Imagined Destinations: The Role of Subjectivity and the Generative Potential of Lived Experiences in Adult English Learners' Paths to Fluency

By

Christine Palumbo

_____

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the

GRADUATE INTERDISCIPLINARY DOCTORAL PROGRAM IN SECOND LANGUAGE ACQUISITION AND TEACHING

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

In the Graduate College

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

2015

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

GRADUATE COLLEGE

As members of the Dissertation Committee, we certify that we have read the dissertation prepared by Christine Palumbo, titled Imagined Destinations: The Role of Subjectivity and the Generative Potential of Lived Experiences in Adult English Learners' Paths to Fluency and recommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the dissertation requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

_____Date: (9/03/2015)

Dr. Luis Moll

_____Date: (9/03/2015)

Dr. Christine Tardy

_____Date: (9/03/2015)

Dr. Robert Ariew

Final approval and acceptance of this dissertation is contingent upon the candidate's submission of the final copies of the dissertation to the Graduate College.

I hereby certify that I have read this dissertation prepared under my direction and recommend that it be accepted as fulfilling the dissertation requirement.

_____Date: (9//2015)

Dissertation Co-Director: Dr. Luis Moll

_____Date: (9//2015)

Dissertation Co-Director: Dr. Christine Tardy

STATEMENT BY AUTHOR

This dissertation has been submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of Arizona and is deposited in the University Library to be made available to borrowers under rules of the Library.

Brief quotations from this dissertation are allowable without special permission, provided that an accurate acknowledgement of the source is made. Requests for permission for extended quotation from or reproduction of this manuscript in whole or in part may be granted by the copyright holder.

SIGNED: Christine Palumbo

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation is dedicated first to my God whom I owe my life and all that I am.

I next acknowledge the time, support and encouragement of the members of my dissertation and comprehensive exam committee who have been fundamental to my development along this path. My amazing co-Chairs Dr. Tardy and Dr. Moll: Dr. Tardy for sticking through the entire process from the Pilot Study to which this dissertation comes; To Dr. Moll who encouraged me and believed in the concept of Imagined Destinations from its inception and helped me to develop and breathe continuous life into it. I acknowledge my third committee member, Dr. Ariew for being my first Mentor in the SLAT PhD program and my mountain. In addition, to Dr. Sheilah Nicholas who introduced the concept of a "tension" in qualitative research, which supported the results in my first pilot study and Dr. Perry Gilmore who attended my Mock Defense and gave me additional room to grow.

To all of those championing me from the sidelines: my beautiful daughter Toni for working diligently beside me toward her own goals; to my son Solomon; his wife Laura for loving one another and giving me my nipote Domenic; to my ex-husband for financial support and being proud of this accomplishment; to my sister Cheryl who was my first Mentor, and above all to my son Frank – who undoubtedly deserves an honorary PhD beside me for all of his love and dedication to not only being my biggest support over the past three years, but also formatting this dissertation, producing my power points and always being there when I needed a helping hand. Finally to my SLAT buddies especially Samina Yasmin, Osman Solmaz and Steve Pryzmus for being study buddies and for believing in me when I didn't believe in myself.

Thank you Lm for the endless hours you spent with me this summer! CT too! Francisco for helping to weather the many storms along the way! Leslie my reader! My family and friends especially Kyle Good! Samina bestie! Sarah for your kindness! SLAT PhD Program! University of Arizona! Panamá and its wonderful NNESTs!

DEDICATION

To my father Francesco Benzoino who instilled a respect for education and to always trust my own generative potential to succeed; and, for my nonna Theresa Palumbo who guided me through her spirit, her culture, her language and her love of God and family.

Table of Contents

List of Tables and Figures

Abstract

Focusing on a Vygotskian theory of cultural historical psychology, this dissertation features a narrative analysis to examine the role of subjectivity and the generative potential and agency manifested in Non Native English Speaking Teachers' (NNESTs) successful development of L2 (English) fluency. My research creates another view of a Vygotskian theory by means of the imagination. Building on a cultural-historical approach, I conducted a qualitative analysis of how these teachers' pathway to fluency evolved from their Imagined Destinations. This term is defined as a goal or objective in the mind of the learner that mediates, and is mediated by, his or her lived experiences.

The concept I coin as Imagined Destinations surfaced in my three initial pilot cases and took shape while working with NNES Panamánian teachers, from the analysis of online survey data with 27 of these experienced teachers, and detailed case study analyses of the language learning of eight of these teachers. These data revealed how participants dynamically create and recreate their environments through Agentive Roles that support the transformation of their environments to advance their goals.

These transformations have implications for how subjectivity, agency, and acquisition of the target language intertwine throughout the participants' lived experiences or pathways to learning, thus providing an additional way to look at subjects and subjectivities within a Vygotskian theoretical frame. The findings also indicate that teachers' language trajectories are continuous, emergent, and the result of taking on very deliberate ecological roles in their bilingual success despite recurring salient and limiting circumstances. These findings about the

centrality of Imagined Destinations in learning "smudges" the perception that societal power outweighs the dynamic and agentive roles of individuals as active molders of their lives.

Finally, this dissertation also seeks to enrich scholarship by demonstrating how NNESTs use their bilingual identities built from their trajectories to bilingualism as ways to influence and inspire their own students' second language learning.

Keywords: *subjectivities, imagined destinations, agency, sociocultural theory, second language learning*

1. Introduction

The dissertation examines the role of subjectivities and the generative potential and agency of eight Non Native English Speaking Teachers' (NNESTs) trajectories' to L2 fluency (as dynamic systems). The findings familiarize the reader with the processes of how people "come to know themselves and their world as well as [become] human in and through the processes of collaboratively transforming the world in view of their goals" (Stetsenko, 2008, p. 471). The results show the generative potential of Non Native English Speaking Teachers while engaging from their Imagined Destinations: a term defined as a goal or objective (destination) in the minds of individuals that generates potential to organize and orchestrate successful language learners' roads to fluency. This potential is specifically connected to their emotions and predilections for acquisition. The results also show how these progressions support the altering of these teachers' worlds as subjective alternatives that complement and transform their environments. And, finally, the results show how the externalization of these narratives include control of symbolic processes that stimulate the correction of actions sufficient to achieving their goals, while serving these teachers in defining their identities as second language learners and teachers.

The first theme (thematic analysis) uses participant narratives to closely examine and elaborate González Rey's (2007) Vygotsky-based insights on the role of subjectivity in human development, and the mediating roles of emotions and lived experiences in shaping these subjectivities. In my analysis of participant narratives I identified four related constructs that clarify the role of Imagined Destinations: Construct 1: Imagined Destinations: as predilections for

the second language coming from their imaginations (within *vivencias*[1]); Construct 2: Obstacles encountered and how they transform into subjective alternatives; Construct 3: Agentive roles of the participants: showing up as multiple subjective actions; and Construct 4: Unity of Affect and Intellect analyzes the narratives from an emotional point of view, observing the narratives from the ways in which the participants, as described in their retellings, control their emotions in order to correct the actions' adequate to the exigencies to accomplish their goals. To further clarify the role of *vivencias* (mentioned in footnote 1) in this dissertation I will discuss it below.

Moll (2014) discusses *vivencias* (akin to the Russian *perezhivanie),* to mean "lived or emotional experience convey[ing] the dialectical connections between affect and cognition in relation to living a social situation, and it includes the subjective meaning and sense of an experience" (Rodriguez Arocho, 2009, as cited in Moll, p. 104). Moll explains the term *vivencias* when he compares two students in one of his studies who "ostensibly share the same social situation of development" but "experience it differently, living socially, emotionally, linguistically, and intellectually different lives" (Moll, 2014, p. 104). Moll continues in his explanation of *vivencias* as a way "to capture the combination of intellectual and emotional aspects of the social situation while underscoring the inseparability of development from its contexts" (p.105). Thereby, "in an emotional experience we are always dealing with … indivisible unity of personal characteristics and situational characteristics… represented in *perezhivanie*" (Vygotsky, 1994, p. 342: in González Rey, 2009, p. 70). Consequently, *vivencias (perezhivanie*) supports the

---

[1] Used by Moll (2014) to replicate what Vygotsky meant by *perezhivanie*. *Vivencias* in Spanish is identified as a lived experience that shapes someone's character. *Vivencias* are life events that contain emotion (p.14).

understanding that two people will experience the same event differently due to the combination of emotion, personality and context.

The second theme I employed to analyze the narratives was taken from a study by Johnson & Golombek (2011). This study provides three functional constructs originally designed to analyze the benefits and uses of teacher narratives in teacher development: Function 1: Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) to measure the tools used in the environments that support the teachers' transition into consciousness. Function 2: Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) to show how the teachers' use the social to explain the (language learning) experience through inquiry in order to regulate the thinking process. Function 3: Autobiographical Reflection (AR) as a way to reflect on the teachers' own language learning experiences in order to guide their teaching processes and identities. These eight analyses, guided by the research questions (see Appendix B for research questions), specifically test the narratives under the following conditions: gender, urban versus rural, parental education, access to the target language, and the socioeconomic status of the participants. All contexts were identified in an online survey and confirmed in face-to-face interviews.

The three constructs borrowed from Johnson and Golombek and used for this study were associated to the actual monitoring of whether teachers were metacognitively aware of their L2 learning experiences, retrospectively. These three constructs also establish how the eight cases related their historical records to their second language learning classrooms when adapting the function of inquiry to gain insight into their minds and their L2 identities as English learners and teaching professionals – as guided by the research questions. By combining these two analyses the subjective places and imaginations can be monitored, becoming as important as the social

context for learning and development; person and context become inseparable through the teachers' lived experiences within their autobiographical retellings.

The dissertation then, discusses theoretical issues within a cultural-historical framework that follows a system, inseparable from the mind, where the original Imagined Destinations (goals, subjectivities) begin and are eventually mediated within participants' *vivencias*. González Rey (2007) argues these systems are "dynamic configurations within the social context in which the subjects' action is developed" (p. 3). This theoretical analysis takes root in Vygotsky's earlier work discussing cultural historical origins involving the psychical system. This lens lends credence to subject and subjectivities of mental processes as a system that encompasses the following theoretical viewpoint: ideas can begin in the person's psyche initially originating in a place I coin as "Imagined Destinations." These very real destinations, set in the mind of the participants' narrative stories, are theorized as going through permeable phases of development into successful second language (L2) acquisition. Vygotsky's work encapsulates imagination as a part of human development emphasizing imagination as "a means by which a person's experience is broadened… not limited to the narrow circle and narrow boundaries of his own experience" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b: as cited in Moll, 2014, p. 94). Therefore, a goal of the analysis is the theoretical elaboration analyzing how the Panamánian teachers' pathways to fluency evolved from their Imagined Destinations, defined as a goal or objective in the mind of the learner that mediates, and is mediated by, his or her lived experiences. Finally, this dissertation also seeks to enrich scholarship by demonstrating how NNESTs use their bilingual identities built from their trajectories to bilingualism as ways to influence and inspire their own students' second language learning.

1.1 Background of the Study

Evidence from the 2014 pilot study originally found credence in Norton's constructs of imagined communities, identities and investment, however, more compelling evidence ascribed to the concept of Imagined Destinations (IDs). The deliberate predilections for the language vividly expressed by the participants acted as essential tools within the invented places of two L2 learners and one native English speaker in three different university writing classrooms (see Appendix F: Pilot-Participant Table). The addition of emotion that intertwined throughout the stories is noted by Moll (2014) and González Rey (2011) as "subjective configurations" which adds to the production of the people they can become (Moll, 2014, p. 98). Participants' subjectivities transpire as integral pieces essentially aligned within IDs successfully propelling these cases from monolingual Chinese, Vietnamese and Spanish to bilingual English speakers and writers of English as their additional language.

An example of the construct of Imagined Destinations was clearly witnessed in pilot participant Andi (pseudonym), originally from China who found an ID initially upon arrival to the United States. It was his beginning predilection for English fluency that provided deliberate action that continued into successful acquisition of the target culture and language. First, he used religion as a tool, and then he used "beating"2 unkind classmates that made fun of him (Andi, personal interview, 2014). Andi systematically combined his strong emotional drive with his intellect to exit his English as a Second Language classes successfully, specifically to leave behind his ridiculing classmates. Ultimately, Andi's deliberate rendition of the choices he made

---

[2] Beating here means competing, not beating in the physical sense of the word.

revealed specific destinations that supported the agency he needed as a non-English speaker in an English-speaking world -- step after step. Tran, another case, etched out certain high-achieving classmates as her Imagined Destinations. The agency she created by setting out to "be like them" (top students in her fifth grade classroom) successfully created potential friendships, which systematically delivered her into a destination that grew and transformed into exactly what she saw and felt would be her Imagined Destination as an honor student, which she eventually attained. These achievements were again guided by "agentive roles that actively molded [and shaped their] li[ves]" and served as dominating factors in their stories (Stetsenko, 2008, p. 478). Nate (pseudonym), the only native speaker chosen for the study, became fond of writing as a way to express himself in a non-judgmental place. His propensity toward his Imagined Destination to become a successful writer provided a venue that he strove toward, that provided comfort, positive attention and clarity at a time in his life when he had none. This strong combination of affect and intellect assured his success, which he continues into his senior year of university studies. These successes, as discussed earlier by González Rey, come from a consciousness that was also discussed by Zinchenko (2002) when he defends the generative character of the human psyche he contends is a major theme of consciousness. He argues that "consciousness emancipates from activity and it begins to create new forms of activities" which "is a driving force of human development" (in González Rey 2011, p. 10).

Unquestionably, my first case evidence, more similarly situated in the work of Moll (2014), González Rey (2011), Stetsenko (2008), Zinchenko (2002) and van der Veer and Valsiner (1991) examines self-determination and subjectivity as potential components of self-determinism. My pilot study research therefore, went beyond Norton's three concepts of

imagined identity, imagined community, and investment into a fourth realm that is more deliberate and focused on a specific destination that causes, in my view, a cognitive shift in the person's feelings and view of themselves and their environments. I stipulate in my dissertation research that it is the learners' deliberate predilection from their Imagined Destinations that makes the difference in not only scaffolding the journey to fluency in the additional language, but because of this vision, their fluency evolves from self-determination (power) that cross-pollinates (naturally, ecologically) into their desired places – shaped and reshaped over time (transformed). In turn, these Imagined Destinations continue to create and recreate agency needed to support their desired outcomes of successful acquisition of the additional language and the vision of becoming successful writers. These contradictions between consciousness and activity as originally theorized by Vygotsky and interpreted by González Rey (2009, 2011), and again by Zinchenko (2002), shows a force that drives these cases human development within real life trajectories as a result of their Imagined Destinations.

My pilot study then, reestablished a different view of successful language learning through the lens of a Vygotskian theoretical framework. While locating imagined communities, identities and investment within the pilot narratives, there remained a tension due to unanswered questions. This disparate view of successful learners' roads to fluency was found in a place that I appropriate as Imagined Destinations (IDs). Similar to Norton's (2014) constructs elucidating imagined communities and identities as viable entities "theoretically generative for SLA theory" (p.3), IDs, more specifically integrate how the generative potential and agency of Non Native English Speaking Teachers' trajectories to fluency evolve from their Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* that contain their subjective goals and desires. These self-

determined images coming from their imaginations dynamically create and recreate agency, in order to transform their environments (due to exigencies) into subjective alternatives actively appropriating artifacts (tools) within their environments as told in teachers' narrations into conscious renditions of their trajectories to target language fluency. Appropriation refers to how individuals adopt tools through communication with their surroundings. Studying participants' Imagined Destinations within a narrative analysis approach, a view of the power of subjectivities within the Imagined Destinations beginning in the subject's imagination, became a consistent component of the participants' stories into target language fluency which, as stated by Vygotsky is "a completely essential condition for almost all human, mental activity" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b).

In Norton's numerous publications on the constructs of imagined communities and identities (Norton, 2001; Kanno and Norton, 2003; Pavlenko & Norton, 2007; Norton & Gao, 2008; Norton, 2013) her concept of the "imagined community" was based on the construct of Benedict Anderson (1991) who coined the term "imagined communities" when describing affiliation of the individual with members of communities and nations. Anderson (1991) posits that even though members of "even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion" (p. 6). Borrowing this concept, Norton wrote of "imagined communities that assume imagined identities" as "desired communities that offer possibilities for an enhanced range of identity options in the future" (Norton, 2014, p.3). She also refers to these imagined places as "imagined communities" refer[ring] to groups of people, not immediately tangible and accessible, with whom we connect with through the power of the mind" (Kanno & Norton,

2003). Norton argues "that an imagined community assumes an imagined identity and that a learner's investment … can be understood within this context" (Norton, 2014, p. 3). Norton's work has been largely influential in catapulting *identity* as a central term in SLA, which widely enabled applied linguists to explore the changing and complex struggles in the L2 learners' worlds for the past 15 (or so) years.

My work, which originated in locating identity in the constructs of imagined communities, identities and investment, with three L2 learners from a university writing class, now intends to develop an added view. This view is not specifically situated in identity, but instead refocuses the lens by means of the idea of subject and subjectivities as taken from a cultural historical perspective, which is based on Vygotsky's definition of imagination, and the interpretation of his work by Moll (2014), González Rey (2009, 2011), and van der Veer & Valsiner (1991). Unlike Norton who tends to foreground identity as the main construct within imagined communities, *Imagined Destinations* begin as goals (subjectivities) that are then mediated in order to control subjects' *vivencias* to stabilize their aims (goals, objectives) described by González Rey (2011) as a control of symbolic processes that stimulate the correction of actions sufficient to "create processes which are not objectively justified, but which are a part of human reality" (p. 20). He furthers explains these realities between "symbolical and emotional processes" when combined (unified) to "configure the complex subjective systems, at individual and social levels" (González Rey, 2011, p. 20).

Also different in my work: that the central role of language in imagined communities assumes an imagined identity. Imagined Destinations is derived from the personality of the person within their own environments, and is looked at as a "unified conception of mind as a

phenomenon that engages people within the setting of their action" (Smagorinsky, 2012, p.322). In other words, Imagined Destinations looks at the generative character of emotion that Vygotsky discusses as "cognitive-emotional synthesis or unities", and the "idea of psyche as a dynamic system" (González Rey, 2011, p.1) beginning within the imagination, set forth through a very specific process of interaction and events within *vivencias,* grounded in culture. Additionally, Norton's work is based "extensively on poststructuralist theories of identity associated with the work of feminist scholars such as Christine Weedon (1987/1997)" (Norton, 2013, p. 3). My work is appropriated strictly from Vygotskian theoretical frameworks of self, subject, subjectivities within *vivencias* as interpreted through, among others, Moll (2014) González Rey (2007, 2009, 2011) and van der Veer and Valsiner (1991); further explained throughout the remainder of the dissertation. Although Imagined Destinations share some commonalities (both theoretically generative, both within imagination, encapsulating goal(s) of some sort) the constructs of imagined communities and identities, and the construct of Imagined Destinations are coming from two different conceptual viewpoints and observations.

In sum, exploring the interpretations of the role of generative potential, subject and subjectivities through the lens of González Rey, (2007, 2009, and 2011), Moll (1995, 2014), van der Veer and Valsiner (1991, 1999) et al., by means of the examination of eight NNESTs from Panamá, interpretations of Vygotskian theories more succinctly answer the tensions that began in my original pilot study (see Appendix F for Pilot Study participants) and filtered into this dissertation research. This view of the *internal* perspective that looks at the L2 learner that I coin as "Imagined Destinations" more closely resembles the concept of subject and subjectivities within *vivencias* that Moll (2014), building on the work of González Rey (2011) creates. My use of

these evolving theoretical frameworks and ideas will be more thoroughly discussed in the Literature Review, Chapter 2.

