A HISTORICAL SURVEY OF MUSIC APPRECIATION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS OF THE UNITED STATES

by

Glenice Henley

A Thesis submitted to the faculty of the Department of Music Education in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of MASTER OF ARTS in the Graduate College, University of Arizona

1950

Approved: Lyle M. Young, Director of Thesis, March 24, 1950
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer wishes to express her sincere appreciation and gratitude to her family and friends for their encouragement in this study. Particular recognition is extended to Mr. Lyle Young for helpful guidance, constructive comments and altruistic interest in the work.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER I</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER II</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EARLY MUSICAL EDUCATION</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Import of Originators of Our First Music</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significance of the Singing School and Its Leaders</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowell Mason's Experiment and Influence</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER III</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EFFECTS OF EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHERS ON AMERICAN EDUCATION</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influencing Philosophers and Beliefs</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Meets Pestalozzi</td>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earliest Teachers, and Publications Used in Public School Music</td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further Graded Materials and Resulting Concepts</td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leaders in the Field of Public School Music in the Early Twentieth Century</td>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER IV</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MECHANICAL INVENTIONS AND THEIR IMPRESS ON EDUCATION</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Trends in Musical Education and Publications</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening Lessons and Musical Memory Contests</td>
<td></td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Appreciation Replaces Listening Lessons</td>
<td></td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER V</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td></td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT IS APPRECIATION AND HOW MAY ONE GAIN IT AS A NATURAL HERITAGE</td>
<td></td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

For some time this writer has been concerned with appreciation and how it could be attained; have some people had more capacity for appreciation than others, and if so was it due entirely to native capacity, environment, or training and/or all three. In making this survey, which has been very enlightening, the author was most concerned with the thinking during the different periods of education, and prevailing philosophies and procedures which indicated what the educator was trying to accomplish.

The author's concern is due, probably, to the results of having received a high school education during the listening lesson era when Musical Memory Contests were in vogue. The listening aspect was of inestimable value from a musical standpoint. The memorization gave the student familiarity with titles of compositions, composers, and performers which resulted in respect for the capabilities and work of other people. The contest was a type of social pressure with a reward that spurred scholarship and a friendly type of competitiveness.

With music so much a part of everyday life and a major part of any auspicious occasion, it behooves the school to see that each and every child acquires as much understanding of the meaning of music in his personal and social life as it is possible and to appreciate the meaning of music in the world wide structure.

In making this particular study current trends have posed more difficulties than historical affairs. History speaks for itself in so far as the knowledge and information can be commanded, but com-
temporary affairs may take an unexpected turn. One is almost too close, too involved, and too concerned about one's own age, whereas historical happenings may appear remote. Opinions may differ but history can more-or-less be viewed dispassionately even though it arouses interest, enthusiasm, and even disagreement in views, but it is almost impossible to view the present impartially and without emotional concern.

Due to apparent varied meanings of the term music appreciation resulting from manner of approach, content of curriculum, and expected objectives this study attempts to clarify the present meaning of the term based on current educational thought and practice.

The survey includes the period immediately preceding Lowell Mason and his contemporaries revealing the origin and impetus that introduced music into the curriculum of the public schools which is found in Chapter II.

Changing values of music appreciation, prevailing philosophies and methods of intervening years are discussed in Chapter III.

Current trends, attitudes, and thought are developed in Chapter IV.

Chapter V is devoted to conclusions and evaluations resulting from the survey.
Musical beginnings in the United States, in so far as mass education was concerned, were rooted in hardships as was the founding of the nation. It is true that the Cavaliers had their gay, sophisticated tunes imported from England, as were their manners and dress, for they were economic colonists for the king and mother country; the Pilgrims, however, demanded a harder diet than lightness. That did the Pilgrims seek when they left England for Holland, then left Holland for the new land? History connotes they sought religious, political, and economic freedom that would give them an accompanying inner peace and security permeating their entire life and living. The type of security they sought was to be passed on to their children.

The New England Settlers were as dogmatic and strong-willed in every phase of their life as they were in their puritanical religious beliefs. Their hard-headedness was revealed in the struggle for education, particularly musical education. More frequently than not, the Puritans were equally as intolerant of those who did not see the way they believed - to wit, the injustices dealt to non-conformers as had been the people of other lands from which they migrated. Holland had given them a home, but their children were marrying Dutch children and accepting their religion. The new land awakened hopes.

Religious non-conformers had to move to other communities in order to worship according to their particular conscience. Not to be overlooked was the superstitious practice and abuses of "witchcraft."
and possibilities for a long-desired way of life that had been dormant in their hearts. It could be likened to the "Promised Land" which the Israelites sought.

It is not difficult to understand why the Puritan-Pilgrims developed such stern attitudes toward life and living. They arrived with the barest necessities for existence; landed and settled on a cold, rock-bound coast, and were faced with the need to wrest food from the earth.mere existence demanded all of their time and energies for immediate survival. Such urgent needs left little or no time for leisure and self-indulgence. They were in America to establish a home for themselves and their children and life was a serious consideration under the circumstances.

On the other hand the Cavaliers were recipients of land grants from the king of England. Such grants were usually choice lands farther south along the Atlantic coast which made life noticeably easier. Rich soil, warmer climate, and close contact with the "mother country" gave the Cavaliers frequent moments for cultural contacts and living life in a lighter vein. They were able and wanted to transplant English cultural traditions rather than develop their own. They were economic colonists.

The Cavaliers were not the people to give distinctive tone to music in their adopted home. The stern, severe, religious atmosphere of the New England Colonies did more for the beginnings of American music, although the first efforts were unpromising enough, since the Puritans disapproved all music except that of Psalm tunes. . . . . . . It was inevitable that the more progressive among the clergy and the people should demand better singing of the Psalms; and from this came the first singing schools, the beginning of musical education in the Colonies.

It is interesting to note that some members of the clergy, apparently the better educated men of the time, were leaders in directing attention to the needs for better music and singing in the church through education. Musical education was to take place in the Singing School which was a direct outgrowth of the need to improve church music and congregational singing. Members of the clergy were men of courageous and pioneering spirit, according to history, and were the leaders in major issues of the day. Barring personal conflicts, the outstanding clergymen usually initiated or voiced approval of improvements that benefitted the New England Colonies and Colonists and later spread over the entire nation and descended to following generations.

Melioration of church music began in the Singing Schools which may be said to parallel the Sunday School. The earliest education outside of the home took place in the Sunday School. The first Psalm books to be printed in America were prepared by ministers, and the first one was by John Eliot, Thomas Weld, and Richard Mather. It was entitled The Bay Psalm Book with the Psalms written in meter without music in the first edition of 1640. The ninth edition of 1698 was comprised of thirteen tunes in two-part harmony. The twenty-seventh edition appeared in 1762.

This crudely printed book, without bars except at the end of each line, is the oldest existing music of American imprint.

Reverend John Tufts of Newbury Massachusetts wrote a very plain and easy Introduction to the Whole Art of Singing Psalm Tunes.

about 1712, but its influence was not felt until about 1720. The book was comprised of twenty-eight Psalm tunes composed, according to the author:

"... in such a manner as that the learner may attain the Skill of Singing them with the greatest ease and Speed imaginable."

The book was a forerunner of the Tonic Sol-Fa system which was a matter of contention in public school music methods and procedures one hundred eighty years later. Letters were employed to represent the syllables, as: M for mi, F for fa, S for so, L for la, on the staff instead of notes.

The Grounds and Rules of Musick explained, or an Introduction to the art of singing by note was by Reverend Thomas Walter of Roxbury and printed in 1721 by J. Franklin, brother of Benjamin. It is said to be the first instruction book printed in America with printed music that included bar lines. Remember the book of 1698 only had bar lines at the end of each line of music. The Bay Psalm Book mentioned above was published in several editions prior to 1721 but only had bar lines at the end of each line of music.

Singing by "lining out" the hymns, that is a leader reading one line of the hymn at a time followed by the people, was a custom the worshipers had brought from England for the benefit of those who could not read. Lack of sufficient number of hymnals could have been

3. Ibid., p. 7.
4. Ibid., p. 8.
another reason for the practice. The practice did enable the singers to begin together even if the outcome did not result in pleasing musical performance. Many disciples and staunch defenders of the "lining out" school of thought felt that any change in religious practices would be wrong. Could such belief be the line of least resistance? The practice involved no effort for the majority, only the leader would have any need for musical knowledge.

Although a Singing School has been recorded in Boston as early as 1717, according to Baltzell, they were not in accepted use until 1720 and after. As late as 1725 Reverend Thomas Symmes was pleading for the project. His question technique was used in addresses and publications.

Would it not greatly tend to promote singing of psalms if singing-schools were promoted? Would not this be conforming to scripture pattern? Have we not as much need of them as God's people of old? Have we any reason to expect to be inspired with the gift of singing, any more than that of reading?

Singing by rule and note came into common practice through the Singing School apparently when Thomas Walter's book was published. The book by Tufts was used at that time, too, but it took the efforts of many people to clinch the Singing School as an institution for the improvement of church music. Insufficient data makes it impossible to estimate how commonplace the practice became in some areas or, how rapidly the movement spread. According to Birge classes were conducted in Charleston, South Carolina in 1750, Bethlehem, Pennsylvania in 1750, New York in 1754, and Philadelphia in 1757.

---

It is interesting to note at this point the striking parallel in the history of music education in the new land and in Europe. Improvement and reformation of music began in the church as did the first schools of any type. The church and catechetical schools of the old country were probably slightly superior to the Sunday School in the new country, however both were forerunners of the public school and mass education. Watching this country imitate European countries, unwittingly at first then deliberately, provides notable similarities until the new country began to feel the need of something different.

After the American Revolution when the Declaration of Independence had been declared, the new nation had many problems to be solved beyond politics. With all men free, leaders recognized the need for education in order to use the privilege of freedom wisely rather than abuse it. Among the first states to realize and provide for schools in their constitution were North Carolina and Pennsylvania in 1776, Georgia and Vermont in 1777, Massachusetts in 1780, and New Hampshire in 1784 according to Cubberly.

The Singing School was a private enterprise and continued to be one until the public school movement was favorably received as part of the nation's obligations and privileges. The Singing School teacher organized his own classes and collected his own fees. The earliest classes were for adults and met in the evenings because of demands of daily work. The teacher pursued another trade by day until the music classes began to require all of his time and they began to give him a livelihood.

Significance of the Singing School and Its Leaders: The Leaders of the Singing Schools were many and their impress on musical progress
and appreciation left effects felt today. Their early efforts and enthusiasm for the cause, gave America the first stepping-stone to a musical education. The establishment of the Singing School took place while the nation was finding its way politically, educationally, and defining what its citizens should have in the way of a good life.

Most outstanding of the early Singing School teachers in the New England States was William Billings, (1746-1800). His career as a composer of church music began a few years prior to the American Revolution.

"it was not till about 1779 that William Billings had fairly and effectively embarked upon a work that left a decided and beneficial impress upon the course of musical cultivation, and that made his name a landmark in the progress of the art in America."

Comparatively speaking Billings was no musician, but all historians agree that none of the European musicians would have been able to accomplish what he did under like conditions. His practicable musicianship was the secret of his success. Natural learning resulted from his teachings by easy steps which encouraged the pupil to continue study. The demands of music and his interest in the work soon led Billings to give up his trade as a tanner and devote all of his time to teaching and composing.

His first book entitled New England Psalm Singer was issued in 1770 and The Singing Master's Assistant in 1776. The books included original compositions. He and his contemporaries fostered a mode of singing psalm tunes that was termed fuguing tune. Its popularity was derived from its exhibition value which gave the singers an op-

---

portunity to parade their vocal ability.

Theory employed in the early tune books was:

- taken exclusively from similar books written by Playford, Tansur, Williams and other English music teachers and editors.  

The first theory used only mi-fa-so-la as singing syllables, which supplanted the hexachord syllables ut-re-mi-fa-so-la. It was a difficult method because there was not a different syllable for each tone of the scale.

The limitations of the early English methods were improved and corrected by Oliver Holden, Samuel Holyoke, and Hans Gram in their edition of The Massachusetts Compiler published in 1796 which introduced the continental system of seven syllables. Do-re-mi-fa-so-la replaced mi-fa-sol-la and gave a musical system that anyone could understand with the right application. The United States adopted the system before England did, but later England derived the Tonic-Sol-fa system from the continental scale and the United States employed it. More will be heard about it in the nineteenth century.

To notice that Coronation by Oliver Holden continues to find favor in modern hymnals is interesting because, Billings, Holden, and their contemporaries were self-educated men due to necessity. They gained deserved repute during a period that required ingenuity and application for the nation was in its infancy. There were very few opportunities for instruction beyond studying the works of other people. Would it be natural for people of English descent to use Englishmen for models?

While the New Englanders were pursuing their course in the New England States, Francis Hopkinson, (1737-1791) and others were following more scholarly procedure in Philadelphia. Hopkinson has been accredited by many historians as the first American composer, which is of little consequence except that his music characterizes the culture of the gentlemanly existence led by the wealthier southern neighbors of the period. Hopkinson, assisted by William Young, instructed the children of Saint Peter's and Christ Church in the art of psalmody. He was a signer of the Declaration of Independence and has been called:

A musical amateur of considerable attainment, and a man of greater cultivation than his New England contemporary, William Billings. . . . .

In all modesty, he hoped that through his example, "others may be encouraged to venture on a path, yet un­trodden in America, and the Arts in succession will take root and flourish amongst us." 10

In 1778, two years after the continental scale was introduced in Massachusetts, William Little and William Smith compiled The Easy Instructor in Albany which was the first printing of "Buckwheat" or "patent" notes. There was a different shape for each note in addition to their position on the staff. The notes retained the same shape in each key which relieved the pupil of the responsibility of learning key signatures. Do had the same shape in every key, of course an observant person could soon learn the location of do in any key, but many people remained satisfied to know the pitch relationships without gaining any acquaintance with key signatures and their significance. Little and Smith used notes of four different shapes. Later seven different shapes appeared and some theorists dispensed with the staff.

Instrumental study required traditional notation, hence the shaped notes soon disappeared except in rural areas in the South where the Singing School continued to prevail during the summer. Many small churches in all sections of the United States use hymnals with shaped notes.

These attempts to employ what Americans have come to admire in themselves, "Yankee ingenuity," in order to circumvent the arduous task of learning to read conventional musical notation makes an interesting and characteristic incident in the story of American music...

More important than the "patent" notes was the good teaching which accompanied the spread of choral singing. Employed in it were men of genuine talent, endless enthusiasm, and considerable shrewdness.

Teachers in the early Singing School did the spade work for men of later years. The men who followed Billings, Holden, and others were better trained than their predecessors. Such names as Oliver Shaw (1719-1848), Thomas Hastings (1784-1872), Lowell Mason (1792-1872), and others received notice as teachers in Singing Schools and normal institutes or as directors of choirs, and all were editors and compilers of books patterned after the eighteenth-century tune-books, but with contents greatly improved.

Oliver Shaw wrote the first instrumental book which was published at Dedham, Massachusetts in 1807 and entitled For the Gentlemen. A Favourite Selection of Instrumental Music: Calculated for Use of Schools and Musical Societies. Contents included such characteristic compositions as Marches, Airs, Minuets written mainly in four parts, as two clarionettas, flute, and basson; or two violins, flute, and violoncello which were:

11. Ibid., p. 620.
Selected, composed, and arranged, by O. Shaw.

For the German Flute. The first thing to be learnt on this instrument is to make it sound. For the clarionet. This instrument must be held near the centre of the body, with the left hand uppermost. You must be sure that your instrument is in tune, and that your reed is good one; for without these, even the best performer cannot play correctly.

For the Bassoon of Fagotto. This instrument, of itself, like all others, is very imperfect, but by the assistance of a good ear, and a thorough practical knowledge, may be played very correctly in tune.

That a book such as this would have enough readers to justify printing in 1807 seems to indicate considerable amateur interest in musical instruments.

By 1807 musical societies seem to have become an accepted cultural and social element. The Middlesex Musical Society heard Professor John Hubbard of Dartmouth College and founder of the Handel Society on deplorable musical conditions of the time.

Almost every pedant, after learning the eight notes, has commenced author. With a genius sterile as the deserts of Arabia, he has attempted to rival the great masters of music. On the leaden wings of dullness he has attempted to soar into those regions of science never penetrated but by real genius. The unhappy writers, after torturing every note in the octave, have fallen into oblivion and have generally outlived their insignificant works.

The same year Francis Brown addressed the Handel Society of Dartmouth College thus:

The greater part of those in our country who have undertaken to write music have been ignorant of its nature. Their pieces have little variety and little meaning. As they are written without any meaning they are performed without expression. Another very serious fault in the greater part of American music denominated sacred, is that its movements and air are calculated rather to provoke levity than to enkindle devotion.

13. Howe, op. cit., p. 31. (Original source not available.)
Our best musicians, instead of being awakened to exertion by call for splendid talents, have been discouraged by the increasing prevalence of a corrupt taste. 14

He deemed three causes responsible for the "corrupt taste". They were "passion for novelty, antipathy of the higher classes, more particularly ladies, to taking part in the music of the sanctuary; and lack of attention to the character and qualifications of the instructor."15

Publications to improve and correct conditions in the Singing School were as plentiful at the beginning of the nineteenth century as the ones ushering in the Singing School a hundred years earlier. Introductions to the publications were indicative of trends and procedures of the choral classes and organizations. Joel Harmon, Jr. of Pawlet, Vermont endeavored to amend the atmosphere of church music through compositions that inspired an attitude of reverence. His Columbia Sacred Minstrel, published in 1809, contained original themes of three, four, five, and six parts with the following comment in the preface.

