

## INFORMATION TO USERS

This was produced from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or "target" for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is "Missing Page(s)". If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure you of complete continuity.
2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark it is an indication that the film inspector noticed either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, or duplicate copy. Unless we meant to delete copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed, you will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame. If copyrighted materials were deleted you will find a target note listing the pages in the adjacent frame.
3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed the photographer has followed a definite method in "sectioning" the material. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.
4. For any illustrations that cannot be reproduced satisfactorily by xerography, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and tipped into your xerographic copy. Requests can be made to our Dissertations Customer Services Department.
5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases we have filmed the best available copy.

University  
Microfilms  
International

300 N. ZEEB RD., ANN ARBOR, MI 48106



1318833

AMMAR, KHALIFA SHAREF SALEM  
A CRITICAL REVIEW OF ARTICLES IN STUDIES IN  
ART EDUCATION RELATING TO TEACHING METHODS  
AND STRATEGIES.

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA, M.A., 1982

University  
Microfilms  
International

300 N. ZEEB RD., ANN ARBOR, MI 48106



A CRITICAL REVIEW OF ARTICLES IN STUDIES  
IN ART EDUCATION RELATING TO TEACHING  
METHODS AND STRATEGIES

by

Khalifa Sharef Salem Ammar

---

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of the  
DEPARTMENT OF ART  
In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
For the Degree of  
MASTER OF ARTS  
In the Graduate College  
THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

1 9 8 2

STATEMENT BY AUTHOR

This thesis has been submitted in partial fulfillment of requirements for an advanced degree at The University of Arizona and is deposited in the University Library to be made available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

Brief quotations from this thesis are allowed without special permission, provided that accurate acknowledgment of source is made. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this manuscript in whole or in part may be granted by the head of the major department or the Dean of the Graduate College when in his judgment the proposed use of the material is in the interests of scholarship. In all other instances, however, permission must be obtained from the author.

SIGNED: \_\_\_\_\_

*J. C. Rush*

APPROVAL BY THESIS DIRECTOR

This thesis has been approved on the date shown below:

*Jean Rush*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
J. C. RUSH  
Associate Professor of Art

*4-16-82*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

With sincere gratitude and respect, appreciation is extended to Dr. Jean C. Rush, as major advisor, for her invaluable guidance and patience during the course of this study and in the preparation of this manuscript.

Many thanks are also extended to Dr. Warren H. Anderson, and Dr. Maurice K. Grossman, as committee members, for their very insightful suggestions, and for their encouragement.

I give special thanks to my wife and children for all their sacrifices during the course of my studies.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES . . . . .	v
ABSTRACT . . . . .	vi
 CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION . . . . .	1
2 SCOPE AND ANALYSIS OF TEACHING LITERATURE . . . . .	4
Types of Research . . . . .	4
Content of Research . . . . .	4
Need for Further Research . . . . .	8
3 LITERATURE REVIEW . . . . .	12
Elementary Education . . . . .	14
Importance of a Structured Approach . . . . .	16
Importance of Instructional Media . . . . .	19
Importance of Motivation . . . . .	21
Junior High School Level . . . . .	26
Senior High School Level . . . . .	29
College Education Level . . . . .	33
Adult Education Level . . . . .	38
4 DISCUSSION . . . . .	41
Importance of Research . . . . .	41
Importance of Articles Reviewed . . . . .	42
Limitation of Articles Reviewed . . . . .	43
Implications for Libyan Art Education . . . . .	44
Future Areas to be Investigated . . . . .	52
APPENDIX A: SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	53
REFERENCES . . . . .	60

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Numbers and kinds of articles relating to art teaching, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	5
2. Numbers and kinds of descriptive/experimental research articles relating to art teaching, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	6
3. Categories and figures of different educational levels that were submitted to particular investigation in art teaching, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	7
4. Kinds of content in articles relating to art teaching, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	9
5. Numbers and kinds of skills taught in research articles relating to art teaching, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	10
6. Selected articles relating to teaching methods and strategies, <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	13
7. Categories and figures of different educational levels in which 21 articles related to teaching methods and strategies were submitted to particular investigation; studies in <u>Studies in Art Education</u> , Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981) . . . . .	15

## ABSTRACT

This paper is an attempt to thoroughly examine teaching methods and strategies in art education that were developed or investigated in research studies published from 1959 to 1981 in Studies in Art Education (vol. 1-22). Initially, an overview of available research provided 69 articles relating to art teaching in general. From this overview, 21 articles relating to teaching methodologies were thoroughly reviewed to determine their applications to and implications for teaching art.

This review indicates that these studies provide important information relating to techniques in art education which can be utilized to improve classroom art teaching. Some of the studies reviewed provide appropriate educational approaches found to be applicable to art education in Libya. However, current research included in this review provides more implications for further research than practical applications to the classroom.

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

Many people think that a teaching vocation is an easy one, but the fact is different. People who are familiar with this kind of work agree that teaching is a difficult job, much more complicated than is generally assumed. The simplest function of teaching is to transmit knowledge; that is, to explain and tell. According to this definition, effectiveness of teaching bears a direct relationship to teachers' knowledge of content areas. Nevertheless, one needs not only to be acquainted with the accumulated body of knowledge related to a specialized field and its educational goals, but also one must be able to interact with the whole learning process involving students in the classroom.

The key to success in teaching art, as is true in all studies, lies in having an understanding of students--their interests, needs, and abilities. Consequently, in planning for teaching, one should have information about the students as well as the classroom environment, and should think about what the students want to accomplish and how to accomplish it. In other words, an art teacher should initially decide the objectives of the art program to be accomplished. Having determined the objectives, one must then decide what methods or strategies can best enable accomplishment of these objectives.

Art educators, through studies relating to teaching art published in Studies in Art Education between the fall of 1959 and the fall of 1981, have made important contributions to the teaching literature. However, more significant studies are needed today to manipulate some problems that still exist in teaching art through all the different levels of education. An overview of available research shows that 69 articles referred to teaching art in general. These can be grouped into 5 categories (according to the Registry of Studies in Art Education, volumes 1-22).

1. Descriptive and experimental research.
2. Historical research.
3. Philosophical research.
4. Tests and measures.
5. Issues and others.

Among these studies approximately 21 research articles relate specifically to teaching methods and strategies, which will probably form the major focus of this paper. These studies represent different kinds of research (experimental/descriptive, historical, or philosophical research, or issues in teaching art education). Most of them, however, were descriptive studies. The research studies related to teaching methods and strategies attempted to evaluate the various educational teaching methods and strategies, and their implications in teaching art. Some of these studies specifically investigated new methods or strategies (programmed instruction, synchronized slide-tape

learning) and their effectiveness upon art produces as well as upon students' learning. Other studies compared some teaching methods or strategies and their effectiveness upon teaching drawing or other subject matter areas.

This paper will review and summarize selected articles related to teaching and also discuss the content of these studies in order to find out the implication for teaching art education. It will represent a kind of descriptive research paper and will follow the outline as shown on a separate paper included herein. Also, selected articles related to teaching methods and strategies will comprise a bibliographical reference in an appendix to this paper.

This study hopes to find some information about the effectiveness of teaching methods and strategies and their implications for future art teaching. It will identify a significant body of material useful to the development of learning processes in art education, and it will clarify and define some ideas that might be inferred from these studies. It is intended also as a significant contribution to the growing body of research in art education. Finally, and most importantly, this kind of study will be helpful to art teachers in Libya to improve and develop new conditions for achieving desired educational goals within a context of art education.

## CHAPTER 2

### SCOPE AND ANALYSIS OF TEACHING LITERATURE

The Registry of Studies in Art Education, Vol. 1-22, was examined for articles relating to teaching art in general.

#### Types of Research

An overview of 69 studies related to teaching shows that most of these studies (75%) are labelled "descriptive/experimental" in the Registry, while the rest are labelled "issues and other kinds of research" (see Tables 1 and 2). The majority of these descriptive/experimental studies use descriptive research (56%), and the remainder of the studies use experimental research (44%).

#### Content of Research

A review of the content of these studies shows that the majority select their samples from the elementary education level rather than from the secondary level (see Table 3). Yet the secondary education level can be regarded as a more sensitive indicator of a student's general education. This review shows also that the number of research efforts in art education in recent years has dwindled in comparison to the previous ten years (Table 3).

