not suit the tastes of the typical American urban nature-lover. Scenic appreciation required the most unique, spectacular, or sublime of nature. Nature-lovers sought "arcadia", defined as a "scene of simple pleasure and untroubled quiet".<sup>255</sup> Scenic beauty was considered an art form. Photographs provided the proper blending of reality and art, and effectively preserved the arcadian vision of nature. Photographs were as precisely composed as landscaping. Both eliminated unwanted intrusions and isolated the best of natural scenery,<sup>256</sup> creating an "unreal" or perhaps "surreal" depiction of nature. The clubwomen did not seem to be disturbed by their dependence upon the literature's interpretation of "scenery". Thus, they may have fallen prey to (or followed loyally) the pastoral or grandeur ideals of natural beauty - they too, sought "arcadia". However, photographs did provide the first views of the national parks and monuments for future

---

<sup>254</sup>Monday Club of Prescott. Minutes of the Literature Section 1920-1922. Meeting March 21, 1921.

<sup>255</sup>Schmitt. Back to Nature. p. xix.

<sup>256</sup>Ibid., p. 147.

tourists and helped generate interest in visiting the sites.

Records of nature study increase in the later 1920s into the 1930s, like the other areas of natural resource concern. In 1926, the federation was in the midst of purchasing and mailing nonfiction books representative of Arizona for the GFWC library. The topics they chose included Arizona history, the Colorado River, pioneers, and scenic descriptions. Some of the authors included sometime member and state historian, Sharlot Hall, and husbands of several clubwomen.<sup>257</sup> The same year, Mrs. A.Y. Smith, of Pierce, spoke to the Benson Woman's Club about Arizona landscapes. She also brought along oil paintings of Arizona landscapes, which she painted.<sup>258</sup> At the 1928 convention the federation listened to two nature-oriented presentations. Mrs. A.J. Chandler spoke on "Flowers of the Desert". She also appealed for the preservation of cacti. Mrs. Albert Smith presented "Secrets of Windsown Acres" about the lure of the desert in spring, accompanied by pictures of the Arizona desert.<sup>259</sup> Presentations regarding the desert and its plants, especially the flowers, seemed

---

<sup>257</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee Records. 1926 Convention.

<sup>258</sup>Benson Woman's Club. Minutes 1926-1930. Meeting Dec. 9, 1926.

<sup>259</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 154.

to be favorites of the clubwomen. In 1929, Ethel Musgrave published an article in Western Woman, a magazine for AFWC news, called "A Desert Miracle", describing the night blooming cereus cacti and the surrounding scene.<sup>260</sup>

In 1930, the Arizona federation chose its state flower, the saguaro.<sup>261</sup> In 1931, Mrs. D.I. Craig recommended making the cactus wren the federation bird. The Arizona Legislature had recently adopted the cactus wren as the state bird.<sup>262</sup> Mrs. D.I. Craig was "influential in bringing the matter up for adoption".<sup>263</sup> Concurrently, President Arkills mentioned in her "Message" to clubwomen, printed in Arizona Woman, that the Arizona chair of conservation of natural resources had been actively surveying various clubs relative to choosing a state bird. The national chair had requested that the AFWC choose a federation bird before the national biennial that was to be held in Phoenix.<sup>264</sup> Surveys of the Arizona federation showed that the cactus wren was the favorite;

---

<sup>260</sup>Ethel Musgrave. "A Desert Miracle". Western Woman 1(1929):2.

<sup>261</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 149.

<sup>262</sup>Ibid., p. 160

<sup>263</sup>N. Bess Prather. "Sahuaro Blossom and Cactus Wren for State Federation". Arizona Woman. 2(1931):21.

<sup>264</sup>Mrs. S.T. Arkills. "Message from the President". Arizona Woman 2(1931):4.

thus, the executive committee recommended its acceptance.<sup>265</sup> President Arkills mentioned in another Arizona Woman "Message" that Nature Magazine would publish a special issue on official state birds in cooperation with the GFWC chair of conservation of natural resources, Mrs. K.B. Tippetts. There would be pictures and descriptive text plus five pages by Mrs. Tippetts on the birds and their method of selection.<sup>266</sup>

At the 1931 national GFWC biennial council held in Phoenix, the division of natural resources heard several nature study presentations. Dr. Forrest Shreve, director of the Carnegie Institute Desert Laboratory in Tucson, spoke on the desert and its many forms. Miss Pauline Mead, a ranger-naturalist at Grand Canyon National Park, spoke about the giant cactus, the saguaro, the state flower. Mrs. S.T. Arkills reported on Arizona's adoption of the cactus wren as the state bird and that it was also named as the Arizona federation bird.<sup>267</sup>

Arizona Woman, the official magazine of the AFWC, often published news along with articles of general interest to the clubwomen. Nature poetry, outdoors photos,

---

<sup>265</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee. Board Meeting March 25, 1931.

<sup>266</sup>Mrs. S.T. Arkills. "President's Message". Arizona Woman 3 (1931):11.

<sup>267</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 172.

and essays were part of the normal fare. One example of nature writing was "Arizona, Land of Contrasts". It examined the stereotypical image of the barren desert, too ugly and forbidding for life, but also included that the real desert always had some vegetation, and that the seasonal rains resulted in beautiful flowering. There were also animals, lakes, streams, and varying landscapes. The article noted Arizona also had its own natural history, combined with human achievements, such as reclamation dams and irrigation.<sup>268</sup> All the nature-oriented articles were enthusiastic about Arizona for its scenic attractiveness and its economic potential. Furthermore, the authors of the entries were not only clubwomen. Some pieces were written by local "experts" and by some federation husbands. Some examples were: "Conservation of Arizona's Wild Life", by Fred Gibson, President of the Arizona Game Protective Association in 1931;<sup>269</sup> "The Green Wealth of Arizona's Forest", by USFS Tonto Forest Superintendent T.T. Swift;<sup>270</sup> and "Ineffectiveness of Plant Protection Law", by F.J.