It is with pleasure that the author discovers that fuguing music is generally disapproved of by almost every person of correct taste.16

Templi Carmina; or Songs of the Temple, later called the Bridge-water Collection, published in 1812 by Brown, Mitchell and Holt, contained three hundred fifty pages of tunes and anthems of English origin. All American works were omitted. The book was a favorite and has been

14. Ibid., p. 32.
15. Ibid., p. 32.
16. Howe, op. cit., p. 32. (Original source not available.)
considered by many historians as the most important publication between Billings and Mason.

A three hundred fifty page book known as The Village Harmony; or Youth's Sacred Music appeared in 1813 with the author's comment from "general observations."

When a tune is well learnt by note it may be sung by words. Pronounce every word as distinctly as possible. Never sing through the nose, for that will spoil the voice, make the music disagreeable, and have a disgusting effect upon the hearer. 17

The book was popular enough to eventually appear in seventeen different editions. No available source gives the name of the author.

While the above mentioned books, experimented in the field of methods, attempted to give knowledge and appreciative understanding by inviting and maintaining interest, they were none-the-less governed and limited in content by the needs and purpose of the Singing School. All of the publications contained an introductory section devoted to the rudiments of notation with practice exercises followed by a variety of anthems and psalm tunes. Methods of presentation improved and some writers began to add part and secular choruses. The increasing number of publications from the initial book until 1800 indicates the growing popularity of the Singing School. Rudimentary instruction included reading notes according to the Sol-fa system, beating time, and following their own voice parts.

The Singing School, a church enterprise and always a private institution, was an educational enterprise. Its first aim was to improve church music through the study of choral music; later there was

17. Ibid., p. 32.
a desire to improve church music and performance through improved composition and the art of reading music. The Singing School laid the foundations for musical culture and appreciation.\textsuperscript{18}

The institution, solely religious in character, at first, came to be the social and recreational activity of the people. Its popularity was due, probably, to the instinctive and unrealized need of creativity through group singing - a social form of self-expression. It was natural that such folk-expression find its outlet through the improvement of church music in the new land, particularly in the New England States. It was the only justifiable and legitimate reason that was applicable since the earliest attitude looked askance at any musical activities. First church meetings were almost barren of music in the New England States, but as life grew more comfortable, results of their persevering labors, the people felt an instinctive urge for social contacts and expression. Through the Singing School, music was first among the arts to find its way into public education in the new land.

The Singing School reached its highest attainment through the teachings of Thomas Hastings and above-mentioned men and passed on to other musical efforts. Later efforts adopted the appearance of a cooperative, public enterprise. It originated with interested and enthusiastic individuals who labored selflessly to fire the minds of the community. The battle for music for every child was long and hard-won. Occurrences even today make one wonder if it has been completely won.

\textsuperscript{18} Birge, \textit{op. cit.}, pp. 11, 12, 15.
The most dominant figure in the public enterprise was Lowell Mason. He was ably assisted by many others, for no one person can ever be solely instrumental in negotiating a revolutionary change in customs, but to him is due direction of the course.

Lowell Mason's Experiment and Influence: Lowell Mason has been dubbed the Father of Public School Music in the United States. He humbly called himself the Father of Singing Among the Children of this country. His earliest efforts in the musical world were through the church choir. Most historians and educators agree that he was not just another Singing School teacher and composer.

Born January 8, 1792 in Medfield, Massachusetts, Lowell Mason manifested a remarkable fondness for music at an early age. His parents did not intend that he should take up music as a profession, but his talent was not neglected.19

He received his early education in Massachusetts and began teaching singing while a youth. At the age of twenty, he went to Savannah, Georgia where he was employed as a clerk in a bank. After hours he pursued his musical studies under F. L. Abel. Through application and perseverance he soon gained skill in composition which was to give him a medium for entering the musical world. After the usual discouragements, he finally gained the approval of Dr. G. K. Jackson who wrote an introduction to the Boston Handel and Haydn Society Collection of Music, and the work was published.

It became popular in 1822 and was adopted for use in the New England Singing Schools. The collection was so well-liked that it was reprinted seventeen or more times and gave church choirs new experiences in beautiful harmony.

Resulting popularity of the publication brought attention to Lowell Mason as a musician. His successful choir conducting in Savannah resulted in Boston calling him to direct three choirs in 1827. As early as 1826 he was lecturing for the cause of music as a "pleasant and agreeable employment for children." 20

In Boston he lectured and taught large singing classes where he demonstrated his methods and soon had a large group of pupils, many of them Singing School teachers themselves, who were anxious to learn his techniques. His lectures received enough publicity to circulate his ideas among more people than one person or one lecture could hope to stimulate.

The chief ideas throughout the lectures were to improve and spread musical knowledge by introducing the study of music into the public schools. He recognized the effectiveness of reaching people at an early age for any type of learning or activity. Musical knowledge and appreciation, according to his concept, were to be realized through the training of young people. Musical education was to be acquired along with literary subjects. From the time Lowell Mason went to Boston until music was inaugurated into the school curriculum his efforts were expended in that direction. His earliest attempts through the Handel and Haydn Society were

vain, but unexpected assistance came through public-minded citizens who witnessed and heard a successful demonstration of his work with children who composed his singing classes.

Upon hearing the children in concert under Mr. Mason's direction, the citizens were made aware of the value of early musical education. In order to promote public sentiment to favor music in the public schools they formed an organizing unit of the Boston Academy of Music. Active in the venture were Samuel A. Eliot, who became Mayor of Boston in 1835 and was the father of Harvard's renowned president, and Jacob Abbott author of the Rollo Books. It was the first school of organized instruction in the United States with definite founding purposes. The aims were to teach the art of singing and the rudiments of thorough-bass, figured bass, and harmony; to explain the methods of teaching Singing School classes and conducting choral music, and to advance the public school music movement. The final and chief aim was realized after fourteen years which brought the academy to a close. In the meantime a Manual of Instruction had been published in 1834 and Mason's aims, ideals, and teaching methods were introduced, through it, to teachers who had been unable to witness his demonstrations. In 1836 a convention was held at the academy with a program that set a new precedent for successive gatherings during the next thirty years.

The first convention was held in 1829 and met with immediate popularity. Program for the 1836 convention scheduled lectures on teaching methods, general discussions for problems, and classes in psalmody, harmony, and voice culture. The evenings were devoted to
choral rehearsals for a concert which concluded the session.

Just as the singing-school gave the nation its first school in the rudiments of music, so the Music Convention became our first national school of music pedagogy, harmony, conducting and voice culture, and thousands of young people in all parts of the country received training in these fundamentals under the leadership of such men as Thomas Hastings, George J. Webb, William B. Bradbury, George F. Root, Isaac B. Woodbury, Benjamin F. Baker and Luther O. Emerson, all of whom possessed outstanding qualities of leadership. Webb, Bradbury, and Root had some years of study with European teachers.

The convention offered a new type of activity that proved interesting to men who were able to lead people to forming new convictions. Men who were convention leaders had been in most instances trained or directly influenced by Lowell Mason.

Lowell Mason raised the standards of the Singing School, initiated children’s singing classes, instituted new and practical methods of teaching, set a precedent in convention programs, lectured and demonstrated for the cause of music education in the public schools, and raised the standards of religious composition with his hymns. His simplicity of style has placed him in an enviable position as a composer. Among original compositions were My Faith Looks up to Thee, Nearer, My God, to Thee, Triumphant Zion! Lift Thy Head, Come, Holy Spirit, Dove Divine, Hail to the Brightness, From Greenland’s Icy Mountains, Work for the Night is Coming, A Charge to Keep I Have, The Heavens Declare Thy Glory, Lord, A Glory Gilds the Sacred Page and many arrangements which continue to be in popular use today.

Agitation for the public school music cause extended over

a period of eight years before legislation was secured. Singing in school was not prohibited, rather was encouraged, but that was not what Lowell Mason and his contemporary workers were interested in for the children. They wanted music an acceptable phase of the curriculum. Logical and persuasive arguments were used to gain authorization and therein lies the full weight of the action.

Music became a part of the school curriculum because people wanted it for their children.

Instituted instruction was limited to the grammar schools, as primary instruction was not organized until 1864 and high schools until 1869 in Boston.
CHAPTER III

EFFECTS OF EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHERS ON AMERICAN EDUCATION

Influencing Philosophers and Beliefs

About the same time Mason started his children's singing classes in Boston during 1827, William C. Woodbridge, a minister interested in education, returned from European travels where he had observed educational methods in several countries. His observations were made with the intention of utilizing practicable features in the common school system of America. It must be recalled that even though the educational structure of the world was undergoing tremendous renovation due to revolutionary ideas and changing social orders, the idea of a common school system was not too widespread in the United States, and education in the formal sense of the word did not begin until the period of colonization. According to Gubberly the educational problem was to make people consciously aware of the need for general education and then develop the willingness to pay for it. Generally speaking the consciousness was not actively awakened until 1820 with the exception of the New England States and New York. Educational activities were carried on in the southern states but only a chosen few were exposed to any type of learning and able to participate in said activities outside of the home. What could be more natural than a young country turning to its forebears and much older lands for guidance in directing a course for establishing a public school system.

Before the American Revolution, Colonial education almost
wholly reflected European conditions of the same period, particularly in political structure. Class conditions were more prevalent in the southern plantation localities, but even the New Englanders were conscious of such distinctions. Large land holdings entitled owners to definite distinctions and privileges, which is still true, but other people have educational privileges and opportunities today if they wish to grasp them. The settlers of this land migrated from European countries, hence it would be normal for them to continue known customs until a need for something different was felt.

Every age and nation has produced free and independent thinkers who have deplored the social discrepancies practiced by their various peoples and ages. To wit: Socrates and others in Greece, Confucious of China, Christ of the Israelites, Quintilian of the Romans, Erasmus, Montaigne, Comenius, Bacon, Locke of later European nations, and too many others to name here, have had more influence than most people realize on current philosophies and practices. The idea and ideal incorporated into the Bill of Rights of the American Constitution extending civil rights to every "honest and industrious man" was not original with Noah Webster. The idea is as old as man himself, but it has been abused by a variety of conceptions, social orders, and customs.

In order to understand the impress of European philosophers on American educational practices in regard to the present survey, there must be some point of departure. Rousseau (1712–1778) seems to the logical thinker from whom to proceed as his belief that social reforms should transpire through the individual certainly anticipated the educational system in the United States. He did
not believe in altering the individual from the outside to conform with social institutions, but social institutions should be consistent with the natural impulses and instincts of individuals. He believed that nature was fundamentally good; so education should aim to follow the lead of nature in developing uninhibited expression. He felt it was better to waste time than to force education, because children can only reason about familiar experiences.

Rousseau wrote that memory and reason are different faculties, but one does not develop without the other. Consequently if one wishes to reason about something, he must have had enough experience to reach reasonable conclusions. He believed in education for the present and not some far distant future which the child may never reach. Aside from his invaluable contribution to education from the child's point of view, probably the greatest value of Rousseau's social philosophy to a free society resides in his stress on equality and genuine merit of individual human beings. He wrote:

I know of no philosopher who has been rash enough to prescribe a limit which a man cannot pass. We do not know what nature allows us to become. . . . Why should my equal go farther than myself?

From Rousseau in France to Pestalozzi in Switzerland (1746-1827) and Froebel in Germany (1782-1852), some change is observed. Both Pestalozzi and Froebel removed educational aims, in part, from the child's natural tendencies and abilities. They differed on philosophical reasons and methods, but were in radical agreement on social reform through the evolution of the child's own particular possibilities.

Pestalozzi, a social reformer for many years, spent his life as an educator. He believed education to be the most auspicious vehicle for social regeneration. Pestalozzi's own words reveal his educational beliefs.

The ultimate end of education is not perfection in the accomplishments of the school, but fitness for life; not the acquisition of habits of blind obedience and of prescribed diligence, but a preparation for independent action.  

He believed all children possessed approximately the same set of faculties regardless of origin, heritage, or environment. Independence was to be achieved through the congruent development of these faculties. He was in common agreement with Rousseau in his belief that all should be granted and none should be denied the opportunity for complete development of all possible capabilities.

Froebel believed in training free thinking, independent men, even though he had suffered suppression at the hands of government. He believed the development should take place through the inner nature of the individual.

Pestalozzi and Froebel followed Rousseau in their belief and aim to bring out the child's latent capabilities, but others looked obliquely at such practices. Foremost among the dissenters were Hegel (1770-1831) and Herbart (1776-1841). Hegel favored universality rather than individuality in education while Herbart contended that the objective of self-development was based on incorrect ideas of human nature.

---

Herbert believed education resulted from contact with environment rather than command of environment. The two defined the educational ideal as Hegel thought:

by seeking to capture what is universal in the free intellectual spirit of the Greco-Roman world. He was best formed, from Herbert's view, by gaining and elevating moral ends to predominance through a many-sided interest.\(^5\)

Even though Comenius, Locke, and Rousseau directed the trend of educational thought and aim, it remained for someone to show the teacher how to employ the insights in the classroom. Learning had been left to memorization of the printed symbol rather than through direct, complete, and personal experience. It was Pestalozzi who gave directed progress to practical application of methods and comprehension through experience along with memory. He proceeded from the object to definitions thus defining the organization of textbooks. He was interested in how the child was learning to think, feel, and act, but the patrons were usually more interested in specific knowledge such as how far could the child count, whether he knew his alphabet, or could read or spell, regardless of whether the accomplishment held any meaning for the child. Parents wanted the child to learn in a hurry regardless of worth of knowledge and personal meaning. Pestalozzi's lessons have been called going from the simple to the complex or from the concrete to the abstract, but the following example illustrates the misconceptions of his ideas. For instance in reading, going from the simple to the complex, the child learned the letters, put them together to form syllables, then into words, put the words into phrases, then into sentences as if anyone

\(^5\) Brubacher, op. cit., p. 16.
learned in such a manner.

Music Meets Pestalozzi: Upon his return from Europe, Mr. Woodbridge sought someone to project Pestalozzian theories in musical education. In 1830 he and Elam Ives collaborated on a musical project with children in Hartford, but there are no available records regarding the outcome. Birge stated that Woodbridge soon placed his ideas with Lowell Mason who was quite enthusiastic about Pestalozzian principles for teaching music. Mason wrote the practical ideas into the Manual of Instruction of the Boston Academy of Music. According to words from an address made in 1826, Mason's own ideas rather paralleled those of Pestalozzi. Mason spoke:

A capacity for music is much more common than is generally supposed. . . . Some degree of cultivation is also necessary to enable us to enter into the spirit of singing. . . . Children must be taught music, as they are taught to read, if music be not taught in childhood, much progress must not be expected afterwards. . . . In such a manner as to afford relief from other studies, and be a pleasant and agreeable employment.

Pestalozzi believed in the educational value of music and his words were:

It is the marked and most beneficial influence of music on the feelings, which I have always observed to be the most efficient in preparing, or as it were, attuning, the mind for the best impressions. . . . I need not remind you of the importance of music in engendering and assisting the highest feelings of which man is capable. We do not neglect the aesthetic training given by song. We think it is as important for the contentedness, cheerfulness and higher life of the soul as it is for forms of worship. The rhythmic movements, the choice of songs and poems, the common effort, everything tends to mould the

---

Pestalozzi's influence on methods for particular subjects was slight, but he brought attention to the need for revision of educational tasks. The best sources indicated that Pestalozzi was not well-enough acquainted with music to employ his own theories. Buss was the only one of Pestalozzi's first assistants who had any musical proficiency. His early experiments seemed to be of little consequence, but later he grasped Pestalozzi's fundamental ideas and worked out a detailed method for teaching drawing with his music teaching remaining informal and recreational. He used bodily movements as the basis of teaching or creating the feeling for rhythm.

Naegeli, another friend of Pestalozzi, collaborated with Pfeiffer to apply Pestalozzian theories in music. Their efforts produced *Gesangbildungslehre* which, according to their views, introduced a new epoch in music education. For some years it was the only publication expounding Pestalozzian music teaching, which resulted in its general use as a basic text for vocal instruction in the common schools of Europe, particularly Switzerland and Germany. It is thought to have had more influence on Lowell Mason's teaching than any other single work, says Rich.

In his *Musical Letters from Abroad* in 1837, Mason wrote that the work of the two men was superior with far-reaching influence, and that every teacher should study the principle until it became his own. He believed better adapted works had been published, but

---

no better principles had appeared. Disregard for limitations of children's voices was the criticism of Gesangbildungslehre. Compositions ranged from extremely easy to the unsingable. The mechanical, unmusical examples were written to display Pestalozzian educational theories instead of for musical merit.

Mason believed the greatest benefits from music were powerful, moral influences. His use of the term moral did not connote exactly what the modern term implies, but his version was rather the spiritual benefits. He realized and noted that music could and was cultivated for immediate pleasures, intellectual pleasures, or for artistic results as beautiful tonal expression, but he believed the moral benefits most important.