Of the total number of articles reviewed, 34 studies dealt with the teaching of skills; for example, looking at art, talking about art,

Table 1. Numbers and kinds of articles relating to art teaching, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).<sup>1</sup>

	Descriptive/ Experimental	Historical	Philosophical	Issues	Total	Test Measures <sup>2</sup>
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	33	1	0	8	42	99
Vol. 15, 73-74	4	0	0	0	4	10
Vol. 16, 74-75	0	0	0	0	0	0
Vol. 17, 75-76	1	0	0	0	1	0
Vol. 18, 76-77	3	0	0	1	4	0
Vol. 19, 77-78	0	0	0	1	1	0
Vol. 20, 78-79	4	0	1	2	7	0
Vol. 21, 79-81	3	0	0	3	6	0
Vol. 22, 80-81	4	0	0	0	4	0
Totals	52	1	1	15	69	109
Percentage of Total Articles (N = 69)	75%	2%	2%	21%		

1. Categories and figures were taken from Registry of Studies in Art Education.
2. Total number of tests or measures used or referred to in the 69 articles surveyed; some articles used more than one test.

Table 2. Numbers and kinds of descriptive/experimental research articles relating to art teaching, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).

	Descriptive	Experimental
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	18	15
Vol. 15, 73-74	2	2
Vol. 16, 74-75	0	0
Vol. 17, 75-76	1	0
Vol. 18, 76-77	1	2
Vol. 19, 77-78	0	0
Vol. 20, 78-79	3	1
Vol. 21, 79-80	0	3
Vol. 22, 80-81	4	0
Totals	29	23
Percentage of Descriptive/ Experimental Research Articles (N = 52)	56%	44%
Percentage of total Articles (N = 69)	42%	33%

Table 3. Categories and figures of different educational levels that were submitted to particular investigation in art teaching, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).

	Educational Level														Totals								
	Handicapped	Adult	Senior	Junior	Sophomore	Freshman	College Level	Twelfth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Tenth Grade	Senior High School	Ninth Grade	Eighth Grade	Seventh Grade		Junior High School	Sixth Grade	Fifth Grade	Fourth Grade	Third Grade	Second Grade	First Grade	Elementary School
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	1	3	1	3	3	2	8	1	1	3	1	4	2	6	5	5	3	3	1	2	9	4	34
Vol. 15, 73-74							2				1			1						1	1		4
Vol. 16, 74-75																							
Vol. 17, 75-76							1																1
Vol. 18, 76-77							1	1	1	1	1										2		4
Vol. 19, 77-78																							
Vol. 20, 78-79							2								1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	5
Vol. 21, 79-80		1														1		2		1	2		3
Vol. 22, 80-81																						2	2
Totals	1	4					14			4				7							15	8	53*

\*This number of articles exclusive of other 16 articles related to art teaching, but not conducted at particular educational level (N = 53).

and/or making art. In addition, 36 studies investigated different aspects of student behavior. Finally only 9 studies concentrated on teacher behavior (see Tables 4 and 5). Based on the above analysis of research studies, more useful and pertinent empirical research of art education is certainly needed at the present time.

#### Need for Further Research

Smith (1973) assumed in his study that the behavioral sciences, the new technology of instruction, and the finding of research, all have an important bearing on the problem of improving instruction at any level of education. Art educators and art researchers are the most authoritative and, at the same time, responsible persons who should be refreshing and feeding the field of art education with meritorious and innovative educational ideas that will make this part of human education survive.

This argument is based on the well-grounded assumption that art education is still suffering from some restrictive problems which, in addition to other external factors, place this field at the bottom of the school curriculum list. In other words, there is a bias toward regarding this field as a luxury item in student education while at the same time, art education is still confounded by numerous pedagogical problems. Thus the need for further research is imperative, especially in the educational systems of other countries.

However, these problems could be eliminated if appropriate diagnosis is provided by those who are specialized in this field and also

Table 4. Kinds of content in articles relating to art teaching, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).\*

	Skill Taught	Age Level	Teacher Behavior	Student Behavior
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	18	34	5	24
Vol. 15, 73-74	2	4	0	2
Vol. 16, 74-75	0	0	0	0
Vol. 17, 75-76	0	1	0	1
Vol. 18, 76-77	2	3	1	2
Vol. 19, 77-78	0	0	1	0
Vol. 20, 78-79	7	5	0	2
Vol. 21, 79-80	4	3	1	3
Vol. 22, 80-81	1	2	1	2
Totals	34	52	9	36

\* These categories are not mutually exclusive; some articles address more than one subject (N = 69).

Table 5. Numbers and kinds of skills taught in research articles relating to art teaching, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).\*

	Looking at Art	Talking About Art	Making Art
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	1	6	10
Vol. 15, 73-74	0	2	0
Vol. 16, 74-75	0	0	0
Vol. 17, 75-76	0	0	0
Vol. 18, 76-77	0	0	1
Vol. 19, 77-78	0	0	0
Vol. 20, 78-79	4	2	3
Vol. 21, 79-80	1	3	2
Vol. 22, 80-81	0	0	1
Totals	6	13	17

\*These categories are not mutually exclusive; some articles address more than one subject (N = 69).

from others who are experts in related disciplines. Art teaching, in light of this overview, needs further exploration and further conceptualization that could identify more specific contents related to each level of learning (Clark & Zimmerman, 1978).

Empirical research studies in art education in general are few and in need of development (Rush & Kratochwill, 1981; Smith, 1973). However, any kind of research has little value for the teacher in the classroom unless its implications are intelligently brought to bear on practice (McFee, 1960). Consequently, art education as a field of exploration and practice should constantly find more collaboration between the art teacher and art researcher. Once this cooperation is established, innovative research can serve as inspiration to the art teacher who in turn can become more inspirational in the classroom. This argument is based on the fact that both the researcher and the practitioner are agents of change and inspiration.

## CHAPTER 3

### LITERATURE REVIEW

In this chapter, 21 studies, or 30% of all articles related to art education published by Studies in Art Education, are selected for further discussion because of their applicability to classroom art teaching. These articles deal mostly with descriptive and experimental research that yields information on teacher and student behaviors as well as on lesson content (see Table 6).

The selection of these articles was based on the following reasons:

1. They offer information related directly to teaching methods and strategies.
2. Many of these articles suggest approaches to art education that could be undertaken in the curriculum of public schools.

The significance of these articles stems from their attempt to relate practical manipulations to pedagogical problems faced by art teachers in teaching visual arts in different levels of education. Any findings or results that can be derived from both descriptive and experimental research is useful for art teachers, especially when the data are related to a larger theoretical model. The art teacher, however, must transform these findings whenever he or she wants to bridge the gap

Table 6. Selected articles relating to teaching methods and strategies, Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).\*

	Descriptive	Experimental	Issues	Teacher Behavior	Student Behavior	Looking at Art	Talking About Art	Making Art
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73	8	6	0	2	8	2	0	8
Vol. 15, 73-74	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Vol. 16, 74-75	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Vol. 17, 75-76	0	1	0	0	1	1	1	0
Vol. 18, 76-77	0	1	1	0	1	0	0	1
Vol. 19, 77-78	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Vol. 20, 78-79	0	1	1	1	0	1	1	1
Vol. 21, 79-80	2	0	0	0	2	1	2	3
Vol. 22, 80-81	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Totals	10	9	2	3	12	5	4	13
	21							

\*Articles selected for their applicability to classroom art teaching (N = 21).

between research findings and action in particular situations in the classroom. Most research methodologies generate findings that are directly relevant to populations and samples rather than to individuals, while the teacher is concerned not only with groups but with the concrete reality of a particular student in a particular classroom.

At the beginning of this review, all 21 articles were classified according to the educational levels in which these studies took place (kindergarten, elementary school, junior high school, senior high school, college, or adult). An overview of these articles demonstrated a lack of research at the kindergarten level, but the amount of research at the other levels of education is as follows (see Table 7):

Elementary school	8 studies
Junior high school	3 studies
Senior high school	3 studies
College	6 studies
Adults	1 study

This summarization will begin with research conducted at the elementary school level and will continue through the college and adult educational level. With the exception of the elementary level, the articles will be discussed in chronological order.

#### Elementary Education

Because of the vast majority of research conducted at the elementary level, the reviewed studies are classified according to areas of research.

Table 7. Categories and figures of different educational levels in which 21 articles related to teaching methods and strategies were submitted to particular investigation; studies in Studies in Art Education, Volume 1 (1959-1960) to Volume 22 (1980-1981).