---

<sup>268</sup>Ethel Musgrave. "Arizona, Land of Contrasts". Arizona Woman 3(1931):5

<sup>269</sup>Fred Gibson. "Conservation of Arizona's Wild Life". Arizona Woman 3(1932):16.

<sup>270</sup>T.T. Swift. "The Green Wealth of Arizona's Forest". Arizona Woman 3(1932):19.

Crider, Director of Boyce-Thompson Southwestern Arboretum.<sup>271</sup>

In 1931 the Junior branch of the federation reported that programs had been sent to each club on a variety of subjects, including nature study and preservation of roadside beauty.<sup>272</sup>

### Recreation

The last category of activities of the federation clubwomen is recreation. It is the smallest of the five distinct areas of their natural resource interests. Furthermore, some of the issues also fall into other categories, such as preservation. Outdoor recreation was a new concept at the turn of the century. Its origins can be found in the "back to nature" movement for the wholesome, healing spirit of nature. It is partially a reaction to the confines of the city and a nascent response to the growing valuation of nature and redefinition of the uses of a natural resource. Recreation is also one of the original "nonconsumptive" or passive uses of resources.

Recreation implied outdoor activity, but not necessarily rugged outback hiking. It was a search for the

---

<sup>271</sup>F.J. Crider. "Ineffectiveness of Plant Protection Law". Arizona Woman 3(1932):9.

<sup>272</sup>Mrs. Paul Siberts. "Junior Activities". Arizona Woman 3(1931):7.

wholesome, fresh air healing of nature and relaxation. A recreation influence could be found in tourism, scenic appreciation, designation of the national and state parks, city playgrounds and kindergartens.

Specific reference to recreation occurred as early as 1909. Lucy Ellis, the founder of the Conservation Club, published an article in The Earth magazine extolling the benefits of children's kindergartens and playgrounds. She mentioned the potential betterment of the "back to nature" movement for health. Children could become composites of the outdoor's characteristics - robust health. Playgrounds were introduced into city life to provide a substitute source of the physical pleasures of country life. The movement gained professional standing and underwent a change in goals. Social awareness was introduced into child's play.<sup>273</sup> Presumably, professional educators combined outdoor exercise and fresh air with young children's education in an urban setting, perhaps to give their minds a respite (conservation of the child) or provide another means of learning. Phoenix had one of the first kindergartens, part of the "versatile and progressive growth of the valley".<sup>274</sup>

---

<sup>273</sup>Schmitt. Back to Nature. p. 74-75.

<sup>274</sup>Lucy T. Ellis. "A Garden Kindergarten". The Earth 6(1909):32.

Federation records occasionally mentioned recreational activities themselves. Often as highlights to meetings, or promotions of the state, the clubwomen would take scenic drives or visit historical or natural attractions. For instance, the grand finale of the 1922 convention was an auto trip to the Oatman gold camp, over a scenic highway. Special guides were provided to escort the clubwomen through the big plant at the mines.<sup>275</sup> In 1929, there was reference to the Desert Rambler Club for women who desired outdoor meetings. Mrs. Ellen Cooper planned many trips of interest to the local members and for winter tourists. The club also built and dedicated a concrete picnic table in Papago Park in 1925.<sup>276</sup> When Arizona hosted the 1931 14th biennial council of the GFWC in Phoenix, the majority of delegates attending the convention took time to visit the Grand Canyon prior to returning home.<sup>277</sup>

The Century Club of Phoenix was founded in 1921 with a membership of primarily business and professional women. To further their "service", they purchased 30 acres of pine forest land in the Sierra Ancha Mountains, 30 miles from Roosevelt Dam. Their plan was to build a lodge and

---

<sup>275</sup>Haughtelin. "Twentieth Annual Convention of AFWC". p. 9.

<sup>276</sup>Western Woman 1(1929):8.

<sup>277</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 179.

cottages to accommodate women to vacation, in their own state, and to enjoy the "beneficial air of the mountains and pines". The members created a summer camp atmosphere with a swimming pool, natural amphitheater, and a tributary from Rose Creek. The women advertised their camp in a 1929 edition of Western Woman: "in a very ecstasy of delight it [the creek] babbles over the rocks and stones and among the roots of watercress and mint, until it splashes over, a miniature waterfall, into the swimming pool". The summer camp was a "...delightful spot for those seeking rest and inspiration...".<sup>278</sup> Organized camping provided fresh air and recreation without having to "rough" it. Such summer camps as the Century Club's were often resort-like in structure, yet they encouraged communion with nature.<sup>279</sup>

It is unclear whether these women encouraged or allowed only women to their camp or whether husbands were able to attend. Professional women of the time might have been more likely single or at least childless. However, this is the only reference seen regarding women, specifically, seeking respite and creating the means for it without others' assistance.

The federation did specifically support outdoor recreation. Mrs. T.H. Cureton, President from 1922-1924,

---

<sup>278</sup>Western Woman 1(1929):8.