***Please note my research does not draw any comparison to Norton's concept of investment, a term she derived from inconsistent findings within her research in the field of SLA inherent in the role of motivation in the L2 learners' worlds, which I found some credence to in both studies.*

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Even though a surge, often referred to as the "sociocultural turn" in the late 1990s successfully brought a plethora of dialoguing around the concept of identity, it is important to gauge the progress made after the acceptance and entrance of those Vygotskian approaches since their emergence over the past fifteen years. When gauging, the first problem important to note, is that despite the revelations made in those hopeful days of the late 90s and early 2000s, there is an abundance of data claiming the "inadequacy of schooling (Cobbold, 2010; Giroux, 2013; OECD, 2010) for L2 learners, and, as continued in Teemant et al (2014), "these inadequacies also show up in teacher preparation for students who are culturally, linguistically, economically, and learning diverse" (p.137). To further the research done by Teemant et al., although the authors note "a plethora of prominent models of culturally responsive teaching grounded in Sociocultural theory" (Johnson & Golombek, 2011; Moll, 1995; González, 2005; Gay, 2002; Lucas & Villegas, 2013, et al), L2 students achievement scores remain lower than those of non-L2 students (Abedi, 2002; Fry, 2008). Also crucial to communicate and examine is why the "majority of teacher education courses that prepare general education and content area teachers do not include instruction on teaching ELs (Ballantyne, Sanderman & Levy, 2008), and

finally, only 20 states require that all teachers have training in working with ELs, while the breadth, depth and quality of this training varies widely (Ballantyne et al., 2008).

In line with the exigencies described above, it is also important to take note of the differences in the demographics of L2 learners in the US in the past decade (2004-2014). According to NCELA (2011), more than 10% of the P-12 classrooms are L2 learners and ELs constitute a growing presence across the US. As stated, "EL school-age population has grown more than 63% since the 1994-1995 school year, while the non-EL school-age population has only increased slightly more than 4% (NCELA, 2011). In addition, comparing the L1 and L2 speakers in this country, there continues to be a gap in the high school completion rates and pursuit and attainment of university degrees. Finally, according to statistical evidence, ELs frequently live in poverty. ELs also often attend schools "that serve students living in poverty, as defined by eligibility for free and reduced-price lunch (Fry, 2008). According to Ballantyne (2008), these same students tend to go to public schools that have low standardized test scores, high student teacher ratios and high student enrollments. Other researchers have determined that nearly 60% of adolescent ELs qualify for free or reduced-price lunches (Ballantyne et al, 2008). In Arizona, most ELLs are US-born, thus American citizens. Some of these students are called the 1.5 generation, or heritage learners, which means that the issues with ELLs are not simply an immigrant issue. All of these factors highly contribute to the exigency to continually update and upsurge our theoretical perspectives in SLA.

In summation then, Sociocultural Theory which rose in importance in the 1990s, has been modified and needs to continue to modify in response to the complexity of Vygotsky's work. His work is also fractured due to many factors: having different moments in his written

works discussed temporally as different "blending of ideas from his written works in different times" (Valsiner, 2009, p. 60). It is also important to note is that Vygotsky was in the formative stages of developing a "blueprint for a comprehensive psychology of human development in its cultural-historical context", therefore, it is incomplete (Smagorinsky, 2012, p. 321). Furthermore, his work is translated not only from Russian to English, it is also translated from one culture to the next and one political entity to another. Furthermore, as Vygotsky died in the thirties, many theorists are interpreting his unfinished written works; therefore, there are many alternative interpretations and arguments based on these fragmentations. Because of these divisions and in light of the current problems in SLA, it seems logical to more closely monitor, examine, and align our efforts within the changing stages of L2 education in the United States and also within these many interpretations of Vygotskian theories that gained importance in the 1990s and momentum since 2006.

1.3 Purpose of the Study

To peer through the opacity screening second language fluency, my research creates another view of a Vygotskian theory by means of the imagination. I look to the data and the power that is in our own cultural historical records and ideologies that students bring to their L2 learning experiences within *vivencias* as they interact with the environments they encounter. In studying only successful L2 adult learners, I wondered why some EL learners succeed despite "inequitable worlds in which learning takes place" (Norton & McKinney, 2011). My research, examining a diverse array of ELLs "smudges" the perception that societal power outweighs the "emergent and agentive roles of individuals as active molders of [their lives]", as indicated by Moll (2014) and furthered by Stetsenko (2008), González Rey (2009, 2011), and other

contemporary researchers. These venues aim to shed light on ways to support L2 learners to gain fluency in their second language as well as elucidating how Non Native English Speaking Teachers (NNESTs) might be viewed in light of these findings.

The concept I coin as Imagined Destinations surfaced in my three pilot cases and took shape while working with NNES Panamánian teachers. The L2 learners' IDs more clearly situated in Vygotskian ideas of generative potential come from an idea which originated in participants' strong desires and predilections for target language acquisition. Therefore, the contexts represented by Norton (2013) when she references phrases like "struggles to speak" and "more powerful identities to speak from," in relationship to these adult learners, did not convincingly surface in my pilot study research.

Although Norton's paradigms undeniably exist in some L2 learners, these particular exemplars, although surfacing in the Pilot Study, did not explain the resiliency and self-determination in the participants –especially in light of inadequate English learning environments. For example, Tran was given very little support in her fifth grade classroom. She was put at a computer (by herself) until she was fluent enough to join the class. She had very little instruction all the while determined to fulfill her internal goal of becoming friends with one of the highest ranking students in her class. Tran's objective of being an honor student stemmed from her imagination, and she reached it due to her incredible willingness and conscious attention to achieving it. Andi's self-determinism originated from his original decision to come to the US to learn the language and culture; he continued to create and recreate his own agency; from studying harder to "beat" unkind classmates that ridiculed him, to participating in Bible

study with his host family with one goal in mind – fluency in his L2 English (see Appendix F for background on Pilot Study cases).

The numerous "obstacles" that somehow became routes (avenues) to support these pilot cases' success were seen as "ruptures" in the environment explained by González Rey as subjective alternatives, are *subversive* in relation to the dominant current social status, that become sub-alternates (alternate choices) that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011). This uncanny ability for the participants to achieve success, despite their obstacles caused the tension left unanswered when examining the pilot narratives within the scope of Norton's two constructs (imagined community, identity). Perhaps Norton's quest for equality and social justice envisions these depictions of the L2 learners relative to a political context, and with a specific purpose to support the inequities faced within ELL contexts across the country (globe).

In the pilot study and again in these narrative retellings– very explicit descriptions and organized senses of learners' own directions in successfully acquiring the target language surface by the interviewer asking the right questions. The results show the generative potential of Non Native English Speaking Teachers while engaging in their autobiographical retellings of their journeys to English fluency beginning in their Imagined Destinations. As responses to research question four indicated in the study (please see Appendix B for research questions), the teachers unanimously revealed passion and clarity in their ability to use their L2 English journeys within the contexts of their ELL Classrooms. All the teachers felt that the trajectories they experienced in their own second language learning experiences, could not only be used as tools in their classrooms, they also indicated using their stories in various ways to inspire and work with their ELL students. Hence, when the intellect becomes metacognitively aware of its passions, "it

gradually learns to control them" (p.240). The teachers' narratives elucidated how their paths to English fluency support their teaching identity and in turn, spill over into their teaching practices working with their students.

Therefore, in response to the problems discussed in 1.2, and the stated differences between IDs and Norton's constructs of imagined communities and identities, the purpose of this dissertation is to offer, as advocated by González Rey (2011); Hall, 2008; Johnson and Golombek (2011); Kanno and Stuart (2011); Lucas and Villegas (2013); Moll (2014); Stetsenko (2008); Zinchenko (2002), and other present-day researchers' methods for overcoming current fragmentations within sociocultural approaches in psychology, education, and a number of neighboring disciplines within the context of second language learning. This dissertation also intends to pave the way into how teachers' subjectivities within Imagined Destinations including their own agentive roles to transform their environments from monolingual Spanish speaking ones to include subjective alternatives, seen as obstacles or "ruptures" in the narrative stories that attracted and transformed the language-learning context, which supported their success in learning their second language, successfully. González Rey (2009, 2011) refers to subjectivities as senses that are "not guided by rationality" but instead are proclaimed as subjectivities that, when coupled with emotion, create relevance and stability, which characterize "the uniqueness of human actions" (p.16). Similarly, as brought forth through these teacher narrations, views of the second language learning process illuminate into clear and reliable trajectories toward fluency in L2 acquisition. The specific courses affecting participants' success in acquiring the additional language, whether in a foreign or a second language environment aim to propound the importance of subject and subjectivities within Imagined Destinations in accomplishing goals.

This research intends to find out what aspects of learners' lived experiences influence their second language development and how much is their own collaborative, purposeful transformation of their monolingual worlds into English language fluency. Simply put, this research aims to give a view of how "the self-directed core of human nature and the principled grounding for learning and development" (Stetsenko, 2008, p. 483) occurs in second language development in successful L2 learners. By taking these ecological perspectives, I seek to understand how aspects of subject and subjectivity work together with the social world to influence L2 learning and the experiences of NNES teachers' processes of learning the second language. From these discoveries, I can further explore how these mysteries may be integral in planning for the L2 and/or foreign language (FL) learning classrooms and in Teacher Education. Finally, another aim of this dissertation is to contribute to the professional development of second language educators by means of their autobiographical narrative retellings as "tools for knowledge-building and professional development practices" (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p. 1).

1.4 Organization of the Dissertation

I organize the current study into five chapters. ***Chapter 1, Introduction***, provides background and situates the problems and theoretical discoveries that led to the present research. The purpose of the dissertation and the theoretical concepts that are adopted throughout the study are discussed in this section. ***Chapter 2, Literature Review*** offers a synthesis of scholarship drawn from the interconnected aspects of analyses in the current study. It is presented in nine relevant sections based on the theoretical frameworks of data analysis (seen in Appendix C and Appendix D). Next, there is a general overview of the context of identity in the literature, and its importance in the context of teacher development. Specific literature on the

uses of teacher narratives for the purposes of this study are also illumined. In 2.9.1, I introduce my historical record created in Panamá before this study was conceived. This historical ontology provides a background of English in Panamá, which includes my own involvement as a Senior Fellow for the English Language Fellow (ELF) program. The chapter continues with a review of data collected and conclusions made from the work done with teachers and L2 learners from 2008 – 2010. It is important to note that some of those same teachers were also teachers in the cases studied for the dissertation. *Chapter 3: Methods* discusses the research methods employed in the study and includes information regarding research design, participants of the study, data collection, and data analysis. The concept of Imagined Destinations as discussed in relationship to two analytical themes guided by the four research questions (RQs) which are:

1. Do teachers discuss Imagined Destinations as a goal or a predilection toward the language they wanted to reach/learn? Did it become a strand that was discussed in their story?
2. What was the biggest obstacle to fluency in English? How did they handle that obstacle(s)?
3. Specifically does age of onset make a difference in their stories? In their memories?
4. Do they feel/think their journey supports their skills in the classroom? Do they use their stories to Inspire and teach their students?

Chapter 4: Findings begins with a brief discussion of the findings from the online survey, followed by an introduction of each of the narratives in a vignette style. Next, I lay out the findings of the dissertation in three categories: Participants' answers to the RQs; how their answers corresponded to Imagined Destinations and the themes of analysis related to their journeys to bilingualism, and finally the analysis of the three Functions of Narrative analysis by Johnson & Golombek (2011). The seven components of analyses within the two Theoretical

Frameworks that were found when answering the RQs are then summarized and all three analyses (Examination of the RQs; Analysis Two and Analysis Three) are linked to the overall genre of subject, subjectivities and Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* as well as a discussion on the importance of how narratives supported the teacher participants in their own L2 learning classrooms. ***Chapter 5 Discussions*** discusses the findings of the study within relevant areas of scholarship and contributes to the ongoing discourse in the field. Limitations of the present study as well as theoretical, methodological, and pedagogical implications are also presented here. My ***Closing Remarks*** end the dissertation.

2. Literature Review

Theoretical Considerations and Literature Review

In this chapter, I review a synthesis of scholarship drawn from the interrelated aspects of the current study and present them in nine sections: 2.1 begins with an overview of Vygoskian Theory as distinguished from the view of the "Sociocultural Turn" and the separation of SCT from Vygotsky's "earlier work" to his "later work" as posited by Valsiner (2009) and González Rey (2009); 2.2. gives an overview of the "Stages in the Mastering of Mind" developed by Vygotsky maintaining that "the cultural development of the child goes through phases: 1928p, pp, 68-71; 1929, pp. 424 – 8; 1931n/1983, pp. 250-1; Vygotsky and Luria, 1930a, pp. 200-9" (in van der Veer & Valsiner, 1991), setting the stage for the current study. This is followed by 2.3 that begin by giving background of the specific sequence of events behind the findings giving a prelude to Imagined Destinations covered in 2.3.1. 2.4 discuss the obstacles encountered by the participants and how they transform into Subjective Alternatives within participants environments. 2.5 talk about the Agentive Roles of the participants that show up as multiple subjective actions. 2.6 present the role of emotion, specifically the mediation of the Unity of Affect and Intellect that ignite cognitive processes and act as stabilizing forces. 2.7 discuss how the participant teachers' narrative reflections regarding their Imagined Destinations and trajectories during their acquisition of English support their current conceptions of language learning and language teaching as well as how they transfer those reflections to their classrooms (see these seven constructs in Lists of Tables and Figures Table 1 and Table 2). 2.8 illumines a short discussion on deficit perspectives and approaches in L2 education displaying their ill effects

to the L2 learner, which accounts for the initial reason Norton's constructs were contradistinguished. Finally, 2.9 features an Introduction to my historical record in Panamá and an overview of English in the country before this study was conceived. A brief account of a study of progress made by learners and a follow-up done with teachers in Panamá prior to this dissertation research is briefly introduced and used to back up claims made in SCT and Teacher Development in 5.3 of the Discussion section of the dissertation. This final section continues with data collection and analysis that were accomplished while I was living in Panama.

Chapter 2 ends with the conclusions from the work done with teachers and L2 learners from 2008 – 2010 which will be used again in Chapter 5, discussing the Implications of those findings for Pedagogy (5.2.2).

2.1 Vygotskian Theory since the 2000s

Since the Turning of the Tides in the early to mid- 2000s, the Vygotskian theoretical frameworks conceptualized from the field of psychology have grown in popularity in the West. Although Vygotsky's work was developed in the early 1900s and ended with his untimely death in 1934 of Tuberculosis at the age of 37, the ideas within his insightful, yet unfinished works have unfolded in the United States in the last fifteen-twenty years. Early in his career, Vygotsky searched for ways to connect complex psychical unities to personality and motivation that could be used as the driving forces of human behavior. Those systemic categories were developed in order to comprehend the human psyche (in González Rey, 2009, p.62). However, Vygotsky's work is vast and complex and many of his concepts are "seeds of the ideas Vygotsky developed" suggesting that

…even with reserves of genius working in his favor, he was in the formative stages of developing the blueprint for a comprehensive psychology of human development in its cultural-historical context" (Smagorinsky, 2012, p. 321).

Vygotsky's studies originally focused on the mental processes of the individual, and later shifted to the mediation of tools within the environment. Sociocultural theory (SCT) more popularly grounds itself in the dominant Western interpretations, which are according to González Rey (2009) the "second moment of Vygotsky's work emphasizing semiotic mediation, signs, tools and internalization… ignoring the involvement of those [earlier found] processes and tools in the functioning of the psychical system as a whole" (pp. 62-63).

Valsiner (2009) further discusses an effort to organize cultural psychologists into 'two camps' – cultural-historical and sociocultural theory (Matusov, 2008a, 2008b). Both were commenced by Vygotsky in several different phases of his life and career; both remained unfinished. González Rey (2009) furthers this idea by arguing that the second movement of Vygotsky's work which emphasizes "semiotic mediation, signs, tools and internalization" has been "reified" by the West, while "the involvement of those processes and tools in the functioning of the psychical system as a whole" (p. 63) have been ignored. Valsiner (2009) continues to say "that the major distinguishing characteristic between these two perspectives is the relationship to the notion of hierarchy in the implicit or explicit theoretical models" (p.14), which certainly alters the conversation.

It is important to note that although this dissertation began in ideas of the mediation of the environment, this dissertation developed to more closely relate its theoretical analyses and

findings to the "second moment of Vygotsky's work," eventually this dissertation took root in the cultural historical stages of Vygotsky's earlier work involving the psychical system.

2.2 Stages of Mastering the Mind

To continue this conversation, as it has developed, "Vygotsky had different moments in his written works" (Valsiner, 2009).These are discussed temporally as different "blending of ideas from his written works in different times" (p. 60). Vygotsky's important reflections in these particular works (especially in the beginning) had to do with emotions, personality, fantasy and the generative capacity of the mind. During this time, according to van der Veer and Valsiner (1991), "in the [earlier moments] years that he was developing cultural-historical theory," Vygotsky developed the "Stages in the Mastering of Mind" (p. 237). The particular theoretical underpinnings of cultural-historical theory is where I located the belief that successful L2 learners begin their language goals (identities) in Imagined Destinations that begin internally: that is, as a part of the psyche and as a form of the systemic organization of the person within their imaginations. According to these stages of mind, they are at first mediated in the environment naively and later deliberately. When examining these four phases, each in their own way, the subjects' own unique personalities and subjective selves are highlighted. Subjectivities here are neither passive nor are they simply reflections of their environments - subjectivities are active, dynamic and produce outcomes that cannot be entirely inferred from the external circumstances where human actions take place (González Rey, 2011, p.47). Subjectivities are "a complex human production within which, collateral effects, consequences, facts, and subjective configurations of the individuals and those social spaces [where] they live combine into a recursive and complex subjective network" (González Rey, 2009, p. 65).

According to Valsiner and van der Veer (1999) this original generative nature and control of human emotions were identified by Spinoza: he posited these stages as "man seeking a way … to control his passions… emphasiz[ing] the mind's capacity to understand" and make meaning. These stages are evident in the self-determination and eventual success of all the participant cases tracing from the pilot study, and now again in the teachers' narratives of the eight Panamánian teachers. Specifically put, when the intellect becomes metacognitively aware of its passions, "it gradually learns to control them" (Valsiner and van der Veer (1999, p.240).

Vygotsky describes the First Stage of "Mastering of Mind" as natural or primitive behavior coming from the idea of subject and subjectivities. In this phase, "subjects (children) rely on their natural mental processes, hence, where we see the personality of the child manifesting. In the second phase, the child combines his/her own mental processes combining now with the cultural resources and social processes available to them… always fluid, "deeply singular" --- (Moll, 2014, p. 98). In this second stage, there is a connection between the outside world that interfaces with the mental, but this connection is not fully understood (van der Veer & Valsiner 1991, p. 237) by the subject (child). In this phase, for example, a child will "naively" use a picture to associate with a word even when there is no connection between the two because they are relying on the link (connection) to be there, even if there is none. In this stage a child may draw a picture and tell a story about the picture that has nothing to do with what they've drawn; however, they make the drawing fit within their own storytelling. According to van der Veer and Valsiner (1991) in this stage a child will "simply read aloud what they understand to be the content of the picture and assume that it will coincide with the words to be remembered" (p. 237).

These initial phases of "Mastering of Mind" are described in Vygotsky's work as transitory stages that come before the phase of the "external use of cultural means". In the third and fourth stages, the external use of instruments is replaced by "internal mental activity" (van der Veer & Valsiner, 1991, p. 238) that suddenly (eventually) coincides with the outside world. In my cases that indicated earlier ages of onset into English (0-8), these two beginning phases were witnessed by the participants' acceptance of the goals declared by their parents and families, no matter how difficult or illogical. This initial, blind acceptance of the parent's goals was later taken on in lead roles by the participants.

These stages that were developed in the years that (Vygotsky) was developing cultural-historical theory explain (in my interpretation) how Imagined Destinations begin internally and follow phases. These stages are actually "man seeking a way … to control his passions… emphasiz[ing] the mind's capacity to understand" and make meaning (van der Veer & Valsiner, 1991), which can be seen in the self-determination and eventual success of the cases in both the pilot study and in the teachers' narratives, which will be discussed in the Findings section (Chapter 4).

Specifically put, when the intellect becomes metacognitively aware of its passions, 'it gradually learns to control them', which leads perfectly into the next two sections (2.2- 2.3) introducing Imagined Destinations.