	Educational Levels													Totals									
	Adults	Senior	Junior	Sophomore	Freshman	College Level	Twelfth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Tenth Grade	Senior High School	Ninth Grade	Eighth Grade	Seventh Grade		Junior High School	Sixth Grade	Fifth Grade	Fourth Grade	Third Grade	Second Grade	First Grade	Elementary School	Kindergarten
Vol. 1, 59-60 to Vol. 14, 72-73			1	1	1	4	1		1	3	1	2		3	1	2	2	1			4		14
Vol. 15, 73-74																							
Vol. 16, 74-75																							
Vol. 17, 75-76						1																	1
Vol. 18, 76-77																	1				2		2
Vol. 19, 77-78																							
Vol. 20, 78-79						1									1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2
Vol. 21, 79-80	1															1	1			1	1		2
Vol. 22, 80-81																							
Totals	1					6			3					3							8		21
Percentage of Total Articles (N = 21)	4.77					28.57			14.28					14.28							38.10		

### Importance of a Structured Approach

Art education objectives in any educational system usually include the development of skills. One type of skill that requires development at this level is the visual perceptual skill. Children in art programs will have greater improvement in their perceptual skills if they are given appropriate instruction rather than merely participating in traditional art activities (Salome, 1965; Salome and Reeves, 1972). In 1965 Salome suggested that fourth- and fifth-grade students be given perceptual training in combination with drawing instruction. In his study, the students receiving this training produced drawings higher in visual information than children not exposed to perceptual training. Salome developed a method of perceptual training that encouraged the child to look for information concentrated along the contours of objects. His results indicated that the posttest drawings of fifth graders who received this training showed a greater ability to communicate the image, to define the image, and to show the image in correct proportion than did the drawings of the students in control groups who were given only conventional instruction in drawing. According to these results, perceptual training combined with instruction is significantly effective in teaching contour drawing to elementary students. Thus, to improve the perception of visual information of children who are learning drawing or any other subject area in visual art, the art teacher should provide suitable instruction in the development of perceptual skills to improve the effectiveness of his teaching.

Based upon many indications that children's representations in graphic materials can be changed by instruction, Neperud (1966) conducted a study to investigate the contribution of instruction in visual elements to the development of the drawings of fifth-grade children. The different instructional conditions under which drawing development was studied were: the teacher-centered method, the cooperative method, and the child-centered method. Neperud assumed that children who are instructed about visual elements will create drawings exhibiting a greater use of such elements than those who received no instruction. Another assumption was that the learning situation involving pupil-teacher cooperation and including instruction on visual elements will result in the use of these elements to a greater degree than will instructional conditions lacking such pupil-teacher relationships. His results indicated that neither cooperatively developed learning situations nor those centering on the child and lacking formal instruction facilitated the development of drawings of fifth-grade children over an extended period of instruction. Only under the teacher-centered method was drawing development apparent over the eleven-week period. Based on the results of this study, it appears that instruction in visual elements does encourage noticeable drawing development. Furthermore, direct lecture presentation of information, combined with demonstration, was the appropriate condition facilitating drawing development. In this case, Neperud supported previous studies (Salome, 1965; Salome and Reeves, 1972), indicating that aspects of art can be learned, or at least their development encouraged, by instruction in visual elements.

Another study was conducted to investigate different teaching methods and their effectiveness in teaching drawing to elementary grades. Two teaching approaches were examined: blind contour drawing and copying. Pariser (1979) suggested two exercises in drawing aimed at providing the children with drawing experiences which encouraged both technical facility in a medium and a capacity to observe carefully and identify perceptual features of objects to be transformed into graphic marks. The blind contour-drawing approach focuses on drawing as the registration of perceptual cues, and the copying approach focuses on drawing as the assimilation of graphic conventions. A blind contour exercise was given to fourth, fifth, and sixth graders, and a copying exercise was given to first, second, and third graders. Various selected objects were used for the blind contour exercise, while highly conventionalized graphic images were used for the copying exercise (e.g., Dürer's "Rhinceros"). After examination of the two sets of children's drawings, Pariser concluded that the advantages of a contour exercise range from the development of perceptual motor skills to an increase in the ability to see correspondence between perceptual cues and marks on the page. The advantages of the copying exercise included the revealing of new graphic codes and new ways of handling the medium. As a result of this study, Pariser concluded that a student's accomplishment in art can be enhanced by both perceptual cues and graphic conventions. Based on these findings, both blind contour and copying teaching methods are appropriate at the elementary level to practice and develop

drawing skills and train the child's vision. In this study, Pariser supports the earlier research of Salome and others in terms of advocating perceptual training in combination with appropriate instruction to increase the child's perceptual or visual information.

#### Importance of Instructional Media

Art educators and researchers are today giving more attention to new educational means that aid the classroom teacher in demonstrating art effectively and at the same time, may help the student fulfill his needs and interests. This attention and way of thinking is based on serious problems that occur in the art classroom, and it is now a major focus in the field of art education. At the elementary level these problems include overcrowded classrooms, lack of art education training among regular classroom teachers, and lack of a specialized art teacher in many schools. Force (1970) assumed that the presentation of some cognitive aspects of art through programmed materials will aid the classroom teacher to accomplish the art program objectives. Also, he indicated that materials designed to develop the individual's special ability can result in achievement in learning art concepts. He developed two programmed materials for sixth-grade children in order to teach them four cognitive concepts dealing with aspects of positive and negative volume in sculpture. These aspects include the visual concepts of solid and void, concave and convex volume. The two instructional materials are presentations of manipulative and nonmanipulative materials. The manipulative materials used written instruction in book form and

pictures of artifacts and sculpture. The nonmanipulative materials were designed to minimize the usage of motor abilities, depending largely on verbal abilities, but the manipulative materials were designed to minimize the use of verbal abilities, making use of the student's motor abilities. Force's analysis of his study reported that the learning of art concepts can result from programmed instruction. However, this achievement can only occur with students who are involved in a program allowing manipulation of materials. In conclusion, programmed instruction can be used to supplement, not substitute for class instruction and provide individual instruction in concepts in order to meet the needs of students.

There is an argument that the compatibility of educational objectives with both programmed instruction and synchronized slide-tape presentation were given idea as an economical bridge between nontechnologically equipped classrooms and the growing use of television and other advanced equipment for educational goals (Brouch, 1971). In 1971, Brouch stated that programs in art utilizing equipment for teaching factual information free the teacher to devote his efforts to the more personalized aspects of teacher-student, art-learning interaction during skill-building sessions. Educational means such as packaged slide-tape programs can be viewed as class presentation, and later rerun several times for individuals or small groups while the teacher works with others during practice sessions. In her study, Brouch examined the benefits of synchronized slide-tape presentations for general classroom

use to supplement art teaching, and studied the paintings of elementary-level students to determine if the quality was enriched when the motivational presentation included slides that were related both verbally and visually. Brouch's results implied that gains in painting were attributed to enriching the visual field by the use of audio-visual equipment. These results confirmed the applicability of instructional units as supplementary art teaching aids in the elementary classroom. In the generalization and retention of concepts in art, the students who were exposed to a slide presentation performed significantly better than the control groups. These findings generously support the use of such equipment as a supplementary aid for both the regular classroom teacher and the art specialist for instruction at the elementary level. The researcher recommended testing these programmed packages at higher levels to determine their optimum effectiveness in teaching art. However, she noticed that careful presentation of subject matter and the use of appropriate equipment are important to strengthen both the teacher-student interaction and the student interaction with the equipment itself.

#### Importance of Motivation

Another study investigated the importance of an instructional model based on curiosity as a motivation factor in art learning. Whitsitt and Peterson (1977) predicted that the knowledge of elementary-level students regarding selected color information would increase when given an opportunity to observe and manipulate materials. These

instructional materials were carefully designed to simultaneously arouse curiosity and illustrate the chosen color material. They developed the instructional model which was composed of devices that utilized such properties as novelty, intermediate complexity, incongruity, randomness in order and nature, and changeability. Color concepts were incorporated in the design of the model as instructional goals. The findings provided a general support for the researchers' hypothesis, and this was most clearly confirmed in the color performance measures which directly assessed improvement in the subjects' use of color in their art work. However, these results indicated that verbal measurement techniques for assessing awareness of the emotional and symbolic meanings of color are not appropriate at the fourth-grade level. Whitsitt and Peterson argued that the curiosity/exploratory motive can play a vital role in art education at the classroom level. Teachers and art supervisors therefore might design two- and three-dimensional art instruction materials based on arousing curiosity, using search-and-find questions as guidance. This approach can also provide learning experiences in many other areas of art education, or in science as well.