He prepared his work by starting a graded classification of musical subjects and gave greater clarification to statements of definitions and principles for musical education than had ever before existed. His formulations took the ideas from Europe and improved on them, thirteen years later he was able to comment thus:

The result already is, that a multitude of young persons have been raised up who are much better able to appreciate and to perform music than were their fathers; and experience proves that large classes of young persons, capable of reading music with much accuracy, may be easily gathered in almost any part of New England, or indeed of the United States. 6

He did not believe, however, that the ability to read music was a justifiable reason for music, but that it resulted from continuing contacts with the study. The chief function was to:

lead to the highest human development.  

It is not the mere knowledge which is desired, but it is

the expansion of human powers which is the result of the acquisition of knowledge.7

Pestalozzi and Mason both believed that gaining the interest of the child was an important phase of education and they believed it was secured only through an interested teacher. To promote learning interesting devices needed to be utilized according to both men. Pestalozzi believed ideas and thoughts came as a whole before single words and separated letters existed for children. Lowell Mason believed that things should be taught before signs, principles before rules, and practice before theory, and that conclusions should be reached through the child's own reasoning powers. His methods of instruction were pupil activity by which they learned, rather than the teacher telling, and proceeding from the known to the unknown.

Although Pestalozzi made no direct impress on any particular subject he was able to do so indirectly through other people, as Lowell Mason and followers in the field of music. Henry Barnard in the field of general education was another Pestalozzian disciple and an admirer of Mason as a teacher educator. From Ohio, Calvin E. Stowe was sent to study educational systems in Germany, France, and England. The above mentioned by no means include all the European observers from the United States.

The combined efforts of Horace Mann, Henry Barnard, and many others promoted the public school movement in the United States. Mason's efforts for music were furthered through the combined political position of Samuel A. Eliot, intelligent assistance of George A.

7. Ibid., p. 62, (Original source not available.)
Nebb, publications of William C. Woodbridge, and the efforts of many unnamed Singing School teachers.

Historians indicate that the influence of Pestalozzi did not reach its full force in the United States until after the Civil War. From 1838, when public school music became a part of the curriculum, until 1860 so many educational decisions were being defined, attempted, and declared that no particular philosophy prevailed. Secular education was making the difficult transition from the Church or Sunday School to tax supported, state controlled schools which paralleled the transition of music from the private Singing School to the public school curriculum. Popular agitation for public schools started before 1800 and continued to spread until after 1860.

Earliest Teachers and Publications Used in Public School Music:

Besides Lowell Mason, other people labored in the teaching field of public school music who deserve mention as teachers and pioneers in the courses of study employed. The very earliest techniques were directly transferred from the Singing Schools as were the books used. Birge states that books soon began to appear adapted for public school music classes.

The first high school music book published in 1864-65 was Song Garden by Lowell Mason and was soon followed by School Companion. Both books followed the Boston School Song Book which appeared in 1841.

The Golden Wreath by William A. Hodgdon of St. Louis was to be used in the so-called grammar schools. It appeared about the same time the above mentioned first high school music book appeared.
Mr. Hogdon was a pupil of Lowell Mason and George J. Webb. He went to St. Louis in 1854 and taught there for fifty-two years.

Another outstanding leader was Charles Aiken of Cincinnati. He gave his services for one year 1842-43 in the public schools after which he continued to direct adult classes and work out a system of instruction using a movable Do. From 1843 until 1845, there was no music in the Cincinnati public schools. In 1845 William Coburn taught until Mr. Aiken became officially connected with the schools in 1848. Books by Mr. Aiken, for use in the elementary school, were The Cincinnati Music Readers, and for the high school, The High School Choralist and The Choralist's Companion.

These books, remarkable for their time, were filled with choice selections of the great masters. Nourished by choral works of this kind, and taught for more than thirty years by a man who radiated their spirit, the children of Cincinnati grew up with an appreciation of music which has become a tradition. The resulting harvest from the seed thus constantly sown and cultivated is a music loving city, supporting a great biennial festival, of which choruses of children form an integral part, a symphony orchestra, and colleges of music of the first rank, the whole forming a community enterprise, with its foundations firmly laid in music in the schools.8

Luther Whiting Mason introduced music to the primary grades of Cincinnati in 1857. While thus employed he became acquainted with and gave careful study to the school—music book of Christian Heinrich Hohmann, which was based on Naegeli's teaching in its application of Pestalozzian methods. He was successful in securing Oliver Ditson as publisher of an English translation of the Hohmann book. According to the best sources it was probably the first juvenile book of its type to be used in the public schools.

In 1864, Luther Whiting Mason was asked to organize music education in the primary grades of Boston. It may be significant that Luther Whiting Mason was a distant relative of Lowell Mason. Both were outstanding pioneers in their work. With music to be taught at every grade level there arose the need for books planned for progressive growth. Luther Mason compiled the first such course in 1870 which was published by Edwin Gina as the *National Music Course*. The name *National* may have been prophetic for the book found universal appeal and was translated into German and Japanese. Luther Mason was governmental music supervisor in Japan for three years.

Luther Whiting Mason may be considered the founder of school music methodology, for the *National Music Course* was not only the first completely planned course to receive national recognition—it was also the prototype of all the many methods which followed it.\(^9\)

Luther Mason made his main contribution to music methods through formulating instruction in the primary grades and through his philosophy to the approach of reading music. The technique was used by James Currie of Scotland and according to Mason:

> The proper view to take of a child learning to read is, that he is learning to recognize in printed or written forms, the words with which he is already familiar in speech. We only surround him with difficulties if we regard his reading book at this period as the means of extending his vocabulary.\(^{10}\)

With the application of language reading to music teaching he

---


10. Luther Mason as cited by Birge, *op. cit.*, p. 104, (Original source not available.)
advocated the song method. He used the Tonic Sol-fa modulator and the Galin-Paris Cheve notation which was a modified Tonic Sol-fa notation that employed numbers instead of syllables. The latter was a temporary step preceding the study of the staff. Feeling for pulse was established through use of time values of the Galin system, and he also recommended beating time with the hand to secure a firm feeling for the regular beat.

Early use of Tonic Sol-fa was mentioned in the previous chapter.

It is interesting to note, in this connection, the profound influence upon American School music, not only of Pestalozzian pedagogy, but of the Tonic Sol-fa system.

Tonic Sol-fa began to be used in England about 1840. Started by Elizabeth Glover, it was perfected by John Curwen, and became the accepted method of primary music education in the British schools. The system featured the revival of the ancient movable Do which was being displaced by the fixed Do as favored by instrumental study. Tonal relations were taught from a vertical modulator or tonal ladder, followed by notation which employed the initial letters of the sol-fa syllables printed horizontally without staff, but separated into measures by bars. The time divisions being indicated by the linear distance between the syllables, also by commas, dots, and dashes. It was employed a few times in this country, and many attempts have been made to introduce it, but teachers favored staff notation. Time has shown, however, that an employment of both methods saves time. Many teachers use a combination of Tonic Sol-fa and staff notation in teaching public

---

Luther Mason's philosophy was a complete innovation to an age that had been teaching reading by the alphabet method. Nevertheless, the method was widely used and the songs were learned and sung with pleasure at school and home.

The method of the National Music Course was the result of a wide acquaintance on the part of the author with the methods of teaching in the European schools, not only of music but other subjects as well, coupled with a keen sense of the need of American public schools. In basing the beginnings of reading upon the rote song he broke entirely away from the traditional methods of the singing-schools, and was far in advance of his generation, but his treatment of the transposition of the scale and insistence on beating time with the hand followed the customary procedure of that institution, although with necessary adaptations to the immaturity of children.

The main difficulty with school-music in the period we are considering was essentially the same as today, a lack of knowledge of music on the part of many of the grade teachers, though the common stock of such knowledge has been undoubtedly growing year by year.12

Further Graded Materials and Resulting Concepts: In 1884 the Music Department was added to the National Education Association which had been organized in 1857. At all of the annual meetings restatements of aims of education, duties, qualifications, and methods may be noted. As early as 1874 remarks concerning methods were made during the general session of the conference thus:

A multitude of methods of teaching are known. Considering how many persons claim to have a method of teaching that is entirely their own, we become inclined to think that there are as many methods as there are teachers.13


13. Soldan, Professor of St. Louis, Methods and Manner, National Education Yearbook, 1874, p. 245.
Lectures voicing the same idea continued for ten years when the public school music teachers joined the chorus with their department. According to the Commissioner of Education, about two hundred fifty school systems were regularly teaching music in 1886. Birge attributes the rapid spread up to that time and afterwards to four reasons: recognition of the private music teacher as a professional; development of choral clubs and societies plus their artistic performances; musical festivals or jubilees in the East and West as Boston and Cincinnati; exceptional concerts resulting from organization of symphony orchestras as the work of Theodore Thomas first in Chicago then Cincinnati, the Symphony Society of New York, and the Boston Symphony Orchestra; the rapid expansion of music in colleges and the founding of conservatories of music as the New England Conservatory and the Cincinnati Conservatory.

The combined effect of this four-fold influence upon general musical culture was very great. It raised the whole general interest in music to a higher level; it brought into existence a distinct musical profession, consisting of teachers, concert performers, and critics, together with a multitude of listeners of every degree of critical appreciation. And it paved the way slowly but inexorably for the introduction of music into all the public schools.\textsuperscript{14}

Trends of the period were on the well-trained teacher which brought the work to an artistic and skilled professional stage. The best authorities claim Pestalozzianism was the ruling ideal of the times with text books written and rewritten adapted to his patterns of thought.

The work of such men as Benjamin Jepson, who started teaching

\textsuperscript{14} Birge, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 89.
in New Haven in 1865; George B. Loomis, who started teaching in Indianapolis in 1866; N. Geo Stewart, who became supervisor of music in the Cleveland and Akron, Ohio schools in 1871; Walter Aiken, son of Charles Aiken; Sterrie Weaver and many others were outstanding. They compiled and edited graded courses of study. Some of the works are more-or-less in use today. The books stressed reading of music and elements of simple rhythm. The resulting belief, that children should learn as many songs as possible and that they should be able to read music in order to learn the songs, brought about the rote-note process of teaching.

When the Music Department became a branch of the National Education Association in 1884, the National Music Course had been in use for fourteen years, and was familiar to all teachers. The close acquaintance created reaction among teachers which brought about new methods of teaching music reading. The song method was believed to be merely entertaining. Hosea Holt was one of the first men to work out new methods of teaching music, particularly in the Boston schools where he gained distinction. He gained attention in the national field through the Music Department of the NEA by making such statements:

All true elementary teaching seeks to awaken an interest in the subject by presenting to the mind the real objects of thought. The teacher who can keep the pupils actively employed in thinking upon the subject, simply guiding the mind in its investigation, has learned much of the art of true elementary teaching. To do this successfully in teaching music the mind must be kept constantly active in thinking sounds. There is no subject taught in our public schools to which the principle of objective teaching can be more easily and successfully applied than in that of music; the real objects of thought are always at hand.
Music as an educational factor is worthy of a prominent place in our common-school studies.  

The most skilful instruction and supervision for the regular teachers will always be in demand, but we shall never secure the best results in music so long as it is regarded as a special study to be taught by special teachers.  

He gave considerable time and attention to developing a system that would simplify music teaching for the classroom teacher. He collaborated with John U. Tufts on The Normal Music Course. Mr. Tufts, a former teacher of Mr. Holt, was a musician of note, having studied with Moscheles and Hauptmann in Leipzig. The chief aims of the course were to enlist the classroom teacher and make music readers of the pupils. Mr. Tufts wrote all of the music for the course in contrapuntal form. The harmonic structure resulted from the two and three melodies written one below the other, which was a definite withdrawal from the harmonic structure of the National Music Course of Luther Mason. The latter used two-part songs with thirds and sixths predominant. The Normal Music Course essayed mastery of the major scale through melody then developed intervals. The scale modulator, charts and five fingers of the hand were used to represent the staff when tonal dictation was used. Beating time with the hand was not used as the feeling for rhythm was regarded as mental rather than muscular. The class watched a swinging pendulum and repeated the Galin-Paris-Cheve time language at the same time. There were three readers, first, second, and third, for the elementary grades and The Euterpean Song Book for high schools included in the course. Mr. Holt demonstrated

---

15 Holt, Hosea Edson, Methods of Teaching Music address NEA Yearbook, 1884, p. 213.
his methods at the conference of 1884 and in the same year held a summer school at Lexington, Massachusetts for the purpose of demonstrating the method.

Later Benjamin Jepson claimed to be the first teacher to employ the classroom teacher in the cooperative plan.

The highest and best incentive to sing music is the ability to read music. Children learn most by imitation.

The plan of fifteen minutes' daily drill by the regular teacher, which is now practised all over the U. S. is obviously the best, as without the co-operation of the regular teacher perfect success cannot be attained. The speaker, by the way adopted this plan in January 1865, and unless someone can antedate him is clearly entitled to the patent. 16

He planned and published the first so-called Music Reader in the first years of his teaching at New Haven, but it did not find the same favor as Luther Mason's National Music Course nor the later Normal Music Course.

The Normal Music Course was popular and shared honors with the revised version of The National Music Course, but in time was replaced by others as: The Model Music Course edited by John A. Broekhoven and A. J. Gantvoort of Cincinnati, and the even more favored Natural Course in Music by Frederick H. Ripley of Boston and Thomas Tapper. Both courses were published in 1895, but the Natural Music Course attempted to correct the weaknesses and limitations of the Normal Music Course.

Mr. Holt's method enabled the children to master tonal and rhythmical problems through complicated drills, but they could not

combine them in reading songs readily. Mr. Ripley and Mr. Tapper simplified their procedure by teaching ear and eye training almost simultaneously. Tonal relations were established through the staff minus technicalities. Notation became an established fact, and melody and rhythm were employed at the same time through a preliminary reading tour without actually singing. On the preliminary tour the tones were recognised by number or syllable and rhythm through a monotone language. A rhythmical scheme was devised which the authors learned, later, was commonly used in France. The plan adopted a certain note as standard and tied it in with other notes to produce longer note values. For example, in four-four time the quarter note was standard with two tied to make the half note, three tied to make the dotted half, and four tied to make the whole note. By means of beating, the child passed from short values to long values without too much difficulty. The same process was used with the eighth note. Later the same authors used the same method and philosophy in the Melodic and Harmonic Courses. The earlier and later publications were used in many sections for a number of years.

The Novello Music Course by Francis E. Howard was published by the H. W. Gray Company in 1899. The Child Voice in Singing gave Mr. Howard more note in the vocal world. His expert knowledge of the child voice was spread through lectures and demonstrations, too, and he made teachers more aware of the right use of the child voice.

His other main contribution to school music pedagogy was his emphasis upon learning to do by doing. He believed that nothing should come between the child
and the music he is trying to read. He did not believe in elaborate preparation for reading by means of various drill exercises. To him, real music reading did not consist merely in singing one note after another. The meaning came through the onward rhythmic flow of the music itself.17

Method and drill by means of elaborate scale work had prevailed for fifteen years and now teachers were ready for music reading to be taught without all of the entrapments of drill.

At the same time the new courses of study were being compiled and published, conferences continued to convene and lectures revealed the thinking on matters. David Kelsey voiced his feelings regarding the matter at Asbury Park, New Jersey in 1894 thus:

Music is the expression of feeling, as words are of ideas; and I would that all future musicians, so-called, could be made to understand this: that their art is made for this purpose—and for this purpose wholly—to express feeling.

This, then, is music, the expression of feeling by the most aesthetic, acoustic forms. This, then, is music in the new education. Aid at growth or unfolding of the embryos of feeling in the young human soul, and the term "Music in the New Education" is used merely to call your attention to the possibilities of Froebelizing this truly kindergarten subject, both in spirit and in subject-matter.

But right at this point we begin to experience the difficulties of the work, and I know of no other subject which is surrounded by so many discouraging circumstances.

For years, I have been convinced that the great defect in school music work in this country is caused by various combinations of the following difficulties:

First, and worst, dense and complete ignorance, on the part of the regular teacher, of practical methods of presenting and teaching the subject-matter in this study.

---

Second, special teachers in the same condition, usually plus their publisher's can't to some one's idea, as the National System to rote, Holt's to intervals and harmony, Jepson's to sight reading, others to time, and the latest, The American, to enunciation.

Third, the whole mass of the people, including all educators, so actually illiterate in music that there is no standard, no taste, with which to purge out the vile in either matter or methods.

We Americans have been digging and building for three hundred years, while tortoise Europe has crept on toward this goal of joy, till to-day, the low and humble in England, Germany, and France or Italy sing as naturally as they speak, and could teach the American Millionaire. Our paths have been antipodal. We have forbidden music in our churches and forgotten it in our homes, while they have fostered it at every turn, even by royal patronage and subsidy, quite beyond our reckoning.  

He considered the order of teaching music in importance thus: ear training (sense), vocal training (muscle) and these were to be followed by sight singing, theory, and harmony.

If a child's faculties are not developed with pleasure to himself there is something wrong in the process. Does not this arraign our present school system, which, as a rule, is conducive of anything but pleasure to a child, and is not the indictment a true one.

How to make knowledge desired is the problem that confronts every teacher, and it is one that Froebel's methods help to solve. But original investigators in education were never so many, never so enthusiastic, as now.

The following year 1895 the association met in Denver with N. Ooe Stewart as president of the Department of Music who spoke of appreciation thus:

Music is peculiarly useful in developing the.