2.3 A Prelude to Imagined Destinations

As discussed earlier, a tension that began in the pilot study in 2014 manifested into a second study developed to answer tensions due to unanswered questions. By creating new

research questions and proposing a new study, I found that the original tensions created earlier were answered in Moll's works and Gonzalez; interpretation. In these works I found theoretical frameworks with distinguished and answered certain questions. One glaring gap in the context of imagined communities posited by Norton (2013) comes from a view that is externally located: participants seek a community outside of their own to join in order to fill the exigencies (deficiencies) in their language learning worlds, unlike Imagined Destinations that begin in the internal psyche due to participants cultural historical origins eventually mediated in the environment creating subjective alternatives to meet the changing needs to achieve their goals. This is pointed out by Norton (2013):

> Through human agency, language learners who struggle to speak from one identity position may be able to reframe their relationship with others and claim alternative, more powerful identities from which to speak, read or write, thereby enhancing language acquisition (p.3).

My subjects in the pilot and now in the teacher studies were not coming from places of struggling to speak, and did not need to "claim more powerful identities," which is how I interpret the quote above. In fact, the participants were coming from empowered places, speaking from their historical ontologies. They faced obstacles along the way; however, they met those potential deterrents with their own agencies and generative potential to transform their environments to overcome exigencies.

Likewise, seeing all L2 learners as coming from a place of needing to claim alternative, more powerful identities and communities are a potentially narrow view of a second language learner. Although this paradigm does fit with numerous studies and cases done under this view

(Norton, 2001; Kanno and Norton, 2003; Pavlenko & Norton, 2007; Norton & Gao, 2008; Norton, 2013) and could be posited as potentially reverberating in some of the teachers' narratives, this paradigm neither gives a full picture of every learner, or every context, nor does it tell the full story as I found when I investigated my cases from cultural-historical theoretical frameworks.

Finally, within the context of imagined communities coming from Benedict Anderson's context of persons finding allegiance to a government, political party, etc., "community" metaphorically is a different context from which the NNESTs are coming (for instance). In fact, when I look at my subjects in this context, I could tell they liked their lives, their first languages and their first cultures and were not trying to find better or alternative communities. The teachers were living in Panamá and had no desire to leave and to join a new community. The Panamánian subjects were simply wanting to learn a language via their own predilections and chose to learn English either because of their parent's wishes, or because, as declared by Zittoun (2008), "every activity is … undertaken by a person, actively making sense of a situation… its goals" quite often, not even noticing"…why (in Valsiner, 2009, p. 15).

Being a part of a community means that the person has interest in furthering the community's aims, and play a part in that community. But what I posit this conversation is leaving out are the people around the globe that really do not have any interest in being a part of America, Britain, Australia, or any other English speaking place (region). Some ELLs instead simply have a proclivity toward the language, or perhaps they see the language as an investment for their futures. Moll's (2014) Veronica, a case that will be discussed later in the dissertation, wanted to teach her little sister English; in the case of my participants historically from Barbados, there was a desire to keep a part of their historical origins intact, to preserve their identities, and

their cultural heritage in keeping English as their first language in a monolingual, Spanish speaking place. There is also the case of Blexi who wanted to travel; Sonya, who liked the language and felt challenged by it, and Yari who wanted to ameliorate or "fix" her bad teachers, so on and so forth (more stories will be elaborated throughout the dissertation). Therefore, on behalf of those teachers and global citizens who really do not want to be a part of an English language community as such, I raise the question: why did these teachers (L2 learners in the Pilot) work so hard to learn English and more importantly, why were they a part of a very small number of persons in Panamá to become successful, fluent English language learners? Where did their success begin, and where did those initial (propensities, proclivities) stem from?

To further this discussion, I would like to bring in one other final (potential) difference in Norton's constructs. As discussed by Valsiner (2009) concerning the fragmentation in the field of empirical research (in psychology). He says there has been

> [An] effort to organize cultural psychologists into two camps – cultural-historical and socio cultural may stand out from the multitude of wasteful debates by including a kernel of basic assumptions. It turns out that the major distinguishing characteristic between these two--- otherwise rather overlapping perspectives is the relationship to the notion of hierarchy in the implicit or explicit theoretical models (p. 14).

As he continued, and as mentioned earlier in the Introduction, due to the "reification of Vygotsky's second work" which had more to do with having been "overlooked by the dominant Western interpretations of his work" (p. 62) González Rey (2009) further declares

> there has been a strong tendency to reify the second moment of Vygotsky's work, emphasizing semiotic mediation, signs, tools and internalization as the mature

> accomplishments of his work, ignoring the involvement of those processes and tools in the functioning of the psychical system as a whole" (p. 63).

This research is not interested in the "periodization" of Vygotsky's work; however, there is an intention to clarify the complexities and "mixes of ideas" within Vygotsky's work transpiring into different theoretical meaning. The aim of this research to untangle the brilliance of Vygotsky's many different theoretical written works. Therefore, with this background locating the "context" of this dissertative work, I introduce Imagined Destinations.

2.4 Imagined Destinations (IDs)

As aforementioned, my pilot study research that began in 2014 to locate Norton's (2013) concepts of imagined identity, imagined community and investment, found root in a fourth realm that is more deliberate and focused on a specific destination (goal, subjectivities) in the person's imagination that supports the person's feelings, views of themselves, and their environments. My first case and the teacher narratives are more closely situated in the work of Moll (2014), González Rey (2011), Stetsenko (2008), González (2005), van der Veer and Valsiner (1991) and Zinchenko (2002) which all examine self-determination, subjectivity, and subjective configurations as components of self-determinism.

I stipulate that it is the learners' deliberate proclivity for English, stemming from their Imagined Destinations [hereafter IDs], that shows up as a "consciousness" within the person that supports, indeed scaffolds, the journey to fluency in the additional language. Because of their IDs, their English fluency evolves from self-determination (power) that cross-pollinates (naturally, ecologically) into their desired places – those environments being shaped and

reshaped over time within their environments (social). In turn, these Imagined Destinations continue to encourage, by the participant's active attention to the goal within their imagination, the agency needed to support their desired outcomes. I see these contradictions between consciousness and activity, as originally theorized by Vygotsky and interpreted by Moll (2014); González Rey (2007, 2009, 2011), and again by Zinchenko (2002) as what drives these individual's development within real life trajectories as a result of their IDs. Moll (2014) and González Rey (2011) explain this phenomenon in reference to subjective configurations that "contribute to the production of the people they will become" (Moll, 2014, p. 98). Subjectivity is spoken of as a concept discussed by Vygotsky before the "reification of relational and social practices" (González Rey, 2009, p. 62), which brings these concepts, not well developed in the West, to the forefront.

Imagined Destinations within a cultural-historical approach, is related to motivation and personality. Vygotsky developed an idea from L. Feuerbach's idea that "there is a consciousness for consciousness and a consciousness for existence" (in van der Veer & Valsiner, 1991). Leonteov highlighted "three principal elements of consciousness: the sensory fabric of image, meaning and sense" (in Zinchenko, 2015, p. 54), which gives a view of the sequence I refer to in this study. Imagined Destinations begins as a consciousness via the person's own propensity toward their own cultural historical records to make sense of their worlds.

In an aim to continue to uncover the opacity in second language fluency, I studied the narrative stories created in the pilot study to find the generative power experienced in those tales to fluency. From the teachers' success poses a burning question that sought to answer by finding out why some L2 learners succeed despite "inequitable worlds in which learning take

place" (Norton & McKinney, 2011). This research (IDs), as stated earlier (in 1.3), "smudges" the perception that societal power outweighs the "emergent and agentive roles of individuals as active molders of [their lives]" as indicated by Moll (2014, p.99) and furthered by Stetsenko (2008) González Rey (2009, 2011) and other contemporary researchers. By looking at IDs from the self, or subject that lie in the minds and imaginations, internally; self-determination takes on multiple roles, a process that is furthered by Moll (2014) and González Rey (2009, 2011) as "a combination of the self (subject), and subjectivities" entwining within the unity of the affect and the intellect within *vivencias.* According to my research, their IDs follow a process which may contain a power that is separate from their own social circumstance. Referring back again to Stetsenko and Arievitch (2004), I find the concept of self as a "leading activity" beseeching recognition as an emerging entity, clearly capturing a more accurate view, not only of what the self "is", but also what the self is "capable of" in relation to the broader society to which it engages. It is this "self" that I name Imagined Destinations, which breeds within the internal imagination. The concept of imagination by Vygotsky is clearly defined (as cited in Moll, 2014, p. 94):

> Imagination takes on a very important function in human behavior and human development. It becomes the means by which a person's experience is broadened, because he can imagine what he has not seen, can conceptualize something from another person's narration and description of what he himself has never directly experienced, but can venture far beyond these boundaries, assimilating, with the help of his imagination someone else's historical or social experience. In this form, imagination is

> completely essential condition for almost all human, mental activity. --Vygotsky, 1967/2004b, p. 17

As discussed by Moll (2014), imagination in Vygotsky's work takes a "form of child consciousness, a central characteristic of schooling and of how children come to control their minds" (p. 94). Moll also refers to this work in her view that imagination is a very important function in human behavior that broadens the narrow boundaries of the child. Moll quotes Vygotsky: "with the help of his imagination [the child can take on] someone else's historical or social experience"; in this form, "imagination is a completely essential condition for almost all human mental activity" (Moll, 2014, p. 94). Therefore, imagination is a power that is used by all of us, no matter what place or position we are born into the world and is thereby available to be used for all human development.

González Rey (2009) also speaks of Vygotsky's work re how personality and imagination show the "higher psychological functions departing from psychical system functioning… between 1928-1931, thereby, topics like emotions, fantasy, personality and imagination in fact disappeared from his analysis of the functions between 1928-1931" (p. 63). González Rey further discusses how some of Vygotsky's strongest contemporaries like "Bakhtin and Shpet, never separate signs from the complex subjective characteristics of the individual, nor from the social contexts within which action takes place" (González Rey, 2009, p. 63).

This gap in the literature regarding Vygotsky's work, as discussed by González Rey, is another area that my research has the potential to shed light upon – giving a view of "where" the resiliency and the Agentive Roles played by the participants in the narratives rendered their

subjective goals and self-determination, which is not widely discussed in the literature. *Imagination*, according to Vygotsky, is a place that sets the stage to understand how a goal can be conceptualized even if s/he has never had access or experience, but simply borrows the ideas from another person in his/her own unique way and interpretation as when he says, "can conceptualize something from another person's narration and description of what he himself has never directly experienced, but can venture far beyond these boundaries, assimilating, with the help of his imagination someone else's historical or social experience" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b, p. 17: as cited in Moll, 2014).

Finally, in my experiences working with successful L2 students and FL/SL teachers, and again in these narrative retellings, I found that very explicit descriptions and organized senses of learners' own directions to successfully acquire the target language could be evoked by asking the right questions. These retellings of the journeys in individual persons recurrently find a "hidden power" within *vivencias* as discussed throughout the remaining chapters of this dissertation. Consequently, the term Imagined Destinations is more closely defined as a goal (destination) in the minds of the individual that generates potential to organize and orchestrate successful language learners' roads to fluency specifically connected to their emotions and predilections for acquisition that transformed their environments into successful L2 trajectories.

In summation then, in reference to Norton's positioning of second language learners as aspiring to "imagined communities that are not immediately tangible and accessible with whom we connect through the power of the imagination" (Norton, 2013, p. 3) that I find structured systems emerging from the psyche showing up as self-determination, that show real ways within lived experiences create the provisions needed by actively seeking, in their own worlds, access to

the language through the transformation of their sometimes *inadequate worlds* in order to achieve success language fluency that leads to the next source of analysis described in 2.4.

2.5 Obstacles Turned into Subjective Alternatives: Construct Two (Analysis Two)

Continuing this conversation, González Rey (2011) says that Vygotsky's work introduces "a new theoretical representation of human development underscoring the self-regulatory movement of personality in the face of lived experiences leading to ruptures", and consequently, "the beginning of new development" (p. 2). In this research, the ruptures were recounted as obstacles transformed into developments within the learner, the family and even the environments to which they live. These obstacles that are somehow reassigned are explained by González Rey as subjective alternatives, *subversive* in relation to the dominant current social status, turning up as sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011). In an example from one of the teacher narratives, one female teacher turns an impossible situation in a rural part of Panamá to an advantage. Here, the teachers are described as horrible and there is little access to English speakers which somehow preempts her desire to get a scholarship to the US. This story reveals how an obstacle was transformed into an opportunity, which in turn changes into the "beginning of new development" for her both immediately and later in her career. Another example of this phenomenon, is when Nilsi, who was ridiculed by "mocking cousins" for her inability to speak English well, suddenly improved her ability immensely by "reading all the English books in the house" accelerating her fluency in English and therefore, relinquishing the obstacle through her own agentive role in the process. These obstacles turn into successful roads to fluency exemplifying the theory that Gonzales Rey introduced in the literature as "ruptures that turn into new development" in an individual, a family, school, and /or

society which are powerfully witnessed as possible contributions to language learning classrooms and teacher development as witnesses to generative potential within self-determination.

These examples (more examples to come) that began surfacing in the pilot study and narrative inquiry embody self-regulatory movement of personality in the face of *vivencias* to begin new development, time and again. Whether from Panamá, China, Vietnam, Mexico or the United States this new theoretical representation of human development was found in the narratives, which essentially locates the "tension" I felt, while only using Norton's constructs. For example, in the pilot study, Andi uses religion to gain access to English dialoguing; Tran uses honor students as role models to generate her own potential in the language, while concurrently in the teacher cases – Yari uses her dismay and anger at the bad teachers to employ a scholarship, Marcel uses a mirror, a dictionary or anything available in his environment catapulting from their Imagined Destinations in order to have access and attain success in the language.

IDs viscosity to transform obstacles, versus being defeated by them, expresses the internal friction to resist the flow of the natural environment, if that environment does not support reaching their goals in order "to create new realities … as is the basis of a psychology oriented to human creation rather than assimilation" (González Rey, 2011, p.11). Since making a decision implies that there are alternative choices to be considered, in such cases we want not only to identify as many of these alternatives as possible, but to also choose the one that best fits with our goals, objectives, desires, values, and so on (Harris, 1980), which according to this study, may often begin in a subject's imagination.

To further this discussion, González Rey's description of "subjective alternatives" is an interpretation of Vygotsky's work on cultural historical theory that as quoted before, sees "man master[ing] his own mental processes by introducing new, artificial elements into a situation" (in van der Veer & Valsiner, 1999, p. 239) by making choices to mollify deficiencies in the environment through transformations. Self-regulation of the individual shows successful learners' exemplary qualities as developing and making use of cognitive and social skills oriented toward goal attainment through interactions with their surrounding contexts.

Finally, within SCT, the major focus of self-regulation research is thus on the situated development of abilities to exert voluntary control over higher and culturally organized mental functions, such as focusing attention on a particular utterance or sign, purposefully planning an action, solving a problem, or selecting what to remember. It is from this vantage point that individuals self-regulate by exerting their own voluntary control over mental functions when they discover opportunities to advance in their surroundings, or by finding subjective alternatives to advance their development regardless of the social norms or materials offered due originally (potentially) from their Imagined Destinations within the subjective self. Therefore, the amazing resiliency and "subjective sense[s] that ha[ve] no rationality or system to predict" are the "confluence of a multiplicity of subjective senses and emotional states" --when in combination are stable and can be reliable (González Rey, 2002, p. 16). These active mediators in producing the agency needed to achieve the goals set in participants' Imagined Destinations, leads to the next section of the Literature Review (2.5) that discusses agency, particularly Agentive Roles played by the learners to achieve their goals.

2.6 The Agentive Role of the Learner

Agentive Roles played by the narrative cases in both studies are witnessed throughout the dissertation. Agentive Roles come from a "consciousness" discussed by Zinchenko (2002, p. 46) when he defends the generative character of the human psyche which he contends is a major theme of consciousness:

> Consciousness emancipates from activity and it begins to create new forms of activities to create the world and not only to reflect it… but precisely the contradiction between consciousness and activity as a driving force of human development" (in González Rey 2011, p. 36).

This affiliation between consciousness and activity as a driving force, as stated in González Rey (2011), "Zinchenko's oriented consciousness as an active and generative subjective system" not contingent upon external influences as a driving force (p. 36), was clearly witnessed in both the pilot and the teacher study. For example, Andi, originally from China, clearly found an Imagined Destination before he arrived to the US, as an exchange student living with an American family. It was this beginning predilection for English fluency that provided deliberate action, which continued into successful acquisition of the target culture and language. First, Andi used religion as a tool, and then he used "beating" or surpassing unkind classmates that made fun of him (personal interview, Andi, 2014) as another tool. Andi systematically combined his strong emotional drive with his intellect to exit English as a Second Language classes (ESL) successfully, specifically to leave behind his ridiculing classmates. Ultimately, Andi's deliberate rendition of the choices he made revealed specific destinations (goals) that supported the agency he needed as a non-English speaker in an English-speaking world -- step after step. Tran, another case, etched out certain high-achieving classmates within the vision of her being "just like them" in her

IDs. The agency she created by setting out to be another top student in her fifth grade classroom supported her success in creating role models (at first in her mind) and eventually friendships, which systematically delivered her into a subjective destination that grew and transformed into exactly what she saw and felt in her original Imagined Destination as an honor student, which she eventually attained.

These achievements were manifested within the "agentive roles that actively molded [and shaped their] li[ves]" (Stetsenko, 2008, p. 478). In the next section, there will be a brief overview of the construct of the Unity of Affect and Intellect in Vygotskian theory which is one of the seven theoretical constructs used for analysis in this study.

2.7 Unity of Affect and Intellect

Zaporozhets (1986, p. 283) argues that the *"Unity of Affect and Intellect"* helps to regulate the environmental conditions adequately, and as spoken by Zaporozhets. shows the "correction of the action adequate to the subjects' sense of what is being done with respect to the satisfaction [of] present need" (in González Rey, 2011, p. 45). According to Vygotsky it is only when there is a Unity of Affect and Intellect that a full realization of any form of activity can be guaranteed. Therefore, as gauged in the narrative analyses of the participants, the Unity of Affect and Intellect was the space where control of the emotions served the participants to correct actions adequate to the exigencies of the participants. As we continue to analyze the stories, we notice the participants' active participation in finding, mediating and/or creating

subjective alternatives[3] in their environments which show up as exigencies within their lives that needed to be corrected in order to achieve their goals. This unity is easily seen in Yari, one of the narrative participants who was so angry at her "horrible" English teachers. That emotion within *vivencias* caused turbulence within her psyche that needed amelioration. She retells in her autobiographical narrative how, after having awful English teachers and very little fluency in English (because of them), she pursued and obtained a scholarship to the US where she met Teacher Cody whom she adored and she considered a "great" English teacher. This example of how the unity of affect and intellect, combined with the creation of subjective alternatives, *subversive* in relation to the dominant current social status, turned up as sub-alternates that embody emotion and helped Yari self-regulate "[her] personalit[y] at the moment of … living a concrete experience or series of experiences" (González Rey, 2011, p. 2). This story and others like them continue in the Findings chapter of the dissertation.

To further explain these phenomena, also noted in the Introduction (pp. 14-15), González Rey (2009) discusses the introduction of *perezhivanie* by Vygotsky, which Moll borrows from (Rodriguez Arocho, 2009) as *vivencias* in Spanish (Moll, 2014, p. 104). "The problem of the environment," according to Van der Veer and Valsiner (1994), was why this term was introduced and then explained by Vygotsky:

> The emotional experience [*perezhivanie*] arising from any situation or from any aspect of environment, determines what kind of influence this situation or this environment will have on the child. Therefore, it is not any of the factors in themselves (if taken without

[3] Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011).

> reference to the child) which determines how they will influence the future course of his development, but the same factors refracted thought the prism of the '*perezhivanie'* (Vygotsky, 1994, p. 339-34-: in González Rey, 2009, p. 68-69)

The next section joins Johnson and Golombeck (2011) and other theorists in a discussion of why the narrative analysis in teacher reflection serves as an important tool in Pre and In-service teacher education. The functions of analysis used by Johnson and Golombeck to evaluate the effectiveness of using narratives in teacher development will be discussed in the next section.