Many aspects of classroom interaction are important and are needed to facilitate different teaching-learning situations. One aspect is the teacher's questioning strategy. This strategy is very useful in any educational process because it will encourage the student to inquire and will also train his thinking in problem-solving. Many art educators claim elementary students become more inspired when indirect teaching

occurs in classrooms. In this kind of teaching the teacher's questions were basically designed to promote student-centered learning (Armstrong and Armstrong, 1977) and to actively involve the student in higher types of learning. Armstrong and Armstrong make two assumptions in promoting examination of the teacher-planned questioning strategy for instructional purposes: art teachers are concerned with the development of students' positive self-concepts, and students who have successful art experiences will perceive the school and themselves more positively. They suggested that teacher-questioning increases the amount of student verbal response. Even in visual arts education, attention is being given to students' verbalization of concepts that are important for learning through art. Questions that encourage students to think and develop ideas allow them to contribute to their learning. Appropriate types of questions provide less teacher talking and more student thinking, as well as verbalization of observations. The appropriateness of these types of questions to art education can be easily demonstrated. However, the attention will be focused on those types of questions conducive to student involvement in learning information, leading, and proving. Educational interaction between the teacher and the pupils begins with informational questions. Informational questions focus on the students' attention to relevant stimuli provided by the teacher. Leading questions focus on the students' search for relationships in the stimuli. After developing all concepts necessary for arriving at the idea of the lesson, the teacher asks synthesizing questions to encourage the recall

and the relating of those concepts to a meaningful generalization. The generalization may be the art product, verbal statements, or both. However, most important is that the teacher's questions are clustered, dealing with one concept at a time. The authors suggested that a verbalized generalization from a five-year-old involving the concepts of balance would reflect the level at which that concept had been developed. Finally, the approach which invites and trusts student inquiry is more humanistic than glossaries, teacher demonstration, lectures, etc. The ultimate effect of greater student involvement and extended thinking will be more art learning and more inspired students, as reflected by their attitudes and interest.

The following study was conducted in an attempt to investigate alternative methods of instruction and their effectiveness in expanding the range of student art preferences. This study was based on a serious need for identifying an effective approach which could be easily understood and implemented by the elementary teacher who has had little formal training in art education (Gilliatt, 1980). In this study Gilliatt examined three alternatives: (1) the concept of habituation (Pepper, 1949), suggesting that exposure to art works in the environment can lead to the inclusion of those artworks in the student's range of preference; (2) the Feldman-Mittler methodology, which is an art-criticism approach; and (3) the idea of studio activity, suggesting that the student who learns different styles of producing art is more likely to expand his range of art preferences. Gilliatt studied the effectiveness of each

of these approaches when used exclusively and also several combinations of approaches. Significant change in art preference scores was noted after students were exposed to each approach. The results reported that habituation alone appears to expand student preference for works of art at the third- and fifth-grade levels in comparison to the first grade. Gilliatt concluded that these results can greatly simplify the elementary classroom teacher's attempts to expand the range of student art preferences. Gilliatt's results give support to the assumption maintaining that the student learns to expand his range of preferences by exposure to a variety of artworks. A combination of habituation and studio activity was also found to expand student preferences at the third and fifth levels. The two alternative methods mentioned above were found valuable to the regular classroom teacher untrained in art education in expanding student art preferences. Gilliatt noticed that the combination of habituation and the Feldman-Mittler methodology proved to be the most effective approach in this study; however, it is the least productive for the untrained art teacher because the application of this methodology at the elementary level requires special training. Finally, as a result of this study Gilliatt approved the application of both habituation alone and habituation combined with studio activities in the classroom to expand art student preferences, and he demonstrated simplicity of application for the untrained teacher. However, this could be realized by establishing a stable artistic environment in which students in elementary grades become familiar with

displayed valuable works of art, and also by practicing art activities in the classroom.

#### Junior High School Level

Only three studies were found at this level of education discussing different approaches in instruction and their application in classroom art teaching. Beittel and Mattil (1961) conducted a study to compare the effectiveness of two teaching methods on student art teaching. This study examined the depth method of art instruction, which uses closely related experiences in similar media and allows a sustained long-term concentration on one specific area of study. This is compared with the breadth method of art instruction, which uses a variety of different experiences in dissimilar media. The basis for the comparisons was on gains and losses on the spontaneity and the aesthetic quality of the student's art produces. Two groups of ninth-grade children were utilized, each group instructed by a different method. A third group was selected as a control group, and it was taught with the previous year's course of study, which was essentially a breadth approach. The results of this study indicated that the depth approach is valuable because the losses of the students taught by this method were not significant, while the other two groups lost significantly. The group taught by the depth approach gained significantly in both aesthetic quality of their artworks and in spontaneity, while the others did not. In general, this study showed that the depth method produced the greatest gain in individual student progress over a one-year period, and it suggests that

it may be well to begin earlier with children in engaging in sustained long-term projects of a depth approach with less yielding to the demands for variety.

Another study was conducted to discover an appropriate approach for teaching art history. The desired approach would aid the children at this level of education in increasing their interests in art history, which is regarded as an essential part of art curricula. Day (1969) developed an integrated method of teaching art history simultaneously with related studio art activities, and he compared this method with the traditional lecture-slide art history teaching method. In this experiment Day utilized the Cubist movement as the particular area of art history to be presented to junior-high-level students. His results reported that pupils who were taught art history by integrating the study of art history with related studio art activities performed significantly better than pupils who were taught the same unit by the traditional lecture-slide method with no related art activities. Day's research, therefore, shows evidence that the experimental method of integration of art history with studio art activity can be an effective teaching method. In conclusion, pupils at this level of education may, as Day's results implied, learn more art history subject matter in this type of integrated program than in a more traditional lecture-slide art history program.

The third study at this level of education was conducted by Rennels (1969) to investigate methods of developing abilities in spatial

perception in eighth-grade disadvantaged Negro children through the use of perspective drawing and photographs. Rennels examined the analytic and synthetic teaching methods in an attempt to increase the disadvantaged student's ability in spatial discrimination and visualization, and thus to enrich his cognitive world through an increased awareness of his perceptual world. The study was based on the assumption that a child's perceptual style affects his response to different approaches in perceptual task instruction. The analysis of the results indicated that significant differences in performance scores occurred with different perceptual styles, and also it showed that the disadvantaged Negro male scored highest on all tests. This was based on both male and female normal experiences in their own environment. Due to the nature of the environment in which these subjects lived, Rennels found that the disadvantaged male and female groups dealt more with what he called "iconic representation," i.e., they related to objects in terms of their physical appearance only, attaching no symbolic meaning to the object. The environment of the disadvantaged Negro results in his being more field-dependent. Therefore, these subjects reacted better to the analytic method which deals with the visualization of the entire object. In general, this study reported that the analytic method produces superior results in teaching spatial tasks to disadvantaged students. Rennels postulated that this may also be due to an increased interest resulting from the continued use and novelty of the Polaroid camera. Rennels added that the use of a camera as well as the related discussions

utilized in the analytic method may have taught a different manner of approaching visual stimuli. It was understood from the results of this study that the use of appropriate equipment in classroom teaching can result in significant contributions to learning in an art program.

#### Senior High School Level

Only three studies were conducted at this level of education to investigate the effectiveness of teaching methods and the possibility of application in the art classroom. In the following study, two art programs and two teaching methods were investigated to find out which one of those programs and methods is more effective on the quality of the art products created by adolescents. Frankston (1966) noticed that there was a lack of research in the development of art programs that suit the needs of students in the important adolescent period. Frankston suggested two art programs: (1) a prescribed art program, and (2) a self-developed art program. He built the prescribed art program in depth; drawing and painting were to be taught to students in the adolescent period by teachers who were trained to use different methods. As for the other art program, he saw that this program would be better if developed by the teacher himself to meet the interests of his students. Two methods were used and compared in this study: spontaneous and divergent. The spontaneous approach concentrates on the whole problem, utilizing various experimental means of solving the problem. The divergent strategy concentrates on the development of a single element, eventually arriving at the whole through discovery. His results showed

that the self-developed program was better than the one prescribed and was better suited for the spontaneous rather than the divergent teacher. It was concluded that there was a great difference in the way in which the teachers with divergent and spontaneous art strategies handled their classes. It is implied that the art program may need to be adapted to relate to the strategy used by the teacher.

Based on the different levels of thinking that have significant influence on the methodology used in the art classroom, Madeja (1967) investigated two teaching methods and compared them in an attempt to discover any significant differences in the general development of creativity, or any changes in attitudes that relate to the subjects and methods of teaching, and finally any significant relationship between art ability and general creativity. Two methods were used in this study: (1) the divergent-thinking method, and (2) the convergent-thinking method. The comparison between these methods was made in the teaching of groups classified as having high and low abilities in art. Both experimental groups of divergent and convergent thinkers were exposed to similar patterns of instruction, and both received treatment related to each of the teaching methods. The results of this study showed that both instructional methods had a positive effect on all three high-ability groups regarding growth in creativity. However, it seems that the high-art-ability groups profited more from divergent kinds of experiments in art than from a convergent problem structure. Madeja concluded that the divergent method of instruction with high-art-ability

subjects produced more aesthetically oriented end products than did the convergent method. As for the attitudinal change, there were no firm conclusions; but the findings of this study may indicate that the divergent instructional methods have a positive effect on changing attitudes of students of high and low art abilities in their self-concept. Madeja stated that the "findings of this study have some significant implications for instruction." Both the convergent and divergent methods of instruction affect the students of high and low art abilities in different ways. However, the divergent method produced higher-quality end products than the convergent method in the high-art-ability groups. This could imply that instruction for the high-art-ability student should be more divergent in structure than for those of low art ability. However, this suggestion may contradict the art education philosophy which states that open-ended divergent kinds of art experiences are proper instructional methods for all students, regardless of their abilities.