---


19. Ibid., p. 936.
aesthetic nature; for in melody, harmony, and counterpoint it is replete with beautiful forms or creations, which, when understood and appreciated, both of themselves and in their suggestiveness, awaken and cultivate a sense of the beautiful and excite the purest emotions. This is true to a degree in all who listen to music attentively to music, whether they understand it or not. But when music is studied from a mental standpoint rather than a sentimental (the only true way to study), these beautiful forms coming through the ear, evolved through mental consciousness, accepted by the judgment, appropriated by the feeling, and retained by the memory are a present and continual source of beauty and of satisfaction. This shows also that music is a powerful and legitimate agent in developing the emotions and nobler sentiments.20

The same conference revealed the trend inward integration of subjects while specialization continued to prevail.

Two strong tendencies in opposite directions may be marked in the education of today. One is the tendency toward separation of studies, - specialization, - as evinced by the new impulse in departmental teaching. The other is the attempt to centralize, to coordinate, represented in a high degree by the Herbartians.21

Miss Arnold had particular reference to music and poetry as relative studies. Later art joined the two as a natural companion, then the other subjects began to find their place as an integrated part of the curriculum. Social studies and nature found their way into music through the poem and as natural melodic and rhythmical expressions of mankind. If the race was happy and lived under pleasant circumstances that race produced delightful music, and otherwise if life was unhappy. Man made music about whatever he happened to be doing and the music was a natural expression for

20. Stewart, N. Coe, President's Address, NEA Yearbook, 1895, pp. 768-69.

him at the moment.

Before investigating new channels Sterrie A. Weaver needed attention for his work in the field of methods. His implements were his voice, the child's voice, and the blackboard. Music books were used only as a test of the child's ability to sight read. Tones were taught by imitation and immediately written in notation on the blackboard with Do changing position quite often. Rhythm was learned by imitation. The basic idea of Mr. Weaver's method was the child as a singing individual and the plan was deliberately flexible to meet the varying abilities.

Sterrie Weaver and Thaddeus Giddings represent direct opposites in philosophy. The former was the epitome of the period of efficiency and the latter believed in letting the child do his own learning. Mr. Giddings' classes read page after page and many books keeping their own time.

The same year that Thomas Tappers' collaborated work appeared he spoke to the conference thus:

What Power Does the Child Gain through music study? Primarily the child's gain is that he becomes attached by a strong tie to the complete life. Its inspirations and its possibilities are the more open to him. He has gained another interest in life. Through one more powerful channel he may pass out into self-expression. Not only is he provided with a new form of mental activity, but he is permitted to enter another world of thought; . . . . . .22

Could the above words have meant the same philosophy of Complete Living that Herbert Spencer (1820-1903), the English philosopher, believed in so whole-heartedly?

Spencer became concerned about the confusion in educational aims and sought a standard by which relative values could be determined. In 1859, he answered his own question regarding complete living with an arrangement of educational aims in the order of survival value to the individual and society. Spencer placed the individual first, as did some of the music methodologists. Aims according to Spencer were: first, teach the art of self-preservation; second, how to earn a living; third, how to bear and rear children in order to ensure survival; fourth, social and political duties; and fifth, the enjoyment of the refinements of culture—of art, literature, and pure intellectual enjoyments. Many educators place the last aim first. The gratification of tastes and feelings may lead to intellectual development. The child reached through emotional appeal may be led to reasoning and intellectual development—going from the known to the unknown. Since his work was done mainly with adults at universities, it would be reasonable to conclude that he was not as conscious of the demands of childhood as Rousseau, Pestalozzi, or Froebel.

Spencer believed that culture should fill the leisure parts of education as it fills the leisure parts of life, which would place responsibility squarely on the shoulders of the classroom teacher. In spite of certification requirements and nearly a hundred years of pressure, teachers continue to refuse the responsibility as a part of their duty and as a means of self-improvement in many school systems. Music specialists continue to prevail, and, according to many authorities, will continue to be needed. Many educators think that teachers specially trained for work requiring skill can do a better job of
teaching the material than those without any particular early back­
ground for the subject. Music is such a broad field of study re­
quiring much time, talent, and effort, - it is a study and way of
life in its own right. In General Education in a Free Society the
Harvard Committee stated in 1945 that special subjects should be
introduced to the child at an early age, particularly music, be­
cause of the scope of the subject and its requirements of highly
developed motor skills for artistic performance.

The year before Tapper made his address regarding the child
and his gain from music education a new name entered the field of
music education, William L. Tomlins. His name was not new to the
musical world, but because he believed as Mr. Tapper, Mr. Tomlins
gave up his private work to devote all of his time and energies to
public school music. William Tomlins was born in London, England
in 1844. He came to the United States in 1870 and became choral
conductor of the Apollo Club in Chicago from 1875 until 1898. His
first three years in the United States were devoted to private
teaching in New York City. In 1883 he began training children's
choruses from the poorer districts of Chicago; the activity later
grew to include the training of teachers. A chorus of fifteen
hundred children sang under the direction of Mr. Tomlins at the
Columbian Exposition in Chicago in 1893. The performance drew at­
tention to Mr. Tomlins as a musician, conductor, and educator of
children. The performance itself set a new standard for spontan­
eous, sincere, and artistic expression in song through the child
voice. Selections performed were collected in the Columbian Song
Book and later found its way into the public schools.
Mr. Tomlins began to apply his energies and time to public school music in 1898 because he felt education was concerned too much with learning for the sake of learning and left the fullest powers of the child undeveloped. He was well able to judge for he traveled extensively in England and the United States where he observed, lectured, and held demonstration lessons. His philosophy in his own words:

"The boy whose powers are merely physical is but a fraction of his true self. Add his mental powers and still you have only half your boy, for besides what he knows and does there is what he is. To fully fit your child for life, then, you must complete him; body, mind and spirit. . . . . .

"In bringing this three fold power of the child into harmonious expression you complete the circle of his individuality. Almost instantly there will come to him the awareness of this fuller life within and all around him."25

Mr. Tomlins and Mr. Tapper voice the philosophy of Herbert Spencer in their pleas for developing all sides of the child equipping him for complete living and like Herbart giving him diverse interests.

The foregoing philosophies continued into the twentieth century when new ideas resulted from new inventions and a new philosopher. The United States had turned to Europe for basic principles and methods in its public schools, but from year to year found the need for renovations and innovations. Early years of the nation produced such philosophers as Ralph Waldo Emerson (1803-1882) who believed education should be as broad as man, be a vibrant process that aroused youthful vigor to rise above obstacles, and foster the

25 Tomlins, William L., cited by Birge, op. cit., p.155, (Original source not available.)
best that is in man. Later the Jeffersonian and Jacksonian theories resulted from two different democratic implications. One theory believed that the school should find the gifted and give them opportunity, the other believed that the standards of the average should be raised.

The hope of the American school system, indeed of our society, is precisely that it can pursue two goals simultaneously: give scope to ability and raise the average. Nor are these two goals so far apart, if human beings are capable of common sympathies.24

The American philosopher John Dewey took the prevailing philosophies, interpreted and integrated them into American educational needs for an industrial and changing society. The philosophies needed psychological application to agree with the life of the child and his impulses. Dewey said that school was life for the child and not a preparation for a future life which he may never live. The latter and for that matter the entire statement may be reverberations of Rousseaus early words. Dewey, like Herbart, believed in a many-sided interest, but all activities were to be direct outgrowths or features of community life. The interests were to be emotional, intellectual, and social according to Dewey, but Herbart concentrated on intellectual pursuits.


The Harvard Committee stated that a cooperative spirit should result from education "irrespective of agreement on ultimates" which would foster a belief in the "worth and meaning of the human spirit", however it may be understood. The belief would rest on "tolerance" which would involve the possession of standards rather than the absence of them.

At this point the music educator takes up the hue and cry that music is the most cooperative activity the school can promote, and it develops a social bond beyond anyone's wildest imaginings that result in mutual respect and sympathetic understanding.

Leaders in the Field of Public School Music in the Early Twentieth Century: Rights of the child, the place of music in the school, and what music should contribute to education were considered in the early 1900s. Frank Damrosch of New York City regarded music a language of the feelings and spiritual ideals of man. The language was to be learned in its own setting - that is, learn to sing by singing, then draw inferences from what has been done.

What is a good citizen shall we be satisfied with; one who obeys the laws of his country, casts his vote at the polls, and attends the primaries? or shall we say: A good citizen is he who tries to develop his own natural faculties to the highest extent, both for his material and spiritual betterment and, in so doing, raises the moral standing of society or state in which he lives.

We look to education to bring about, this state of things by the careful development and thorough training of the young. . . . .

Good music, somehow, seems to bring out the best that is in man. It makes him feel, better than anything

Harvard Committee, op. cit., p. 41.
The writer prefers attempted understanding to tolerance. Does anyone want to be tolerated?
else can, that he is something more than a vitalized lump of clay, for in music his higher spiritual entity seeks and finds communion with that of his fellow beings and with its original source.

In order, however, that good music may act most directly upon the mind, it is necessary that its nature become familiar through use and practice. The person who hears a beautiful musical composition may enjoy it and be impressed by it, even if he knows nothing of the art; but he who is able to sing or play some instrument can enter much deeper into its beauties and will carry away a more lasting impression.26

Two years later Hollis Dann of Ithaca, New York stated a similar thought at the conference of the National Education Association.

Music education should represent the most progressive thought and spirit of the times, doing its full share toward placing music where it can do its unique and wonderful part in the refinement and unification of this great people; sowing and nourishing in their hearts a spirit of love and devotion which will help mightily to live, and, if need be, to die, for country, for home, and for the brotherhood of man.27

Mr. Dann also stated that music, of all the subjects taught in the public schools, lost its power and was hurt most by incompetent and unskilled teaching. He believed the situation could be improved through standards of qualifications fixed for music supervisors by school authorities which would provide competent direction of grade teachers. It may be stated here that the average school administrator will unhappily admit that he knows nothing of music and will gladly leave the full responsibility to the music specialist, to be handled to the best ability of one thus employed.


Mrs. Frances Elliot Clark was heard first as Supervisor of Music of the Ottumwa, Iowa Public Schools. Her outstanding work there led her to Milwaukee; later she became Educational Director of the Victor Talking Machine Division of Radio Corporation of America. She followed Hollis Dann as lecturer in 1902. The first address, followed by others in later years and later writings, reveal the change in Mrs. Clark's ideas on the teaching of music in the public schools.

The one great aim of school music, including and absorbing all others, is the evolution of a nation of singing people, an intelligent, educated, music-loving people, a nation of singers, whose rich and mighty volume of ringing tone shall roll heavenward from every valley and mountain top in paens of praise for the blessings of our commonwealth.

The high school is a sort of crucible which chaotic childhood is put into, and from which he emerges, through the kindly administrations of watchful teachers, the self-helpful, self-reliant youth, with hopes, aspirations, and determinations for his career.

In 1907, after Mrs. Clarke had taken over the supervision of music in the public schools of Milwaukee, she stated that

The vitalizing influence of song in the development of the child is a force that even the devotees of music do not yet half understand, nor half utilize.

The power of the song to vitalize, lies largely with the teacher, the most beautiful song falls lifeless if presented by a listless, expressionless teacher.

When the child has once been really vitalized through song, it reaches in, and in a real and intimate manner makes him alive to the beauties of

---

music other than song. ... A really vitalized child enjoys a good melodic or harmonious exercise as well as if it had words.29

Mrs. Clark mentions the mechanical devices for use in the classroom for the first time. She stated that when the child heard and learned the great things from piano, violin, organ, band, pianola, or graphophone they became more critical and were less satisfied to listen to "trash". In other words the child developed standards first through his performing activities then through his listening.

That same year Thomas Tapper again stated the place of music in the educational scheme. His statement, perhaps, clutches the thinking of all music educators before 1907 and all of those who have followed after him. His remarks culminate the philosophies of all time by the statement that school music was not a part of education, but the

... every soul and life of it; with school music you are not filling in a little here and a little there, you are supplying the spirit of it all; with school music you are not merely a toleration in the school faculty, you are its inspiration; with school music the curriculum is not only made complete, but all is quickened. The youth sent out into life with some years of school music mingled with the rest is not merely polished a little brighter in one spot, he is alive farther in. There is more of him. All the rest has come to its true value with the music that is present. ... 

Music's power, it seems to me, lies in its deep stimulation of the individuality. It reveals a man to himself no less truly than it reveals one man to another.30

The foregoing words do not conclude philosophy in the field of

29. Clark, Mrs. Frances Elliott, The Vitalizing of the Child Through Song, op. cit., 1907, pp. 862-64.

public school music, but they anticipate a broader scope for the subject than has heretofore been conceived.

Changing concepts were due to many different things: individual revolt to cut and dried procedure presented to the children with all their thinking done for them; innovations due to inventions as the victrola and radio; larger enrollments in the public schools; changes following the First World War as enlarged population and influx of immigrants. The foregoing factors caused renovations in the public school which has had to extend its boundaries to include more and more students with an accompanying extensive curriculum. With the trend in school music away from expert music readers and drill to the development of a more appreciative musical audience, music only listener, intelligent participant, or whatever happens to be the bent of the individual. In any event the sum total of the process is aimed toward producing appreciation.
CHAPTER IV

MECHANICAL INVENTIONS AND THEIR IMPRESS ON EDUCATION


In order to understand the significance and necessity of change in philosophy, methods, and activities in the school, particularly music appreciation, it becomes necessary to look backwards then move forward again from the initial step. With the home surrendering more of its teaching to the school, it behooved educators to shift aims and thinking to meet life needs. Education that would give the child experiences in learning, character building, personality development, producing an integrated human able to earn a living and take on the responsibilities of adulthood.

During the years when emphasis was on the reading of music, results gave music a rather secure status in the curriculum, but with new inventions, innovations were inevitable to meet changing needs. All children needed to be exposed to every type of musical activity so that each would be able to find his particular niche. The orchestra and band entered the junior and senior high school, the study of musical history, and a subject called music appreciation were added to the curriculum. The elementary school had a new course of study outlined as listening lessons which resulted from production of records for classroom use and the improved victrola and radio models that were portable. Cities became larger, the nation was stabilizing, European concert artists were appearing in America more often, and America was producing artist performers of
her own. These changes with more leisure time for Americans demanded an educated audience. The adult need for intelligent listening was fulfilled by a publication by W. S. B. Mathews in 1880. Whether Mr. Mathews anticipated music appreciation as a subject or whether he felt the student needed such a book is not fully determined. He was a student of Lowell Mason's, and it is possible that Mr. Mathews realized the ground work had been laid and that Americans were becoming aware of music as music in general audiences. How to Understand Music: a Concise Course of Musical Culture by Object Lessons and Essays was first printed in Chicago by Donnelley, Gassette and Lloyd Printers. The fifth edition was printed in 1888 by Theodore Presser company. The author wrote thus regarding the work:

As a text book, the present work covers a new ground. Its prime object is to lead the student to a consciousness of music as MUSIC, and not merely as playing, singing, or theory. It begins at the foundation of the matter; namely, with the observation of musical phraseology, the art of hearing and following coherent musical discourse.¹

Contents of the book were in eight divisions with first lessons on musical phraseology which were designed to lead the class to observe musical periods and phrases, then to perceive different modes and phrases. The purpose was to develop intelligent hearing. The pupil was to be clearly informed of what he was expected to hear, which is the chief difference in current practice. The present attitude is pupil discovery by personal explorations which tend toward more lasting impressions. Another direct contrast in present day

¹ Mathews, W. S. B., How to Understand Music, preface 1.
thinking included in the book was the fourth section devoted to the
study of art which was written for adults and not children or youth.
The author believed only the mature and serious minds would under-
stand the significance of such a study.

At the turn of the century Waldo S. Pratt blamed routine
college training and musicians who stressed technical performance
and composition for the misconception of musical education in the
public schools. He denoted the concerns of public school music as
history of music, analysis, criticism, and elucidation.

There is an immense opportunity for rational
and systematic classroom work in music, . . . . .
I mean the reproduction on the piano, with the voice,
or even through musical machines, or works arranged
in some classified order, illustrating forms or styles
or composers, and accompanied by the same scientific
analysis, comment, and explanation that are used in
every classroom of history, literature, or social
economics. Such work takes time and thought, is
liable to abuse, and is not well systematized as yet.
But with its advent comes the awakening of many a
groping mind to musical realities, and a sudden intui-
tion of their vital relation to other worlds of thought.2

Mr. Pratt was not a lone voice crying in the wilderness, but his
voice and words indicated the pathway music was seeking for mass
education in the public schools. The same idea was voiced by
Louis Elson three years later, when he noted that nine tenths of
the graduates of all classes from any educational institution ex-
cept conservatories would not be actively employed in musical ac-
tivities in adulthood. He meant professionally or as a source of
livelihood. In Mr. Elson's words:

... they will enjoy music, so far as
they are able from the passive side. Surely these

2. Pratt, Waldo S., New Ideals in Musical Education, Atlantic
Monthly, October, 1900, p. 229.
submerged nine tenths have some right in the
domain of music and some claims for an educa-
tion fitted to their needs; classes in musical
appreciation are a more crying necessity than
the omnipresent classes in singing. 3

Mr. Elson believed that educating listeners would give the concert
world a tremendous uplift in America. His recommended course was
one that interested the child in the symmetry of tone and chord be-
ginning in the primary grades and continuing through the high school.
He, like Frank Damrosch and others, believed in the study of music as
a language.