2.8 Narrative Analysis (background for Analysis Three)

Due to the unfinished work stemming from the work of Vygotsky on self, the place I reference throughout this dissertation – that undecided place central to Vygotskian SCT theory that is more clearly seen from an 'active transformative stance' suggests that people "come to know themselves and their world as well as [become] human in and through the processes of collaboratively transforming the world in view of their own goals" (Stetsenko, 2008, p.471). The view of self in Vygotsky's cultural historical theoretical framework is another wave that is now interwoven in the literature, and which was identified in the original voices heard in the pilot study and that continued in the narrative voices and self-determination of the Panamánian teachers. Therefore, this gap in the literature to determine where the success of these participants comes from—internally or externally situated is one that needs to be filled. And perhaps, even more importantly in light of L2 Teacher Development is how we capture this success, self-determination, and propensity for learning a second language for all learners?

When Canagarajah (2012) introduced auto ethnographic renditions of his own experiences learning and teaching English in Sri Lanka saying that the act of composing the narrative enabled him to explore his "hidden feelings, forgotten motivations, and suppressed emotions" (p. 265), I was reminded of the expressive voices I found first in the pilot study and then again in the Panamanian teachers' autobiographical retellings. By furthering the cultural historical view, we can embrace the notion that teacher learning is social, situated in physical and social contexts, and distributed across persons, tools, and activities, thus creating an additional challenge for L2 teacher education to redraw the boundaries that have typically defined professional development (Johnson, 2006, p. 213). Asking teachers the right questions to guide their own quests to find their imagined selves, that can then lead their own trajectories from their meta-awareness, might very well serve to unwrap histories, cultures, and developmental influences that support the new boundary configurations spoken of by Johnson (2006). Teacher awareness of how their epistemologies cause self-determination, growth and development, as shown in both the study done in 2010 with the teachers in Panamá (in 2.8), as well as the narrative retelling, examined in this dissertation

Lucas and Villegas (2013) make recommendations to investigate teacher identity as a tool to be implemented in pre-service education that prepares novice teachers to examine their beliefs about and visions of linguistic diversity as a valuable resource. The more we open up teachers to their own ideologies, the more these linguistically responsive teachers can be recognized and can also be made aware of their own pathways to language learning as a way to "promote trust of teachers by students and heightened expectations of students by teachers." (p. 104).

The Kanno and Stuart (2011) study found that one year of teaching was long enough for the two novices to identify what aspects of teaching constituted the core of their teacher identities. They were able to improve and enhance their confidence as teachers further supporting them in justifying the teacher authority they were supposed to command, while their emerging identities, in turn, shaped their classroom practices (p. 249). Kanno and Stuart argue for more research and studies to "include a deeper understanding of L2 teachers' identity development in the knowledge base of L2 teacher education" (p. 249). Again, by asking the right questions, self-efficacy emerges from teachers' ontological records, cultures and lived experiences. When applied to their classrooms as inspirations for their students, teachers' stories, as shown in findings from the teacher research done in Panamá in 2010 (see Chapter 4) and also again in the 2015 analysis done with Panamánian teachers in this dissertation research supports student learning.

Again, the idea that identity formation is central to L2 teacher development has major implications in terms of what fundamental questions we should ask in L2 teacher education opportunities urged by Freeman & Johnson (1998). The findings by Kanno and Stuart continue to envision the integration of the knowledge of language teaching as it is intertwined and developed within the context and contents of teacher identity. They specifically argue that "[k]nowledge acquisition is part of this development, not the other way around" (Kanno & Stuart, 2011, pp. 249 – 250). In a prior study done in Panamá (2010), similar findings were uncovered when asking what made a difference in the listening and speaking scores of English Panamánian students I worked with (further elaborated on in 2.8.3) over a two year span. The results of these studies indicated that teachers' knowledge of their own language and teacher

identity encouraged their feelings of empowerment as they knew they were making a difference in the success of their students. Also found is that continual reflection of teachers' own practices as compared with other teachers' in the field, caused further meta-awareness. When asked what made a difference in their teaching, one teacher declared: "Exchange of different activities among teachers" and "talks and seminars to improve our teaching skills and language proficiency" (such as pronunciation)… helped me a lot" (See Appendix G: Panamá Survey Responses). These developments are important keys to unlocking how to integrate knowledge of language teaching and learning intertwined within the context and contents of teacher identity in professional development.

To summarize this section, we look to Dewey (1933), who more than half a century ago characterized learning as " intellectual tools of inquiry as a means by which humans make experience educative" vs. "common insights concerning the character of academic work and students' performance on tasks" (Doyle, 1983, p. 166). When we ask teachers how they teach and we learn of the spark that inspires them, we find intellectual 'tools of inquiry' that began in the 1990s and continues to prevail in the turn and progress of this century; above all, as found out in my prior work with Panamánian teachers, when teachers themselves perceive that they can affect and influence their lives and the lives of their students they are empowered and inspired, which consequently affects their students' learning success. This constructionist paradigm looks at the L2 learner and NNES teachers as "whole," coming in with an array of talent, cultural artifacts and linguistic knowledge-- not as vessels to be filled or as a tabula rasa. When we label L2 teachers and learners as vessels to be filled, insight into their own teaching

and teacher identities is less likely to happen, leading me to an important conversation on deficit perspectives based in the literature.

2.9 Deficit Perspectives

When reading the first two vignettes (in Chapter 4, 4.2), the reader will notice that the narrative stories have intertwining themes. Both participants come from poor families and both parents do not have college degrees. Their families were from similar rural poverty "situatedness," which was openly acknowledged throughout their narratives. These recurring salient issues bring to light how reframing their relationships to and with poverty served as motivation and desire to succeed. The noticeable issue of poverty then, served as a catalyst to achieve. Thus, their success had as much to do with their disadvantages, not in spite of them. This conclusion becomes an interesting finding to challenge not only the way schools look at the "poor" but also how we look at the Non Native English teacher teaching English as their second language.

Instead of seeing successful language learners into English from a marginalized place, this research notices the agency and the power that comes from these eight Panamánian teachers' subjective choices and predilections for Imagined Destinations into English (Spanish) that transform them within their environments from one place to the next within successful cultural and language acquisition. Also distinctive is that these narrative analyses examine these cases first by focusing on the language learners, and then transfer the stories of those English trajectories into their roles as L2 teachers and administrators of English as a foreign language in Panamá.

Harklau (2000) reveals “how individual teachers [that] adopt societal and institutional discourses that lead them to position students in particular ways, ultimately influencing [L2]writers’ (learners) own self-conceptions and their actions, in turn re-construct their identities”(in Tardy, 2015, p. 10). Harklau’s (2000) ethnographic case study that follows three refugee students in the US as they transitioned from high school to college classrooms, furthered this notion of how the identity label of “ESOL student” was variously constructed in these different spaces: “good students” in one context and “problem students” in another” (p. 10). Harklau discusses how these identity labels stereotype the learner. Therefore, how we frame students and also when we as educators do not recognize diversity and the historical and ontological record they bring to our classrooms as the subjective power and identity of the learner to control and produce positively, the results belittle and demean. Harklau argues that not representing the L2 learner as multifaceted, and ever changing, and because these “labels” are out of “conscious awareness, the tendency to accept representation as unchanging and self-evident” (Harklau, 2000, p. 37) are accepted not only by the society (school, teachers), but also the L2 learners themselves. The acceptance of these learners as static and homogeneous sets them up for failure and the results are the opposite of any goal determined for them to succeed.

As previously discussed, Vygotskian’s thought on cognition come from the concept of self-regulation is tightly linked to context. Self-regulated learning emerges and develops regardless of the socioeconomic background of the learner. Vygotsky, within the SCT framework, only discusses how essential the mediation of the environment is to learning. Self-regulation of the individual, then, re-conceptualizes successful learners' exemplary qualities to a social process where they develop and make use of certain cognitive and social skills oriented toward goal

attainment through interactions with their surrounding contexts. Within a sociocultural theoretical framework, the major focus of self-regulation research is thus on the situated development of abilities to exert voluntary control over higher and culturally organized mental functions, such as focusing attention on a particular utterance or sign, purposefully planning an action, solving a problem, or selecting what to remember. Thus individuals self-regulate by exerting their own voluntary control over mental functions if and when they are given those opportunities.

This research similarly posits the power of the Imagined Destinations of three L2 learners and eight Panamánian teachers; their Imagined Destinations contain vivencias, or "lived experiences" as another way of showing expression of their subjectivities, subjective configurations within their predilections for their second language English to mediate their additional language learning goals in concert with the environments to which they come live and work. González et al. (2005) defines and frames these cultural and socially rich possibilities within the repertoire of second language learners as "Funds" which places Vygotsky's famous work into a contemporary context. When these cultural artifacts are judged negatively by societies that do not share or understand them – the effects are potentially debilitating.

González, Moll, and Amanti's (2005) work that looks to the "whole child," the family, the culture and the community in order to unwrap and embellish the historical knowledge the child (learner) brings to the classroom, figuratively looks to "big bags of jewels" that are historically embedded. If this knowledge is ignored, the self-regulation of the learner is taken away, reducing their chance to imagine and create their own controls over higher culturally organized mental functions. These eight teachers' tales, in turn, not only bring in their stories as personal,

ontological records of their L2 success, they also show proofs that these journeys inspire not only them, but also their students.

In the next section, I locate the history of the English language in Panamá. Panamá has had a relationship with the Americas since Columbus' coming in 1492, which opened a new era where institutions and customs from many European countries contended to become the dominant force in different parts of the "New World". More recently, my own history of the English language in Panamá commenced with my teaching in a private school in 2007, and then again as a Senior Fellow in 2008 – 2010. These trajectories relay important aspects of my life's work that identify artifacts of my ontological record in order to give the reader important pieces of my identity and epistemology of English language learning and teaching in the country.

2.10Background Information on Panamá and ELF Program

Figure 1 - Map of Panamá

For centuries, English speaking has been accomplished in Panama. As told by Winston Malcolm (2011), in 1572 Sir Francis Drake and his men were communicating in English on Panamánian soil. English privateer William Parker and his men also operated on the isthmus; and, in 1601 they captured the Spanish colonial town of Portobello on Panamá's Atlantic coast.

In more recent times other private enterprises (such as Chiquita Bananas and other businesses surrounding tourism and/or trade) lived on the Caribbean islands and parts of Central America's Caribbean coast including the Bocas Del Toro region of (Arauz, Panamá 2007).

The next significant group of English speaking people to live in Panama and affect its language habits came from the United States. Starting in the 1840s, operations of the Pacific Mail company brought many English-speaking people to the isthmus. The numbers of US citizens and other English-speaking individuals transiting through the country dramatically increased with the California Gold Rush and the building of the Railroad during the early 1850's. English speaking workers from the Caribbean islands also came to during Panamá the construction of this historic railroad. As told by Malcolm (2011), "the Star and Herald, first E Panamá's English newspapers appeared to satisfy the needs of the growing English speaking population" (p.3). In the late 1880's and early 1890's more English speaking people came from the Caribbean islands to work with the French on two failed attempts on the Panamá Canal, and then again with the US creation of large banana plantations in the Bocas del Toro province. With the help of large numbers of workers from the Caribbean, a distinct English dialect persists to be spoken to this day (Malcolm, 2011, p. 4).

In the 1900s, Dr. Arnulfo Arias Madrid (August 15, 1901 – August 10, 1988), a Panamánian politician, doctor, writer became the president of Panamá on three occasions: 1940–41, 1949–51, and for 10 days in October 1968. During both of his initial terms, Madrid outlawed the use of English. Patricia, one of the cases in the dissertation research from a Caribbean background, referred to this period as a time when "the president was sending back parents and their kids that came from Barbados because he did not want anybody to speak English" (Patricia 2, 2015). In addition to this turbulence over the English language and cultures in Panamá, in the 1950's there were demands for the United States to hand over the then-occupied canal and "canal zone" back to Panamá. The unrest culminated in riots on January 9, 1964, when about 20 Panamanians and several U.S. soldiers were killed. The Torrijos-Carter Treaties in 1974 were the negotiations toward a settlement of the Panamá Canal that began a decade later. On September 7, 1977 the treaty was signed by Carter and Torrijos and gained control of the Canal for the first time in its history.

After these intermittent, very dramatic periods of English invasion, domination and exploration, Spanish only/No English periods existed. Due to the Panamá Canal release of power (from being controlled by the US government/Torrijos/Carter agreements) new laws to establish English as a second language with the purpose of eventually rendering Panamá a bilingual country regained momentum. Since the late seventies and eighties, the public and private education system has attempted to integrate English into the school day of its students in a country where Spanish is the dominant language. Clearly, it has been a slow road to multilingualism in Panamá; although, as stated earlier, there has consistently existed a Creole English that was brought to the isthmus with the Caribbean population as well as indigenous

sectors which do speak "other" languages. Consequently, much of Panamá's history has been linked to Spanish and English as the two sources of social activity and economic expansion.

2.10.1 My Historical Beginnings in Panamá

As stated by Valsiner (1991), with regard to Vygotsky's work, "to understand any complex human phenomenon we have to reconstruct its most primitive and simple forms – in other words, to study its history" (p. 189). When my journey began in Panamá in 2007, I knew that speaking English had become an important mandate by the Panamánian government in 2003. I also knew that there had been times when English had been badly regarded by the government. Such as in early 2004, and specifically up until 2009, English-teaching was mandated from kindergarten through elementary school for a limited time per day. In secondary schools, English was offered; this depended on the school and students; own interest and pursuit of the language. The Panamánian government began a powerful initiative with a program called English for Life (EL) in 2004 that had a trained base of 300 plus EFL teachers and included roughly 25,000 students around the country for five consecutive years before the program collapsed when a new government was elected in 2008. The U.S. government, in support of this program brought in English Language Fellows (ELF) for various English initiatives over the years and especially in 2003 - 2008 to support the English for Life project.

As my Senior Fellowship Project, I requested to start a Center for English language learning. With the help of a seed grant awarded by the US Ambassador, the Center for English Language Immersion (CELI), as it was named by myself in partnership with my State Department counterpart, commenced. Administering CELI became one of my "other duties" besides working with EFL teachers and Institutions to support ELL around the country. As of 2015, CELI has

become an English language entity that houses the United States Information Service (USIS) Library, which includes a collection of English books and information; and, CELI also acts as an English Language Institute (ELI) partnering with local English affiliates and the American Embassy to support English in the country (go to www.celionline.com/ for details of the project). The next section I begin my historical beginning working in Panamá for a private school as an external consultant followed by a brief discussion regarding my acceptance into the English Language Fellow Program (ELF).

For more information about this project, see http://elprograms.org/fellow/ for details.

2.10.2 An ELF in Panamá

My direct intervention with Panamá began in 2007. Hired by the newly appointed Director of the International School of Panamá (ISP), I worked in a K-12 school to revamp their ESL "pull out" program. I had worked as an Internal Consultant with this same director at the Anglo American School (AAS) in Moscow, Russia, a year earlier for a much larger K – 12 schools. Based on the model I created and implemented during my time in Moscow, I was hired as an external consultant to support English language programming at ISP. This very elite Panamánian private school made me privy to how the children of the upper class Panamánians and upper income ex-patriots living in the country were educated. As Patricia, one of the teachers in the dissertation study reinforces, "English was just for the high society people, the ones that they would study in the USA" (Personal Interview, Patricia 1, 2015). Indeed, a majority of these students did, in fact, study abroad in foreign universities after high school. The Panamánian students that attend ISP enjoy an English curriculum in all subject areas and are taught by international teachers from the US, England, Canada and Australia (predominantly US and

Canada). All subject areas are taught in English and Spanish is also taught in the International Bachelorette (IB) high school program in other subjects as well. This discussion is mainly important due to its insight into my cultural historical understanding of Panamá's upper middle class education system. As an ELF my job primarily dealt with underprivileged students in the public education sectors.

After consulting for ISP, I decided to apply for the English Language Fellow (ELF) program in Panamá; although there were offerings in 80 plus other locations in the world. Due to my history working in the country, I felt drawn to expand my horizon in both the public and private sectors of education. I was awarded the fellowship and then served as a Senior Fellow for the Georgetown English Language Fellow (ELF) program housed and operating from *Universidad Latina*, supervised by the same persons currently running English Language Programs under the direction of President Varela and the Ministry of Education English projects. This entity acted as my Panamánian supervisor, and counterpart throughout the two term fellowship (2009 – 2011). I also partnered projects set forth by the American Embassy: CELI (English Language Learning Center) start-up and acting Project Manager; training teachers for the Access program. (See http://exchanges.state.gov/non-us/program/english-access-microscholarship-program for details of that project),

Officially named "The English Access Micro scholarship Program" (Access), this program for teacher development for Latina professors was led by me in the capital (Panamá City) and in neighboring cities with Latina branch universities. Access programs are funded by the American Embassy in partnership with local entities. They provide a foundation of English language skills to talented 13-20 year-olds from economically disadvantaged sectors of Panamá, through after-

school classes and intensive sessions. English skills that may lead to better jobs and educational prospects and also the ability to compete for and participate in future exchanges and study in the US are all a part of Access.

I have continued until the present day to work as a private consultant both advising and continuing the training of English teachers in Access and other entities to support Embassy and Ministry of Education initiatives. At the end of my terms (two consecutive ten month terms), I had worked with approximately 2,000 teachers, 1800 plus students, local universities around the country, Peace Corps Administration and Volunteers as well as TESOL to support English language learning in the country.

The primary objective that brought me there in September of 2008 was to evaluate the progress of the English for Life (EL) program in its final year of a five-year tenure, and to also educate already appointed teacher coaches working for EL to more effectively observe and evaluate fellow EFL teachers. I was also chosen to run the grant funded by the US government for the Access program (discussed above) in the country. When I commenced my work I was amazed at the enormity of the EL program. When I arrived, the program had grown to include a trained base of 300 plus English language teachers and it also included roughly 25,000 students around the country. Despite the size of this English language programming, there had been no testing of the program, which surprised me. There was also no official monitoring of the students' English language proficiency to measure their progress. The success of EL was gauged by its growth; it had indeed expanded its infrastructure over the five years; another gauging of success lay in anecdotal records of students getting jobs in Call Centers and other areas where English was needed. No formal evaluation if student progress had been done. It is this discussion

which leads me to the next section which gives some background research on educational practices in Panamá.

2.10.3 Teacher Development in Central America

Considering the past history of English in Panamá, and also in light of the many specialists and moneys supplied by the American government in English language programming, I was curious as to why these numerous attempts toward bilingualism were not apparent when I arrived as a Senior Fellow. Furthermore, cognizant that there had been no monitoring of language acquisition of the students over four plus years of the EL program, I wondered if the teachers had standard measurements to know where the students entered or exited the program, and their abilities. With that question in mind, I went to the literature and found that that in Latin American public education, the pre-service training that many teachers may have received "is likely to have been insufficient, or inadequate, or both" (Portes & Hoffman, 2003, p. 48). Thereby, rather than justifying training for teachers in the name of lifelong or continuous, the working hypothesis widely applied throughout the region comes from a perspective thought to "deliver or compensate for whatever teachers lack in terms of skills, motivation, or knowledge." According to Navarro (2000), training for teachers traditionally and typically delivered tends to treat the teacher in isolation, separate from the larger contexts of the classroom, school and community. In addition, for the most part, widespread adoptions of teacher training programs are rarely accompanied by dedicated efforts for monitoring and evaluation. More often than not, concrete decisions about what and how to deliver teacher training is fed by interest group preferences, or are shaped by weak assumptions and designs (Tattoo, Velez & Skyes, 1997). Teachers often receive training as a means of advancing in their

careers, or of satisfying a given legal requirement. I also witnessed these phenomena (aforementioned) as being very prevalent in teachers who attended teacher education workshops and summer trainings.

Every year, the teachers in Panamá must accomplish trainings in order to receive points. Without the points, there are consequences, such as in many instances training is treated in a superficial or a formalistic manner, simply to achieve this required and quite arbitrary point system necessary to advance in the system. Prevailing incentive structures lead teachers to accumulate diplomas or certificates rather than to acquire substantive education. Most importantly, in my impression, was that little, if any connection was made between the diploma or certificate received and the use of new skills or techniques in the classrooms. The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) promotes policies that will improve the economic and social well-being of people around the world. The OECD has provided a forum in which governments can work together to share experiences and seek solutions to common problems. As OECD pointed out in 1998 and again in 2000, teacher education in Latin America provides “little connection between the training they received and their classroom practices” (Portes & Kelley, 2003, pp. 45-46). Their statement matches my initial needs analysis: although there had been a great deal of training both by local and international teacher trainers, very little transference to the classroom was apparent.