Another study was conducted by Pletcher (1972) to determine the effects of two contrasting teaching methods on learning in art by students judged as having spontaneous art strategies and divergent art strategies. Pletcher sighted that new concepts relating to learning in art place the emphasis upon the individual's role in the learning process, and focus upon the working process for evaluating purposes. He used two teaching methods which were described as independent study and dependent study. The independent study was structured to include the

following teaching techniques: free choice of one area of instruction, student-teacher interaction, process feedback, individual differences, and group interaction. While dependent study was more teacher-centered, students were not free to choose an area of instruction in which to work but were subjected to the same instructional content as the independent study group. His results indicated that the independent study group produced gains in aesthetic quality, in spontaneous art strategy, and losses in divergent art strategy to a greater degree than dependent study. Also independent study, although not proven statistically significant on all measures, tended to be the more effective method of teaching art at the secondary-school level. Based on these results, Pletcher suggested that a small rural school system can accommodate an independent study approach in one area of instruction with little or no difficulty or disruption to the system as a whole, as long as there is understanding and cooperation between the students, faculty, and administration. Moreover, the implication here is most significant for those concerned with curriculum development and scheduling in that the independent study can fight the loss of available time allotted for art instruction. This study lends support to a teaching approach that considers the individual's personality structure and related patterns of learning. The results of this study also gave support to Beittle, Burkhart, and others who have worked to develop "process feedback," "student-determined evaluation criteria," and "student-teacher interaction patterns."

### College Education Level

Early studies involving students at the college level attempted to analyze the creative processes which lead toward an art product in order to evaluate the effectiveness of art education. Kendrick (1962) utilized a Gestalt approach in determining the influence of teacher motivation on the quality of each part of the art process, as well as the quality of the final product. Motivation included normal teacher influence in the forms of: personality, verbal encouragement, demonstrations, and a creative atmosphere. The results of Kendrick's study concluded that teacher motivation significantly increases the aesthetic quality of each part of the art product, and this influence is fairly consistent throughout the art process. The study indicated that the amount of overall quality of each part had a direct relationship on the aesthetic quality of the finished product. This experiment emphasized the need to fully understand the complex relationships involving the art student, the creative process, and the final art work.

Further studies examine the various personalities of art students and the influence of each type of personality on the art process and the final art product. Beittel and Burkhart (1963) established three categories of art student: the spontaneous, the divergent, and the academic. The spontaneous student has a consistent goal and varies his procedure until he obtains the solution to the problem; this concern is the creative process. His objective is to expand the whole by suggestive progressive interaction. The divergent student varies his goal,

but the process is controlled in order to be free to intellectually experiment for new discoveries. His freedom is expressed in organizational innovation; he will change the whole throughout the creative process until unity is achieved at the conclusion. The objective of this strategy is discovery through elaboration. Both the divergent and the spontaneous students desire freedom, but in different ways: the former through process involvement, the latter through process control. In contrast, the academic student functions under static strategy, keeping both technique and goal constant. He is not concerned with innovation or vitality; he concentrates on technical competency and seeks external acceptance through his skill. Both the spontaneous and divergent students obtain internal satisfaction through their creativity.

Beittel and Burkhart's studies indicate that these differing categories of strategies are determined by differing development in personality. Both the spontaneous and divergent students come from supportive environments; they were rewarded for enhancing life through their accomplishments. The spontaneous student's background included some inconsistency and turmoil. He learned that life consists of problems to be solved by his own actions. The divergent student was taught relative values, but was given freedom to make his own decisions. He learned to perceive life as allowing for discovery through his actions. In contrast, the academic student comes from a rigid, authoritarian home, having clear distinctions between right and wrong. The instinctual nature of the child was suppressed, emphasizing conformity and compliancy.

Beittel and Burkhart's research concludes that students have developed different styles of thought and value systems for problem-solving, discovery, and evaluation. In the past, art education has been concerned with only the problem-solving strategy of the spontaneous student. It was assumed that discovery was a dimension of problem-solving. This analysis indicates that discovery is a distinct strategy, as well as an end in itself. There is a great need for educational methodology dealing with discovery as a manner of learning. This same principle can be applied to many other areas of education.

Beittel (1968) further analyzed creative strategy, using abstract terms from psychological learning theory to expand art education theory. His study consisted of two experiments. The initial experiment examined the effect of the implicit learning set (differing drawing stimulus conditions) and the effect of process feedback on students working in a relatively natural task environment. As a result of this experiment, students were classified as spontaneous or divergent. The second experiment involved the effects of an induced learning set and learning feedback on students in an instructional-task environment. In this experiment students worked under an implicit learning set of conditions thought to be related to their strategy classifications. Beittel concluded that feedback conditions help to further knowledge regarding art strategies--he found that spontaneous students are affected more by process feedback. The implicit learning set produced subtle changes in style and aesthetic quality. The induced learning set significantly

influenced the style toward the direction of the instruction, but with very little change in aesthetic quality. It was determined that change in style and quality does not automatically occur; a very strong induced learning set is required. This study also reaffirmed the importance of the concept of drawing strategies as a basis for change in art education. Beittel advocates further research to determine the effects of all variables.

It is generally accepted among art educators that there are distinctly different kinds of art instruction, each requiring different educational methodologies. The breadth method of instruction involves a variety of carefully chosen art activities in an attempt to satisfy the different interests of students. The depth teaching program concentrates on one area of study; activities are well planned to allow for easy transition from problem to problem.

Davis (1969) felt the need for research to compare the merits of both these methods at the college level. He attempted to discover the effects of each teaching method on: creative thinking, art attitudes, aesthetic quality of the finished artwork, and personal-social motivation. His experiments indicated that there is no uniform effect on creative thinking with either method. He determined that art attitudes are not significantly changed by the short-term instruction of one semester. Davis also determined that improvement in aesthetic quality of finished artworks is affected more by the factors of instructor and time of instruction than by the method of instruction. But most

importantly, his research included no evidence which supported either the depth or breadth method to the exclusion of the others. The findings, therefore, raise questions regarding the superiority of one method over another.

It has been found that many elementary education students enrolled in art education courses lack depth and breadth in their experiences in art. When encountering art and art criticism, these students tend to respond favorably only to artworks that are similar to those they have been exposed to in the past. These students will predictably respond negatively to any diverse forms of art. As a result, teachers of art education must cope with the problem of overcoming preconceived attitudes when presenting art and art criticism. A study was conducted (Mittler, 1976) to develop a teaching approach in art criticism that would: (1) encourage students to reexamine established attitudes, and (2) provide students with a broad spectrum of art theory and aesthetic qualities in order to facilitate the formation of new, more positive attitudes. A teaching strategy based on studies in attitude and attitude change was tested for effectiveness in causing students to assimilate a particular aspect of art criticism. This strategy proved most effective when students were asked to express only positive evaluations of an artwork that was previously viewed in a negative manner. A substantial change in attitudes was noted, and students utilized more aesthetic qualities when justifying their changed attitudes. Although not as great, a change in attitude was also noted when students were asked to express either positive or negative changed attitudes.

Further studies were conducted on elementary-education students enrolled in art education to compare strategies for teaching a concept of painting style (Rush, 1979). A strategy utilizing an active classroom condition of practice combined with verbal response was compared with a passive condition of modeled verbal response. The results proved a slight superiority of the latter condition for teaching the style concept. This may have been due to the distraction of incorrect active anticipation. This experiment demonstrated that college students can learn a concept of painting style when exposed to slides of artworks identified only by the artist's name, and these concepts are better retained when the artworks are identified by the artist's name plus a description of that artist's particular style. When no identifying information accompanied the presentation of the slides, students could not differentiate between the artists. Therefore, "verbal information accompanying presentation of the slide" was deemed necessary for acquisition of the style concept. Since most university-level art history is presented in a passive manner utilizing the accompaniment visual and verbal information, this study supports the typical strategy utilized in teaching painting-style concepts.

