

MINUTES
FACULTY SENATE
January 27, 2014

Once approved, these minutes may be accessed electronically at:

http://facultygovernance.arizona.edu/senate_minutes

Visit the faculty governance webpage at:

<http://facultygovernance.arizona.edu/>

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair of the Faculty Robert Mitchell at 3:03 p.m. in the College of Law, Room 164.

Present: Senators Abraham, Aleamoni, Armstrong, Ashton, Ayoun, Brooks, Camenisch, Colina, Comrie, Conway, Dahlgran, Dai, Daryaei, Duran, Fountain, Fregosi, Ganapol, Gehrels, Hart, Hildebrand, Howell, Johnson, Labate, Martin, Mazzella, McCammon, McKean, Mitchell, Moreno, Nadel, Nfonsam, Pau, Reed, Reynolds, Secomb, Silverman, Smith, Tabor, Ulreich, Vaillancourt, Visscher, M. Witte, R. Witte and Zwinger.

Absent: Senators Blanche, Brewer, R. Brown, Castro, Cervelli, Cuello, Douglas, Franklin, Guertin, Hamilton, Higgins, Jones, Joseph, Lee, Lysecky, Willerton (Polakowski), Rychlik, Sokoloff, Spece, St. John, Watchman, and Zedeno.

2. OPEN SESSION

There were no speakers for Open Session.

Presiding Officer Mitchell asked Senators' permission to move Agenda Item #6 to accommodate the guest speaker's 4:00 p.m. meeting. With no objections from the Senate, Item #6 was moved to Item #3.

3. INFORMATION ITEM: THE PROGRESS OF RCM, CANDACE CORVEY, INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT AND FORMER VICE PRESIDENT FOR FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION, UNIVERSITY OF NEW HAMPSHIRE AND PROVOST ANDREW COMRIE

Provost Comrie introduced Candace Corvey, Independent Consultant and former Vice President for Finance and Administration at the University of New Hampshire (UNH) and the current the RCM consultant for the UA. Comrie pointed out the RCM website's resource page, and introduced James Florian, Associate Vice President for Institutional Analysis who is undertaking the technical aspects of RCM. The RCM Steering Committee's twenty members are made up of all the chairs of the nine RCM subcommittees, plus a few others to round out shared governance representation. The subcommittee structure was established in the spring 2013. As of fall 2013, each subcommittee has provided written recommendations to the steering committee. Three years of data in the UAccess system allows for manipulation of different sets of variables within the UA system, and diagnostic testing of the variables should be complete by late spring semester 2014. A final recommendation to President Hart and implementation into transitioning into RCM could happen as early as summer 2014. Approximately twelve Guiding Principles are in place to act as a constitution, balance debates and keep the precepts on track.

Corvey opened by explaining differences in the RCM models between UNH and the UA. Each RCM model has to be unique to that university. RCM has been in place at UNH for thirteen years. There have been three formal reviews of the model and governance structure over a period of time and adjustments were made. Two main themes of adjustments were to move the model to a greater level of simplicity, and secondly, to try to generate a greater pool of strategic funds to allow the President and Provost more opportunity for strategic investment. There are no predictions how the UA's model will change over time, but there will be opportunities in the future for formal review, learning from experience and adjustment. The process thus far with two site visits and bi-weekly phone calls with the team has been one of considerable integrity and thoughtfulness. The RCM process takes two to three years, and the UA is maintaining its target time-wise. Transparency of the financial model of the institution is important, and the goal is to allow everyone at the institution to have a lay-person understanding of where the money comes from, where it goes and what is the basis for resource allocation. Predictability is important for planning purposes, and RCM decentralizes authority and accountability, giving more capacity to plan at the college level. When the steering committee introduces its recommendations to the President and the community, Corvey urged everyone to make their own assessment of the extent to which the formula and components of the model strike the right balance with the principles. She stressed senators to keep in mind that the model is a tool and requires good leadership and good judgment, and acknowledges that the role of the faculty in the creation, delivery and assessment of high-quality programs is essential.