When most of those same students (who were now in the Access program) were retested at the beginning of the following school year (on the LAS[4] proficiency test), the final analysis showed that the students' listening and speaking scores had improved and were now functioning at par with their reading and writing scores, thereby setting a positive path toward their language proficiency in English. A statistical difference of .05 was made from the prior testing done six to seven months earlier. With this win secured, the questions I next ventured to answer were, of course--how did we do it? These questions were asked so that our program could be reproduced in trainings for other teachers. In a country that had been working on English for five years consecutively in a program as large as English for Life, what difference had 20 months and a few projects later made? Hence, where the follow-up research ventured to find answers? The follow-up research described below reviews the results of the teacher narratives referenced earlier in this chapter and again in Chapter 5, (5.2).

The study done and literature had two findings. First, that professional development for teachers is very complex and multi-faceted, and also to point out that many factors that can contribute to teachers progress and development are malleable and supportable if done well as discussed by Kanno & Stuart (2011). My extensive work in Latin America and other parts of the globe raised my understanding that professional growth in Latin America (particularly Panamá) depends on the teachers' perception that the organization provides them opportunities to grow

---

[4] *Language Assessment Scale*: A popular test used for language proficiency. The identification of ELLs' language and academic needs is very important, because it becomes the basis for the development of a proper program of instruction. When ELLs' needs are not identified, their program may lack the instructional components necessary for their success in language proficiency and academic achievement. (from http://www.colorincolorado.org/educators/assessment/identification/)

and develop professionally, to continue to learn, and to expand their skills during their work in the school, or program. The teachers' increased status promotes professional respect and admiration that the teachers perceive that they can earn from their colleagues. Respect to the teacher is granted when the knowledge and expertise is demonstrated and used in support of each other. Self-efficacy refers to the teachers' perception that they are equipped with the skills and ability to help students learn, and are competent to develop meaningful and effective curricula. The feeling of mastery, in knowledge and in practice, is critical in the teachers' sense of self-worth. This worthiness supports them to make critical decisions related to their educational setting; thus, they feel empowered. This is according to teacher narratives collected alongside the LAS testing results (see Appendix H and Appendix I).

The success of these 100 students created a foundation and a goal for this dissertation: to learn how teachers' self-efficacy improves their teaching and learning results of their students. The findings of this study will be referred to in the Discussion in Chapter Five (5.3.3).

Unfortunately, the new government led by President Martineli (elected in 2008 until 2013) was less interested in education than building the country's infrastructure (roads, buildings, commerce). Learning English in Panamá took a back seat and the only real English done in the public schools was a continuation of programming with ninth and tenth graders through the Access Micro scholarship program and an eleventh and twelfth grade program done through the Ministry of Education. No results or monitoring of this program was done as far as I know after my departure as a Fellow.

2.10.4 Present Day: 2014-2015

Currently, under the direction of Panamá's new President Juan Carlos Varela, who began his Presidency on July 1, 2014, has a strong vision for Panamá as a bilingual Spanish-English country into which he launched his new education campaign: Panamá Bilingue. In light of broad participation in English trajectories in Panamá, I was invited back via the Varela initiative as one of several other consultants to accompany English language development and training in the country. Dr. Cardoze, and her counterpart Dr. Lopez, once again in charge of not only the Access Micro scholarship program, and the owners of two English private schools in Panamá (two each), are also acting as the Executive Directors of Panamá Bilingue and are to assist Panamá in becoming bilingual over the next four years (five initially). With this background of my own historical record in Panamá, I will now venture into the Methods section.

3. Methods

This chapter discusses the study's research methods by including information regarding the research design, participants of the study, data collection, and data analysis. I present the research design by summarizing the study's theoretical bases, research questions, means of data collection and analyses in the first section. Then I provide detailed information about the participants who took part in the online survey and semi-structured interviews. Finally, in the data collection section, I present the design and development of the instruments of this study and the steps toward data analysis.

3.1 Research Design

Using a narrative analysis approach, this study examines how Panamánian Non Native English Speaking Teachers' display agency and predilections for second language acquisition stemming from their Imagined Destinations. The aim of the dissertation is to use narrative inquiry to closely examine the role of subjectivities and the generative potential of Non Native English Speaking Teachers' (NNESTs) trajectories to successful L2 fluency. The qualitative analysis assumed by a narrative perspective (autobiographical storytelling) first aims to answer four research questions (RQs) seeking to understand human development through participants Imagined Destinations. Answering the RQs, lead to the findings of themes that consistently emerged throughout the narratives. The RQs are:

1. Do teachers deliberately preordain reaching goals that came from their Imagined Destinations?

2. What was the biggest obstacle to fluency in English? And, how did they handle those obstacles?
3. Does age of onset make a difference in their stories? In their memories?
4. Do they feel/think their journey supports their skills in the classroom? / Do they use their stories to inspire and teach their students?

By these means, we better understand how the NNESTs reach their goals as measured through two constructs I call Analysis Two and Analysis Three; see 3.5.2.2 and 3.6.1 for the Tables with the specific constructs. The first thematic Analysis came from consistent occurrences found after refocusing the lens from the constructs of imagined communities and identities (Norton, 2013) to the Vygotskian ideas of subject and subjectivities as taken from a cultural historical perspective within SLA. Based on Vygotsky's definition of imagination, and the interpretation of his work through Moll (2014), González Rey (2009, 2011), and van der Veer & Valsiner (1991, 1999) predominantly, the four constructs of analyses were formed. The second theme taken from Johnson and Golombek (2011) highlights the use of teacher narrative activities "as tools for knowledge-building and professional development practices" (p. 1).

For the study, I followed a mixed-methods approach by cyclically collecting data through an online survey, and then in semi-structured interviews with selected participants. I carried out content analysis of the group of teachers through an online survey to give the demographics of the group, including data relating to the population of the 27 teachers sorting out the particular ethnic groups; Areas of the country (rural vs. urban); Gender of the participants; Parental literacy; Analysis of their Journeys to Bilingualism; and, the time they began learning English. From the information gathered from the online surveys, I gained a clearer picture of the overall

group of teachers; it also supported selection of the participants, representative of its diversity. The survey data supported the choice of which participants would be interviewed. I, specifically considered the demographics and their journeys to bilingualism of the participants, also the gender and area of the country (rural vs. urban).

3.1.1 Analysis Two: Imagined Destinations

My first thematic analysis is set in sociocultural perspectives, specifically in cultural historical theory as was discussed in greater detail in 2.3 – 2.6 that elucidates "man master[ing] his own mental processes by introducing new, artificial elements into a situation" (in van der Veer & Valsiner, 1999, p. 239). In light of Vygotsky's definition of imagination and in examination of the cultural historical origins of SCT, this research similarly hypothesizes the power seen in eight Panamánian teachers' Imagined Destinations within lived experiences as another way of displaying expression of the teachers subjectivities, their elected selves and their predilections for their second language English to mediate their additional language learning goals in concert with their environments. To monitor and evaluate these constructs, this study examines the narratives from four separate paradigms: Imagined Destinations (IDs): Subjective Alternatives (obstacles) (SA): Agentive Roles Played (AR) by the participants and a further examination of the Unity of Affect and Intellect (specifically seen in Appendix C, Analysis 2). This first analytical theme uses participant narratives to closely examine and elaborate González Rey's (2007) Vygotskian based insights on the role of subjectivity in human development, and the mediating roles of emotions and lived experiences in shaping these subjectivities. These four constructs are contained within a system of human development where participants' subjective places and

imaginations become as important as the social context for learning and development; person and context become inseparable through their lived experiences (*vivencias*).

Construct 1. Imagined Destinations (ID) - Possibility to imagine another place venturing far beyond boundaries, assimilating with the help of imagination someone else's historical or social experience and is an essential condition for almost all human mental activity (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b). A goal within the subject's imagination.
Construct 2. Subjective Alternatives (obstacles) (SA) - Individuals self-regulate by exerting their own voluntary control over mental functions when they discover opportunities to advance in their surroundings, or by finding subjective alternatives to advance their development regardless of the social norms or materials offered. Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González Rey, 2011).
Construct 3. Agentive Roles Played (AR) - Multiple subjective actions that embody emotions and symbolic processes, expectancies that are not cognitive (Moll & González Rey).
Construct 4. Unity of Affect and Intellect – (A & I) - Unity of Affect & Intellect guarantees control of emotions to correct actions' adequate to the need of the subjects (Moll & González Rey).

Table 1 - Analysis Two: Imagined Destinations

3.1.2 Analysis Three: Narrative Analysis

My final analysis (Analysis Three) locates an autobiographical narrative approach for enquiry qualified in the narrative investigation consequential to Johnson and Golombek's (2011) article, which discusses their analysis of two teachers' narrative self -reflections. In this article, Johnson and Golombek (2011) argue for "narrative inquiry as professional development" supporting teachers in "increasing control over their thoughts and actions" (p.2). Examinations of teachers Jenn and Michael's reflections during their learning as novice teachers in professional development, the authors exemplified how teachers' thoughts can be used in Pre-Service teacher development. Reflective journal writing, for example, became Jenn's tool to mediate and create space around her day to day learning over a 15-week semester. From a Sociocultural Theoretical (SCT) perspective, "her journal served as a *cognitive act* in which her self-directed writing allowed her to act as a temporary other creating a mediational space" for her own self-reflection and externalization of the sociocultural context (p. 9). Michael used his

journal to reexamine his everyday understandings within his classroom which enabled him to gain inner control and power to change his own environment. By "bring[ing] his experiences and emotions to conscious awareness" (p. 15) the cognitive dissonance he was experiencing because of unanswered pedagogical questions while working with a portion of his students were answered, thereby quelling a tension created by a self-professed "failed" lesson. Michael retaught the lesson based on his own reflection after speaking with his colleagues. These interactions' created the "space" around the situation through verbalization of the problem with his cohorts. Michael's new lesson "was a tremendous success "by providing the structure for, or giving some shape to the activity itself" (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p. 15). Both Jenn and Michael demonstrated what the authors called "the principle of ascent from the abstract to the concrete" through the reexamination of their everyday experiences in their classrooms (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p. 9).

Replicated in my inquiry, the seven Panamánian teacher narratives similarly serve as both a physical and a symbolic space bringing the teachers' autobiographical tales of their trajectories to L2 English fluency to conscious awareness, which in turn gives voice to their own inner understandings. The three functions used from the study are: (1) Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT): narrative as a function representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational spaces to transition into conscious awareness through their inquiry, reflection, verbalization, and to regulate the thinking process of the teachers. (2) Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE): narrative as a function that locates how teachers engage in the social to explain their experience—"through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate their thinking processes. (3) The third analysis, borrowed from Johnson and Golombek (2011),

Narrative of Externalization (NEX): narrative as a function that employs teachers' reflection of their prior language learning trajectories to critically analyze as experiences; the function is used to reflect upon teachers' own practices and their current conceptions of both their own language learning and language teaching in the classroom with students (see Table 2, below for these constructs).

First Analysis (A1): Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) - Analysis representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational space to transition into consciousness through: inquiry, reflection, verbalization, to regulate the thinking process (cognition).
Second Analysis (A2): Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) is how the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process.
Third Analysis (A3): Autobiographical Reflection (AR) - Narrative of Externalization (NEX) of their prior language learning experiences, critically analyzing those experiences, and then relating their analyses to their current conceptions of both language learning and language teaching.

Table 2 - Analysis Three: Narrative Analysis

Although I am using the first two functions of analysis differently than in the original study done by Johnson and Golombek, I see the value of the functions to be used as analytical tools to inspect the narratives as viable and relevant sources of examination. These analyses became excellent guides to analyze my data, to answer my research questions and profoundly see the value of teacher narratives as metacognitive tools of self- reflection that improve their teaching and their own awareness of their identities as language learners and teachers. The Third Analysis (A3, Narrative of Externalization) was duplicated precisely and became an important function for not only the data collection, but also served extremely well to answer RQ4 discussing how the teachers used their trajectories into fluency to inspire their students. The differences between the First and Second Analysis lie in how the authors used them. For instance, Jenn and Michael's reflections were done in the present and used in the present to gauge their ideas and to reflect upon their own teaching practices. My analysis was in retrospect,

autobiographical reflections of past learning and how that learning was discussed in the narratives. These analyses were discovered as part of my Findings during the process of answering my RQs.

In sum, this research is unique in that it chooses a view of the second language teacher and learner of English from a different paradigm. This view, more resonant with the work of González, Moll, and Amanti (2005), Johnson and Golombek (2011), Tardy (2015) and other contemporary researchers' reminds us of the importance and delicacy of how successful language learners' narrative histories are productive in contexts that honor them.

Within this same lens, the non-native English speaking teachers when looked at as funds, assets, or as discussed by Gunther Kress (2011) "jewels" of their L2 classrooms reveal a multitude of cultural and mechanical understandings (grammatical constructs similar to English, difficulties when translating from Spanish their mother tongue, for example) of learning English that are rarely discussed in the current literature. Instead of seeing successful language learners and teachers into English from a marginalized place, this research sees the agency and the power that comes from both the pilot findings and these eight Panamánian teachers' subjective choices and predilections for Imagined Destinations into English that transform within their environments from one delicate place to the next within successful cultural and language acquisition. Also distinctive is that these narratives examine the cases first as English language learners and then observes them transferring those roles from second language learner to L2 teacher and eventually administrators of English as a foreign language in Panamá.

More specifically, the narratives uncover important elements involved in second language acquisition as told within each individual narrative history, retrospectively. The interviews delve into the culture and circumstance of the interviewees and inquire into how teachers use their subjective selves within their environments. These "selves" include their emotions as a way to become successful in acquiring the English language within the context of an arguably monolingual Spanish speaking country. The findings further embellish how these trajectories are even more powerful because they are Non Native English Speaking (NNES) learners and eventually (NNES) Teachers.

3.2 Participants

Within these theoretical ideas, it is important that we study the narratives by how they are arranged and their relationship the tellers have with the scribe. Duff says (2012) "how research participants represent themselves and their histories or experiences depend[s] to a great extent on their assumptions about what the researcher expects to hear" (p. 20). As an educational consultant and Fellow working in Panamá for the past eight years (as discussed more extensively in Chapter Two), I share a long-term professional relationship with the majority of the 27 Panamánian teachers participating in this research. I had met most participants either directly or indirectly over the past eight years living and working in the country. Furthermore, this group came to the Arizona Teacher Training program in concert with discussion and decisions made with the Panamánian MOE, and administrators making the decisions. Jointly decided by the Ministry, these Ministry of Education (MOE) supervisors and coordinators have the highest potential to impact English language programming in Panamá because they are responsible for all the private and public school English language programs in the country. Due to

my long history working in the country it made sense for this group to come to Arizona to work side by side with me. In addition, the course requested was designed specifically for a supervisory capacity and in follow-up to the work already accomplished (with me) directly and indirectly in the country.

I borrow the stories told in these teachers' narratives with great care and also carefully interpret them with an established rapport and professional credibility with teachers I have known and worked with since 2009 directly or indirectly as discussed in Chapter 2: 2.9.1 - 2.9.3. This relationship will be discussed in more specific detail in the next section.

3.2.1 Participant Details

All of these cases belong to a particular group of teachers. They are national and local supervisors and coordinators of English language programming, or a combination of both, working for the Ministry of Education in Panamá. They are therefore considered proficient bilinguals capable of overseeing all EFL classes (Kindergarten through University) offered within the context of both private and public schools; primary through university education in the various provinces around the country. All born in Panamá, their fluency in English situated them for a lifetime of teaching, and then supervising and coordinating English language programs and teacher supervision in the country. Once the participants coming to the course were determined by the Ministry, I sent the 27 teachers a recruitment email with a link to the survey. The email was sent to the teachers via the main facilitator working for the Ministry of Education (MOE) in Panamá. The number of expected teachers' respondents was 27; and all were eventually received. Initially all but five participants returned the survey. Those participants were invited to fill it out once they arrived in the US. As discussed in Chapter 2, I worked with large numbers of

English teachers around the country. Also, many of the teachers came to my seminars for points needed to promote their teacher certifications and salary increases. Over the course of this time, I had met (almost) all of the supervisors and had worked with them indirectly in those trainings. I also traveled with a group of nine of the supervisors escorting them to the Boston TESOL conference. Those teachers (supervisors/ coordinators) were sent under a grant given by the United States Embassy.

Overall, the 27 participants varied in terms of age, gender, and parental background, area of the country and ages of interest in learning English. The results concluded that each of them, regardless of these backgrounds, recalled their multiple paths to success in the English language. Even though the diversity of participants does not embody all areas of Panamá, it does encompass an array of the diverse backgrounds, representative of the country. As part of the research design of the study, the respondents of the online survey had the opportunity to indicate whether they would like to continue to participate in the study. All 27 teachers confirmed their willingness in taking part in the semi-structured interviews. After that consent was given, I aimed to conduct the interviews face-to-face on campus. I chose the eight participants according to several criteria discussed in section 3.4 of which seven were chosen to discuss in the dissertation. First, from their responses in Journey to Bilingualism; second, consideration to the background of the participants was given in order to ensure a range of backgrounds; and third, final consideration was given to their ages of acquisition into English.

3.2.1.1 Data Collection Timeline and Analysis

Timeline of Data Collection and Analysis
October 2014: Survey questions began in Panamá Trainings in October 2014 and again in January 2015. Participants questioned about their Imagined Destinations and journeys to English fluency.

November/ December, 2014: Survey Piloted to 30 Mexican teachers; Applied Linguistics PhD International Students (3); Panamánian Teachers (6)
January, 2015: ONLINE SURVEY DISTRIBUTED BEFORE THE TEACHERS ARRIVED and after I left Panamá.
February, 2015: Teachers begin classes: Identity work begins in first class activities.
February, 2015: Online Survey analyzed: Ten cases invited to be interviewed. Eight interviews accomplished
FINAL two weeks in US: Interviews completed with teachers chosen and agreements signed outsideof their classroom schedules. Eight final interviews were scheduled for February 12 – February 26, 2015
March Forward: Eight cases analyzed against four constructs: survey analysis, research questions, analysis one and analysis two

Figure 2 - Timeline 1

3.3 Online Survey: Phase One

The surveys were sent, responded to, and returned electronically. With this online material, I was able to analyze the group in terms of their profile (gender, geographic area, parental background, age of onset and access to the language). The purpose of the survey was to (a) get background on the participants such as age the participant began learning English, the area they were born and raised, their parental language background; and (b) to reveal the multiple paths they remembered taking during the process of learning English that also included obstacles to fluency. The answers to these questions were partially responsible to how the cases were chosen for the interviews. In order to increase the validity and reliability of the instrument, I took additional steps while developing the online survey to ensure its reliability as an effective tool to gather pertinent information. First of all, I asked a total of six Panamánian teachers that I had a relationship with while living in Panamá; 30 Mexican teachers taking a teacher development course in the United States, and three Applied Linguistics PhD international students to take the survey as a pilot. Based on their feedback, I made some structural changes, technical improvements such as formatting and the order of the questions, and restated some of

the questions / expressions to overcome potential ambiguities and misinterpretations. I also made sure that "other" was available as an option to each question to give the participants more flexibility in answering the questions independent of my options throughout the survey. Also important to note is that before the participant proceeded to fill out the survey, they had to read a section explaining the survey would be used for research. Also important to note is the participants were also given the choice whether to identify themselves, to ensure their comfort and openness in the answering the questions. Finally, the participants were given the opportunity to waive working with me in the future. Notably, all 27 participants indicated wanting to work with me again in the future beyond the survey.