#### Adult Educational Level

Only one study was found at this level of education. Fitzner (1980) investigated the effectiveness of combined art teaching approaches on the development of aesthetic sensitivity in elderly adults. This study was based on previous research findings that aesthetic

sensitivity can be improved through instruction and direct experience and interaction of students with original works of art is essential for developing aesthetic sensitivity. In this investigation, Fitzner introduced to selected adults (60 years of age and older) curricula combining three components of art education: productive, historical, and critical appreciative. These three components were combined to produce eight teaching approaches which were analyzed individually and collectively to determine the effect each approach or combination of approaches would have on the development of critical judgment and on the aesthetic quality of the art products. Two distinct emphases served as a means of comparison for each art curriculum component: (1) the production component compared a preceptive-cognitive emphasis with an affective-intuitive emphasis; (2) the art history component compared an audio-visual emphasis with a direct-experience emphasis; and (3) the critical-appreciative component compared a product emphasis with a process emphasis. In this study, Fitzner sought to examine three areas: the development of critical aesthetic judgment by elderly subjects, the development of the overall aesthetic quality of art products, and any trends or changes in the overall aesthetic quality of art products over the eight treatment sessions. His results from the first and repeated measure analysis reported that the experimental groups, considered as a whole, performed significantly better on a critical aesthetic judgment measure than the control group. Also the majority of the participants significantly improved the overall aesthetic quality of their art products as assessed by expert judges.

Fitzner concluded that retired adults can improve their ability to make critical aesthetic judgments as a result of experiencing the art education teaching approaches which were employed in this study. All treatment approaches utilized in this study resulted in improvement of the overall aesthetic quality of the art products of the elderly subjects.

## CHAPTER 4

### DISCUSSION

This chapter is a discussion of the role and contributions of research in art education. The importance and limitations of the 21 reviewed articles is examined, with emphasis given to the implications for art education in Libya. In addition, areas that require further research are investigated.

#### Importance of Research

Empirical research is essential for effective improvements in art education. As mentioned previously, there is a need for collaboration between the art teacher and the art researchers; together they function as the agents of inspiration and change. Scientific experimental research is useful to teaching, not because it can provide directions, but because it can provide perspectives: it can provide new ways to examine old problems and can simultaneously identify new problems. The results of this kind of research are warranted to be used in an appropriate teaching-learning situation because the research is based on specific criteria and related tests to logically yield potential findings. In order for the collaboration between the art researcher and the art teacher to be complete, the results of applicable research must be published in accessible art education literature to be used by the

teacher as a resource for ideas and inspiration. In this manner, the art teacher who needs assistance in developing a suitable approach to a particular aesthetic problem is able to identify teaching strategies that have been proven effective. These new innovative approaches serve as inspiration to the teacher and raises his or her desire and conviction as an educator. The basis of all teaching is a true conviction; the absence of this conviction leads to a process of mechanical and meaningless results. Art education research can enhance the teacher's conviction and encourage his or her imagination; and this is reflected in his or her creative teaching. Art education research can lead to more innovative teaching in the preparation of materials, the introduction of new media, and the choice of appropriate methodologies to accomplish the new and different objectives to meet the interests and needs of the students at different ages and levels of education.

#### Importance of Articles Reviewed

Based on the content and results of the reviewed articles, it appears that these studies will contribute to expanding art education theory, and will provide directions for improvements in curriculum development and classroom practice. All of these studies developed or investigated methods and strategies dealing with art instruction at the elementary level through the college and adult education level.

These studies demonstrated the necessity of instruction in a related aesthetic area for improvements in skill as well as understanding. In addition, structured approaches, motivation, and instructional media

were investigated and found to be important factors in an enriching art program. According to the reviewed studies, the art curriculum should be well organized, emphasizing a depth approach based on discovery and exploration. At the lower educational levels, art history and appreciation are more effectively presented through practice and related activities rather than a lecture approach.

At the college level, art major students should be introduced to both theoretical and practical courses of study that will enrich and solidify their background in art education. These combinations of courses will offer a useful body of knowledge on developing the art curriculum content and methodology. The future art teacher should learn how to expand art preferences, motivate students, and develop and design art programs appropriate for each educational level and related area of art aesthetics.

#### Limitation of Articles Reviewed

Although the reviewed studies in art education provide important information related to teaching procedures and techniques, there are some limitations to the current state of art education research. It appears, from this review, that current art education studies provide more implications for further research than practical applications in teaching art. In addition, the conclusions drawn from some studies are based on broad generalizations rather than on clear statistical results, and the results are sometimes less generally applicable and difficult to adapt into classroom practice. As a result, the art teacher sometimes

finds himself very confused if he or she intends to utilize available research.

The conclusions drawn from some studies are based on very limited research evidence, e.g., the superiority of the depth method in comparison with the breadth method, and the more effective teacher-centered method in comparison with teacher-child interaction or child-centered situation. Therefore, these teaching techniques should be field-tested at different educational levels to better determine their merits in classroom art teaching.

In addition, research studies in art education most often utilize two-dimensional subject matter. It is necessary that future research examine the use of alternate visual arts media, e.g., ceramics or metal work.

#### Implications for Libyan Art Education

In Libya, the instructional system within the context of art education is in need of much concern and attention, especially from those who are officially responsible for the design of the art education curriculum, and also from art educators who have made a vow to teach. This attention is necessary in order to establish the field of art education as competent to participate with other educational fields in the universal modern awakening which is now taking place throughout the nation. The importance of any area of study is dependent upon its contribution to the development of the individual and society. The significance of art education is its educational integrity; the laws of

learning and psychological drives of childhood are not violated in professional art teaching, but are strengthened and supported. Learning by practice, verbal learning, and observational learning are all aspects of an art program. Learning by practice involves creative work and planning. Verbal learning incorporates discussion and evaluation. Observational learning involves visual discrimination. Meanwhile, it should be realized that art teaching and learning, along with art, are open concepts which are subject to continual change; this change can occur in content as well as the method of accomplishing this content.

Art education in the Libyan public school system is still suffering from pedagogical conflicts, especially at the elementary and junior high school level. It can be observed that there are two distinct trends in methodologies. One group of teachers believes in absolute freedom in art education; they are under the impression that freedom in the classroom means that the instructor should not offer any guidance or instruction. Their theory is that whatever the student produces on his own is a satisfactory, creative achievement in self-expression. Other teachers disagree; they believe absolute freedom leads to confusion and endless repetition with haphazard, accidental results. Their approach is a well constructed plan of instruction consisting of several lessons, and designed to fulfill a specific objective. By means of this system, students are encouraged and expected to develop their sensitivity, appreciation, and creativity.

The existence of these two methodologies has resulted in misunderstanding and conflict. The laissez faire group is of the opinion

that a structural program interferes with the student's self-expression; the teacher imposes his own values, personality, and knowledge on the student. The group of the more traditional approach claims that a lack of direction and guidance encourages carelessness and repetition, actually retarding the development of artistic values.

The student's development in art education is greatly dependent on the attitude of the instructor. The student should be encouraged without interference, guided in the right direction without any loss of individual personality and style. Many studies that have been reviewed in this paper (Salome, 1965; Neperud, 1966; Pariser, 1979; Rush et al., 1980) support the viewpoint that instruction and guidance are necessary for the development of the student's self-expression and learning in both two- and three-dimensional work. The results of these studies offer numerous possibilities for the development of the student's creativity and visual perception. These studies, therefore, provide evidence that instruction in a related art activity will enrich the student's art learning.

Although art education literature indicates that art history and appreciation are essential components of art education programs, there is a lack of instruction in these areas in the Libyan public schools. This is due to the lack of research designed to inspire art teachers and provide a practical educational methodology to be applied in the classroom. Art history and appreciation should be presented to junior and senior high school students through actual studio practice.

Although academic lectures in appreciation or art history are suitable for art academics, they are not appropriate for junior or secondary schools. In order to teach appreciation and art history through studio practice, a qualified art teacher should think of some aesthetic objectives. As students are concerned with the problems at hand, they are introduced to various traditional sources which play a great role in solving their aesthetic problems. They are able to relate their experience and knowledge of the works of art of the past to the immediate aesthetic problems they are confronting. This gives meaning to the traditional works of art and develops the student's sensitivity at the same time.

One study reviewed in this paper (Day, 1969) offered an important method in teaching art history to children at the junior high level. In his experiment, Day integrated teaching art history with related studio activity. The results proved the superiority of this method over the traditional lecture-slide method. This study, therefore, supports the idea that art history and appreciation need to be taught through practice at this level of education. This idea could be applicable in Libyan junior high schools, especially in the urban areas. At this educational level, trained art teachers are available, as well as equipment and materials. As for the instructional content, the art teacher himself should choose what is suitable for his students from the established art education curriculum.

At this time in Libya, art education is available only to first-year students in secondary schools. I propose that this method of

presentation of art history with related studio activity or practice could be applied at that level as well. As for teaching art history to students at the higher education level, especially to art major students, there is an important study reviewed herein which investigated the learning of a concept of painting style (Rush, 1979). Its results support the on-going teaching method of a slide presentation accompanied by verbal information, i.e., the traditional lecture-slide method. This study, therefore, affirms and supports the teaching method which is presently used in teaching art history to art major students at the Al-Fateh University.