Questions and comments included: 1) Senator Tabor asked what the best and worst consequences of RCM are. Corvey answered that the best consequence is that the schools under the leadership of the deans have significantly more ability to plan for the future and the ability to launch new programs and more fully understand the growing revenue associated with such programs. The disadvantage is maintenance of sufficient flexible funds at the level of the President and Provost for strategic investment. 2) Senator Silverman said that the RCM model appears to put more responsibility/authority in the units, and some deans and department heads are more in tune with shared governance than others. How will RCM train deans and department heads while encompassing an aspect of decentralization? Corvey said there is an important training factor not only for deans and department heads, but also for the financial personnel of each unit. At UNH, the experience was that some deans were better at taking on responsibility, flexibility and accountability than others. The Provost made it clear to the deans to create a rational and transparent budget process so that everyone in the college would understand the revenue and expenses, and share a five-year set of projections for each college. Most did well, but some lacked in these areas. In total, it produced more inclusive decision-making and better planning, creativity for the development of new programs and ideas for greater efficiencies that could flow back to the unit. Any budget surplus, as determined by the steering committee, could be set aside in a reserve to offset any future financial strains. President Hart reiterated that "closed-

room” or “back door” decisions are not possible with RCM. Knowledge of the budget by all faculty will allow for more entrepreneurial activity, which in turn will generate more revenue and new programs, contributing to the growth of the University. 3) Senator M. Witte stated that the shared governance issue needs to be established at the departmental level. 4) Chair of the Faculty Howell said that after the UA’s share of budget cuts, each unit developed its sources of revenue for operational costs. Creative units developed revenue streams such as teaching more summer courses or online teaching options. Faculty have expressed concern that RCM will take away revenue from a successful unit and share it with a less successful unit. Faculty are asking questions and no one is providing any answers. Corvey said that these types of questions are now being dealt with by the steering committees and subcommittees. The successful model has to provide incentives for outreach to continue and grow. Exact formulas and results cannot be shared because they do not exist yet. Questions such as these are before the steering committee at this time. Comrie clarified the structure of incentives needs to be on an even playing field which will require some experimentation and fine-tuning by colleges and departments to allow for resources to follow activity.

4. REPORTS

4A. ASUA President Morgan Abraham

Abraham reported that ASUA is focusing on restructuring its student Senate. ASUA’s Senate consists of ten At-large elected officials with similar interests and from similar University communities. The Senators generally do not represent the diverse areas on campus occupied by students. ASUA would like to create an Assembly to be more representative of areas such as Student Affairs, Greek Councils, diversity and college schools where students belong. The addition is a simple bylaws change as opposed to a major constitutional change. The addition, hopefully, will be added this semester with implementation in the fall of 2014. ASUA is strategically planning its vision to align with the *Never Settle Strategic Academic and Business Plan*. ASUA elections are scheduled for March 12 and 13, 2014. ASUA is lobbying against HB 2196 which is the bill to repeal the HB 2013 omnibus election law bill.

4B. GPSC President Zachary Brooks

Brooks reported that Senator Daryaei will be taking over for him at Senate for the remainder of the semester. GPSC’s elections will coincide with ASUA’s elections. Brooks encouraged ASUA to implement an Assembly in order to expand diversity of college representation among its Senate. The Research and Projects Grant program has awarded \$25,000 last semester and will award \$25,000 for the current semester. GPSC thanks the deans of Social and Behavioral Sciences and the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences for providing funds for the grant program. Brooks encouraged Senators from Eller College, College of Education and College of Medicine to inform students that GPSC has funds provided by its deans. GPSC will present two Graduate Student surveys at next week’s ABOR meeting in Tempe on mentoring experiences and campus health services/student health insurance. A colleague at Arizona State University will report to the ABOR Academic Affairs Committee on mentoring and Affordable Care Act concerns. The Student Health Insurance Advisory Committee is recommending a 31-41% increase in healthcare insurance benefits for graduate students. The national *Grads Have Debt 2* campaign made over 850 calls to Congress. UA made seventy of those calls. On January 29, 2014, GPSC will hold its first Affordable Care Act Forum in the Tubac Room from 6:15 to 7:15 p.m. with Graduate College Dean Carnie, Human Resources Director Helen Rodrigues and Campus Health and Wellness Executive Director Harry McDermott.

4C. Faculty Officers’ Report

Mitchell reminded Senators that the deadline for petition submission for the upcoming Primary Election is February 7, 2014. The Officers would like to report the resignation of Robert Sankey as Parliamentarian to the Faculty Senate. We would like to thank Dr. Sankey for his many years of service to the Faculty Senate and are sorry to see him go. The bylaws of the General Faculty state that the Parliamentarian shall be appointed by the Chair of the Faculty, and the Chair has designated that I, Robert Mitchell as Vice Chair of the Faculty, take over the duties of the Parliamentarian until the end of my term in May 2014.

4D. Provost Andrew Comrie

Provost Comrie reported that December Commencement was a big success. The UA had two important academic visits in January. The Liaison Committee on Medical Education (LCME) Accreditation team and the American Veterinary Medical Association (AVMA) pre-program visit, advising on the planning for an offering of the Doctor of Veterinary Medicine degree. The findings with the LCME were not out of the ordinary and the UA did well in quite a few areas. The self-study document submitted is approximately 2,500 pages and available through iTunes U. The Strategic Plan implementation continues. Planning for the next capital campaign is underway with a kick-off date of April 11, 2014.