3.3.1 Table 3: Online Survey Divisions

Divisions of the Online Survey: Starred components specifically used to choose the participants to interview
**Background of the participant: This section is purposefully situated to support an accurate view of Panamá's diversity and to attempt to accurately represent the country. As an example, in Panamá there are twelve regions. Some of these regions are much more urbanely situated versus rurally located. There are also indigenous populations that include six tribal groups: Kunayala; Nabe; Embera; Ngobe; Madigandi and Wargandi. If the survey participant clicks the section indicating that s/he is indigenous, the screen will automatically go to specific questions to indicate their indigenous tribe. There was no one from an indigenous community from Panamá sent to the United States. No indigenous supervisors or coordinators are currently working in the Ministry.
Access: This section includes statements in regards to the access to digital literacy and access to English language speakers.
**Journey to Bilingualism: This section gives a view of the journey of the participant in learning English. For example, the time involved in English learning, things they did when they began this journey into bilingualism, their support as well as their obstacles during this process. Probably most essential is whether they recollect the moment (time) they chose the destination to becoming bilingual in English. This section was the one that most supported choosing cases to study in order to answer the research questions.
Teaching Background: This section gives a view of the survey participants' teacher profile. How long have they taught? Where do they teach? What roles do they play at their institutions?, etc.
Permission to contact them: In this section of the survey, they indicate whether I can contact them for the follow-up portion of the study.

Table 3 - Online Survey

3.4 Online Survey: Phase Two

After the survey was finalized, it was distributed to the English teachers coming from Panamá. The survey was distributed online. Of the 27 collected surveys, eight teachers were selected for the interviews. The criteria for choosing the eight case narratives were based on their answers to the survey questions, primarily the questions about their roads (chosen paths) to bilingualism, and especially the questions that showed proof or evidence of the teachers' recollected journeys into bilingualism. Demographics in terms of rural vs. urban was also a consideration and gender was also a factor, although the main consideration was how the teachers answered the survey questions specifically in terms of their Imagined Destinations when learning the L2 English and also how agency was created from those internal spaces. There were five who had not completed the survey therefore; they were given the opportunity to complete it once they arrived in country. To note, because all of the participants deemed multiple paths to fluency in their journeys; gender, area of the country and parental fluency became larger considerations. See the section entitled, "Journeys to Bilingualism" in 3.3.1.1. For a perusal of the entire survey, see Appendix A and for a Timeline of events that occurred pivotal to this research please see Figure 4, Timeline 2 below.

Figure 3 - Timeline 2

3.5 Interviews: Selection of Participants

A range of teachers based on their profile information (gender, urban vs. rural) was decided upon in order to represent the group's diversity within Panamá in order to get a range of possibilities in answering the research questions. As there are ten provinces in Panamá, and nine were represented in the group, choosing participants from very rural areas with little access to tourists, as well as urban areas that included more access to English speakers was decided upon. Finally, I decided to choose teachers from each age of onset (into English) category (0-8; 9-13; 14-17, and 18 plus). This category was chosen for two main reasons: one is the knowledge of autobiographical memory of children in early childhood that includes their lack of independence of children before school age (0-8). As González Rey (1999) points out, children's subjectivities are "deeply singular" for no two children have identical social histories" however, a consideration must be given to the fact that "children actively create themselves within domains

and communities mostly not of their choosing" and "specific ideological aspects specific to their particular locations as children in their sociocultural environments" (in Moll, 2014, p. 98). Beyond this, in prior questioning when working with a group of Mexican teachers I recall several bilingual teachers not remembering their own paths to learning the language because they grew up with both English and Spanish, for these reasons, age of learning English was one of my considerations. Three participants from each category: 0-8, 9-13; 14-17 and 18+ that included mixed gender and different areas of the country were selected for a screening interview based on their interest in meeting with me, their answers on the online survey (most importantly identification and clarity of their recollections of their Journeys to Bilingualism) because an aim of the study is the use narrative analysis to closely examine the role of subjectivities and the generative potential of the teachers trajectories to fluency.

Also considered in choosing the participants initially, was their willingness to get to know me, talk, ask questions in class as well as after class, and their language proficiency. The specific basis for choosing the initial semi-structured interviews was done from the survey outcomes and profiles, but logistically if they responded to my email, of which I had eight responses out of twelve, sent out. Therefore, eight interviews were scheduled to meet. Those eight teachers were sent an invitation to meet me after their scheduled hours in courses for a one hour interview. In a second email, I asked teachers to identify a convenient place and time to meet on campus for an interview (approximately one hour).

3.5.1 Interviews: Face to Face Meetings

All participants were invited to meet me by email. The invitations were sent during the third week in the country so that they could successfully acclimate into their routines and the

course work. Also, it gave me some time to get to know the group and support them all in settling in, which meant that the scheduling of the interviews happened within their final two weeks in the county (in the US for four consecutive weeks). Once the teacher emailed back, when and where to meet was accomplished through email correspondence. My first interview was done with two teachers in the Graduate Room in the library. As one interview was done, the other teacher had the option to leave or to do their own work, or to listen to the interview. The first group decided to sit together – they were close friends and work together in the same region in Panamá. Since Sonya and Blexi were sitting together, at the very end of the interview I asked them both questions regarding the state of Panamá Bilingue. This ecological manner of conducting the interviews was dictated by the participants. I wanted the teachers to feel as comfortable as possible, and coming from a Latin country, the norm is to be together with your friends and family; therefore all but three of the participants opted to be interviewed together. The second interviewees also preferred coming together. The second interview was done in a private study room in the library. These three interviews again were done with the participants in the same room as decided by them, although the other interviewees were not involved in any individual interview, for the most part. From a sociocultural perspective considering the culture and the environment are key to producing the best results, the participants' input on how they wanted the interview to transpire was important. In the second interview, one of the interviewees went off to get snacks while I began interview one. Again, in the second interview the participants were friends and comfortable with one another. These interviews also took between 45 minutes to one-hour each. The third scheduled interview done with Patricia was requested to be done at the bookstore to which she asked that I take her to buy books for

Panamá. After she shopped, we sat at the coffee shop inside of the bookstore. Her interview took approximately 40 minutes in total. The next two interviews were done after scheduled hours on an extracurricular trip I was there to chaperone. Both Yari and Marcel opted to interview with me at different times conveniently scheduled during their free hours. These interviews took a little longer, between 45 minutes to one hour in total.

In sum, all of the interviews were done face to face and were recorded on my laptop. They were done on, or off campus outside of the teachers' TEFL Program, on a voluntary basis convenient to their schedules. Again, consent was given to contact them from the initial online survey. The teachers that were chosen were then sent invitation emails to meet me at a certain time and location. An additional consent form to given permission for the interviews was given again in the face to face interviews in hard copy. Time at the beginning of the interview was spent reading the consent form and giving consent via their signatures. All of this correspondence was done in English, except the final consent that was given in Spanish, both as a courtesy and also to make sure the teachers had seen the information in English (on the online survey) and again more specifically in Spanish in the final consent.

The eight face to face interviews (see Appendix B for RQs) were done in a semi structured format. The aim was to delve deeper into the information derived from the online survey responses. Also, the questions asked in the interviews were guided by an attempt to uncover answers to the research questions. The interviews were recorded and transcribed.

3.6 Steps of Data Collection and Data Analysis

In this section, the steps of data collection and data analysis are given in a Table Format seen below. Next, in 3.6.1, I describe the procedures of data analysis step by step for the reader, in order to understand the mental process I went through in locating the next two analyses chosen. In 3.6.2 I discuss the first online analysis. In 3.6.3 I briefly discuss the theoretical constructs of Analysis Two, the constructs chosen to monitor Imagined Destinations, and in 3.6.4 I give an overview of the third analysis borrowed from the Johnson and Golombek study (2011) to monitor narrative as a tool to inform teachers' identities and teaching practices.

Steps of Data Collection and Analysis	
Preliminary Work	
Step One:	Pilot Study done in 2014
Research Design	
Step Two:	Findings from that study began the query to formulate new Research Questions with a different audience and context. See Appendix B for RQs
Step Three:	Online Survey created guided by the research questions
Step Four:	Online Survey is piloted with different groups of NNES teachers from Mexico, Panamá, Turkey, Pakistan and Oman
Step Five:	Online survey is ameliorated according to the results of the pilots
Data Collection and Analysis	
Step Six:	Online survey is distributed to the Panamánian Teachers
Step Seven:	Online survey is analyzed quantitatively and used to support the choices of the interviews
Step Eight:	Interviewees are invited to join the interviews: 12 sent; eight responses
Step Nine:	Interviews performed with the eight participants
Step Ten:	Transcribed the interviews from the audio recordings in Word format
Step Eleven:	Content analysis of interview transcriptions done first to answer the research questions,
Step Twelve:	Examined the narratives according to the ages of onset into the second language,
Step Thirteen:	Created short vignettes of the participants
Step Fourteen:	Systematically answered the research questions comparing them to the narrative analysis
Step Fifteen:	Both Analysis Two and Analysis Three are theoretical positionings that came from the elaboration on findings I obtained from answering the four research questions. Two different analysis were formulated: the first based on readings of Cultural Historical Theory predominantly taken from my own construct of Imagined Destinations and the other three taken mainly from González Rey (2011) (Analysis Two), and next, a contruct to gauge if Narrative Analysis was a useful construct to demonstrate the theoretical positioning taken from Johnson and Golombek (2011) narrative analysis done in their own study (Analysis Three).

Step Sixteen:	Continue to examine the narratives against the Research Questions eventually mollifying RQ1, and deleting RQ 2 and 3. I kept RQ 1 (mollified), RQS 4, 5 and 6 from the original questions (See Chapter 3 for explanation).
Step Seventeen:	Examined the narratives against Analysis Three (see Appendix C)
Step Eighteen:	Examined the narratives against Analysis Four (see Appendix D)
Step Nineteen:	Formulates the hypothesis based on the Findings

Table 4 - Steps of Data Collection and Analysis

3.6.1 Steps of Analyzing the Data leading to Findings

Here, I describe the procedures of data analysis step by step for the reader, in order to understand the mental process I went through in locating the next two analyses chosen in the process of answering the research questions.

First, I carried out content analyses of the online survey. Afterward, I transcribed the interviews from the audio recordings in Word format. Next, I did the content analysis of interview transcriptions sorting the data in three ways: first, I examined the narratives answering the research questions; next, I sorted the participants according to the age they indicated learning the language on the survey and answering the research questions according to this theme (category). Then, I created short vignettes of the participants in order to share them in the Data Analysis section. Interview data was analyzed qualitatively, attempting to clarify and go beyond the data from the survey questions and get a more detailed picture of the participants Imagined Destinations and their journeys through bilingual pathways within SCT, particularly the cultural historical framework from Vygotsky's earlier work.

Transcribing and then sorting the data to answer the research questions allowed me to grow more comfortable with exactly what I was concomitantly asking and what I was aiming to be answered. I also realized (in this process) that a couple of the research questions were redundant, or were no longer applicable; therefore, they were taken out. I also rewrote the first

research question to more specifically fit the analysis and the Findings. The creation of the vignettes further familiarized me with the autobiographical renditions of the teachers' journeys to bilingualism within the questions asked. I was able to more closely monitor the narratives from a more metacognitive place, which led the way into the next two data analyses; these were found within the processes of transcribing, and analyzing the data. In contrast to quantitative designs, in qualitative research: specific research questions typically emerge after the research begins. As the specific questions emerge, certain participants are often selected using the purposive sampling technique to elaborate and clarify the theoretical positioning and elaboration.

In this process, by getting to know the participants through their narratives I was more able to recognize the process Vygotsky calls the *Stages of Mastering the Mind* discussed in 2.2 of this dissertation. Analysis Two is created from the work of Moll and González Rey on Subject and Subjectivities and specifically Moll's interpretations of Vygotsky's writings on the imagination. From their interpretations of Vygotsky's work, I could more closely see how Imagined Destinations begin in the self (mind, psyche). A goal set in the imagination begins a process that follows in stages from an internal place to an external one, which is where agency, in combination with emotions, transforms the environment to meet their goal (objective). González Rey (2011) discusses these transformations as sub-alternates in their environments due to exigencies needed to achieve their goals as discussed in more depth in 2.4 of the dissertation. Therefore, within the analysis of the data, I was more specifically able to find a theoretical positioning in relationship to the analysis I had already accomplished, originally guided by the pilot study and then the formation of the research questions. As a part of this process, the other

two thematic analyses described in 3.1.1 were formed. They include: Imagined Destinations, Agentive Roles, Subjective Alternatives and the Unity of Affect and Intellect. Analysis Three was chosen as a way to monitor the narratives, taken from the study by Johnson and Golombek (2011). The authors' three functions of Narrative Analysis as described in 3.1.2 were discovered as a part of the Findings. Those three functions are: Narrative as a Mediational Tool; Narrative as Systemic Evaluation, and Narrative of Externalization and are more intimately described in the next paragraph (See Appendix D for Table with descriptions of functions).

Because the narratives were so intimate and well-spoken (animated, passionate and reflective), narrative analysis became the obvious route to take. The Johnson and Golombek (2011) study based on the narrative analysis of two L2 teachers was a perfect tool to use to monitor the value of the narratives' potential to utilize narrative as a mediational tool to influence "how [the teachers] come to understand" what they are narrating about (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p.5). Both analyses were cyclical in the sense that each informed the other. For instance, the emergence of certain categories during the content analysis of interview transcripts informed the content analysis of the narrative data. For example in both Analysis Two and Analysis Three, the functions are by no means mutually exclusive, but instead permeable, as a single narrative activity will most likely, but not necessarily involve any, or all of the constructs of analysis as discussed by Johnson & Golombek (2011, p. 488).

** See Table 4 for an easy perusal of the steps taken for Data Analysis.

3.6.2 Online Survey Analysis: Analysis 1

In this section, I discuss the first online analysis that led me to the selection of the interviewees chosen.

The distribution and receipt of online surveys was one of the three analyses carried out in the study to inform the investigation. The results of the online survey mainly included counting of participants' demographic information, the calculation and documentation of their journeys to bilingualism, the age they began learning English and parental literacy. I used the numerical data and percentages for the analysis of the information provided in the online survey to calculate mean scores of the Likert-scale statements to measure the participants' parental literacy, years teaching, areas they lived, which regions they worked and when they began to learn English as their second language. Additionally, I analyzed the mean score differential between all of the survey respondents and interviewees in order to show to what extent the interviewees represented the whole group (see Appendix A for Survey).

3.6.3 Imagined Destinations: Analysis Two

In this section, I briefly discuss the theoretical constructs of Analysis Two as one of the Findings from the analysis of the data, especially in answering the four Research Questions.

This second data analysis found while analyzing the research questions within the data collected, specifically creates a way to monitor and illuminate the construct of Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* as discussed by Vygotsky, Moll, and González Rey and as interpreted by myself. Subject, Subjectivities, Subjective Alternatives and Agency were interpreted from the work of González Rey, 2002, 2007, 2009, 2011; and Moll (2014) as a part of the dynamic system coming from the participants' Imagined Destinations. The constructs gauged to analyze subjectivities and Imagined Destinations and the Narrative functions are briefly explained in Table 5 below and further explained in the Literature Review: 2.1-2.5.

Imagined Destinations (ID) - Possible to imagine another place venturing far beyond boundaries,

assimilating with the help of imagination someone else's historical or social experience and is an essential condition for almost all human mental activity (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b).
Subjective Alternatives (obstacles) (SA) - Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González Rey, 2011).
Agentive Roles Played (AR) - Multiple subjective actions that embody emotions and symbolic processes, expectancies that are not cognitive (Moll & González Rey).
Unity of Affect and Intellect – (A & I) - Unity of Affect & Intellect guarantees control of emotions to correct actions' adequate to the need of the subjects (exigencies) (Moll & González Rey).

Table 5 - Analysis Two

3.6.4 Functions of Narrative Analysis: Analysis Three:

In this final part of 3.6, I give an overview of the third analysis borrowed from the Johnson and Golombek study (2011) to monitor narrative as a tool to inform teachers' identities and teaching practices.

Analysis Three is taken from teacher narrative research carried out by Johnson and Golombek (2011) in their study with teachers discussing how this type of inquiry functions as a vehicle for teacher inquiry "based on the assumption that such inquiry will ultimately bring about productive change in teachers and their teaching processes" (p. 486). They argue that within the Vygotskian SCT perspective, the "transformative power of narrative [that] lies in its ability to ignite cognitive processes that fosters teacher professional development. Please see the three functions of analysis with a brief description of each in Table 6 below.

First Analysis (A1): Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) - Analysis representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational space to transition into consciousness through: inquiry, reflection, verbalization, to regulate the thinking process (cognition).
Second Analysis (A2): Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) is how the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process.
Third Analysis (A3): Autobiographical Reflection (AR) - Narrative of Externalization (NEX) of their prior language learning experiences, critically analyzing those experiences, and then relating their analyses to their current conceptions of both language learning and language teaching.

Table 6 - Analysis Three

As stated earlier, in both Analysis Two and Analysis Three as discussed by Johnson and Golombek (2011, p. 488),"These functions are by no means mutually exclusive, but permeable, as a single narrative activity will most likely, but not necessarily involve" more than one function.

In conclusion, combining the data taken from the surveys with the qualitative data from the narratives, this data set was analyzed across three lines of systematic inquiry guided by answering the research questions: first, to quantify the profiles and demographics of the participants, second, as guided by the answers to the research questions to examine the RQs against the functions of analysis in Analysis Two, and then again in Analysis Three discussed above and also in 2.3-2.7 in the Literature Review. The transcriptions were analyzed according to the seven constructs, both across narratives and within a single narrative. This analysis will be shown in Chapter 4. As the two methods are a part of the Findings, both the pedagogical insights for ELLs and L2 Teachers will be discussed further in the Discussion of the Findings section of the dissertation.

4. Findings

This chapter summarizes the results from the three data sources discussed in Chapters Two and Three. They are: Teachers' Online Survey Results; Analysis Two based on Vyotskian Theory to explain Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* that includes subject, subjectivities, the subjective alternatives, agentive roles played by the participants and the role of emotion and the unity of affect and intellect as discussed in Chapters 2 and 3. Analysis Three interprets the narratives through the three functions of analysis borrowed from Johnson & Golombek (2011) to gauge how narrative inquiry supports their learning and fosters teaching identities. This focus was also discussed in Chapter 2 and again in Chapter 3, 3.6.4. As described, first a pilot study was done and from those findings new research questions were formulated to create the next study. As laid out in the Introduction, and again in the Methods chapter, the purpose of takin these (recording) narrative histories was to find the generative potential and agency within the NNES teachers' subjective choices and predilections for English coming from their Imagined Destinations. (See Appendix G for Table 4: Steps of Data Collection and Analysis, also at the end of this section). The theoretical elaboration of both Analysis Two and Analysis Three is a goal of this research.

In this chapter, the reader will learn about the "generative capacity to create processes not objectively justified' which creates an "inseparable unity between symbolical and emotional processes" (González Rey, 2011, p. 20) within the autobiographical renditions of the eight participants lived experiences into English fluency. The chapter begins with a brief overview of the findings from the online surveys, followed by "vignettes" that introduce the reader to the eight participants; the chapter then relays findings from the research questions which supported

the theoretical positioning chosen for the next two narrative analyses, based on the literature that were explained in Chapters 2 and 3. Both analyses are then discussed separately by comparing each theoretical construct to particular narratives. Selections of specific narratives were chosen to clarify the concept of Imagined Destinations; and/or, to clarify and elaborate the concept asked. Theoretical elaboration of the analysis is key to the purpose of the research. Since all of the narratives were analyzed, the chapter ends with a table informing the reader of "other" examples of each of the Themes of Analysis for the reader's easy perusal of additional proofs collected in both the Pilot Study (see Appendix F for details of the participants) and the Teacher Narratives (See Table 9 for those additional examples).

The results in the Findings section draw from the data gathered from the teachers' online survey results and the semi-structured interviews. The online data served in keeping track of salient issues such as living in rural areas where there were no English speakers, parental literacy, and also gender. This information gave background to add to the teachers' stories, and to fill in any gaps not answered in the face-to-face interviews. After a brief overview of the online survey analysis, the first categorization of results includes how these autobiographical stories answered the research questions. The goal of this section is to provide a snapshot of how the participants' narratives answered the research questions and specifically how the RQs were answered through the stories told. The second theme (Analysis 2) uses constructs to elucidate Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* (see Appendix C for Analysis Two constructs) through the four constructs (Imagined Destinations, Agentive Roles, Subjective Alternatives & Unity of Affect and Intellect) used to gauge subjectivities within the subject's trajectories to English fluency. This analysis attempts to position the writings of González Rey (2011) that argues "Vygotsky's

cognitive-emotional concept of sense is one that … needs to be re-defined… [to] more fully recognize the unity between symbolic process and emotion --- a continuous movement between the subject's actions, relations, and psychological states "(p. 15). This thematic analysis redefines the movement of the participants' subjectivities that began in participants: imaginations as goals that can be followed through their Agentive Roles, and Subjective Alternatives that transform their environments to the needs and exigencies which eventually support their L2 goal of English fluency.