A forceful departmental meeting of the Music Section of the
N. E. A. was held at Boston in 1903. Sterrie Weaver demonstrated
sight-reading and the group passed a resolution to the effect that
notational details should not be taught below the third grade. The
resolution continues, more-or-less, to be the practice of to-day.
Current philosophy does dictate, however, that first and second grade
children should make the acquaintance of notation through casual ob-
servation.

The high school orchestra became an accepted feature of the
high school music curriculum in 1905. Previous to that year it had
been an extra-curricular activity. Will Earhart, Music Supervisor
in Richmond, Indiana at the time, was one of the first music educa-
tors to expand the high school curriculum to include instrumental
activities as well as vocal. Mr. Earhart's pioneering work in the
orchestral field at Richmond from 1898 to 1912 developed an instru-
mental group of twelve to a full symphony orchestra.

3 Elson, Louis, Our Public Education in Music, Atlantic Monthly,
August, 1903, p. 252.
The orchestra, with its problems, was a natural illustration of the project method of teaching. The two, orchestra and project method, appeared on the educational scene about the same time. A new teaching technique had to be evolved to meet the demands of the new instrumental classes. No stone was left unturned and no effort spared to motivate effective, speedy learning. The entire process was an experiment. Birge believes the successfulness of the first appearance of the high school orchestra was due to the extra-curricular years preceding 1905.

Musical educators were faced with other problems in the early part of the twentieth century in addition to curriculum expansion. The problem of basic musical terminology was tackled by a committee in 1906. Its inquiries into the matter and conclusions continued over a seven year period. The adoption of a uniform version of patriotic songs was placed in the hands of a committee in 1907. Teachers were questioned throughout the nation as to preference, but no agreeable conclusion had been reached by 1909 when a new committee was appointed. This committee submitted a report in 1912. The question was reopened when the United States entered the First World War and referred to the Community Song Book Committee.

The year 1907 not only gave birth to the desire for uniformity of version in patriotic songs, but the idea of an independent music supervisors' organization was originated. Due to the unsuitable geographical location of the N. E. A. Conference, music supervisors met in Keokuk, Iowa, that year. Many music educators were reluctant to leave the N. E. A. ranks because of the many years of allied conferences. Separation was effected in 1910, but ties have never
been completely severed. Meeting time and location are different, but affairs of the Music Supervisors' Conference, now Music Educators' Conference receive attention in the N. E. A. Yearbook today.

The period of greatest influence of the Music Section of the N. E. A. was during the first decade of the twentieth century. In these ten years attendance at the meetings was very large and the Department grew strong in leadership. It became accustomed to working through committees and to making plans and policies which implied a sense of solidarity and continuance. The Department became in effect a national body of music supervisors. The resulting consciousness of the power in united effort brought about a desire on the part of many leading supervisors for an independent national association.  

The first decade of the century witnessed many changes in the child's musical education as well as burdened educators with the solution of basic and common problems that effected some degree of uniformity in many issues. Mrs. Frances E. Clark noted changing conditions at the National Educational Association Convention in 1909. She stated that teachers were doing things so fast in music education that it was difficult to know one's position, much less just what direction music was taking in the educational scheme. She began to do something about chaotic conditions by directing the Educational Department of the Victor Talking Machine Division of Radio Corporation of America in 1911.

With the adoption of a constitution and the name of Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1910, the first task of the organization was to appoint a committee to construct a high school course of study. Will Earhart, Hollis Dann, Walter Aiken, Edward B. Birge, Karl Gerhkens, Birge, op. cit., p. 243.
and Elsie Shaw gave their attention to the matter. Band work enter-
ted the high school that year and has become more widespread in usage than the orchestra. The popularity of the high school band is probably due to two main factors namely: the band lends itself to creating an enthusiastic school spirit at pep meetings and on the athletic field, it is a natural actor; secondly, stringed instruments required by the orchestra are very expensive and present technical difficulties that discourage small school systems and students.

Will Earhart, who took over the direction of music in the public schools of Pittsburgh in 1912, reported on the suggested course of study for high school music at the Fiftieth Annual N. E. A. Conference that met the same year in Chicago. The report may be summarized thus:

1. Music study in high school should be serious as well as pleasant.

2. Since voice ensemble is not the whole musical practice, and is not the only musical practice possible to high school students, it should not be the only practice offered.

3. Orchestral ensemble is as distinctly educational, musically and generally, as is chorus ensemble; and the practice of an orchestral instrument is as distinctly educational to the individual as is the use of his voice in singing.

4. An education in music other than applied music (singing or playing) is possible and desirable. By means of it a body of cultured and appreciative hearers could gradually be formed; and all musical practice undertaken by any of these would be illuminated and informed by the knowledge and taste acquired in their general or theoretical study.

5. Musical appreciation (including study of history, biography, form content, and musical aesthetics) and harmony are subjects of this general or theoretical nature; and are
appropriate and desirable for high schools.\(^5\) Mr. Earhart believed that the administration of the course needed no explanation except the work in musical appreciation.

It seems to be nobody's business, along with all this special teaching, to teach music. The beautiful gets short shrift. It is precisely this function the public high schools can most appropriately perform. Their aims are still primarily general and humanistic, rather than special and technical, however broad and strong may be the foundations which they lay down under all special musical development. Therefore the cultivation of taste, appreciation, discriminating perception of, and genuine love for the beautiful should, without any sacrifice of technical thoroughness and breadth, be the purpose underlying all school study of music.\(^6\)

Recommended materials for the high school musical appreciation course were compositions by the masters; part songs; choruses from operas, oratorios, cantatas, performance by teacher, community musicians, player-piano, singers, victrola, and local concerts. The chief and essential factors were always to be the students' own voices, the piano or player piano. The chief aim of the course was not to gain familiarity with a number of selections, but to gain understanding of music in general: its ideals, its laws of beauty, the nature of its appeal to man, and the necessary limitations of its field. Interesting presentation was considered a desirable achievement.

The result does not come at once; it does not come always. But it does come in measure, and in that measure it justifies any conceivable effort.\(^7\)

---

5. Earhart, Will, Ch of Committee, A Presentation of the High School Course Adopted by the Music Supervisors' National Conference; What It is and How to Administer It, N. E. A. Yearbook, 1912, pp.1005-6.

6. Ibid., p. 1006.

7. Ibid., p. 1008.
Peter Lutkin, School of Music, Northwestern University at Evanston, Illinois, followed Mr. Earhart on the conference program with an address on Musical Appreciation and its development in which he stated that science and art were opposite in processes and that in an appreciation plan music must be presented as an art. He recommended the use of mechanical devices for presenting music to children. The phonograph was preferred to player-piano because of its versatility in being able to present both vocal and instrumental music. The mechanisms were to be used as educational mediums rather than entertainment. He believed children should learn that music was more than a factor of amusement by discovering its mental as well as emotional appeal. Mr. Lutkin said:

While the study of music is richly worth while for its own sake, there is a negative side to the subject that deserves serious consideration. Wholesome entertainment is one of the great needs of our twentieth-century civilization.

While an early injection of the musical microbe may not cure all our social ills, the pursuit of music unquestionably tends toward a love for the pure and beautiful. It is an excellent counter-irritant for the feverish restlessness of the age. It invites contemplation and introspection. It expands our emotional life and sharpens our sense-perceptions. It keeps alive our finer sensibilities which are so likely to become dulled and deadened with the sordid contact of everyday life. It is becoming more and more necessary that one have special preparation to grasp and comprehend this wonderful art, this distinctive product of modern civilization, which typifies in artistic guise the involutions and intricacies of twentieth-century life. Surely we owe it to the rising generation to give them every opportunity for appreciating the art of the day."}

---

Lutkin, Peter Christian, Musical Appreciation—How is it to be Developed, op. cit., pp. 1012-15.
By the "art of the day", Mr. Lutkin meant that the greatest masters of music were comparatively modern in relation to the arts of painting, sculpturing, architecture; and the present form of expression is new. He considered the other arts exhausted, to an extent, in subject matter whereas music has just reached its heyday. There are those who do not agree with him, who consider that every thing needed has been composed, but modern composition belies the belief. There are pros and cons for both considerations.

Another major performance in the early work of the Music Supervisors' National Conference was work on a community song collection to be compiled by a committee composed of Peter Dykema, Hollis Dann, Osbourne McConathy, and Will Earhart. The work started in 1912 following the final selection of a uniform version of patriotic songs. Music in the schools originated in community singing, now the schools wanted the community to take part in music again through the schools and with the schools. Mr. Dykema reported on the work of the committee in 1914, but it was not a task that could be brought to conclusion in two years. In fact the question of a uniform version of patriotic songs was reopened when the United States entered the First World War.

Karl Gehrken presented the following consensus of opinions as the aims of school music to the conference in 1915:

The ultimate aim of music teaching in the public schools is to cause children to know, to love and to appreciate music in as many forms as possible, and thus to bring added joy into their lives and added culture and refinement into their natures. . . . . It is our belief, also, however, that when the science side is emphasized, it should always be as a means to an end and never as an end in itself. In other words, that although
skill in sight-singing, keenness in analysis in ear training, and some knowledge of theoretical facts may all be desirable, yet these technical aspects of musical study must never be allowed to interfere with the legitimate working out of those emotional and aesthetic phases of music which constitute the real essence of the art; in other words, that it is the art side of music with its somewhat intangible influence which we are seeking to cultivate rather than the science side with its possibilities along the line of mental training and its more easily classified results.  

The foregoing words were the first to come from the organized group regarding the new attitude toward music for young children. They continued to regard expressive singing of the best music available as the most "direct approach" for accomplishing the above mentioned aims, particularly with young children. However the following year saw many changes in literature for the elementary school which embodied the cultivation of music as an art.

1916 was a momentous year. It ushered in the listening lessons, class violin, and the revival of some old customs and questions. William L. Tomlins conducted a mass membership choral concert which was a practice used by Lowell Mason at the first conference held at the Boston Academy of Music in 1836. Frank Beach revived the old question of classroom teachers qualifications in the role of music instructors.

Mr. Beach, Director of Music, Kansas State Teachers College at the time, addressed the N. E. A. Music Section regarding Music in the Normal School in which he reviewed the situation

9. Gehrkens, Karl, Supervisors' Bulletin, as cited by Birge p. 252, (Original source not available.)
thus:

Music as a subject in the regular curriculum of our public schools started with comparative ease because of its cultural value. It gained momentum from the easily demonstrable sense training it afforded. In the last decade the added weight of instrumental classes, community music, musical extension and appreciation has developed a startling speed, until it would almost appear that the craft is flying before a steady wind, or, still better, has been transformed into an "automobilous" type of vehicle. Though it has been held in the middle of the road by the supervisors, they are, under present conditions, unequal to the task of the inevitable uphill pull. Who then will do this? A glance reveals the fact that the only members of our party who have hold of the rope are the grade teachers. Many of these have not been taught to pull, while others seem woefully lacking in any sense of direction.10

Mr. Beach knew that the musical taste of children today would be the determining factor in the standards of tomorrow. His recommendations for bringing some order out of the seeming chaos were: require music as a regular subject for certification of all grade teachers, recognize musical limitations of the grade teacher, and for the supervisor in the school to allot time to be devoted to coaching the grade teachers.

Benjamin Jepson claims to have used the plan as early as 1865; what happened to it along the way? Did education of large masses bog the classroom teacher in routine work, book-keeping, and so many other tiresome details that it was impossible to give the child musical instruction; or was the regular room teacher incapable or merely indifferent to the work? Both conditions prevail today, that is, indifference, lack of ability and time, in

spite of high certification requirements. Many teachers feel their limitations so keenly that the task of overcoming the weakness is too overwhelming for them to accomplish even in a moderately successful manner.

Listening Lessons and Musical Memory Contests: Agnes Moore Fryberger set a precedent with her Listening Lessons for children in 1916. Anne Shaw Faulkner anticipated it with What We Hear in Music in 1915. The latter book was prepared for use in high schools, colleges, conservatories, and any adult study groups, while the first mentioned Listening Lessons was for children.

What We Hear in Music has been reprinted many times and is in current use in classrooms. The foreword by Mrs. Frances E. Clark reads:

...for the study of music in a broadly cultural style, looking toward giving a working knowledge of the literature of music, rather than a theoretical study of the form and grammar of the subject. . . .

The talking machine and now the coming of the cinema and the radio into homes, school and community life has completely metamorphosed the point of view of educators everywhere as to the place of music in education also what type of music education is best suited to meet the gigantic problem of preparing the youth of the country for sane, balanced, loyal citizenship in this hectic age of readjustment. 11

In 1902 Mrs. Clark stated the one great aim of public school music was to produce a singing nation, but in the span of ten years she had changed her whole concept of the final aim.

The author, herself, stated that the book had been written

11. Faulkner, Anne Shaw, What We Hear in Music, foreword, Mrs. Frances E. Clark.
as a study guide of the "literature of music, which is now made possible through illustrations offered by Victor records."

In arranging this work for educational purposes the idea has been to develop in each individual listener a comprehensive appreciation of the greatest music, combined with a logical history of the growth of the art. It is the author's hope that this book, with the use of the victrola, will bring an increased enjoyment and wider understanding of the beauty and the message of music. This can come only through an intimate acquaintance with the greatest compositions of musical literature.

Miss Fryberger's book for children which appeared in 1916, though not long in use, did recognize the need for work that attempted to consider the child's viewpoint. In her words:

"The subject of appreciation is the latest phase of public school music to command attention, and while a few cities have given it a definite place in the course of study, ideas concerning its application to the classroom are more or less vague."

Any kind of music lesson is incomplete if aesthetic consideration is omitted. There are many ways of bringing the subject to the class: through suitable textbook material, through the contributing influences of visiting artists, and through the use of the phonograph and player piano.

Many outstanding publications followed Agnes Fryberger's with varying degrees of influence, but before they were printed new forces arose within the ranks of the Music Supervisors' Conference. One of the most significant was the formation of an Educational Council of ten members. The business of the council was to conduct studies on the problems of school music.

---


It became the National Research Council for Music Education with fifteen members in 1923. Besides offering courses of studies for the grades and junior high school they have made recommendations for a standard course of training for grade teachers. The formation of the council was a forward step showing that music educators recognized the need for further unity in the work.

The following year, 1919, Osbourne McGonathy, as president, addressed the group in what is now considered the prevailing philosophy of public school music education: at public expense, to educate each child according to his capabilities with his activities functioning in the musical life of the community.

Following Mrs. Faulkner's and Miss Fryberger's books were many other publications concerning listening to music. The most significant were Outlines of a Brief Study of Music Appreciation composed of thirty-six lessons prepared for High School use by Edith Rhett. The book contained supplementary suggestions for Music Memory Contests.

The Music Memory Contest has become a popular musical feature in many cities. The movement is fostered by all the music forces of the city - the clubs, press, and music dealers. Even the orchestras of the moving picture theatres may co-operate in laying special stress upon the selections from the list for music memory.14

Music Appreciation Taught by Means of the Phonograph appeared in 1922 with the following statement:

The main purpose of this text is to fill the heart and soul of the child with the spirit and love

of the beautiful, that he may live more abundantly and seek wholesome and attractive entertainment in his leisure hours. Any child who has been taught to listen to all the beautiful records provided in this course will go out into the world with his mind and heart open to the cultural and ethical significance of the finer things of life.

In order that the Course of Musical Appreciation may not be a thing apart from the regular music lessons, lists of "Correlative Songs" have been prepared and introduced in each grade. These songs partake of the spirit of the Listening Lessons. They add color, enhance the descriptive incidents, and illustrate the types.

The school had been slow in taking advantage of the victrola, however when it did grasp its significance and utility there was no limit to its application. The privilege was often abused, and as one educator quipped, "wheeling in the victrola on Friday afternoon" was considered the weekly stint in musical appreciation.

Since the school has to fulfill needs at every age level and music wants to hold its own in the curriculum, it is necessary to hold the interest of the child in order to gain his attention and inspire in him a desire for development. Since small children can listen for short periods only it was inevitable that listening lessons as an isolated activity in the musical schedule would lose sway and become enveloped in the whole process. Even adolescent children do not relish long periods of inactivity. Dr. Will Durant has said there is happiness in activity; so music must use that vital element which eases children very slowly and gently into combining the active ingredient, resulting from hear-

ing music, with intelligent listening. The combination will re-
sult in stimulated imaginations and possible creative production
in many instances. The intelligent development results only from
first lending a "willing ear." Listening Lessons were the first
violent reactions to victrola and record production for school.
Listening has always been an essential element in the musical pro-
gram and never absent, but the Listening Lesson as such could not
remain in isolated use in a broad, general course of music.

Satis N. Coleman had the active element and the self-realiz-
ation resulting from doing under consideration when she wrote the
results of her experiments and experiences in Creative Music for
Children in 1922. The child makes his own music, his own rhythm
band instruments, plays them, learns about real instruments and
makes replicas of early crude instruments after learning about
their history, plans his own programs, develops discrimination by
being his own critic, and generally is a creative being while
learning.

The aim of "Creative Music" is to place the
child in such relation to the manifold art of music
as will enable the study and employment of that art
to serve in its fullest capacity the purpose of edu-
cation.

A complete education demands the development
of the greatest possible independence of thought and
action that is consistent with the finest social ad-
just; it also includes technical skill, wholesome di-
rection - direction of the emotions and appreciation
of beauty. 10

Creative music includes such experiences as setting one's own poems
to one's own music. Composition may be an individual or group pro-

10 Coleman, Satis N., Creative Music for Children, p. 141.
ject. According to Rich, Lowell Mason practiced the idea of cre-
ative composition in his early classes.