4E. President Ann Weaver Hart

President Hart reported that she will be out of town for the Senate meeting on February 3, 2014. The governor’s budget proposal is disappointing to higher education, but particularly disappointing to the UA. Governor Brewer has recommended \$32M in new permanent funding with \$27.5M going to ASU and NAU and only \$3.5M going to the UA to rectify the loss the Cooperative Extension has faced. The \$15M outlined in the agreement presented in the ABOR metrics is not addressed in the Governor’s recommendation. Instead, \$15M over five years would be earmarked for the Translational Genomics Research Institute (TGen) and flow through the UA. The Governor has also recommended \$10M of one-time funding for critical, urgent capital projects spread over the three institutions and has earmarked the money for deferred maintenance. No funding has been mentioned for mission critical initiatives, for the Veterinary Medicine program or for financial aid for students. While visiting Oman in the United Arab Emirates, President Hart had a conference call with the three Arizona University Presidents and Chairman Myers, and it was decided to move forward with the original ABOR proposal. Next Wednesday, as a group, the four presidents and Chairman Myers will be arguing for the original \$107M in a presentation to the House Higher Education Policy Committee. Increases to two out of three institutions is a failure to fund the UA. A plan for working with individual legislators and with relevant committees to make a case for university

funding is part of the plan. The tuition issue proposed in the Governor's address is a guaranteed tuition model similar to NAU's option model. The Regents and President Klein have said in public that dependable tuition depends on dependable appropriation. President Hart also said that there are misunderstandings about how medical schools operate, how physicians select areas of expertise and choose how and where they decide to practice medicine. The State of Arizona has legislators who still believe that Arizona only needs to recruit doctors educated elsewhere versus training doctors in Arizona because Arizona has such a desirable climate, everyone is willing to flock here to practice medicine.

The capital campaign is a \$1.5B goal, with hopes of raising half of the money before the public announcement of the campaign. The capital campaign is built into the Business and Finance Plan, and will mesh philanthropy directly into the UA's academic aspirations. Two key initiatives that are interrelated will be the theme for the capital campaign that Senior Vice President for University Relations Teri Thompson has led for the last six months, and launching a state and national advertising campaign and brand initiative to inform the public of the elevated quality and unique experience incorporating all aspects at the UA. The Regents, UA Board of Trustees, students and many others have all been involved in focus groups helping with the project.

The UA has an influential and accomplished set of alumni in the United Arab Emirates Republic, and President Hart has just returned from a meeting there where she learned that shared areas of research and education are prevalent as they relate to health, engineering, technology and agricultural irrigation/water management. The UA has been invited back, and a world exposition is planned for 2020. The Minister of State of the Emirates would like the UA to partner in the sustainability portion of the three-strand theme. Meetings with higher education leaders from Oman and surrounding Emirates brought forth invitations to encourage more UA students to study abroad, and more faculty to participate in exchanges. Hart met with the Sultan of Sharjah, the higher education leader in the area, and was given a tour of the cultural center and an American University he personally founded. The UA has incredibly supportive alumni with tremendous political and financial influence who have not been involved in any UA activities. In the next two to three years, this group would like to hold a reunion in Tucson. This opportunity allows the UA with to become more of a global institution.

5. QUESTION AND ANSWER PERIOD FOR ITEM 3

1) Senator Silverman asked Hart why the UA is being targeted by the Governor and funding is being denied the UA. Hart said that there is a belief in the Governor's immediate group that the UA has "made it" and because the UA does genomic research and basic biomedical research, a revenue stream exists and supports the institution so that additional state funds are not necessary. Representative Kavanagh has been the leader of the anti-funding group in the press. The actual cost for a degree that was applied to the performance funding model has not been applied to the parity model. The UA has allies and support with ABOR Chairman Rick Myers, ABOR President Eileen Klein, and the two University Presidents who all believe in the proposal put forth before the legislature and Governor. The scandal with Child Protective Services has left the State of Arizona devastated and left the legislature unable to focus on anything education related. 2) Senator Nadel said that Kavanagh thinks that the sole purpose for a college education is to prepare people for jobs, but now that many jobs are low-paying and don't require a college education, not everyone needs to attend a university. Contributing to the economic growth of the state is the main purpose of the university, so how do we reverse this conversation? Hart replied that Kavanagh is wrong. Jobs of the future will require higher education degrees and will require more than technical skills. The decrease in public funding reflects entitlement funding that has been locked into budgets, along with the collapse of the economy in 2008. Private universities' tuition can be in excess of \$60,000 a year, so a 3% increase in tuition on that higher amount, is a lot more than a 3% increase on \$10,000. 3) Senator Fregosi asked for clarification on TGen. Hart replied that TGen has always been subsidized by the state and was founded as a biotech incubator with public funds. The UA and ASU each contributed \$10M and never in its history, has TGen been self-supporting. The idea was that it would be a not-for-profit entity that would contribute to the economic development of the state. The Governor has been persuaded to put money into the TGen initiative, with the belief that genomic research was going to solve all the economic problems in the State of Arizona.

6. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF December 2, 2013

The minutes of December 2, 2013 were approved with four abstentions.

7. ACTION ITEM: GRADUATE COUNCIL'S NON-CONSENT AGENDA ITEM: KOEN VISSCHER, CHAIR GRADUATE COUNCIL AND DIANNE HORGAN, ASSOCIATE DEAN OF THE GRADUATE COLLEGE

Mitchell introduced the new chair of the Graduate Council, Koen Visscher and co-presenter Dianne Horgan of the Graduate College. Approval to stop accepting 400-level course work in graduate programs [**Motion 2013/14-7**], is detailed at the end of these minutes, and comes to Senate as a seconded motion. Horgan explained the policy is outdated and confusing, since 400-level courses cannot be used toward full-time graduate student status. Only seventeen students have used these courses toward a degree. Hart asked if this change would affect the co-convened 400-500-level courses when the graduate student is registered at the 500-level? Horgan replied no, the UA would want the graduate student to take the 500-level course so they would be performing graduate level work. Undergraduates in their senior year may take a 500-level course if they would like the course to count toward a graduate degree. Graduate students can still take prerequisites or 400-level courses, but they will not count toward the graduate level degree. Accelerated master's degrees double-count and only enrollment in 500-level courses is authorized. [**Motion 2013/14-7**] passed unanimously.

8. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ITEM: DRAFT GUIDELINES FOR REORGANIZATIONS AND MERGERS OF ACADEMIC UNITS AT THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA – ROBERT MITCHELL, VICE CHAIR OF THE FACULTY

Vice Chair Mitchell reintroduced the *Draft Guidelines for Reorganizations and Mergers of Academic Units at the University of Arizona* [**Motion 2013/14-8**], and outlined changes applied to the document stemming from the discussion at the December 2013 Senate meeting.

Questions and comments included: 1) Senator Conway asked about the definition of “eligible faculty voters as defined above,” and the definition listing “affected faculty.” McKean clarified that affected faculty would include all faculty eligible to vote in the affected units. 2) Senator Silverman brought up the fact that many faculty are granted voting privileges within the college, and those voting privileges are defined in the college bylaws. McKean clarified that the document should state “eligible faculty voters as defined by the unit.” Mitchell will make the change to include “eligible faculty voters as defined by the unit” in the definition. 3) Senator Ulreich questions the section of the document stating that Faculty Senate could ultimately over-rule a split decision in which one unit in a merger has voted against the merger. Faculty Senate would have few or no affected faculty in the merger. Senator Ayoun concurred with Ulreich. McKean said that the document states that the proposal will go to Faculty Senate for discussion and possible vote, and Senate is more likely to mandate that the units amend the proposal and obtain a second vote. 4) M. Witte said that historically the Faculty Senate has always been the entity where merger and reorganization proposals have always been heard and approved. Ulreich agrees with the Faculty Senate’s review of the proposal, but wants to allow the units to adjudicate disputes. 5) Duran commented on how the proposed changes represent an improvement from the existing guidelines by strengthening the process and fostering a more inclusive dialogue leading to an informed vote by all parties involved. 6) Howell reminded Senators that it is ultimately the President’s decision. Mitchell said [Motion 2013/14-8] will return at the February 3, 2014 Senate meeting and no action was taken.

9. **OLD BUSINESS**

10. **NEW BUSINESS**

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:02 p.m.

Barbara McKean, Secretary of the Faculty
Jane Cherry, Recording Secretary

Appendix*

1. Handout: RCM Guiding Principles

**Copies of material listed in the Appendix are attached to the original minutes and are on file in the Faculty Center.*

Motions of the Meeting of January 27, 2014

Motion 2013/14-7 Seconded motion from Graduate Council for Approval to stop accepting 400-level course work in graduate programs. Motion carried.

Motion 2013/14-8 Seconded motion from APPC. *Draft Guidelines for Reorganizations and Mergers of Academic Units at the University of Arizona.* Motion not acted upon.

FACULTY CENTER
1216 E. Mabel
PO Box 210456