<sup>279</sup>Schmitt. Back to Nature. p. 97-99.

recommended the establishment of state parks and tourist camping grounds.<sup>280</sup> Along with other natural resource presentations, Mr. A.W. Hennrikus, of Phoenix, spoke at the 1928 convention about recreation and outlined his proposal for a State Recreation Club near Prescott.<sup>281</sup> A year later, the Phoenix Woman's Club announced in Western Women magazine that it was planning a Park and Playground Association.<sup>282</sup> The chair of the Parks and Playgrounds Committee for the Phoenix Woman's Club published an article supportive of parks and playgrounds in the same issue. She believed parks and playgrounds were the greatest asset a city could have. It was a national duty to maintain recreational opportunities for all citizens, so that each person could learn to appreciate the beauty in life while building toward active citizenship. A sense of space could be found via contact with nature. Ms. St. Claire reiterated the GFWC slogan: "Recreation for every citizen, and every citizen for recreation!"<sup>283</sup> Her article demonstrated the shift in recreation from mere outdoor, country activity to an urban-based social and educational activity, while outdoors.

---

<sup>280</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 109.

<sup>281</sup>AFWC. Executive Committee. 1928 Convention.

<sup>282</sup>Western Woman, 1(1929):15.

<sup>283</sup>Anne St. Claire. Western Woman 1(1929):18.

Urban parks originally were pastoral scenes designed for easy care and spiritual calming. Parks, representative of moral value in nature, eventually were promoted to replace urban development as emblems of progress. However, landscaped city parks came to symbolize the wealthy lifestyle, providing little freedom from physical restraint, which the laboring classes were believed to need. The perception of parks as not providing physical opportunities led to the design of children's playgrounds and inclusion of outdoor recreation sites within the parks. Urban parks metamorphosed from pastoral scenes forbidding walking on the grass to fields and lots designed for physical play.<sup>284</sup>

---

<sup>284</sup>Schmitt. Back to Nature. p. 70-75.

## CHAPTER V

## DISCUSSION

For the purpose of this study, five categories of activity were identified: conservation, preservation, civic improvement, nature study, and recreation. These five categories were specifically chosen because they represent the basic complementary and competing resource ideologies of the time in question, 1900-1932. The AFWC did not choose to support only one of these concepts. Instead it chose to support all five, often combining activities and sharing benefits. Some of the federation's resource concerns crossed into other categories, while others were only addressed within specific category.

The Arizona federation's concern with conservation originated in 1902 with the federation women's interest in forestry. Conservation was associated with utilitarianism, rational forest management and resource sustainability for future use, in addition to flood-water reservoirs and overall rational management of natural resources. The women probably became interested in forestry through their civic activities, especially tree planting in relation to city beautification.

Conservation was applied to a variety of resources: forests, water, flora, fauna, and humanity. The women promoted scientific forest management, following the

principles of Pinchot. They advocated reclamation projects for water storage and irrigation to aid agriculture in the state. They especially desired the development of the Colorado River, in the name of economic development and progress. They also advocated conservation or rational taking of birdlife and wildlife through refuges and hunting regulations.

Overall conservation of natural resources differed from the clubwomen's advocacy of preservation. The ideals of protection or exclusion from human use were applied mostly to individual or specific resources. The term, preservation, first showed up in records around 1908, in response to the Hetch-Hetchy Valley controversy in California. The General Federation and the state federations all endorsed saving the valley from flooding and maintaining the integrity of the national parks. National parks were areas not to be developed.

The AFWC was probably first introduced to protection of resources through nature study. They applied the idea of protection to national parks, desert plants, scenic and historic spots, and historic names. The clubwomen did not arbitrarily designate a resource for exclusion from use. They tended to focus on the spectacular, such as the grand scenery of the national parks. They also favored historical places or objects that could not be replaced,

and thus should be saved for future generations to learn from, or an exceptional species that grew nowhere else, such as desert cacti. If a resource could not be easily replaced, substituted, repaired, or grown quickly, the clubwomen seemed to prefer its exclusion from consumptive use. Other resources, such as trees or water, the more seemingly renewable ones, were designated for efficient management with future needs in mind.

The Arizona federation was founded with service as one goal of the clubwomen. A natural extension of their maternalism and household duties was municipal housekeeping. Civic improvement, in the physical sense, was the self-assigned responsibility of the progressively-minded clubwomen. The Arizona clubwomen started with tree plantings in 1908. Trees were planted for shade, beauty, and memorial. The women expanded into municipal cleaning, promoting city parks, gardening, home beautification and landscaping, the highways movement, and anti-billboard campaigns. The clubwomen worked to improve their human-made, "artificial" environment with the symbols of nature and substitutes that they associated with the qualities of nature. However, support of civic improvement meant an association and acceptance of the Romantic era ideals of "nature". Nature in the civilized environment was custom designed to fit a pastoral ambiance and provide the healing

essence of nature, rather than being wild and untouched by human influence.

The Arizona clubwomen began their investigation of nature with their entrance into the GFWC. Nature study fit well into their goal of self-education and giving lectures to practice their public presentation skills. They started with the topics of forestry and mining in 1902. Additional topics included: conservation, preservation, agriculture, natural wonders, scenery, flora, fauna, and pertinent natural resource legislation. The study of nature was carried on throughout the time period of interest. It was an end in itself and it served to aid other categories of natural resource activity.