Another important approach to art education could be applied to the established art curriculum of the Libyan school system, particularly at the junior high level. The studies of Beittel and Mattil (1961) and Davis (1969) outlined two distinct approaches to art education: (1) the depth approach, and (2) the breadth approach. Each program has its merits in teaching art. However, the depth method was found more effective for evaluation of the student's progress; results are more apparent if all students are using the same medium. Also, the art student is better able to understand and experience the aesthetic problem when not distracted by a variety of media. The student should develop his art experience and his personal technique in one medium before transmitting his ideas to another medium. In this manner, he or she gains more knowledge regarding the advantages and disadvantages of each medium. At this time in Libyan public schools, the breadth method is more commonly used.

There is a great need for a reassessment of the art education curriculum, utilizing a depth approach of instruction in one medium at a time. Art students will be better able to function and be more productive in Libya if they are encouraged to develop expertise in one medium in long-term projects.

In Libya, the art educator must face the problem of overcoming the student's adverse attitudes and misunderstanding towards visual arts. These attitudes must be replaced by expanding the student's preferences in art. A study conducted by Gilliatt (1980) concluded that habituation and studio activity were appropriate for expanding the art preferences of students at the lower educational levels; the Feldman-Mittler methodology, i.e., an art criticism approach, was also effective, but requires a highly trained art teacher. In Libya there is a great need for application of the results of this study, most importantly at the elementary and junior high school level. Libyan students need more exposure to art exhibits in school as well as in the community, in conjunction with their studio activity, in order to expand their preferences and be more objective regarding art. At the higher educational levels, this exposure to art should be continued, and art criticism should be added to the curriculum, utilizing a trained art educator to make the criticism meaningful in expanding art preferences.

It was found as a result of research that audio-visual aids have an important affect on the teaching-learning process in art education. It is generally accepted that a well-prepared and appropriate choice of

educational aids will assist the art teacher in communicating his ideas and motivating the students in art programs. Brouch (1971) concluded that the use of suitable equipment such as a synchronized slide-tape system enriched the quality of the students' art products when the students had been exposed simultaneously to prepared packages of visual slides with related verbal instruction. This study could be very useful to the trained art teacher because he can prepare such packages of slides to complement his instruction on different aesthetic ideas in either two- or three-dimensional art works. But how can the regular classroom teacher utilize this experiment? As we know, at most elementary schools in the U.S. as well as in Libya, art is taught by the regular class teacher, who has had insufficient training in art education, and is unable to produce or prepare such packages for his or her art teaching. To assist the untrained elementary teacher, art specialists and art educators could collaborate with the Instructional Aids Departments to design and produce different synchronized slide-tape packages concentrating on various visual art programs. Copies of these packages should be made available to classroom teachers in the public schools, for their use in appropriate art teaching.

In Libya, it is possible to apply this idea because the instructional aids departments are available, and these departments have sufficient equipment for the production of such programs. However, the art supervisors and art educators should choose the contents of these packages, making them appropriate for students at different educational

levels. When these packages become available, the regular classroom teachers at the elementary level, and the specialized art teachers as well, will be able to obtain these packages free of charge for use in their art teaching. This is due to the fact that education in Libya from kindergarten through the university level is provided to the citizens free of charge, and the Libyan educational system has the resources to develop such technically advanced programs to enrich art education.

Finally, in Libya today there is a great concern for the type of person the future needs. The educational system must be designed to produce individuals who are (1) creative people, not stereotypists or imitators, (2) productive people, not merely consumers, and (3) professional people in their attitudes and actions. This current concern necessitates a rebuilding or revision of the present art education objectives and curriculum in order to comprise the needed educational aspects, concentrating on creativity, discovery, learning skills, and appreciation. Art programs in the public schools should be designed to emphasize subject matter content as well as process and product. Most important, the teaching methodology needs to be developed and varied with the understanding that no one approach to instruction will function effectively in all learning situations. Students learn in different ways at different times. Certain subject matter is best served by the use of a particular teaching method or strategy, and diverse objectives call for diverse approaches to meet the objectives. The studies which

are mentioned in this section are very important because they introduce applicable teaching methods which were not previously known in art education in the Libyan public school system.

#### Future Areas to be Investigated

Further research in art education must be based on existing theory as well as new theory as it becomes available, in order to contribute to the development and organization of our professional knowledge. Presently there is a lack of adequate research regarding the teacher's behavior and its relation to inspiration in the classroom. There is a great need for stimulation in art education; the art teacher needs to adopt a suitable teaching style to effectively motivate the student. The art teacher must be guided in the direction to be followed in the preparation for teaching, the process of teaching, and the evaluation of the student's finished product.

Art education research can provide guidelines and new perspectives, but the teacher must preserve his or her individual style and imagination to adapt to each unique teaching situation.

There is a need for further research on the effectiveness of new technological media. In this age of technology, various new media, e.g., video and computers, are being utilized in other educational fields. It is logical that these advanced visual media could supplement and enhance a visual arts educational program as well. Research needs to be conducted to determine the most effective and appropriate use of such technically advanced media in art education.

**APPENDIX A**

**SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY**

- Abrahamson, R. E. The teaching approach of Henry Schaefer-Simmern. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 22(1), 42-50.
- Armstrong, C. L., & Armstrong, N. A. Art teacher questioning strategy. Studies in Art Education, 1977, 18(3), 53-64.
- Beittel, K. R. In reply to Laura Chapman's critique. Studies in Art Education, 1964, 6(1), 30.
- Beittel, K. R. Manipulation of learning set and feedback in the teaching of drawing. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 10(1), 17-32.
- Beittel, K. R. Unity of truth, language and method in art education. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 21(1), 50-56.
- Beittel, K. R., & Burkhart, R. C. Strategies of spontaneous, divergent, and academic art students. Studies in Art Education, 1963, 5(1), 20-41.
- Beittel, K. R., & Mattil, E. L. The effect of a "depth" versus a "breadth" method of art instruction at the ninth grade level. Studies in Art Education, 1961, 3(1), 75-87.
- Bengston, J. K., Schoeller, J., and Cohen, S. J. On conceptualizing an artistic style: how critical are examples? Studies in Art Education, 1978, 20(1), 49-55.
- Bradley, W. R. A preliminary study of the effect of verbalization and personality orientation on art quality. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 9(2), 31-37.
- Bradley, W. R. Intrinsic feedback and its effect upon aesthetic growth. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 10(2), 41-49.
- Brouch, V. M. An experimental study of the effect of synchronized slide-tape learning experiences on the tempera paintings of third and fourth grade children. Studies in Art Education, 1971, 12(3), 31-42.
- Burkhart, R. C. The interrelationship of separate criteria for creativity in art and student teaching to four personality factors. Studies in Art Education, 1961, 3(1), 18-38.
- Chalmers, F. G. Teaching and studying art history: some anthropological and sociological considerations. Studies in Art Education, 1978, 20(1), 18-25.

- Chapman, L. H. Some comments on "spontaneous, divertent and academic art students." Studies in Art Education, 1964, 6(1), 25-29.
- Clark, G. A., & Zimmerman, E. A walk in the right direction: a model for visual arts education. Studies in Art Education, 1978, 19(2), 34-49.
- Covington, M. V. Teaching for creativity: some implications for art education. Studies in Art Education, 1967, 9(1), 18-32.
- Cromer, J. L. Verbal language conditions as a determinant of aesthetic performances. Studies in Art Education, 1973, 15(1), 49-60.
- Davis, D. J., & Torrance, E. P. How favorable are the values of art educators to the creative person. Studies in Art Education, 1965, 6(2), 42-53.
- Davis, D. J. The effects of depth and breadth methods on art instruction upon creative thinking, art attitudes and aesthetic quality of art products in beginning art students. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 10(2), 27-40.
- Day, M. D. The compatibility of art history and studio art activity in the junior high school art program. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 10(2), 57-65.
- Day, M. D. Effects of instruction on high school students' art preferences and art judgments. Studies in Art Education, 1976, 18(1), 25-39.
- Dorethy, R. E. The effect of expectation on embedded figure perception. Studies in Art Education, 1972, 15(3), 25-31.
- Douglas, N. J., & Schwartz, J. B. Increasing awareness of art ideas of young children through guided experiences with ceramics. Studies in Art Education, 1967, 8(2), 2-9.
- Fitzner, D. H. The effects of combined art teaching approaches on the development of aesthetic sensitivity among selected elderly adults. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 28-37.
- Force, L. S. An experimental study to examine the response of sixth grade students to programmed instruction in art designed to correspond to selected ability trait variables. Studies in Art Education, 1970, 11(2), 37-50.
- Frankston, L. Some exploration of the effect of creative visual art experience upon poetry writing quality of eighth grade students. Studies in Art Education, 1963, 5(1), 42-59.