At first glance the two books, *Music Appreciation Taught*
by Means of the Phonograph and *Creative Music for Children*, appear
to represent opposing ideas, however both can be justified and
brought into agreement in some respects. A certain amount of cre-
ativeness results from listening alone, but Miss Stone did not
recommend listening only. It was an accessory to performance which
is a creative activity in its own right. Listening is essential
to creativeness. A background is required to produce acceptable
quality in creative results. Initial creativity is oftentimes
spontaneous which indicates possibilities within the producer.
Without incentive and direction such creative spurts generally die
for the lack of knowledge and inspiration. Of the two books Miss
Coleman's continues to be in good usage, while Miss Stone's has
been replaced by broader concepts and practices in the programs.
It is possible that the answer for the difference may be found in
Miss Coleman's own words:

> It must be remembered that a child is not
trained by what is presented to him but by his own
reaction to what is presented.\(^\text{17}\)

Miss Coleman's procedure appealed to the learning process while
Miss Stone's appealed to the lesson plan idea.

Perhaps the foregoing is the reason for the revision of
*Music Appreciation for Little Children* of 1920 to *Music Appreciation*
*for Children* in 1925 followed by another revision in 1950. The book

was edited by Mrs. Frances E. Clark and in her words:

To bring MUSIC to CHILDREN is the mission of this book. After eighteen joyous years of a broadened service as a Musical Missionary, it is a great satisfaction to present to supervisors and teachers these concrete plans for teaching music.  

Calvin Brainard Cady stated, in the preface, that the study of music appreciation is a concerted effort to prepare concert audiences to listen more intelligently to concerts and help them enjoy what is heard. He wrote that W. S. B. Mathews book, How to Understand Music and the many courses of study that followed differed only in material but their manner of presentation with emphasis on "instruction" rather than "education" was the same in that they left nothing to be discovered and imagined by the student.

APPRECIATION: WHAT IS IT?
Primarily, appreciation implies judgment of values. These values concern experience of various sorts, according to the mind, heart, and life of the appreciator.

Mr. Cady stated that it was time for teachers to experiment with appreciation through intensive and organized play which would develop the child's imagination, powers of discernment, and judgments that are logical and aesthetical.

A change appeared with the Music Appreciation for Every Child series in 1925. Previously appreciation publications had been teachers' manuals, but now the manual with accompanying student note books, more a work book, tended to motivate scholarship in the class. The first of the series was prepared for grades four, five, and six by Mabelle Glenn and Margaret Lowry. The following year they collaborated

19. Ibid., preface, Calvin B. Cady, p. 11.
on the manual for **Primary Grades** which was republished in 1955.

Emphasis in the lower grades was on free rhythms and rhythm band activities for the development of phrase recognition, mood portrayal, and feeling for form in composition. The **Junior High School** issue of the series was published in 1928. It stressed style in various types and periods of music. Poetry, art, and architecture were correlated studies.

Miss Glenn recommended the **Musical Memory Contest** not as an end in itself, but to promote appreciation. She did not believe that memorizing anything would bring about appreciation, but she believed the listening involved in memorizing for the contest could only result in some benefit to the person listening.

**Music Appreciation in the Schoolroom** a publication of the **Music Education Series** from Ginn and Company was printed in 1926. The work resulted from the collaborated efforts of Thaddeus P. Giddings, Will Earhart, Ralph L. Baldwin, and Elbridge W. Newton, in which they stated:

**Music appreciation, or the understanding and enjoyment of good music.**

Appreciation of music is that pleasurable response which almost all people make to musical tones and to the melodic, harmonic, and rhythmic impressions that are conveyed by tones. The degree of appreciation depends on the hearer's ability to listen intelligently, that is to say, with musical discrimination. The reaction may be more than one of ordinary pleasure; it may be a pure joy of the spirit. But this power of discrimination is developed most easily and best by beginning in early childhood with a carefully planned program of music-appreciation studies and by extending these throughout the school life of the individual.20

---

20. Giddings, T. P. and others, **Music Appreciation in the Schoolroom**, pp. 3 and 24.
The book was a complete guide for teachers with detailed lesson plans, procedures, care of mechanical equipment, a psychological foundation of different age levels prepared by Dr. Henry T. Moore, and illustrations.

It is possible that Max Schoen's study The Effects of Music may have had some bearing on the trends in today's musical education of the child. If his study did carry any weight it was some years before its fullest pressure was felt even though previous practices showed that educators thought what he found to be true. Before Schoen's scientific study in 1927 procedures, so far as this writer has found, were the result of empirical knowledge rather than scientific. Schoen learned there were two types of listeners: musical and unmusical. The unmusical had no associations from which to draw conclusions for comparing and contrasting while the musical did have past associations from which to draw, and while listening it is necessary to surrender practical, everyday attitudes to experience beauty, but day-dreaming can be carried too far. He learned that general reactions obeyed the same laws; that the relatively constant element was psychological as sensation, perception, imaginations; while the variable was the individual who changed in manner of reaction according to change in stimulus, attitude, and training. Reaction to music is psychologically the result of development rather than any given state, while native ability plus training determined the reaction. Training has tremendous effect on reactions.

Training or experiences increases our enjoyment to music. Any device tending to increase fa-
miliarity with artistic music is desirable. 21

Other important findings were: selections that gave strong emotional effect were enjoyed the most, and several emotional effects from one composition were even more enjoyable if other things were equal. Amusement was the least important factor in musical enjoyment. The most appealing effects were reactions to compositions that created an atmosphere of rest, sadness, joy, love, longing, amusement, dignity, stirring, reverence. The reactions to music revealed more individual likenesses rather than differences. Selections with strong rhythms appealed to the young and beginners in listening. If the subject could see something that clarified the music, appreciation was increased. Different hearings of the same music resulted in the same responses each time. The most frequent response to music was the feeling of rest created. Certain types of music increased in pleasantness with frequent hearings. Familiarization with jazz produces listlessness. Jazz is good and necessary for dancing, but for repose and listening what is considered "good music" tends to improve morale. The strongest appeal of music is its tendency to arouse the desire to move.

The radio became a medium for appreciation lessons in 1928 when the National Broadcasting Company produced the Music Appreciation Hour under the direction of Walter Damrosch and The Standard School Broadcast was presented for the schools of the West by Standard Oil Company of California. The former program

ceased to be heard with the retirement of Mr. Damrosch while the Standard School Broadcast opened its twenty-second season September, 1949.

Mr. Damrosch's programs reached such proportions that student notebooks were prepared by Charles Farnsworth and Lawrence Abbott to supplement the program with possible checks, and illustrations. There was a distinguished advisory board composed of music educators from various parts of the nation. The names of Will Earhart, Mrs. Edgar Stillman Kelley, Hollie Dann, Peter Dykema, Mabelle Glenn, John Beattie, Max T. Krone, Margaret Lowry, T. F. Giddings, Howard Hanson, Hazel G. Kinseella, Joseph Maddy, Sadie Rafferty, J. W. Studebaker, and others served on one board. Programs were planned to the minutest detail and gratefully received. They were broadcast in four series according to the maturity of the listener. Mr. Damrosch said that the programs were not designed to replace any classroom activity but to supplement it. He also asked teachers not to expect too much of beginning classes. Programs were heard each Friday afternoon from one to two o'clock in thirty minute relays with series A and B, and C and D heard on alternate Fridays.

The Standard School Broadcast started in 1928 with a narrator and trio composed of violin, cello, and piano. Today the listener hears a full symphony orchestra, a cast of actors, chorus, and soloists. Supplementary material for the current programs include a colorful Music-Map of America and instructor's manual. The manual is rather general including recommended readings for each
broadcast, a characteristic painting, American composers and their compositions inspired by American historical events from which a program is selected. Teachers do not know exactly which composition will be heard until the program is broadcast. There is only one thirty minute program each Friday at eleven o'clock, except holidays, planned to appeal to all age groups including adults. Young children may enjoy listening as long as their attention span denotes interest.

The same year, 1928, Karl Gehrken addressed the Music Supervisors' Conference on the Viewpoint of Music Education in which he stressed the function of music in the public schools where children are being prepared for life by asking: where do we want to go, and what results were desired from sight-singing and listening lessons. He believed the first aim was to promote the love of good music, then the development of intelligent singing and playing would follow. Each child should have ample opportunity to develop according to his own inclination and ability whether it be playing, singing, or listening. To bring about the desired results, Mr. Gehrken recommended teaching music as an art and not merely as an "intellectual exercise" in which lessons were planned for pupils to "derive real aesthetic satisfaction." Results could be judged by the enthusiastic welcome from children when music time arrived, they would seek other musical outlets, and remain in instrumental classes. He considered the two main purposes of the music lesson to be: to give "immediate aesthetic satisfaction," and to prepare pupils for even greater "satisfaction in the future through added knowledge and
increased skill. He felt there was a great need for inspired teachers.

The report of the sub-committee on music appreciation in 1930 made the following recommendations for the first six grades:

- Music appreciation should apply to every musical activity included in the curriculum.
- The aim of listening period with worthy music literature which children cannot sing or perform.
- The music heard is to provide a model interpretation for pupil performance of music.
- To establish attitudes and habits that prefer good music as the result of hearing good music.
- To gain factual knowledge as facts about musical compositions, and composers.

Activities to be used in the program were response to rhythm, feeling, thinking, and developing the ability to discriminate and evaluate which would result in active listeners. The teacher was cautioned to meet the needs and experience of every child by adapting lessons to each and all stages of development, to develop discrimination of meter, recognition of harmony, major and minor modes, modulation, and other theoretical problems presented. Time allotment for the study was one lesson a week with no length specified.

MUSIC APPRECIATION REPLACES THE LISTENING LESSONS: In 1930 Lillian Baldwin became the Director of Music Appreciation in the public schools of Cleveland, Ohio at which time she started a series of Youth Concerts in cooperation with the Cleveland Symphony Orchestra. Study notes edited by Miss Baldwin were collected under Program Notes and continue to grow. Her work started two years after Walter

Damrosch's programs, but she displayed a new attitude in her publications by the complete omission of questions. She has included every detail for arousing interest through story, history, and thematic notation, but she leaves all questioning to the discretion of the teacher. Story and historical material include sketches regarding the country or origin of a composition and its moods, an illuminating account of the composer's life. The biographical statements point up incidents that may have had significant influence on the particular selections studied.

The concerts and notes are outlined for series I and II being Children's Concerts and Young People's Concerts respectively. Miss Baldwin wields a fluent pen which produces enlightening information. Of all the city courses in Music Appreciation that began to appear about the same time it would be very easy to choose hers above all others. Not only for the interesting reading, but because the notes can be added to from year to year.

A study made by Josephine McCauley in 1932 revealed that:

While the one great purpose of public school music is its vocal aspect, yet now the term public school music does not connote singing alone; the whole field of music is included in the great term "musical appreciation."24

According to the study, appreciation of music may be secured a number of ways depending on the interests and inclinations of the person involved. Some people may gain appreciation through singing, others by listening, playing an instrument, or by writing. Since development comes in a variety of ways and interests may be

aroused in the most unexpected situations, the public school is
obliged to furnish them all. All types of pupils make up any
class in the public school hence solo performance and master
musicianship cannot be the chief aims of music. The talented
and outstanding children will be prominent in music, as in any
other subject, and if enthusiastically interested will lead the
others and develop musically themselves. Public school music
produces performers and consumers and as pupils grow older it is
easier to know where the chief interests and abilities should be
directed.

The following year, 1935, Sadie Rafferty addressed the
Music Supervisors' National Conference to the effect that the
longer she taught the more convinced she became that every lesson
should be one of appreciation. In general music appreciation could
be considered exposing people to music, but that teaching music was
teaching music appreciation and the love of music to be the desired
aim.

One year later Miss Baldwin addressed the group on Present
Trends in Music Appreciation in the Lower Grades in which she re-
iterated the emphasis of education on the needs of life, and noted
that many "think we know all the answers" since the trend has been
away from drill and sight singing. She noted the meaning of music
appreciation as a happy "all-around experience." The desired re-
sults was to be the development of "musicianly listening" and
"musical criticism". The child was to learn that music "invites
feeling and thinking as well as movement. 25

In 1935 the question of integration reappeared as a major question in the music appreciation program. Miss Lilia Belle Pitts published a book regarding the matter in junior high school, and in 1937 addressed the Music Educators National Conference on the subject.

 Appreciation is the immediate aim and the ultimate end of music education in the junior high school. We wish to develop more discriminating and more intelligent consumers of music, but above all we expect "Musical Appreciation" to carry over into "life Appreciation." To be familiar with good music and a knowledge of how it came to be, is to penetrate the heart of humanity. Music in common with the other arts was born of man's need to give feeling an ideal expression. From earliest times music was a means of communication between men and his fellow men. It still is. Likewise music was an emotional outlet which enriched the spirit and added significance to the events of life. So it does in the world today.26

Miss Pitts suggests using "cumulative" repertory for the adolescent child because his musical preferences are peculiar to his age and musical judgment given proper nourishment will grow. Discrimination cannot be forced anymore than physical development. She also notes that people are dependent on entertainers for amusement, but a background is necessary to understand the significance of and appreciate what is performed.

In The Meaning and Teaching of Music Will Earhart stated that creative education required more "pedagogical wisdom than is essential to success in mechanical instruction"27 and such educa-

26. Pitts, Lilia Belle, Music Integration in the Junior High School, p. l.
tion left no room for restrictions limited to a book or room. Through creative education the child discovers and reveals innumerable aspects of self-expression.

Those aspects exist potentially in the understanding of the versatile-minded teacher; and the teacher knows that they are the aspects which the subject may assume in the minds of all the pupils collectively. All of the guises and hues it may wear, she cannot know. The pupils will disclose them in unexpected variety when at last given opportunity. And the opportunity is afforded whenever the pupils are invited to lay hold on subject matter and mould it to their uses, instead of being used themselves (as they ordinarily feel they are) in the service of an unyielding subject-matter that never reciprocates.

Finally, the creative project provides the agency by which the subject may thus be made to serve them. But it must truly serve them; they must have freedom to use it in their ways, if deep interest and response, and true originality and rich self-development are to result...

...only when they have full freedom, after a wise preview has been given them, can depth and authenticity of response be confidently expected of them.28

Mr. Earhart observed that the arts are excellent mediums for developing "human personality, character, and wisdom," and no teacher should hesitate to grasp every opportunity for development through creative experiences in the arts.

Mr. Earhart spoke on creative teaching again in 1956 when he denoted the meaning and practice thus:

Creative activity is the recombining of images and ideas into forms that, for the child who makes them, seem new...

Feeling is the basis for creative activities.29


Among the recommended activities were improvisation resulting from mood created by tone with expression to follow later; setting original poetry to original tunes; appropriate, natural, free rhythms; making and playing musical instruments; and dramatization. Creative musical activity should be "prompted by personal mood or impulse and should be an agency for developing musical appreciation with the ultimate effected attitude of understanding and of rich and sensitive response, like that of a person to his native language." Teaching procedures would, of necessity, be informal but it would pay off in the dividends of a "prodigious amount of learning and understanding." The teacher would be a guide in leading children into or out of technical snares.

Miss Pitts spoke at the same meeting as Mr. Earhart regarding the Place of Music in a System of Education. She remarked that the School presents a pattern of living designed to promote specific learning and to inculcate definite attitudes and ideals. Miss Pitts considered the chief aim to be character building which should and could be accomplished by teachers recognizing these:

...immortal cultures of firing imagination, illuminating the mind, inspiring good motives, guiding conduct, and universalizing sympathies.

She observed that the desired aims could best be accomplished through the spirit of play, captivating play which causes work

30. Ibid., pp. 125-27.
32. Ibid., p. 18.
to take on the "freedom of play" which uses time instead of killing it. The process of learning becomes fun instead of a chore. The typical activities were singing, musical reading, and listening repeatedly to fine selections that provide a background for comparing and judging.

Miss Baldwin, too, appeared on the same 1936 program with a message on **Listening**. She believes that:

> Listening to music is a real art, a human skill, demanding both training and practice.

Musicianly listening, which registers the details of musical beauty turns the instant joy of mere hearing into musical memory, a durable satisfaction.

Listening is now considered as definite a musical activity as performing or composing and is recognized as basic musical activity.\(^{33}\)

Miss Baldwin stated that "music exists as it is heard" but for music to be fully revealed one must be completely free and "willing to be still and know." Such a statement is in complete accord with Max Schoen's research of 1927 *The Effects of Music*. Miss Baldwin considered the need for teachers qualified and able to develop an appreciation of music a "crying need." She considered music appreciation the "total response" of physical, emotional, intellectual reaction to "musical beauty and factors that cause it."\(^{34}\)

> Music Appreciation... is the combination of feeling and knowing.


\(^{34}\) *Ibid.*, p. 94.
No person can teach another by direct instruction how to feel.

. . . Feeling will always come first both in importance and in actual experience, for music is a language of feeling, a heart-to-heart message from composer to listener. . . . . .

. . . We might say that music appreciation is what awakens when we experience musical beauty. And this awakening is not of knowledge, that we must get from without, but of feelings that come from within.35

In order to establish a mood of quiet listening, Miss Baldwin recommends substituting mental activity for physical. The listener must have some specific detail for which to listen and about which to think. Discussion of details and emotional reaction are recommended for stimulation of imaginations. It is necessary that the teacher know his or her music and to know the child; to meet needs of the listener and never say that a definite law prevails for there is no law governing taste.