The Arizona clubwomen's interest in the new area of recreation began with their concern with the kindergarten movement and support of the park and playground movement about 1908. The women addressed the ideals of recreation and the benefits of outdoor activity through parks, playgrounds, kindergartens, scenic drives, natural attractions, and outdoor activity. The clubwomen supported the new belief in the healing essence of nature through its aesthetic enjoyment and relaxation in its "natural" setting. They practiced and promoted tourism to scenic attractions and supported the national park system. Of course, tourism would not have been an option were it not

for the clubwomen's socio-economic status. Tourism required money, time, and automobiles, three luxuries the common woman probably did not have.

The Arizona clubwomen were trying to accomplish one basic goal in regard to the use of natural resources: they desired the careful perpetuation of the nation's heritage for the use of future generations. The women saw two means to accomplish this, conservation and preservation, determined by the type of resource and its present and potential uses. Although most of the resources that the clubwomen addressed could be defined as "renewable", some were more readily renewed or more obviously replaceable.

The federation women never directly categorized resources in this manner; however, their behavior and choice of action suggest this form of labeling. The more obviously renewable resources were trees, water, and wildlife. Their yearly growth increment was sufficient for harvest or their replacement rates seemed rapid enough to prevent exhaustion or extinction of the resource. They were also more readily identifiable as commodities, fulfilling definite human needs, often exchanged in a market-type setting. For these types of resources, the clubwomen tended to advocate conservation. They promoted wise-use and rational management with consideration for future use. They also supported the development and

current use of these same resources in the pursuit of progress and civilization of the state and the nation as a whole. They promoted reclamation of arid lands for agriculture and control over water resources. Evidenced by such wording as "harnessing" the Colorado River, the clubwomen supported human conquest of nature. The alienating "man vs. nature" philosophy that encouraged such beliefs drove the settlement of the American continent. Such beliefs also permitted the exploitation of and continuing waste of natural resources, and ignored alternative valuation of nature's gifts as anything more than commodities.

The less renewable resources that the clubwomen were concerned with were native cacti, scenery and landscapes, and Arizona history. The women advocated protection -- exclusion from human use -- for these resources specifically. They promoted nonconsumptive uses, such as viewing and recreation. Furthermore, they advocated no use of some resources because they were at too great a risk of depletion or permanent loss. The clubwomen were equally concerned about future enjoyment of these resources as they were of the commodities. These resources were valued for their aesthetic beauty or irreplaceable heritage. They were often referred to as symbols of the state's individuality or of the nation. Thus, in regard for some

resource preservation, the clubwomen also appeared to support alternative valuation of nature's gifts as something more than mere commodities to be used willy-nilly. Some parts of nature were not to be conquered, rather they were to be awed as "God's" creation for the enjoyment of his peoples.

The historical split between utilitarian conservation and preservation did not seem to affect the activities of the Arizona clubwomen. Both conservation and preservation served their interests in development of the state. As a group, the clubwomen were able to reconcile the two main competing ways to value nature: either nature was a resource available for human consumption or nature had intrinsic value outside of direct human consumption or consideration. Both resource ideologies aided the women's definition of progress - neither advocated consumption of all natural resources without regard for the future. Utilitarian conservation provided the means to manage resource-use wisely and equitably with regard to perpetuation of the resources. Preservation protected certain resources from human exploitation. The federation believed that the state's historical artifacts must be preserved for the future to see. Furthermore, some natural history must be protected to reveal the spirit of nature

and to help people cope with the ailments of progress and civilization.

The clubwomen were concerned about materialism, resource waste, and the rate of industrialization. They had not been previously consulted on civic matters that they felt concerned them or would benefit from their input. Therefore, clubwomen used natural resources as a means to exert their influence upon the direction the state and nation were going. They did not oppose advancement and progress, they simply regretted the residues that they felt duty-bound to clean-up. Therefore, they chose an activist solution instead of a retroactive one. Influencing the nation into accepting and practicing the ideals of conservation and preservation made their lives more pleasant and would improve the future quality of their children's and grandchildren's lives.

The clubwomen protected their actions by building on a foundation of the ideology of the lady, her revered morality, and her household duties. The Woman had always been a preserver and conserver in the home, her domain. The neighborhood and community were natural extensions of that domain. Civic improvements were local, close-to-home activities that she could directly affect. Furthermore, the clubwomen could maintain control and credit for the benefits they had created. In addition, the clubwomen were

not directly competing with large lobbies or interfering with powerful men. However, the federation women's support of large-scale conservation and preservation measures in the state may have required a greater element of risk than promoting civic reform.

The clubwomen's support of preservation gave them specific resources or activities upon which to focus their energies. They passed many resolutions voicing support of conservation actions, e.g., water development and wildlife refuges. It appears that the clubwomen left the actual rational management of natural resources to male experts, and instead, provided verbal and written support of their efforts. In contrast though, the women chose to take on specific preservation issues. The clubwomen took direct credit for local civic activities and a few preservation-associated state activities, e.g., town cleanups, the name of San Carlos Lake and the Arizona Flora Bill. Moreover, they passed resolutions calling for the direct action of clubwomen, e.g., to look for spots worthy of protection and to protest billboards.

Perhaps this distinction was due to the way each ideology was officially enacted. Preservation was more an action of legislatures. The Arizona, or federal, legislature could declare a particular piece of land as protected, e.g., wildlife refuge, park, monument, from

resource exploitation. The legislature could also pass a bill requiring conservation practices for forest reserves. However, the actual planning and implementation of those practices and management of resources were left to government agencies. Therefore, the clubwomen might have been more successful at influencing legislators through voting pressure (theirs, relatives, general public). Government technicians, appointed to their positions, were immune to electoral pressures.