- Frankston, L. Effects of two programs and two methods of teaching upon the art products of adolescents. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(2), 23-32.
- Gilliatt, M. T. The effect of habituation, the Feldman-Mittler methodology and studio activities on expanding art preferences of elementary students. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 43-49.
- Grossman, E. Effects of instructional experience in clay modeling skills on modeled human figure representation in preschool children. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 22(1), 51-59.
- Hardiman, G. W. and Johnson, J. J., Jr. Analysis of motivational stimulus structure: an exploratory study. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(2), 14-22.
- Hogg, J. C., & McWhinnie., H. J. A pilot research in aesthetic education. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 9(2), 52-59.
- Hysell, D. M. Testing an advance organizer model<sup>b</sup> in development of aesthetic perception. Studies in Art Education, 1972, 14(3), 9-17.
- Johansen, P. An art appreciation teaching model for visual aesthetic education. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(3), 4-14.
- Kanegieter, R. B. The effects of a learning program in activity upon the visual perception of shape. Studies in Art Education, 1971, 12(2), 18-27.
- Kendrick, D. The influence of teacher motivation and non-motivation on the overall aesthetic quality of the "whole" and the "parts" of cut-paper art products. Studies in Art Education, 1962, 3(2), 52-61.
- Kensler, G. L. The effects of perceptual training and modes of perceiving upon individual differences in ability to learn perspective drawing. Studies in Art Education, 1965, 7(1), 34-41.
- Korzenik, D. Role-taking and children's drawings. Studies in Art Education, 1974, 15(3), 17-24.
- Kratochwill, C. E., Rush, J. C., and Kratochwill, T. R. The effects of descriptive social reinforcement on creative responses in children's easel painting. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(2), 29-39.
- Lansing, K. M. The effect of drawing on the development of mental representations. Studies in Art Education, 1981, 22(3), 15-23.

- Lienard, M. What is the relationship of children's satisfaction with their art products to improvement in art? Studies in Art Education, 1961, 3(1), 55-65.
- Lovano, J. J. The relation of conceptual styles and mode of perception to graphic expression. Studies in Art Education, 1970, 11(3), 39-51.
- Madeja, S. S. The effects of divergent and convergent emphasis in art instruction on students of high and low ability. Studies in Art Education, 1967, 8(2), 10-20.
- McFee, J. K. Research in art education. Studies in Art Education, 1960, 2(1), 16-21.
- McFee, J. K. Why teach art: Editorial' Studies in Art Education, 1968, 9(2), 1-4.
- Miles, H. C. The development of personality through art appreciation: a vital aspect of education through art. Studies in Art Education, 1960, 2(1), 72-84.
- Mittler, G. A. An instructional strategy designed to overcome the adverse effects of established student attitudes toward works of art. Studies in Art Education, 1976, 17(3), 13-31.
- Nelson, T. M. and Flannery, M. E. Instructions in drawing techniques as a means of utilizing drawing potential of six and seven year olds. Studies in Art Education, 1967, 8(2), 58-65.
- Neperud, R. W. An experimental study of visual elements, selected art instruction methods, and drawing development at the fifth grade level. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(2), 3-13.
- Neperud, R. W. Visual arts instruction in primitive societies--its implications for art education. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 10(2), 12-26.
- Packard, S. P. Editorial: Research on teaching. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 4-5.
- Pariser, D. A. Two methods of teaching drawing skills. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(3), 30-42.
- Pletcher, R. E. Teaching method, art strategy types and learning in art. Studies in Art Education, 1972, 14(1), 59-65.
- Rennels, M. R. Two methods of teaching spatial tasks to disadvantaged Negroes. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 11(1), 44-51.

- Rush, J. C. Acquiring a concept of painting style. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(3), 43-51.
- Rush, J. C., & Kratochwill, T. R. Time-series strategies for studying behavior change: implications for research in visual arts education. Studies in Art Education, 1981, 22(2), 57-67.
- Rush, J. C., Weckesser, J. K., and Sabers, D. L. A comparison of instructional methods for teaching contour drawing to children. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 6-12.
- Salome, R. A. The effects of perceptual training upon the two-dimensional drawings of children. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(1), 18-33.
- Salome, R. A. Perceptual training in reading readiness and implications for art education. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 10(1), 58-67.
- Salome, R. A., & Reeves, D. Two pilot investigations of perceptual training in four- and five-year-old Kindergarten children. Studies in Art Education, 1972, 13(2), 3-10.
- Salome, R. A., & Szeto, J. W. The effects of search practice and perceptual training upon representational drawing. Studies in Art Education, 1976, 18(1), 49-54.
- Seefeldt, C. The effects of a program designed to increase young children's perception of texture. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(2), 40-44.
- Smith, E. P. Selected characteristics of teachers and their preferences for behaviorally stated objectives. Studies in Art Education, 1973, 14(2), 35-46.
- Stallings, W. M., West, C. K., & Watts, G. The effect of feedback and selected personality variables on aesthetic judgment. Studies in Art Education, 1973, 15(1), 28-33.
- Taylor, A. P., & Trujillo, J. L. The effects of selected stimuli on the art products, concept formation, and aesthetic judgmental decisions of four-year-old children. Studies in Art Education, 1973, 14(2), 57-66.
- Whitsitt, M. E., & Peterson, J. M. A model of elementary art instruction based upon curiosity as a motive for color concept learning. Studies in Art Education, 1977, 18(3), 43-52.
- Wiggin, R. G. Art activities for mentally handicapped children. Studies in Art Education, 1961, 3(1), 88-102.

Wilson, B. G. An experimental study designed to alter fifth and sixth grade students' perception of painting. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 8(1), 33-42.

Youngblood, M. S. The hemispherality wagon leaves laterality station at 12:45 for art superiority land. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 21(1), 44-49.

## REFERENCES

- Armstrong, C. L., & Armstrong, N. A. Art teacher questioning strategy. Studies in Art Education, 1977, 18(3), 53-64.
- Beittel, K. R. Manipulation of learning set and feedback in the teaching of drawing. Studies in Art Education, 1968, 10(1), 17-32.
- Beittel, K. R., & Burkhart, R. C. Strategies of spontaneous, divergent, and academic art students. Studies in Art Education, 1963, 5(1), 20-41.
- Beittel, K. R., & Mattil, E. L. The effect of a "depth" versus a "breadth" method of art instruction at the ninth grade level. Studies in Art Education, 1961, 3(1), 75-87.
- Brouch, V. M. An experimental study of the effect of synchronized slide tape learning experiences on the tempera paintings of third and fourth grade children. Studies in Art Education, 1971, 12(3), 31-42.
- Davis, D. J. The effects of depth and breadth methods of art instruction upon creative thinking, art attitudes and aesthetic quality of art products in the beginning college art students. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 10(2), 27-40.
- Day, M. D. The compatibility of art history and studio art activity in the junior high school art program. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 10(2), 57-65.
- Fitzner, D. H. The effects of combined art teaching approaches on the development of aesthetic sensitivity among selected elderly adults. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 28-37.
- Force, L. S. An experimental study to examine the response of sixth grade students to programmed instruction in art designed to correspond to selected ability trait variables. Studies in Art Education, 1970, 11(2), 37-50.
- Frankston, L. Effects of two programs and two methods of teaching upon the art products of adolescents. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(2), 23-32.

- Gilliatt, M. T. The effects of habituation, the Feldman-Mittler methodology, and studio activities on expanding art preferences of elementary students. Studies in Art Education, 1980, 21(2), 43-49.
- Kendrick, D. The influence of teacher motivation and non-motivation on the overall aesthetic quality of the "whole" and the "parts" of cut-paper art products. Studies in Art Education, 1962, 3(2), 52-61.
- Madeja, S. S. The effects of divergent and convergent emphasis in art instruction on students of high and low ability. Studies in Art Education, 1967, 8(2), 10-20.
- Mittler, G. A. An instructional strategy designed to overcome the adverse effects of established student attitudes toward works of art. Studies in Art Education, 1976, 17(3), 13-31.
- Neperud, R. W. An experimental study of visual elements, selected art instruction methods, and drawing development at the fifth grade level. Studies in Art Education, 1966, 7(2), 3-13.
- Pariser, D. A. Two methods of teaching drawing skills. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(3), 30-42.
- Pletcher, R. E. Teaching method, art strategy types and learning in art. Studies in Art Education, 1972, 14(1), 59-65.
- Rennels, M. R. Two methods of teaching spatial tasks to disadvantaged Negroes. Studies in Art Education, 1969, 11(1), 44-51.
- Rush, J. C. Acquiring a concept of painting style. Studies in Art Education, 1979, 20(3), 43-51.
- Salome, R. A. The effects of perceptual training upon the two dimensional drawings of children. Studies in Art Education, 1965, 7(1), 18-33.
- Whitsitt, M. E., & Peterson, J. M. A model of elementary art instruction based upon curiosity as a motive for color concept learning. Studies in Art Education, 1977, 18(3), 43-52.