Do not expect to measure results, for appreciation is many years a-growing and often keenest in the most silent undemonstrative child.36

It is to be carefully observed at this point that discussion has received a prominent position in the lesson and teaching procedure. Discussion, talking about the experience and how "we feel" and how someone else may feel, is another form of self-expression giving the listener another social contact and association. The sharing of experience and feeling is a universalizing factor desired in all education. Discussion appears to be replacing the student workbook of methodical ques-

35. Ibid., pp. 94-95.
36. Ibid., p. 96.
tions and answers, although they continue to find a welcomed place in many situations.

Beatrice Perham considered appreciation the ultimate aim and results of the whole musical experience in Music in the New School in 1957. She believed the most satisfactory learning and results came through creative experiences that adapted themselves to active learning. The dynamic factor in teaching has been gaining in popular favor since the education of large groups entered the picture. Many early educators applied it, but in mass education, swift changing philosophy and methods many teachers have not known how to apply experimental psychology with creditable consequences. Mechanistic practices continue to reign in many classrooms today. Even creative activities which Miss Perham and so many other educators favor are really mechanical performances where the teacher tells the child what to do rather than letting him make the discovery himself. In some instances and frequent situations the teacher may have to make many suggestions before the desired stimulation is effected, but such suggestions should take the form of guided choices. Give the child a choice and he will come up with something. It may not be what the teacher expects always, but many times it may be better than anything the teacher has to offer. In rhythmical activities the child skips because that is the way the music makes him "feel like moving" not because the teacher says he ought to skip to it.

Miss Perham notes the importance of performances as part of the program of daily activities and not something special. Preferred performances are those correlating and integrating work in
other phases of the curriculum and to originate from the desires of the child and his experiences. The sum total should be original and creative in every sense of the word. The idea is favored by educators who can see education as a developmental process. James Mursell recommends performance as part of the natural program. In other words, teach while preparing for a program. Public performances are added incentives for learning music. It is another shared experience. Peter Dykema notes the value in sharing and its important place in music first in 1951 and again in 1941.

Philosophic trends, thinking, and practices are not limited to a particular year mentioned here. They may have been practiced previous to the time mentioned and afterwards by people who cannot even be noted here because there are so many, but the persons mentioned have gained a prominent place in music education and the dates observed reveal the evolution of thinking and practices in favor today. They cannot be entirely new for every age has produced individualistic thinkers, but a personal discovery is very new although it is as ageless as time, even to an adult.

The School of the Air of the Americas which was initiated in 1938 as an aid to classroom instruction for use in all American nations learned by experience that discussion played an important role in effecting learning. The program was not planned to promote music appreciation alone, but appreciation of all activities of mankind. The 1941-42 manual for teachers read:

A study of last year's "Wellsprings of Music" series has shown that the educational worth of such
broadcasts is largely dependent upon the preparatory and follow-up activities under the teacher's direction. It is of great educational importance that as many minutes as possible before and after each broadcast be devoted to activities relating to the program.37

Suggested follow-up activities were: discussion of interesting points of broadcast, original notebook sketches of impressions of interesting episodes of program, discussion of place of music in making everyday life more pleasant, comparison of functions of music in former times and the present, discussion of differences and reasons for song making by the trained and the untrained, write song about a dramatic incident in the life of one or more of the pupils, and collect folk songs from people in the community. The manual contained a bibliography and list of related recordings with each musical program.

The Educational Policies Commission National Education Association of the United States and the American Association of School Administrators redefined the educational objectives of the public schools and why the conclusions were formed in an enlightening manner in 1938.

Every statement of educational purposes, including this one, depends upon the judgment of some person or group as to what is good and what is bad, what is true and what is false, what is ugly and what is beautiful, what is valuable and what is worthless, in the conduct of human affairs. Objectives are essentially, a statement of preferences, choices, and values. With these preferences exercised, these choices made and these values arranged in a variety of ways.

The purposes of schools and other social agencies are not "discovered" as a prospector strikes a gold-mine. They evolve; they reflect and interact with the purposes which permeate the life of the people. In each of the phases of individual, and social living, there are elements which people commend, others which they condemn. Such judgments are based, in the last analysis, on moral standards or ideals. That which, out of their intelligence and experience, the people declare to be good, they will attempt to maintain and perpetuate for the benefit of their children and their children's children. They strive through education to transmit what they think is good to all the generations to come.

A society which exalts force and violence will have one set of educational aims. A society which values reason, tranquility, and the paths of peace will have another and very different set. Again, a society which worships its ancestors and blindly reverences the past will have and does have different educational purposes from a society which recognizes the necessity for adjustment and change. The educational objective in each case rest on certain ideas of good and bad, but these ideas are different in each case and lead to aims for the schools which differ from one another as the day from the night.

Educational purposes, then, are a form of social policy, a program of social action based on some accepted scale of values. Since the application of these values varies from place to place and even from day to day, detailed purposes of education can never be developed so as to be universally applicable and perpetually enduring. Constant study and revision are required to keep them meaningful to the people and effective in the schools. Only the broadest lines of policy can have more than temporary and local application, but these controlling principles are of prepotent importances. Everything, in fact, depends upon them.

Educational objectives, if they are to be of significant practical value must not be established in defiance of known or ascertainable facts concerning the economic and social situation as it is and as it may become. The values cherished by individuals and by social groups are the product of experience and may be changed by the same force which created them. In this realm every effort must be made to substitute
tested truth for ignorance and hunches. Every major change in the structure of human society from tribal government to nationalism and from chattel slavery to capitalism has been accompanied by profound changes in educational purposes. A clear and exact knowledge of the status and direction of any culture is indispensable to a statement concerning its educational purpose.

...Four aspects of educational purpose have been identified. These aspects center around the person himself, his relationships to others in home and community, the creation and use of material wealth, and socio-civic activities. The four great groups of objectives thus defined are:

1. The objectives of self-realization
2. The objectives of Human Relationship
3. The objectives of Economic Efficiency
4. The objectives of Civic Responsibility

Each of these is related to each of the others. Each is capable of further sub-division. The school is only one of the many educational influences in these various fields of human life. Its responsibility extends to all of these areas, but in some areas the weight of education rests on the schools more exclusively than in others. The role of the school is especially definite in preparing for civic responsibility.

Music education has attempted, and in many instances succeeded, to meet the above-mentioned objectives, particularly the first two. Through creative activities in musical expression the child has learned that he, too, can do things; and in group participation he partakes in cooperative and socializing experiences which bring about harmonious human relationships. By sharing his experiences in association, discussion, and performance he contributes to his own growth as well as to other people's growth. His

---

musical education has oftentimes resulted in a profession.

Music is a possession the chief value of which is realized when we give it away. The surest way in which the musician can be assured of having skill and even enjoyment in music is by performing for others.\(^{39}\)

The performance may be for one's own class or age group or public.

The idea of performance as contributing to one's own appreciation and audience appreciation has been generally accepted and widely used since the advent of music as a part of the nation's cultural life. Public performance and private demonstrations were one of the major features employed for introducing music into the school curriculum. Mr. Dykema and Mr. Gehrkens reiterated its useful employment in 1941 as has James Mursell in 1945 and again in 1948, and the Music Educators' Source Book in 1947.

...music may be an agency for democratic living by providing rich and significant experiences and activities in which all may share. ...public presentation of music by pupils should be a living outgrowth of the program.

Music in the schools should be planned and organized as a sequence of aesthetic and social experiences and technical learning out of which may come refined and idealized life attitudes, developing and continuing musical interests, the discipline of intrinsically valued achievement, convincing experiences of the democratic process, recreational resources, and the discovery and revelation of talent. This, we believe, is a fair summary of the wishes and hopes of the public which supports our work, nor always clearly expressed, but of decisive importance.\(^{40}\)

Mr. Mursell feels very keenly the importance of public performance


\(^{40}\) Mursell, James L., *Music in American Schools*, pp. 25, 296, 32.
being an extension of the program itself, not an added accessory.

Creative education concurs on the idea. Mr. Mursell specifically
notes the importance of the aural factor in education and appre-
ciation. So important is the ear and what it hears that one can
not afford to overlook it.

That it is necessary for various and special
skills — the skills of the composer, the performer,
the critic, and the teacher— . . . . . .
No one thing so surely favors the rapid progress of
the beginner, or lays a better foundation for speedy
and continuing development of musical and technical
power and control than training him in the ability
to hear well. 41

The aural factor is essential for the enjoyment of music, and the
aesthetic value of the art or of any art is the one every teacher
should never cease to emphasize says Mr. Mursell. This writing
is an extension of Mr. Mursell's thinking and writing in 1957,
which parallels the ideas of Miss Baldwin, on hearing music he
writes:

The art of music is a creation of the mind
of man. All its characteristics and organizing
principles depend upon the action of the mind.
All its effects upon us when we listen to it, all
that we do when we perform it or create it, are de-
termined by the laws of the mind. What the listen-
er to music hears and what comes into his ears are
two very different things. 42

In a research experiment similar to one made by Max Schoen in
1927 Mr. Mursell states:

... . significant findings was that while the
range of imagery suggested by each composition
was extremely wide and diverse, the mood effects
aroused were comparatively constant for all

41. Ibid., p. 146.
42. Mursell, James, The Psychology of Music, p. 15.
listeners. Here we come upon the true "meaningfulness" of music, which lies in its specific emotional values. One may be stimulated to imagine a hundred different past experiences associatively aroused by a composition. But each will be determined ultimately by and be congruent with its prevailing and basic mood, unless it is purely arbitrary and accidental. Such images and associations are specific embodiments, differing widely among different individuals, of the mood values which are the constants of the musical complex. In the teaching of "appreciation," stories and literary comments should serve not as "interpretations" of a fictitious "meaning," but as factors which set the mood in its proper direction. It is possible to listen to music and be aware of very little else than associative or imaginal content. Within limits this is a perfectly valid type of listening, but it is much less significant than listening dominated largely by mood. . . Any response to music in which emotional values are absent will be inadequate except for special purposes. . . .

Visual experience of various kinds constitutes a third extrinsic factor which plays a significant part in listening, though its importance is less than that of the two others discusses. We have seen that the primary organization of aural experience is to refer its content to the source of the sound. The reason for this seems to be that the optimum activity of the central nervous system in response to auditory stimulation is obtained when the reception of the two ears is equalized. This involves bringing the sound source into the median plane by orienting the head and body with respect to it. And the whole experience becomes much more definite and its pattern more clear-cut if the eyes cooperate with the ears in giving an objective reference to what we hear. This is probably the basic reason why we tend to turn towards any person who is addressing us, and why we find it easier to understand his words in this position even apart from any cues which we may pick up from the expression of his face or the movement of his lips. The language pattern is better structured in perception when it is referred to its objective source. Also it is the reason why we tend to turn towards radio
lou=" pipes or organ pipes, and why we strongly prefer to have a musical performer in front of us rather than any other location.43

Mr. Mursell’s words clinch other statements through research that add further force to Mr. Schoen’s findings and to all previous practices and beliefs regarding listening and resultant reactions.

Miss Pitts noted the vast challenge to the schools by invention with an engaging and revealing account in 1944.

THE CHALLENGE OF A NEW PUBLIC

The wall which once separated the musician from other people has been scaled by modern invention. In an incredibly short time a musical audience of universal proportions has come into existence. Nothing comparable to the existing pervasiveness of music has prevailed since the days when every man was his own instrument for making music. In those simpler times entire groups not only participated in tribal rituals, but, from dawn to sunset the business and pleasures of life were set to music. While it is true that there is a vast difference in both the conditions and the social uses of music then and now, it is possible, nevertheless, that the common meeting ground provided today by radio and sound-film may eventually close the gaps which widened and extended when music lost its public function in the audience chambers of princely patrons. From such an eventuality would come — and there are signs that it may be on the way — of a singing, dancing, musically creative people. A people who have regained their birthright which is a desire for and the freedom to give musical expression to experiences belong to life as it is lived here and now in this, our day. Whether or not a machine age is capable of giving music back to the people in the sense of developing a musical productivity that originates in the human medium, may turn out to be the most crucial question that music education has yet been called upon to answer. . . . . . The fact to be reckoned with just

43 Ibid., pp. 208-9.
here, is that times have changed and we have a consumer public no longer dependent upon the artist in the concert hall, the music teacher, critic, or others in authority and control. When the musical market was under control, so to speak, music could be placed, and did stand, on a pedestal above and apart from ordinary folk. No one asked or cared for their opinions, so the general public remained either wistful, indifferent, or hostile in attitude. But no longer is this the case; people count when they can switch a dial on or off at will and when they can stay away from the box-office because they know what they want. There is a consumer public today that is legion in its infinite variety of musical tastes and stages of development. Moreover, there are commercial producers ready to give this public what it thinks it wants.

We have only to look about to see quite clearly that one positive desire of this new mass audience, including the mass of school children, is that music shall not be refined away from its homely services to everyday life. Already the results of mass musical consumption are far-reaching in quantity of output and quality performance. The man in the street and the child in the school are in the position to make, not only choices, but comparisons. Narrow, devitalized programs of "rote songs" and "Note reading" from a limited number of prescribed books are likely to fare badly in these days of boogie-woogie and Toscanini, of Stokowski and the sound film, and of Walt Disney and the animated cartoon.

Unless due consideration is given to the informal means of enjoying music so widely used by the young of this generation, music teachers in classrooms face the prospect of losing ground. Consciously or not, we who teach are compared with the world's best when it comes to presenting music as a source of recreation, entertainment, and enlightenment. The devices responsible for the spread of music are forces capable of working for us, but they can conceivably be turned against us. And, in the latter instance, not only as our professional interests might enter in, but also in relation to the general progress of cultural growth through music.

This constitutes a very real challenge. What we are called to account for is to find adequate techniques for appraising and adapting these new resources that are at the disposal of educators, so
that they will give additional force and strength to teaching programs. Furthermore, it is our job to try to help in channeling machine power to the end of stimulating a more musically productive people. This is very different from a mass public using music as an escape from reality—a practice which will, if continued, stultify and narrow creative expression. Since one of the most urgent needs of contemporary civilization is to achieve a better balance between mechanized material force and creative human power, both a function of and a challenge to music is implied in this statement.

Music, the arts, and other aesthetic aspects of human activity are not separated endeavors, but expansions of social processes that project themselves into home and family life, and into citizenship and community relations.

Music is a potent cultural instrument and, as such should render full service in shaping that better world toward which we are so painfully moving. What it will be in the years to come depends upon how good, how vital, and how broad in the scope of its functional service we can make music education during these extraordinary times.

The aims of the music curriculum with its creative experiences and activities would be "human betterment through personal and social growth" by learning about oneself, "discovering and developing motor skills and social tendencies, appreciating one's own experiences and shared activities, and appreciate the pinnacles of inspiration and the vistas of beauty that are made possible by the life of mind and spirit."

Miss Pitts has contributed widely to a broad program of appreciation through readable and applicable publications and through preparing elementary school music materials in the most re-

---


45. Ibid., p. 147.
cent publication Our Singing World. In 1947 she and Gladys Tipton edited appreciation notes for the RCA Elementary School Albums. The excellent notes include rhythmical suggestions, general rhythm band procedure, story element connected with selection, and thematic and rhythmical notation. Albums include basic listening, rhythmical, song activities, Christmas carols, patriotic songs, Indian music, and rhythm band activities. The first three albums are graded, however such grading is simply to indicate preferred usage because of the short attention span and limitations of younger children. The recordings are longer and songs more difficult in the upper grades albums. The authors have no intention of harnessing any teacher, but intend to spark imaginations instead. Much is made of the story element and discussion of shared and individual reactions and experiences. As high quality of performance as possible is always desired. This particular educational series of records is receiving favor in classrooms. Children respond beautifully. Tone quality in singing is greatly improved as a result of hearing the recordings.

The Music Educators National Conference which was the Music Supervisors' National Conference until 1954 published a Source Book on Music Education in 1947 in which they recommended at least a one semester course in music appreciation for all high school students. They believed it to be desirable because the schools are educating more listeners than performers. Public performance of high standards are desirable because of the appreciative aspects.

Musical performance not only raises the standard of appreciation in the performers, but if the
performance is of high quality it raises the
standard of appreciation in the audience.

Concerts for children are highly favored and needed for learning
to listen and promote consumer training. The committee deemed it
as important for a person to know how to listen to music as for
one to know how to watch a ball game.

With our American life so widely set to
music, learning to listen has become an "educa-
tion for the needs of life."

The development of taste and discrimination requires standards for
constructive and intelligent comparisons. To make comparisons one
must have had enough experiences and heard enough music to make
any conclusions and choices which is in accord with Max Schoen's
study. The Source Book noted that aesthetic understanding may be
gained through familiarity, analysis, and interpretation. A com-
modation of the three stimulated imaginations to meet the aspira-
tions of any teacher.

Because of the personal insight to be gained and a common
understanding and a knowledge of shared feelings of which no one
need be ashamed, discussion continues to gain and hold a fair share
of time in the class activities. Emotions that can be shared give
another creative activity which may be directed into useful chan-
nels of thought. The child learns why he reacts the way he does
and if he considers it an undesirable reaction he may be able to
substitute a reaction that he and society consider more desirable.

Guided aesthetic discussion of the kind
is potentially exceedingly valuable; and also

47. Ibid., p. 136.
exceedingly neglected. Music education ... is far too exclusively concentrated on skill, and places far too little emphasis on thought, insight, and aesthetic response. 