Historically, women formed voluntary associations to deal with matters of social welfare and their own well-being. But, women were barred from electoral and party politics until 1920. Regardless, female federations pursued legislation that American women felt was in the best interests of the nation.<sup>285</sup> Women's groups adapted existing nonpolitical models of organization - the clubs - for their political purposes and were successful. The club departmental structure permitted focus on several goals.<sup>286</sup> The departmental design of the federation designated committees to individually research issues. The committees would then report back to the federation as a whole, thereby educating every club and club member to many

---

<sup>285</sup>Skocpol. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. p. 318.

<sup>286</sup>Clemens. "Organizational Repertoires and Institutional Change".

competing issues in an orderly fashion without forcing the clubs to neglect one interest for another due to time constraints.

The clubwomen's political expression took shape mainly in public education and lobbying. The women linked education to social policy demands, and educated public opinion to secure legislation. They also educated themselves on political science to aid their cultivation of male electorate sympathizers. Furthermore, the clubwomen created legislative committees and sent officers to testify at meetings on bills. Numerous organizations helped pass a wealth of "maternalist welfare" legislation during the Progressive period. Lobbying was one of the few methods of political influence open to women. However, lobbying had been previously associated with bribery and illicit interests. The clubwomen's activities linked their professionalism and educated expertise to the art of lobbying. Their efforts resulted in the legitimization of lobbying as an avenue for special interest groups to exert influence on the political arena.<sup>287</sup>

#### Conclusion

This study was specifically concerned with the period from 1900 to 1932. From 1900-1916, the height of

---

<sup>287</sup>Ibid., p. 783-785.

Progressive conservation, federal concern focussed mainly on managing trees, land and water, performed by experts in government. The 1920s witnessed a greater acceptance of conservation by the general populace and a focal change to wildlife with a continuing concern with water development.

Natural resource interests were part of the AFWC's foundation when it was federated in 1902. The "back to nature" movement was losing its greatest influence in the East about this same time. However, Arizona was still a territory. Although not a frontier anymore, the state (created in 1912) was certainly not as urbanized as the East. The clubwomen expressed sincere desire to aid the progress of the state. It would be natural to surmise that the "back to nature" or nature-lovers' movement, identified by Peter Schmitt, was influential in Arizona during the early 20th century. Arizona clubwomen exhibited classic characteristics of the movement, and thus serve as a good example as a delayed, Western response to the nature lovers' movement. Specifically, the clubwomen supported the parks and playground movement; some members also participated in kindergartens. They promoted and enjoyed scenic attractions and natural wonders. Garden clubs were federated and advice passed on for landscaping homes and designing theme gardens. The federation also studied nature and nature-oriented art.

Carolyn Merchant mentioned in her article that the GFWC and other women's organizations lost their visible influence on conservation during the second decade of the twentieth century.<sup>288</sup> Although women did not lose interest in resource issues, Merchant suggested that women were squeezed out of the professional sphere during this period and organized conservation declined. The AFWC, however, seemed to maintain its active and visible support of conservation efforts fairly evenly throughout the time of study (1900-1932). Its successes and impacts were also spread throughout the period. The clubwomen felt that the practice of conservation was the best guide to achieve progress in Arizona.

These women were involved in conservation to fulfill two goals. The first was to ensure sufficient stocks of natural resources for their and future generations. The second was more subconscious. The women used conservation to project themselves into the public realm. The result of the second was to advance their status as women and expand their isolated sphere of the home to include community.

The AFWC's activities had an impact on conservation policy, public opinion, and GFWC policy, making their first goal successful. By 1928, the Arizona federation included

---

<sup>288</sup>Merchant. "Women of the Progressive Conservation Movement". p. 80.

71 women's clubs with a total membership of about 3400 women.<sup>289</sup> Arizona reported a population of 535,573 people in 1920.<sup>290</sup> Locally, the clubwomen's activities and concerns were not only announced in their internally circulated publications, but also received attention (sanctioning or acceptance) from the local press. Therefore, the women had the potential to reach other minds than just clubwomen. Their activities could have been known by non-clubwomen and the general public, male or female. However, one can only speculate as to how much they influenced voting or public opinion. Regardless, the clubwomen can be noted for specific accomplishments in regard to natural resources.

The clubwomen had many opportunities to better their communities and influence public opinion through direct action. The women repeatedly mentioned planting trees for various reasons. They also frowned upon wearing accessories made from bird plumage. Several garden clubs were part of the federation as well as many civics clubs. Some clubs were involved in the Parks and Playground Association. The clubwomen often claimed they sent letters

---

<sup>289</sup>Ross. Tale is Told. p. 135. The 1928 Club Membership Director divided the federation into five districts: Northern, Southern, Central Southeastern, Southwestern, and the Arizona Nurses Association.

<sup>290</sup>Mason and Hink. Constitutional Government in Arizona. p. 44.

of endorsement for certain natural resource policies. Furthermore, the federation took credit for passage of the 1929 Arizona Flora Law, via President Christy's efforts. The Globe Woman's Club claimed to have influenced the U.S. Geographic Association (Survey?) to name the water impounded behind Coolidge Dam San Carlos Lake. In addition, Mrs. D.I. Craig was credited with the state of Arizona adoption of the cactus wren for the state bird.