The next theme incorporated the functions of narrative analysis used by Johnson and Golombek's (2011) teacher study that documented how narrative reflection fosters teacher professional development. Their study's functional approach uses Sociocultural Theory (SCT) to "ignite the processes that can foster teacher professional development by examining narrative as externalization, verbalization and systematic examination in two teacher-authored narrative inquiries" (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p. 486). As stated in Chapter 3, Johnson and Golombek's examinations of teachers Jenn and Michael's reflections during their learning as novice teachers gave examples of how teachers' thoughts and reflections can be used in Pre-Service teacher development. Borrowing from this study, I examine my eight cases within these three constructs (see Appendix D for Analysis Three's Functions). Finally, Chapter 4 concludes with a summary of the results presented under the three recurring themes.

4.1 Survey Results: Analysis One

As discussed extensively in Chapter 3 of this dissertation, the surveys were initially distributed to obtain a broader view of the participants' profiles, their demographics, the age they learned English, their parental and teaching backgrounds and most importantly their

journeys to bilingualism. The surveys were given to test the research questions initially, and also supported the choices made to select the participants in the study. Options were given in a Likert Scale format to give the 27 teachers the freedom to choose miscellaneous items that fit their profiles and paths to English fluency; these items assisted them, according to their memories of their Journeys to Bilingualism. Appendix A contains each of the 29 questions and the options that were given. The making and piloting of the survey supported revisions and amelioration more closely detailed in the Methods section in Chapter 3. Findings from the survey analysis indicated that all but indigenous persons, specifically persons from Comarca Guna Yala, Comarca Embera Wounaan and Comarca Ngoble Bugle, which are indigenous provinces, were represented in the four-week TEFL course (see Chapter 3 for details). The participants of the study are discussed at length in Chapter 3, 3.2 – 3.2.1.

4.2 Vignettes

I now focus on vignettes introducing the eight participants to the reader as interpreted from my etic perspective, carved out of their emically told stories. Please meet:

Nilsi: Born in Panamá City; Case One. I originally studied Nilsi in a group context, and she seemed quiet. However, within her interview she seemed to show a different dimension of herself. A small woman, not unlike the stature of many Panamánians, she has short hair, cropped close to her milk chocolate skin. Slightly below her exterior, lay an exuberance that radiates from her quiet demeanor. Nilsi resembles a leader of sorts - stoic - however, not unmovable, undoubtedly free from grim resolve that led me; the listener, to conclude quickly that Nilsi had wrested happiness from adversity. Instead of thinking her as quiet and shy, I now saw her as reserved and confident, the narrator of a very important tale.

Born in Panamá City, but later moving to the countryside, Nilsi categorized her family as very “traditional”. Her calm, yet determined tenacity in explaining her life-history made her story seem common-place. Her interview began with the following:

> My family was very traditional. All my family, my relatives speak in English, like if someone is visiting that cannot speak English we speak Spanish, but all the other times English (Nilsi 1, 2015).

Nilsi’s affiliation with speaking English came from her Caribbean familial roots. Nilsi’s story depicts what it was like to be born to a family that only speaks to you in English, while everyone outside your door speaks Spanish. Nilsi described how the English language in Afro-Panamánian culture was taught as part of their cultural heritage and a piece of their histories that travels with them – an important artifact their parents were determined to keep no matter what the cost, which meant several things. First, when the child enters school they entered as a monolingual English speaker (an SSL student). It also meant that English was the language that was spoken with all family members: grandma, grandpa and cousins, exclusively. In Nilsi’s case, circumstances eventually led her to speaking Spanish earlier than school age due to the move out of the major city of Panamá where she was born where English was not so alien to the school systems. Nilsi describes,

> However, I started only speaking Spanish because we moved to the countryside and we had to only speak Spanish so we had problems. My older sister had problems in school and after that my mom only spoke Spanish but in Panamá City my grandparents always only spoke to us in English. I spoke to her (grandma) in Spanish, but I understood everything (Nilsi 2, 2015).

The circumstance of moving to a rural place did not support English as her only language at home since the rural teachers did not understand English. They also did not accept it due to the historical turbulence of laws that prohibited English (see Chapter 2, 2.9 for Panamá history) which mandated that teachers did not speak English, only Spanish. Consequently, the teachers were complaining about the fact that her older sister only spoke in English when she arrived at her new school.

> So I was almost three years old when we moved [to the country] so I was about 3 and ½ years old. I know it was before I was five... so I remember because nobody spoke English and culturally you were rejected if you spoke English (Nilsi 3, 2015).

Very vividly, Nilsi continued to describe her experiences learning the two languages, English and Spanish -- the language switch from English to Spanish when they moved to the countryside, and how her mother later told her that it was a bad decision switching from English as their home language; however, she deemed it a quick way to deal with the problems they were facing at the time.

Nilsi remembered her journey to a "T", the rough parts and the supports that eventually scaffold her roads to fluency. As her story continued, she told me how her identity and her destinations changed over time as well. She said that her English abilities turned into a positive direction later on when she began to read "all the English books in the house":

> But I think what helped me to improve in English was reading because it gave me the confidence to speak so when I was 14 or 15 I started reading all the books in the house so I told my mom I wanted to read … and at the beginning I could not understand but after

> about three times my mom said [to] take it easy and then after my first book I took off and it became easier… and I was already reading Spanish at that time (Nilsi, 4, 2015).

Nilsi continued her story till the end as if she were strumming a violin; never straying from the notes; steadfast in playing the tune that most closely resembled the melody of her multiple paths to bilingual fluency.

Margy: A true bilingual; Case 2. Margy is a jolly woman, dark skinned, long hair that she regularly keeps in a bun. She is articulate, and a pastor of her church back in Panamá. Margy indicated her age of onset into English was zero – eight on the online survey. While she shares the same historical ancestry as Nilsi, Margy introduces herself as a bilingual from the beginning of our conversation.

> Well, I remember that according to my mom and my dad by my mom's side English and by my dad's side Spanish so I have been learning both languages since I was one – my mom was born in Jamaica and my father was born in Saint Lucia. My mom came to Panamá when she was two because her mom and dad died so she was sent to the US to live with her wealthy aunts. And my father came to work for the Panamá Canal. My father spoke English and French and probably Spanish because he was very fluent in Spanish (Margy 1, 2015).

She asserts that at seven or eight she started to read with her father and that she had skipped a grade due to the intense tutorial sessions with her dad.

> I only spent a few weeks in first grade but then I went to second grade because I knew the math and could read in both languages… so when everyone else was playing I had to stay inside and read (Margy 2, 2015).

Margy's narrative prose was happy-go-lucky, even though her tales seemed a bit grim. As she continued speaking and incorporating little chuckles in her story, I, the listener could feel something forbidding brewing beneath the surface. It was not evident at the time, but her tale was riddled with a foreboding secret. The unattractive reality of her and her sister's treatment as outcasts in her father's home was suppressed - yet simmering. Up until this point in the interview, Margy continued to describe her story, almost bragging that her father called her a "little genius" and that he continued to make her stay inside in order to work on her fluency in English and in Spanish as her stepsisters were allowed to play. A brief time later when I asked who her biggest inspiration was and what drove her to work so hard in two languages, Margy said,

> My father said when I was five I told him that I wanted to be a teacher so since then I started to read and I started trying to do all the things he wanted me to do. But sometimes I tried to teach little neighbors things so I think that I identified myself with my father…my mom was totally different in that way (Margy 3, 2015).

Margy didn't show signs of the fragileness of her delicate route until the very end of the interview. A truth that elucidated hardship, walking long miles back and forth to school, and studying while other children played – lay beneath the brightly stitched threads sewn as pieces of the mosaic woven by Margy's bilingual destination. Nilsi who also faced obstacles in the name of "mocking cousins", moving to a countryside that did not accept English in the culture or the school illumed resolve versus wavering (weakness)-- as though conflict is something life brings – no more, no less. These multiple layers created the final identity of the women I was witness to

that day layered stage by stage in their very own Imagined Destinations' cozily packed within a stream of life histories (now artifacts).

Blexian: Eres de Chiriqui

Blexi began her interest in English long before she acquired it. She said, "Ok so I started getting interested when I was 13, but when I started using the language I was 23" (Blexi 1, 2015). She explained that she wanted to travel so after she picked up English (with very little training) she "worked as a waitress in a cruise ship so the main purpose was to travel and to work outside of Panamá" (Blexi 2, 2015). She later explained,

> I went to the US before I studied, but I knew English because I learned it in the street. I believe that because I liked it and so I always found people and then my former husband was from Norway and so he was my very first English lesson. I practiced with him… I was 27. (Blexi 3, 2015).

Blexi was proud of her ease in learning her second language. She believes that students will learn if they are interested and therefore, feels comfortable that those students will succeed and others will struggle. She told me, "I think teachers should push students but others will just naturally like it" (Blexi 4, 2015).

Sonya: Chiricana También

Sonia openly discusses an intense interest in English, but also how hard she worked to acquire it. Sonia, like Blexi did not attend private school, therefore English during her school day began in Middle School. Her experience in English was only at school.

> I had English for 3 hours in Middle and in High School and even though I couldn't attend private school, I went to public, by 19 I could speak the language. I worked hard at it (Sonia 1, 2015) but it wasn't that hard to learn once committed.

Sonia reveals later that she had a great teacher for four years in middle and in high school. She told me that the teacher only spoke in English and she was amazed. She describes,

> I really loved that class, I was impacted by the way she taught us and well I know that my way of speaking sounds Latina but one thing I learned is that I like to be corrected… and I love to take classes to improve my English since I am not a native speaker (Sonia 3, 2015).

Sonia also tells a tale of meeting a monolingual English speaker and feeling proud that she could converse with him. She said,

> A man was there and needed help but he only spoke English. He was a patient and he could not speak Spanish and nobody could help him (Sonia 4, 2015).

When she tried to help him she realized that she could have a conversation with this person who only spoke English.

Both women are Chiricana, which they are very proud about. Both are very pretty – attractive in different ways. Blexi is dark, almond shaped black eyes and hair, Sonja a strawberry blonde, pale complexion with blue eyes. They laughed at the differences in their appearances and said they (those differences) reflect the ethnic diversity in Panamá. Their bilingual paths were as disparate as their appearances, but now sitting before me – they are best friends and work together as coordinators for the same area to which they were born and now raise their children.

Both Sonia and Blexi agreed that they have seen a big difference in the interest in learning English in Panamá. They also established that Panamánians are beginning to understand the importance of the language simultaneously saying, "the President has a lot to do with it" (Blexi/Sonia 6, 2015). Therefore, they are proud of the place their Imagined Destinations brought them and acknowledge that their abilities in English do inspire and influence their students because of their success and their historical trajectories in the language, which they both enjoy sharing with their students.

Marcel from Bocas del Toro.

Marcel is articulate, speaking English so well that one really cannot hear his very faint Latin accent. He is confident, young and tall. Marcel was so self-motivated to learn English that he began to practice in the mirror. His parents were worried that he was having some type of breakdown. They eventually supported his path however, this was one scaffold he generated by his own volition transforming elements in his environment into mediating resources to support his goal. Marcel's incredible sense of his own Imagined Destinations showed confidence, as if he were a "rock-star" in his own right.

Marcel continued his tale, telling the listener that he always dreamt of interacting with native speakers of English. He imagined himself in a different country, talking to people in English… he said it began with music and then it got more ambitious and then when he actually could "do it" he described wanting to go beyond.

Marcel noticed that he was better and more skillful than the rest of his classmates, and sometimes even his teachers. He recalls helping them in English as well. Marcel continually

positioned himself as poor; however, he reframes his relationship to poverty as a place to kindle "more desire" and multiple tools and destinations that provided him with more drive to becoming fluent because of his disadvantages, not despite them.

Yari: La Chiricana Tres; the National Coordinator for English in Panamá.

Yari is small, with strawberry blonde hair, and dark eyes. She is usually excited about life and comes across at times as almost "gitty". Yari exudes confidence. One might look at her and imagine that she was a rich Panamánian, one that had come from a wealthy family. Yari always wears heels; she is always well groomed – almost always perpetually stylish. When one hears her story, one might call it a rags to riches one that depicts a person who stands against the things that stands in her way; or, if framed differently, advocates for the things available so that she can create and mediate to find and fuel the agency to overcome it. Yari tried hard in English despite the poor English teachers who taught her. After applying for and receiving a scholarship to go to the US for an exchange program, she described knowing that she was not good in English, but not having any idea just how bad. Yari told her tale with venom in her voice as if it happened yesterday. She told me that she was very angry at how bad the teachers were and that this factor later motivated her to be an excellent English teacher. She said,

> [it] was back when I was in high school and I had a very demanding teacher and she was really great. Otherwise, the teachers were very conductive (referring to "conductista" which is a term for behaviorist), but then I got a scholarship to go to first year exchange program in the states to Minnesota. I had a terrible time at this time I was 17. I was frustrated and angry with my teachers because they were so bad (Yari, 4, 2015).

Yari describes here, how upon entering her program in Minnesota she realized that she had zero speaking or listening proficiency in English. She understood nothing and could not even communicate her basic needs in English.

How then did she become the new President's political appointee for all English programming in Panamá? It seemed that Yaris' disdain from her awful experience fueled her motivation and investment to someday become a person who would help people acquire the English language. Perhaps it is not really a "coincidence" that she oversees the country of Panamá's English language programs today – that she was chosen by President Varela and the Ministry to be the National Coordinator for the country. Controlling her emotions first and changing the exigencies in her environment as a teen-ager gaining a scholarship led her to this outcome easily seen through her bilingual pathways.

Yari and Marcel's stories have some intertwining themes. Both are from rural areas. Similarly, both participants come from poor families and both parents do not have college degrees. Both Marcel and Yari used their own agentive roles and determination to create multiple destinations into English fluency. Both participants claimed their age of access to the language as 14 – 17 years of age.

Jeri – A late bloomer

Jeri is a tall man from the province of Chiriquí. He declared his age of onset into the language as early to mid- twenties. Jeri's tale was short and to the point. His age of onset into English began much later than the other teachers' recollections of their paths to fluency. Jeri's

renditions of his desire to become an English speaker came from his professional ambitions. Jeri remembers,

> I became discouraged in the availability of English in my world growing up – I remember giving up [learning English] until later when my church encouraged me to learn the language in order to advance as a Minister (Jeri, 1, 2015).

He proclaimed wanting to learn English so he could advance in his job as Minister. This *utilitarian* desire to become a top leader in the Church and eventually a politician was the motivation behind his pursuit of the language. Therefore, Jeri is relying on *instrumental* motivation[5], aspiring to learn English as a way to advance in his career.

As a husband and father of two teen-agers bound for college soon; Jeri's tale reverberate a clear goal to become rich and powerful, and he recalled always wanting to be in politics – "to somehow make a difference" (Jeri, 2, 2015). His clear destination to achieving a goal to advance in the church has supported him in becoming fluent and also supports his role as Supervisor in English language programming for the Ministry of Education.

Patricia's long tale of Bilingualism: The Most Seasoned Member of the Group

Patricia's interview was done at a coffee shop in a bookstore where she wanted to go buy books to take back to Panamá. Her interview was unique because she is the oldest member of the group; thereby her narrative reveals a historical view of English in Panamá, uninformed with

---

[5] Gardner and Lambert (2009) says that instrumental motivation is the "desires language learners have to learn a second language" such as "employment, or other utilitarian purposes.

the other younger teachers in the study. Beginning with a warm-up question that queried what it was like in Panamá back in the day, opened a vacuum of information. Patricia said,

> There weren't a lot of people although we had a lot of bases (American) not a lot of people were interested… speaking English was just for the high society people, the ones that they would study in the USA (Patricia, 1, 2015).

Teacher Patricia continued to talk about Madrid (Panamánian President at the time) who was sending back parents and their kids that came from Barbados because "he did not want anybody to speak English" (Patricia 2, 2015). She discussed that speaking English was only done in the confines of her home environment:

> At home, we always spoke English. I had to learn Spanish to pass the exams. I begin learning Spanish with my classmates… first I learned by communicating and fighting with my peers" (Patricia, 3, 2015).

Patricia, tall in stature, serious in tone sat very stately, and spoke of how happy she was to have found all the books she wanted to carry back to Panamá. She talked about why her and other families from Barbados remained an English-only community that raise their children in English, having them learn Spanish in school.

> My parents thought to keep their language was to be done and they thought to keep our identity we needed to respect our own first identity… despite the government saying that no English, they still continued English (Patricia, 4, 2015).

She discussed English as a part of her heritage; thus, with confidence, she declared how she has "a better comprehension" of her students' process of learning the language. She said

with pride," I have a bilingual identity and … I have the value of learning the different languages… I have a bilingual identity and…I have the value of learning the different languages… I have a bilingual identity and I understand that!" (Patricia, 5, 2015). She explained that English was her first language and that she, like Nilsi and Margy didn't learn Spanish until school age. She furthered that her father worked on the Panamá Canal when she was three. He used both English and Spanish in his job. She said gallantly, "I would have used both languages as a nurse but the career was too expensive" (Patricia 6, 2015) so she became an English teacher. After the age of nine Patricia recalls "wanting to be a nurse" but she, like Marcel could not afford getting into the profession because it was so expensive, and instead began to study to be a teacher.

Patricia, the oldest member of the group, a *jubilada* (retirement age) has watched her country go from a President that tolerated zero English, to a Panamá that has a presidential directive of making the country bilingual in five years. Her very clear understanding of her own roots, and her bilingual identity were powerful. She was certainly not coming from a disempowered place, but instead a proud heritage of being bilingual in a country that has a long history of English invasion, domination and exploration; which now, by the direction of its President, to become bilingual.

4.3 Analysis of the Research Questions

In this section, specific narratives are analyzed to identify common themes while making connections to relevant literature in order to answer the research questions. All of the narratives were analyzed against the research questions however, as stated earlier in this section, certain narratives were selected to illumine answers to specific questions as chosen by the researcher because certain sub-groups provided the most detailed information to clarify and

elaborate that concept. This section will also familiarize the reader with thematic analysis that defines the movement of the participants' subjectivities that began in participants' imaginations, as goals that follow through their Agentive Roles, Subjective Alternatives that transform their environments to the needs and exigencies which eventually support their L2 goal of English fluency that became a strand that was discussed throughout their story. (See Appendix B for a list of RQs).

RQ 1. Do teachers discuss Imagined Destinations as a goal or a predilection toward the language they wanted to reach/learn? Did it become a strand that was discussed in their story?
Yes, and No. Further discussion of this answer is in 5.1.1

In terms of RQ1, Marcel indicated having dreams of becoming bilingual long before he started learning English. He vividly recalled how this was not a logical pursuit as his environment contained little to support his goal. Marcel describes this agency thus:

> I *always dreamed* to interact with native speakers. I *imagined* myself in a different country - *imagined* me talking to people in English… (RQ1).

When I asked Marcel a similar question, regarding his Imagined Destinations and kinship toward the language, he responded,

> Yes, I think so … it was that picture in my *imagination* because I didn't know any English, but when I would see someone speaking I was fascinated and I always thought it was really hard but when I started to make logical connections and when I saw that I was able to develop I was really motivated… I felt as though I was good at the language… something I really enjoyed was I realized I could understand [and that] I was beyond my

> [English] teachers .. I could understand English and also television but I was soooooo motivated at that time when I realized I could do it! (RQ 1).

Although Marcel began learning English at 14, he very clearly imagined speaking the language from a much younger time which is surprising as he came from such a rural area in Panamá. This narrative shows us what González Rey (2011) means when he says, a person's "generative capacity to create processes not objectively justified"(p. 20). Marcel continues his story generated initially from his Imagined Destinations that create a focus and attention to his predilection and vision of speaking a language he had very little exposure. It is not a surprise then that Marcel is in the US studying and speaking with native speakers of English; his initial dream became a goal that he certainly achieved.