Always remember that aesthetic standards are not created by personal preference. ... of course musical discrimination can only bring about their evolution through a series of revealing and commanding developmental experiences. 

By means of many-sided experiences and training the heterogeneous group will gain common interest as well as diverse enthusiasms. The kind and type of appreciation developed will depend to some extent on the nature and environment of the individual as well as the training imposed on him.

As a child grows from youth to maturity, what he becomes is largely a matter of his experiences and the ways in which they affect his inner self and his relations to those about him. 

Mr. Wilson says that "Music appreciation is a synonym for Music education" and that every lesson should be a lesson in appreciation, neither does "performance necessarily lead to an intelligent appreciation."

Musicianly listeners are not born they are made. Many develop through their own efforts which does not relieve school of guidance of musical consumers.

He, as Will Earhart, Lillian Baldwin, Sadie Rafferty, Lilla Belle Pitts, Peter Dykema, James Mursell, and other music educators, believe that classes in appreciation should foster intelligent enjoy-

---

50. Ibid., pp. 243-44.
ment of music to be gained through knowledge about and of music itself. History is knowledge about music while theory is knowledge of music. Both are sciences while appreciation is an art. The difference in appreciation and liking music is being able to hear and note thematic changes, key changes, rhythmical patterns, and following the over-all structural design. Mr. Wilson observed that orchestral and band performance, choir, and/or all three had made a greater impression on community appreciation than had been gained through listening.

The foregoing conclusion may be due to the interest of parents regarding the progress of their off-spring and to the fact that personal performance is a more dynamic factor in creative learning than listening. Actual doing is a more active process than listening. Discriminative listening is a slow and desired evolution in the whole process. Because meaningful and musicianly listening is such an involved process the school continues to employ all natural, creative activities to motivate and produce, if possible, appreciative listeners.

Now in the year 1949 the National Education Association observes:

Music is for everyone. It transcends time and national boundaries. Its origins in the history of the human race are crystalized in legends that were ancient in the Golden Age of Greece. Whether its rhythms are struck from a hollow log in a jungle or its symphonic strains are wafted from the stage of Carnegie Hall, of Covent Garden, or of La Scala, music is an expression of deep-seated emotions and aesthetic values which no language can transmit. It is international in its nature, universal in its scope.
The school of the Twentieth Century recognizes that it is vitally important to know how to make a living. It stresses also the importance of learning how to live fuller, richer lives. It provides students with experiences in the enjoyment and satisfaction of many cultural opportunities. Among them are music and the visual arts, which have a well-defined place among our school studies. The fine arts are no longer planned only for the talented child, they are available to all students; not because all are equally gifted, but because every normal boy and girl has the capacity to enjoy these arts.

There is perhaps no experience of the school which is carried over more completely to adult life than music appreciation and performance. Long-continued, capable leadership in school music is evident in the operas and symphonies that have become a tradition in some cities which are nationally known as centers of musical culture.

In few other parts of the school program has more progress been made than in music and the visual arts. Much of it has been made during the last twenty-five years. This has been due in part to the fact that teaching of art and teaching of music have become part of the profession of education. Once, professional artists were accepted as teachers. Some of these were artists who had failed in their art professions and turned to teaching as a livelihood. Now, prospective teachers of these school studies lay the basis for their work in the laws of learning and the principles of instruction, as well as in the development of talent in the art which they will teach.

Advancement in teaching the arts has also been due to the recognition given them as an integral part of the school curriculum, not as mere "side-lines", of pursued in after-school hours. Music and the visual arts courses in the modern school include not only development of the skills involved, but study of the arts in their relation to social progress, and appraisal of the current trends in these fields.

The singing classes and the drawing classes of a generation ago are emerging in today's curriculum as interesting and rich experiences in which students are not simply exposed to "artistic education", but in which they actually participate and contribute.
Assembly sings, creative art and music classes, bands, orchestras, choruses, glee clubs, concert programs, poster projects, museum activities, participation on the programs of organizations outside the school are increasing evidence of effectiveness in the teaching of these arts and of their importance in the life of the school and the community.

Among the objectives of our school studies in music and the visual arts are:

To bring greater enjoyment to the lives of boys and girls

To enable gifted students to develop their talents

To project music and other programs into the community

To develop appreciation for the music and art of other peoples in a broad program of education for international understanding

Goals yet to be achieved in our program of education in music and visual arts include greater opportunities for individual instruction in both vocal and instrumental music, and the extension of opportunities in music and the visual arts to the large percentage of American boys and girls who are not getting them.51

The foregoing report seems to well-cover the current expectations and trends music and the arts desire in education.

It seems necessary to review the widespread belief that no standard for measurement has been found. Mr. Mursell and other educators indicate that grading should be of minimum consideration, but an observant teacher can and will recognize desirable progress through individual reactions of enjoyment and desire for more musical activities.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

WHAT IS APPRECIATION AND HOW MAY ONE GAIN IT
AS PART OF A NATURAL HERITAGE

The appreciation that public school teachers are supposed to develop in children through training must come from the children's activities and learning processes. Lowell Mason taught on the theory that people learned by doing, then after thirteen years of such teaching he said that the children had a better "appreciation of music than their fathers."¹ Did he mean they knew more about music or they knew more about what music meant in their lives? From the survey and generally accepted connotation of the meaning of appreciation, he probably meant both.

Daniel Gregory Mason wrote that his father, Lowell, had made Boston a self-sustaining and self-supporting musical center through his early efforts and teaching, whereas New York City depended on Europeans for its musical culture. No doubt the situation was as stated in early years but it cannot be denied that both cities produce and generate their own musical culture today. Did the early educational procedures, practices, and curriculum have anything to do with cities becoming musical centers in later generations? Apparently they did for the localities promoting the earliest musical education have developed into great musical centers with tremendous and enthusiastic boosters and performers. Metropolitan areas of the West are fast claiming a rightful place.

¹ Rich, op. cit., p. 31.
in the musical world which they have earned through their efforts and public schools. One must recall that the earliest musical enterprises were private, but due to their success and the desire of the Singing School teachers to extend the privilege to all, music was the first expressive subject to enter the curriculum of the public school. The experimental attitude and thorough attention of early teachers to the matter of music education laid the cornerstone for present-day achievements.

The aim of education is to give man an interest, something worthwhile to do, and promote a cooperative society composed of human, emotionally well-adjusted personalities. Education contributes to the entire personality. Since the school is not the only educational factor in any person's life, its ever-increasing aim is a strong factor for all that is strong, good, and acceptable in a pattern of living. Lowell Mason believed that education should lead to the "highest human development of the whole man" through the "harmonious development and cultivation of all the faculties." He did not believe the mere acquiring of facts to be an estimable aim of education but the "expansion of human powers which is the result of the acquisition of knowledge" was the desired object. He believed the home to be an important educational factor in the child's life; that childhood "associations" left lasting impressions which carried over into adult character and moral life; and that parents should see that their children heard "only the most choice songs, and melodies" so they would live

2. Ibid., pp. 60-62.
and be sung in later life. He believed that the student should find joy and pleasure in learning and that the skillful teacher could motivate learning and gain interest. He wrote that there were "three grand avenues of human knowledge, the immediate perception of the senses, the reasoning power, and faith," and according to his practices and methods believed that learning could best be accomplished by doing for oneself. He also practiced original composition in his classes.  

Some change in educational aims came about after the Civil War. Colonial education had been concerned first with religion and second with politics. After colonization political education dominated the national scene.

In the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries the utilitarian economic aim, always in the race from the first settlement of the country, came up from last place and even overtook the political in importance. Because America had such vast natural resources to be developed, it should occasion no surprise that people looked to the schools to prepare them and their children to win a portion of the national wealth and to mount the social-economic ladder as high as possible while the unprecedented opportunity lasted.

In the last decades of the nineteenth century American educational aims were complicated by the importation from Europe of the more theoretical statements of educational aims by Herbart, Froebel, and Spencer. From the clash of theory and practice a considerably ferment of thought arose. In fact when this situation is taken in conjunction with other factors at the turn of the century, it is evident the times were ripe for America to do some thinking of its own in the field of educational aims.

The stress on procedure, methods, and thinking in terms of the child was a counter stimulus resulting from extreme Pestalozzian practices; one might say the abuse of Pestalozzian theories. Organized methods and graded materials appeared, teacher training reached a new peak, and a "rote-note process" evolved as the consequences of conflicting ideas of what children should know and how they should learn it. When the rote method lost favor to the "reading method" many teachers including Jepson proclaimed that music education was not to produce singers but readers of music. Oddly enough Mr. Jepson featured "Solo Singing" in his procedure. Mr. Jepson's extreme attitude on reading was due to the fact that he felt music should have an established place in the curriculum and not an ornamental one of recreation only. He felt:

> The popular estimate of music in schools has been, and in most communities continues to be, its use as a recreation to relieve the tedium of study in other branches. Taught in this way, the study of music loses all character and dignity, and the public come to regard it as an ornamental branch to be lopped off whenever economy of public funds or political expediency dictate.

> The highest and best incentive to sing music is the ability to read music.⁵

Outstanding contributions of the "reading" years were: some solution of the reading problem, knowledge of the child voice and its possibilities and limitations, and recognitions of children as singers with individual differences and voice varia-

⁵. Birge, op. cit., p. 112.

tions. The period was dominated by conflicting forces resulting from philosophy imported from Europe and from native practices. One school of thought wished to perfect technique and teach reading of music, while others wished to teach songs of worth and beauty.

The two views were joined through musical publications which intended to interpret the "new education." The monthly publications issued such statements as:

"...music teaching of the future will be based on this truth, that if we would find the most profitable line for music in the schools we can do no better than to take as a guide the best that musical experience does for men and women in actual life; and that on the other hand, the results of schooling will have vital meaning in the ultimate lives of men and women just in proportion as the processes have vital meaning in the immediate lives of boys and girls."

The reaction from stress on learning to a social concept came about for several reasons. People became aware of the child as a member of society; industrial expansion, changes in economic and social living, improved old and new inventions, general movement from rural living to urban residence in apartments, and school taking over more of the child's education made it necessary for schools to revise procedure. To establish some measure of order and peace and maintain discipline, it became necessary for the teacher to gain the pupil's interest and cooperation. John Dewey set forth the "school is life for the child" idea and pointed the way to discipline through social fellowship. Pleasure in music through

---

7. Place, Helen, School Music, first issue cited by Birge, op. cit., pp. 146-46, (Original source not available.)
beautiful songs and sight singing or reading joined forces to prove that the two went together and listening was, of necessity, always present.

The aims of school-music teaching have shifted considerably from epoch to epoch, but always in the direction of values more and more clearly musical. In the introductory period the aim was to have every child learn to sing, and the values most thought of were those of recreation following mental fatigue from other studies. In the next generation the aim was to have every child learn to read music because this power is the key to an understanding of its treasures, a value which was concerned mainly with the child's future. The child study movement was largely responsible for making clear the present aim of school-music, which is that every child shall appreciate and take pleasure in music, not in a vague and indefinite future, but here and now.  

The aims toward appreciation to meet the current needs of age groups have been promoted through several avenues and agencies. Reading of music has become interesting rather than tedious drill through the song method. By imitation in the early years the child learns high and low sounds and intermediate tones, he makes up little songs that employ the scale in "walking up the steps" or "running down the hill", he recognizes the scale when he hears it on the piano, and later he is able to arrange the melody bells in their proper scale relationship. Along with scale recognition he recognizes the tonic chord and its place in the scale which is done through numbers and later rote learning of syllables. All the time the child has seen the notation on the board, music chart, or his own song book so that he is able to associate up moving notes with his climbing tones. He

---

also sees the different notes and their attachments which make some longer and others shorter. By singing the song, then talking about what was done at different places in the song the child soon recognizes fast notes and slow notes which is soon followed by similarity and dissimilarity in phrase structure and when tones or phrases sound alike they also look alike. Recognition of rhythmical values has been preceded by hearing, rhythmical activities of the child's own making because the music told him to move that way, singing of the song just as reading was preceded by rote singing. By progressive steps it is hoped that the child will be able to grow into reading music for himself.

The invention of the Victrola, its improvement, and finally its adaptation for school use with the making of records suitable for classrooms has broadened the scope of music education. Under the supervision of Mrs. Frances E. Clark the Victrola brought music into the classroom that would have been and would be today an impossibility for many children to hear much less perform. She also directed and encouraged usable publications for a wise use of the phonograph in musical education. The Victrola has lost no favor in the classroom and musical imagery may be developed to very keen pitch through its use. The selection may produce different settings, but rarely, if ever, different moods. One person may see an oriental setting due to instrumentation while another may see a woodland scene, but the people of the image will appear small and mechanical in both images if the music produces the feeling of small, mechanical detail. The young child catches the mar-
tial mood and can immediately tell whether or not the soldiers are real or toy or make-believe in marches. They catch a joke in music and can tell whether or not it is play or serious. How does the teacher know that the child responds thus? By the expressions on their faces or their eyes, by their rhythmic response first with hands then with feet and entire body. Changes in phrasing and instrumentation create the desire to do something different. Then questions and discussion have a major place in the procedure. The first listening lessons leaned toward scholasticism and memorization, but after the spurt of employing mechanisms thus, educators realized that lesson plans could not be substituted for the learning process.

Following the use of the victrola and player-piano in the classroom was the utilization of the radio for class purposes. Walter Damrosch pioneered in the field with many able assistants from over the nation keeping him informed. He conducted his own orchestra, was his own master of ceremonies, and at first issued his own questions and manuals for teachers. The enormous task was diverged in later years and Mr. Damrosch limited himself to the immediate planning and performance of the program with workbooks and manuals being prepared by Charles Farnsworth and Lawrence Abbot. Radio programs continue to find favor in the classroom. Due to their apparent success new programs for educational use in the classroom continue to arise. Many excellent programs are heard on the air after school hours which children are encouraged to hear and discuss.

Motion pictures have found their place in the classroom too
and many fine musical productions are now in circulation. Their use has not been as widespread as the Victrola and radio. All of the foregoing factors have given the aim and scope of education for appreciation, a magnitude that has gathered momentum with the years. With discussion a major feature, children are encouraged to recognize an emotion, a mood, and reaction for what it is worth and what it means to them personally and in their relationship to their fellowman.

Pioneers in the field set the trend and attitude by their early efforts and thoroughness. Now artistic performance is possible for every child through the school by its utilization of all the resources at their command and combining the arts in a dynamic combination of good teaching that motivates and inspires self-discovery, world-discovery, and learning that creates an appreciative individual.

Appreciation is knowing the value or worth of anything in relation to one's personal welfare and life and then in relation to the world at large. One must grow into the latter viewpoint, for the world is small to a child and oneself is the center of the universe. Oneself continues to be important throughout life, but enlightenment broadens the viewpoint and the world becomes larger if the person grows spiritually as well as physically. Appreciation is broader and deeper according to the growth of the individual, the information at his command, his reaction to experience, and the application of his knowledge.

When John Dewey said that "engagement of imagination is the
only thing that makes activity more than mechanical, he referred to each individual doing his own discovering. How will the teacher know whether or not a child has made any discoveries in music? The child who had no associations or ideas before begins to imitate his classmates and then tries all of the old activities to see if any fit the new, if not then he tries something new; a known song is requested to be sung or a selection heard again; someone tells of something heard in the music and contrast and comparison evolve through leading questions with the class furnishing the answer if possible. The earliest musical experiences are rhythmical and vocal response, dramatization, and playing simple instruments. Manner of interpretation arises within the child and he displays it to his classmates and associates. The experiences become more involved and detailed as the child matures emotionally and physically. Appreciation grows out of everyday experiences and the teacher should be actively concerned about what music is doing to the child rather than what the child is doing to music. The expression of beauty in a beautiful response is the result of growth in appreciation. The child hears quality, then imitates it and grows into habits of desiring beauty. The process started in childhood and continued over the years until ingrained habits are formed contribute to a continuous growth throughout life and an individual of merit composing a cultural society.

Music appreciation is rightfully assuming a position of basic importance in music education. From its inception it was considered as a supplement of the more serious part of the music program.

---

and was accordingly treated in a rather casual manner. At present, however, there is an increasing comprehension of the part music appreciation is to play in our educational program, if all other musical activities are to become vitalized and possess artistic value. Perhaps this thought is best expressed by stating that music appreciation is after all the principal purpose of all music education, and singing, playing, or listening constitutes a laboratory experience that will provide contacts essential to solid growth. The glee club, a cappella choir, and the orchestra are primarily courses in music appreciation and secondarily a means of developing skill and knowledge.¹⁰

¹⁰ Morgan, Russell V., foreword to Alvaretta West's Signposts to Music.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


American History and Encyclopedia of Music, American Supplement revised edition, Volume VI.

Atlantic Monthly. October, 1900; August, 1903.


California State Department of Education. Music Education in the Elementary School, Sacramento, 1939.


Cubberly, Elwood P. A Brief History of Education.


Dykema, Peter. The Teaching and Administration of High School Music, G. O. Birchard, Boston, 1941.


Howe, Granville L., Editor. *A Hundred Years of Music in America*, Howe, Chicago, 1899.


Knight, Edgar W. *Education in the United States*, Ginn, New York, 1941.


National Education Association Yearbooks, starting with 1886.


Stone, Kathryn. *Music Appreciation Taught by Means of the Phonograph*, Scott, Foresman, Atlanta, 1922.