The clubwomen, likewise, had the potential to influence public opinion via the written word. The federation published its endorsement of Hoover Dam in Arizona, The New State magazine. They also announced their support for preservation of scenic and historic spots for parks. The magazine featured numerous reports of AFWC's civic improvement activities such as tree planting, town cleanups, and gardening contests. A 1912 edition of the magazine was dedicated to women. The Arizona Republic newspaper printed an AFWC section that listed their opinions, e.g., preservation of desert flora, in addition to announcements of club meetings and presentation topics. The clubs published their support of conservation and preservation of natural resources in Progressive Arizona magazine. They also urged women to work with men to conserve/preserve resources and work for better communities. Yavapai magazine agreed to publish a special

issue featuring the AFWC in 1932. The magazine focused on the clubs' activities. Western Woman and Arizona Woman were magazines that specifically published clubwomen's activities. Arizona Woman featured a conservation issue in March 1931 that included the club's opinions as well as guest articles regarding conservation of Arizona's resources.

Although the Arizona federation was often overshadowed by other states, it did exert some influence on GFWC policy. Most notable was the substitute GFWC resolution passed at the 1931 national biennial regarding national policy to prevent Mississippi Valley flooding. The Arizona federation representatives acted to protect Arizona's interests in Colorado River development, threatened, they believed, by California.

An Arizona Republic article mentioned that the AFWC worked with the GFWC to get money allocated by the Interior Department to the Sacaton Indian Reservation for fencing. The AFWC was concerned that stray cattle in Pinal county were destroying crops.<sup>291</sup> The Arizona officer contacted the GFWC and gained their national influence for a local issue.

---

<sup>291</sup>Arizona Republic. "Interior Department Allots Money for Fence in Arizona When Club Officer Asks Help". February 10, 1929. AFWC Section 2. p. 4.

In the GFWC biography by Mildred Wells, Unity in Diversity, the Arizona description focused on the AFWC's work for preservation of the state's historic and beauty spots. The Arizona members devoted their efforts to preserve desert and forest growth, protect wildlife and better the community.<sup>292</sup> Arizona supported national and state welfare legislation. But the General Federation credited them mostly for their natural resource accomplishments.

The clubwomen's second, more covert, and self-conscious goal was to project their influence into the public (male) sphere. It must be reiterated that the clubwomen were able to participate in conservation and attempt to affect public policy because of their socio-economic status. The women were mostly white and relatively privileged. Many were the recipients of extensive education. Some served as teachers prior to and after marriage. Others had experience as business professionals or working odd jobs. Their husbands, usually financially successful, were respected community members and leaders.

If these women had been lower-class, they would probably not have had the education, time, or resources to participate in community issues. But, due to the

---

<sup>292</sup>Wells. Unity in Diversity. p. 448-449.

clubwomen's status, they were able to enlarge women's role in the community and politics. Furthermore, their activism and undeniably positive contribution to progress propelled women into the public eye, resulting in greater respect for their maternalism and intelligence. Moreover, the political atmosphere of the Progressive era, which advocated equity, democracy, political innovations such as the initiative and referendum, and social welfare reform helped to maintain an aura more conducive to women's community outreach. The Progressive era also serves as the context in which women raised their individual and collective consciousness regarding their role and ability to direct progress. In addition, it does not appear that these women were married to men who attempted to censor their activism (except perhaps on certain issue, e.g., mining). It is doubtful that these women could have been so vocal without their husbands' blessing, or at least indifference. Also, it seems plausible that the women could have been employed by their spouses to promote certain issues through the women's community.

The split in natural resource ideology by the second decade in the 20th century may have diminished the potential influence of some natural resource organizations. The antagonism between utilitarian conservation and preservation certainly pitted different government agencies

against each other, e.g., United States Forest Service in the Department of Agriculture vs. the National Park Service in the Department of the Interior. However, the AFWC seemed to weather the fissure, which never appeared to be an issue in its activities. The federation simply applied the competing ideologies to different resources after consideration of the type of human need - utilitarian or aesthetic - and the resource's renewability.

Nonetheless, the clubwomen did exhibit some contradiction in their impulses and beliefs, even if they were not conscious of them. For example, the Monday Club of Prescott mentioned that its members had "beautified" their city plaza by removing piles of rock, cacti, weeds and sandy stretches. They removed the "natural" landscape and replaced it with an ideal, designed setting. Such efforts of civic improvement, landscaping and theme gardening, were symbols of nature and its spirit of relaxation, but they did not necessarily celebrate nature's intrinsic value; nature had to be redesigned to fit into their vision of progress, order, and civilization. Due to the proliferation of "back to nature" materials, pastoral scenes were desired instead of "wild" nature. Landscape architecture took the materials of nature (i.e., pond, or rocks) and added a human dimension of control to achieve a

controlled, relaxing ambiance without the fear of the wild, unknown, and untamable.

The clubwomen's support of recreation took on similar tones. The summer camp that the Century Club bought and designed was located in a rustic setting but included cabins and a pool. At the same scene, the women lauded the "relaxing" atmosphere of the stream setting. The clubwomen desired contact with nature, but without losing the benefits of civilization.

Another example of the clubwomen reflecting the dominant social values of the time was the women's apparent practice of moral judgment of wildlife and birdlife. The women supported the eradication of birds of prey in the belief that they were of no service to humans or were a detriment. In contrast though, the women did support game laws and wildlife refuges. Interestingly, there was no overt mention of the popular belief that large predators (wolves, coyotes, foxes, large cats) needed to be eradicated to prevent economic ruin of ranchers.

Because the clubwomen made great efforts to engage expert advice and guest speakers to properly educate themselves on the issues, they received the best scientific information of the day. Furthermore, if they had not embraced the contacts with nature that the movements of their time had encouraged, they would not have fought for

the conservation and preservation of natural resources. In addition, by earmarking certain resources for definite solutions, they reconciled the competing resource interests.

There were some natural resources that appeared to not engage the interest of the clubwomen. Specifically, the federation rarely mentioned minerals except under blanket statements advocating conservation. Copper, the mineral mainstay of the state, was only referred to about 1932 when Arizona was seeking a copper tariff in Congress. The clubwomen chose to support such economic protection for the sake of their state's economy and all that it would affect. The women may have chosen to essentially ignore mineral issues because minerals were a resource generally found underground and not of visual value (except after extraction). Minerals extracted in Arizona, e.g., copper, were raw materials for industry and this may not have interested the women. Similarly, the clubs never seemed to address any range resource issues. Perhaps the grassland was not identified as a resource base because it did not produce an obvious, primary marketable product such as timber board-feet or water acre-feet. Many of the women were wives of ranchers, or ranchers themselves, and some mineral executives. Those clubwomen who were ranchers or mineral beneficiaries may have chosen not to "meddle" with

their direct means of financial support, whether it was mineral extraction or cattle or sheep ranching. Arizona's three largest industries were cattle, copper, and cotton (agriculture). However, some of the husbands were also influential in regard to water development and irrigation, the foundation of agriculture in Arizona. So, the clubwomen also had economic ties to other important natural resources. The clubwomen publicly supported some water issues, especially reclamation. Water conservation affected the amount of settlement and agriculture the desert could support. The clubwomen may have publicly supported water issues because they desired further settlement and development of Arizona. Record of mineral or ranching interests may not have been saved or may have been accidentally lost.

The AFWC was a viable, informed force of women that maintained an interest in public welfare issues. Furthermore, the federation was a service-oriented, education-promoting organization. Concerned with community, state progress, and their future quality of life for themselves and their descendants, the clubwomen ventured into the public sphere to influence natural resource conservation policy from 1900-1932. Moreover, they advanced respect for women's contributions to civilization through self and public education, direct

action, and publication. They established credibility through consultation with male and female experts of the time and protected their outreach into the community with their roles as maternal housekeepers. They justified, to themselves, their state, and the nation, their public involvement in the political sphere with their concern for the unfortunate by-products of progress and civilization - waste and inefficiency - which they felt men had little time to ponder.

Arizona was a new Progressive state striving to develop its resources and contribute to the nation's growth. Civic improvement through clean-ups, tree plantings, and landscaping would make the Arizona urban environment more palatable, without losing the actual benefits of industrialization. In addition, the clubwomen recognized both the commodity and amenity values of nature. Thus, they reconciled materialism and development with nature's intrinsic value through conservation of natural resources. Moreover, the AFWC quelled the conservation vs. preservation rivalry by promoting conservation or preservation based upon resource renewability. Conservation of Arizona's natural resources would slow unchecked exploitation, while advancing civilization and encouraging democratic use. Preservation would protect the

splendid resources that were the very heritage of the nation and the desert state.

The Arizona clubwomen acted to protect their descendants' futures and to ensure sufficient stocks of natural resources for themselves. Simultaneously, they acted to guarantee nature's spectacular presence for relaxation and recovery from the rigors of civilization. Through the Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs, the clubwomen also surreptitiously advanced their status as women by earning respect for their sex with natural resource education, patriotism, and community service.

## NOTES

## Abbreviations:

AFWC	Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs
GFWC	General Federation of Women's Clubs
NPS	National Park Service
USFS	United States Forest Service
WWI	World War One
WWII	World War Two

## REFERENCES

- Arkills, Mrs. S.T. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 2(1930):6.
- Arkills, Mrs. S.T. "Message from the President". Arizona Woman 2(1930):4.
- Arkills, Mrs. S.T. "President's Message". Arizona Woman 3(1931):11.
- Arkills, Mrs. S.T. "The President's Message". Arizona woman 3(1932):13.
- Armbruster, Mrs. A.C. "Rock Gardens". Arizona Woman 1(1930):6,15.
- Armbruster, Mrs. A.C. "Rock Gardens". Arizona Woman 1(1930):6.
- Bates, J.L. "Fulfilling American Democracy. The Conservation Movement 1907-1921". The Mississippi Valley Historical Review 44(1957):29-57.
- Blair, Karen. The Clubwoman as Feminist. True Womanhood Redefined. 1868-1914. New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, Inc. 1980.
- Bonta, Marcia Myers. Women in the Field. College Station: Texas A & M University Press. 1991.
- Bowyer, Mrs. S.H. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 2(1930):6.
- Bumstead, Mrs. Dale. "Let Us Stand By". Arizona Woman 3(1932):5-6.
- Cady, Mrs. L.M. "The Conservation of Bird Life". Arizona The New State 1(1911):18-19.
- Chandler, Mrs. A.J. "Origin and History of the Garden Club of America". Arizona Woman 3(1932):11.
- Christy, Mary Emma. "Preserving Arizona's Personality". Arizona 5(1927):5.
- Christy, Mary Emma. "The Arizona Clubwoman". Progressive Arizona 6(1928):26.
- Clemens, Elisabeth. "Organizational Repertoires and Institutional Change: Women's Groups and the

- Transformation of U.S. Politics, 1890-1920". American Journal of Sociology 98(1993):755-798.
- Craig, Mrs. D.I. "Conservation". Arizona Woman 3(1932):4.
- Crider, F.J. "Ineffectiveness of Plant Protection Law". Arizona Woman 3(1932):9.
- Cureton, Mrs. T.H. "The Part that Women's Clubs Play in the Life and Upbuilding of the State". Arizona 13(1924):1, 11.
- Ellis, Lucy T. "A Garden Kindergarten". The Earth 6(1909):32.
- Faulk, Odie. Arizona. A Short History. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 1970.
- Foresta, Ronald. America's National Parks and Their Keepers. Washington, DC: Resources for the Future. 1984.
- Fox, Stephen. John Muir and His Legacy. The American Conservation Movement. Boston: Little, Brown & Co. 1981.
- Gibson, Fred. "Conservation of Arizona's Wild Life". Arizona Woman 3(1922):9.
- Haughtelin, Kathryn. "Twentieth Annual Convention of AFWC". Arizona 12(1922):9.
- Hays, Samuel. Conservation and the Gospel of Efficiency. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. 1959.
- Hunt, Governor G. "Greetings". Yavapai 22(1932):2.
- Huth, Hans. Nature and the American. Berkeley: University of California Press. 1957.
- Mason, B. and Hink, H. Constitutional Government in Arizona. Tempe: Arizona State University. 1972.
- McClintock, Dorothy. "Arizona - Land of Interesting Plants". Western Woman 1(1929):7,11.
- Merchant, Carolyn. "Women of the Progressive Conservation Movement, 1900-1916". Environmental Review 8(1984):57-85.

- Musgrave, Ethel. "A Desert Miracle". Western Woman 1(1929):2.
- Musgrave, Ethel. "Arizona, Land of Contrasts". Arizona Woman 3(1931):5.
- Nash, Roderick. The American Environment. Reading: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co. 1976.
- Nash, Roderick. Wilderness and the American Mind. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1982.
- Newsom, Mrs. Sidney. "Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs". Arizona 2(1912):4-5.
- Petulla, Joseph. American Environmental History. Columbus: Merrill Publishing Co. 1988.
- Prather, Mrs. C.H. "AFWC News". Arizona Woman 1(1930):10.
- Prather, N. Bess. "Short History of the Arizona Federation". Arizona Woman 1(1930).
- Prather, N. Bess. "Sahauro Blossom and Cactus Wren for State Federation". Arizona Woman 2(1931):21.
- Ross, Margaret Wheeler. "The Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs". Arizona 6(1916):3-4,14.
- Ross, Margaret Wheeler. "The Oldest Woman's Club in Arizona". Arizona 6(1916):5-6,9,16.
- Rose, Margaret Wheeler. The Tale is Told. Phoenix: AFWC. 1945.
- Schmitt, Peter. Back to Nature. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. 1990.
- Schofield, Elizabeth. "The Alluring Lily Pond". Western Woman 1(1929):14.
- Siberts, Mrs. Paul. "Junior Activities". Arizona Woman 3(1931):17.
- Skocpol, Theda. Protecting Soldiers and Mothers. Cambridge: Belknap press. 1992.
- St. Claire, Anne. Western Woman 1(1929):18.

- Swift, T.T. "The Green Wealth of Arizona's Forest". Arizona Woman 3(1932):19.
- Wells, Mildred White Unity in Diversity. Washington, DC: GFWC. 1953.
- Wild, Peter, Pioneer Conservationists of Western America. Missoula: Mountain Press Publishing Co. 1979.
- Winter, Alice Amer. "We and the Land God Gave Us". Ladies Home Journal. in Scrapbook of Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. Monday Club of Prescott.
- Wood, Mary. The History of the GFWC for the First 22 Years of Its Organization. New York: GFWC. 1912.
- Young, Etta Gifford. "Agriculture in the Mining Counties". Arizona 3(1912):8.
- Young, Etta Gifford. "The North Dominion Copper Mining and Development Corporation". Arizona 6(1912):9.
- Young, Etta Gifford. "White Mountains are Angler's Paradise". Arizona 3(1913):8.
- Young, Etta Gifford. "San Xavier del Bac". Arizona 3(1913):4.
- Arizona Republic. November 1, 1926, p. 1.
- Arizona Republic. "Interior Department Allots Money for Fence in Arizona When Club Officer Asks for Help". February 10, 1929. AFWC Section 2. p. 4.
- Arizona Republic. "Mrs. George Kitt Talks to Members of Liberty Club". March 3, 1929. AFWC Section 2. p. 4.
- Arizona Republic. "Club Reports are Discussed by Members". January 10, 1932. AFWC Section 2. p. 2.
- Arizona Federation of Women's Clubs. AFWC Executive Committee Records 1925-1934.
- Benson Woman's Club. Minutes 1926-1930.
- General Federation of Women's Clubs. "Birds". in Scrapbook of Mrs. C.K. Hartzell, 1922-1924. Monday Club of Prescott.

Monday Club of Prescott. Minutes of the Literature Section  
1920-1922.

Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1900-1919.

Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1900-1910, 1918-1919.

Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1919-1925.

Tucson Woman's Club. Minutes 1925-1931.

Tucson Club Woman. 1(1922):Oct. 30.

Tucson Club Woman. 1(1923):Apr. 23.

Twentieth Century Club of the Warren District, Bisbee.  
Yearbook 1922-1923.

Western Woman. 1(1929):9. "News".

Western Woman. 1(1929):15. "AFWC".

Western Woman. 1(1929):8, "AFWC News".

Woman's Club of Globe. Yearbook 1923-1924.

"Chapter Eight Senate Bill No. 3". in Scrapbook, Mrs. C.K.  
Hartzell.

Mrs. C.K. Hartzell. Scrapbook, 1922-1924. Monday Club of  
Prescott.