Blexi also specifically stated that she always liked the language and that she had dreams of speaking it: "I believe that I always liked the language", and later recalled,

> I am picturing myself from a young age and I saw myself like customer service like a waitress then working in the front desk. I always pictured myself in the United States. It [learning English] was always like a goal or a challenge for me. (RQ1)

Earlier, Blexi had indicated that she really learned English by herself on the streets. When I asked if she found a lot of English speakers, and she told me,

> Well I was in business really, my mom has a little store and we use to go to the other side (Canal Zone) to buy things … and some way or another I found people to speak English to and they always told me that, no, it's this way, not that way, but told me I was good in English. I believe that because I liked it and so I always found people (RQs 1, 2).

Later, when I asked Blexi if her journey affects her as a teacher, she replied,

> Well in my country people don't like people traveling… they think that you are showing off in my country… the colleagues might not like it so I have to be careful when talking to people so… (RQ, 4).

Here, Blexi is describing that actually her goals of traveling and going to the United States is not something that is culturally appropriate, more so pointing out the uniqueness of her Imagined Destinations. I continued to ask her how her stories are used in the classroom and whether they affect her teaching and her students. She said,

> So I think language comes from inside of you.

In my etic perception of Blexi's story, she sums up that the journey to speak English began in her mind. She remembers always working on English and this constant work made her successful. By saying that language comes from inside of you, she was referring to the internal imagination that originated and supported her path to traveling to English speaking places. She also relayed that she had married a man from Norway. Blexi said,

> I believe that because I liked it and so I always found people and then my former husband was from Norway he was my very first English lesson. I practiced with him… (Blexi and I chuckled)

Blexi's predilection for her images of herself that she viewed in and by her imagination continued to manifest in her life, quite possibly leading her into her marriage to a man who spoke two languages, Norwegian and English, thereby she found her English speaker to whom she could take her first lesson. Therefore, Blexi's narrative continued to elucidate her original

goal of speaking English and someday traveling and living in English speaking places. The story that began in her Imagined Destination, like Marcel, continued to be a strand that encapsulated her narrative tale.

RQ 2. What was the biggest obstacle to fluency in English? How did they handle that obstacle?
Obstacles became their trajectories and Subjective Alternatives

The second research question, which asks about obstacles also intersected in the interviews pretty quickly. Both Yari and Marcel mention, first and foremost the inadequacy of their English teachers. Both teachers delivered their answers with enthusiasm, clarity and conviction that despite their obstacles, they continued their paths to bilingualism. It seems that Yari's disdain for her awful experience fueled her motivation and investment to someday become a person who would help people acquire the English language. Perhaps it is not really a "coincidence" that she oversees the country of Panamá's English language programs today. Marcel dreaming to interact with native speakers in an English speaking country manifested as he was sitting in front of me, taking a course in Arizona interacting with exactly -- native speaking teachers in the US. Perhaps their realities more closely connect to the ideas of organizing and transforming their worlds to pursue predilections for their Imagined Destinations within their lived experiences. The generative potential and agency within the teachers' subjective choices and predilections for English will be discussed further in Analysis Two, construct 2 which leads me to the next research question.

The broader answer to RQ2 was one of my Findings leading to González Rey's work in subjectivities and the role of subjective alternatives, which will be covered in depth in Analysis

Two (see section 4.4 for details, or 3.5.2.2 Table 2 for constructs). For the most part, obstacles were turned into alternatives that showed up due to the exigencies of the learner. As Marcel discussed, he noticed pretty early on that his English exceeded his teachers. Both Marcel and Yari used their own agentive roles and determination to create multiple destinations into English fluency. For example, Yari was incredibly dismayed with her "horrible" English teachers so much that she turned that horrible experience into applying and accepting a scholarship to study English in the US. Nilsi, in her teenage years, due to a gap in her English language learning "read every book in the house" and Marcel turned a hand mirror into an English speaking buddy to practice and interact in English. These agentive roles and transformative ways the learners used their obstacles to transform their environments will be spoken of in depth in Analysis Two.

The short answer to this question is that obstacles turned into subjective alternatives in the stories of these eight teachers, from mediating their home environments, to getting scholarships, to finding English speakers where very few existed. This leads me to RQ#3 which inquires' into how the age of learning a second language differs from learning a language in your later years.

RQ#3. Specifically does the age of onset into English make a difference in their stories? In their memories?
No matter the age of onset into English the participants' narratives were prolific, and told with confidence and clarity. As discussed in 5.1.1 participants beginning trajectories before 8's stories came from a different place initially, but then later came from their own generative potential within their own minds, not their families.

Research question three was an interesting one and produced the most surprising answers-- surprising because the most vivid tales came from the teachers who grew up

bilingually. I had assumed beforehand that their recall of learning the language would be mundane, or not quickly recalled. I thought this because I do not remember learning my first language, nor do I recall the trials or the travails in doing so either. Quite the contrary, the tales of Patti, Margy and Nilsi were vivid and passionate and full of obstacles and trajectories which showed similar mediation of their social environment, agency, and obstacles transformed into subjective alternatives.

These teachers' similar paths to fluency can be found in the answer to RQ#1. The three teachers proclaiming their age of onset in English to be in Early Childhood did not come from their Imagined Destinations, but instead from the minds and decisions of their parents. Moll (2014) posits the following which speaks into these results:

> Children then, form their subjectivities but also reconstitute them, using the cultural resources and social processes available to them… always fluid… deeply singular because no two children have identical social histories and "deeply social" for they are always embedded in the dynamics of particular systems of social interaction (Gonzaléz Rey, 1999: as cited in Moll, p. 98).

Van der Veer and Valsiner (1991) discuss the development of attention in children according to Vygotsky:

> Children are not capable of steering their attention towards making use of external means, as they have not mastered their attentional processes and are slaves to external factors… At first this use is imperfect and the children are dominated by the cultural means available, gradually they learn to use them at will (p.236).

In the cases of Patricia, Margy and Nilsi whose ages of onset into second language acquisition were in Early Childhood (EC), their narrative tales were based on their parents' goals for them. Therefore, it was an acceptance of their parents' bilingual expectations coupled with their own emotions and responses to their situations that supported their bilingualism. Because children in the ages from birth to three are in a position of "maximum dependence on adults", their actions and behaviors are intertwined within the adult worlds with either no or limited capacity to human speech (in Quinnes and Fleer, 2011; Vygotsky, 1994, p. 216). Even though it is more complex to investigate the relations of the younger child to their environments, because these tales were autobiographical, the investigation proved fairly easy as opening up vivid memories and emotions intertwined with the lived experiences of the three participants. Since the cases had role models who spoke both languages, they did not need their imagination as their mediating space between their monolingual English worlds at home and the Spanish worlds to which they were joined at school. These trajectories, however, were still riddled with "emotional experiences" that were vividly related in the participants' interviews. Interacting with two languages and two cultures is complex and involves emotion as well as life events that either provide, or withdraw support from bilingual fluency no matter how dedicated the parents are to keeping their first language and adding another. Also contrary to a belief that the earlier one learns a second language the simpler it is, this study shows both the resiliency and the difficulties.

Although this will not be a focus of this dissertation, the vivid and emotional stories told by the three teachers were explicated very clearly in González Rey's, and van der Veer and Valsiner's interpretations of Vygotskian theory. The three teachers were victims, if you will, of

their environments and were very aware of each trial and travail, as well as happy moments too. However, their stories, as they spoke of themselves as older children and adults, reveal their own decisions to continue English fluency in their trajectories that were no longer influenced from their families. Moll says (2014) that we must consider that children are active molders of themselves

> …within domains and communities mostly not of their choosing, but with social, semiotic, and ideological aspects specific to their particular location as children in their sociocultural environments (p. 98)

This finding has severe ramifications in school environments that do not honor cultures and home environments; however this was touched upon in 2.8 regarding deficit perspectives in L2 education and will also be discussed more broadly in Chapter Five.

RQ#4. Do they feel/think their journey supports their skills in the classroom? Do they use their stories to inspire and teach their students?
A unanimous yes to this question across all the cases.

This final question took little prodding and was a second question I most thought about because of the clarity and conviction of all of the teachers' tales of how their journeys to English fluency (as NNESTs) influences their classrooms. Broadly, at times I almost thought that the teachers were making up the story as they reminisced however their conviction to their tales appeared flawless – no pregnant pauses, fluidity and purpose is how I could describe them. Not only did the teachers discuss why their own paths affected their students, they also discussed ways they used their own stories in their classrooms most

When addressing research question four I will specifically use four different narratives to emphasize how teachers elucidated, how, their own L2 identities influence and inspire their classrooms. First, Marcel said with a grin,

> In my classes I always begin with the first question [which] is why they learn English - do they like it? Then I ask them -- Do you? Do you watch TV with English subtitles; Do you read English books… on and on and their hands will go down so I give the recommendations and they then they have things to do and they come back to me and tell me, teacher, now I am doing this or that, that I recommended that they were not doing before (Marcel, personal interview 3, 2015).

Marcel begins each of his classes connecting his path and the tools he used to become fluent with his students and his students become equally fluent. His ability to use that journey is strong enough to create his initial lesson around it. This activity, as told by Marcel, pre-empts any student grumbling that they cannot learn English by taking on his challenge by implementing the same methods he used into their daily lives.

When asked this question, Yari responded,

> I always try to help my students to believe in themselves that the struggle to achieve the *dreams* is important … I came from a poor family and now to look at where I am it really does help to inspire them. The circumstances that brought me here is important. People never thought English was important even with the Panamá Canal, but now that I am in the position I am, I can share my situation and I am in the position to remember what happened in those times and I maybe it can also help teachers believe in this project and believe in themselves (Personal Interview, Yari 4, 2015).

Nilsi and Margy adamantly and confidently answer this question. For example, Nilsi's posture straightened while she passionately described how her multiple destinations into bilingual fluency were important avenues to be shared with her students. She takes risks with her students and being open and vulnerable is a tool in her teacher toolbox. Nilsi confirmed her pride in her journey to bilingualism and when asked how it might facilitate her teaching she proudly proclaimed,

> Well, the students can really be inspired by us and they are young and we can push them to look at the future because they are young and in order to inspire them we must share with them… because then they will trust you to advise them when you tell them your story and how you achieved it (Nilsi 7, 2015).

Finally, at the end of the interview with both Margy and Nilsi, teachers in a room together, a foreboding truth was finally released when I asked the same question to Margy who became beseechingly honest and emotional as she implored,

> Well there was something I did not share... it was really a nightmare in my father's house- I experience many mal treatments because we were not very well accepted or loved... I would have rather been with my mom even though we did not have the things to fulfill our needs that is why she left us there. I remember walking back and forth to school many miles -- even though my father had a car, we suffered a lot…, and this gave me the courage to work very hard for my dreams… (Personal Interview, Margy 5, 2015).

Something about the question that I asked, the answer drawn by Nilsi, or perhaps a combination of both, those suppressed truisms that riddled beneath Margarita's tale from the beginning (as depicted in the vignettes) was finally fully told… Having suppressed that piece of

the story for so long, Margarita described how she and her sister really wanted to live with their mom, but that her mom had financial troubles and that living with her dad's abusive 'maltreatment' was an untold secret that she hadn't shared. I hugged her and comforted her while she calmed down; she finally concluded answering the question in this way:

> So I tell my students that nothing should stop you from taking away your dreams… God is always there for you and I try to be an inspiration to them and even though you have struggled coming from a very hard place and poor place … problems… God will always be there for you and he will always take you from where you are into where we want to be (Personal Interview, Margy 6, 2015).

These narratives give powerful glimpses of these teachers' paths to becoming English teachers that were riddled with travails that became a part of their teacher identities that serve them to inspire their students. Therefore, we can clearly see from the narrative examples just how passionately and uniquely each participant answered the research questions in graphic detail.

4.4 Analysis Two: Imagined Destinations; Subjective Alternatives; Agentive Roles, Unity of Affect and Intellect

This first thematic framework was uncovered as a Finding during the process of answering the research questions. The four constructs (Table 7 below) beginning in the subjects' Imagined Destinations, supported my analysis and were powerful in offering additional insights into the study's aim as well as quelling the tension that originated in the original pilot study. This thematic framework illumined the descriptions of the paths retold by the teachers, located in Moll and González Rey's interpretations of Vygotsky's work on subject and subjectivities.

Another finding was how their paths followed the Stages of Mastering Mind as described by van der Veer and Valsiner (1991) and discussed earlier in 2.2. This discovery powerfully answered not only the unanswered questions originally unfounded in Norton's constructs, the answers further illumined where the self-determinism and generative potential in Andi, Tran and Nathan's stories were engendered.

1. ***Imagined Destinations (ID)*** **-** Possible to imagine another place venturing far beyond boundaries, a assimilating with the help of imagination someone else's historical or social experience and is an essential condition for almost all human mental activity (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b).
2. ***Subjective Alternatives (obstacles) (SA)*** **-** Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González Rey, 2011).
3. ***Agentive Roles Played (AR)*** **-** Multiple subjective actions that embody emotions and symbolic processes, expectancies that are not cognitive (Moll & González Rey).
4. ***Unity of Affect and Intellect – (A & I) –*** Unity of Affect & Intellect guarantees control of emotions to correct actions' adequate to the need of the subjects (Moll & González Rey).

Table 7 - Analysis Two

As stated in the explanation of Analysis Two, these four functions of analysis are by no means mutually exclusive, but instead permeable, as a single narrative activity will most likely, but not necessarily involve any, or all of the constructs of analysis. As discussed by Johnson & Golombek (2011, p. 488) and with which I agree, the utilities are porous, meaning that one single narrative's activity will most likely, but not necessarily involve multiple functions consequently, these constructs overlap and interchange.

Construct One: Imagined Destinations (IDs).

The function of imagination as defined by Vygotsky is the possibility to venture beyond boundaries as an essential condition of humanity. This function is easily seen in Marcel's interview when asked if he remembered when he began his interest in English and he explained

his dream to interact with native speakers: his imagined self in a different country talking to people in English…. (Marcel 3, 2015). Marcel relays active participation within his own Imagined Destinations (ID) long before he embarked upon learning his L2. The initial predilection for English actually came from a place where his imagination connected with people that spoke the language even though he had very little exposure to English speakers. According to González Rey (2011) subjective senses are "not guided by some sort of rationality, subjective senses and emotional states together, create relevance, therefore, prov[ing] a stable character" (p.16). Subjective configurations, according to González Rey (2011), characterize "the uniqueness of human actions, relationships or psychological states, thus, "every human function is a subjective action". Hence, Imagined Destinations combines this interpretation by González Rey together with the defining characteristics of imagination rendered by Moll (2014), and as quoted from Vygotsky (see full quote on p. 44 of dissertation).

Therefore, these Imagined Destinations include the emergence of consciousness, not intentionally created; they emerge and usually contain emotion as shown in this example and correlated within the literature. Marcel also said that he not only remembers dreaming of interacting with native speakers but also talking with them. To further this idea, he said he loved listening to people speaking English even when he couldn't understand it, in essence "ventur[ing] far beyond these boundaries, assimilating, with the help of his imagination someone else's historical or social experience" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004; cited in Moll, 2014, p. 94).

RQ 1 asks whether Imagined Destinations served as a precursor to their goals; Marcel, Blexi and Yari discuss connections to the language that didn't have any rational sense, other than in their internal Imaginations. Marcel, once inspired by his idea mediated his environment that

even he, retrospectively seemed in awe of. When I asked Marcel if this imagined idea was something that was within himself, he said,

> Yes, first [after his Imagined Destinations], it was music and then it got more ambitious and then when I actually could do it then I wanted to go beyond. I noticed that I was better and more skillful than the rest of my classmates and I use to help them too. I am the first person to learn English… As I mentioned I used to get vocabulary from a dictionary, and then the numbers and the tenses and then I started to build ways to use the grammar and I would be at home and I would think of ways to say things in English while washing the dishes. I also used a mirror. (RQ 1)

Not only does this piece of his story point to how he transformed and controlled being poor by mediating tools in his environment to support acquisition into English, it mainly shows the power of that original imagined destination he is always remembering:

> I always dreamed to interact with native speakers. I imagined myself in a different country imagined me talking to people in English. (Marcel, 1, 2015)

Or, similarly when Tran (pilot study) decided as a fifth grader freshly arrived to the US from Vietnam with very few English language skills, she remembers,

> I wanted to be like those girls who helped me in my class – I imagined it. (Tran, 2, 2015)

In her Imagined Destination Tran was an honor student "like those girls" she identified in her imagination. By high school Tran was exactly that and today has a full scholarship to the university (See Appendix H for pilot study participant details).

Also, Blexi who said, "I always pictured myself in the United States… and "who found people to speak with" in a monolingual country.

In sum, these exigencies that came from an imagined destination eventually created the Agentive Roles and Subjective Alternatives needed to accomplish that picture in their minds.

Construct Two: Agentive Roles

Agentive Roles, or also referred to as "agency", underscores the active character of subjectivity through which the "individuals' produce their distinct realities" (González Rey, 2011, p .9). This agency is seen in Marcel's tools of mediation, the mirror, music, dictionary, etc.; and Yari gaining access to a scholarship and deciding to become an English teacher. Disillusioned from the hardship and frustration she said,

> I had a terrible time at this time I was 17, I was frustrated and angry with my teachers because they were so bad the teachers were very conductive but then I [applied for] and got a scholarship to go to a one year exchange program in the States to Minnesota. (Yari 3, 2015)

As similarly situated in Moll's (1994) use of the concept of "vivencias", Marcel and Yari shape [their] definitions of their situations; their sense of significance and [in turn], mediate the relations between forms of existence and the trajectories of development for each [of them]" (p. 100). As discussed in Chapter 2, *vivencias* in Spanish identified as "lived experiences" actually shapes someone's character – "a power not only to control the settings in which people may express their potentialities and interact with others, but also to organize and orchestrate the

settings themselves and control the nature and direction of people's actions' within those settings" (Wolf, 1991, as cited by Moll, 2014, p. 100).

Yari and Marcel similarly decided early on (14 – 16) there was a place for English in their futures. Yari and Marcel's incredible sense of their own Imagined Destinations showed a confidence, self-determined and unwavering belief. To obtain a scholarship took a strong agentive role, especially at 16 years of age on Yari's part. This particular example points out that wanting this outcome stemming from a terrible experience in the English language classrooms does not seem logical *except* in her Imagined Destination within strong emotions that she somehow eventually gains control of through agentive roles she took to change her environment (subjective alternatives); by the award of a scholarship to the United States, which eventually lead her to a position as a national figurehead for English in her country. These Agentive Roles were also described by

Marcel who said,

> As I mentioned I use to get vocabulary from a dictionary, and then the numbers and the tenses and then I started to build ways to use the grammar and I would be at home and I would think of ways to say things in English while washing the dishes. I also used a mirror.

And Sonja, who said,

> When we had vacation I would take those books and I would study those books with my dictionary… I was the oldest of four and the only way was in the books and also my will to learn and that is how I learned the language! To practice I used my sister and I use to stand in front of the mirror… and I would memorize songs too.

In conclusion, it is not as though any of these stories contain the magic key to second language fluency. Therefore, it is much easier to understand when we can see the progression that began in these participants Imagined Destinations that drove the agentive role playing shown in these dialogues. At times, unlikely artifacts in their environments, or at other times bigger roles that caused a shift in their environments and in their lives as it existed, which leads me to the next Construct, Subjective Alternatives.

Construct Three: Subjective Alternatives

A subjective alternative as covered often in this dissertation, means subversive in relation to the dominant current social status sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011) that changes a person's situation to gain control, govern or transform their environment versus subordinate to it. A picture of this is vividly rendered in the narrative of Marcel when he describes,

> Even though the teachers were not good, I just tried a lot on my own, I remember I got a dictionary and I started studying vocabulary but it was hard because I didn't have anyone to practice with, we didn't have tourists so I use to practice by myself… my parents thought I was having psychological problems" (Marcel 2, 2015).

Using a mirror to talk to himself in English was yet another tool Marcel uses to attain proficiency in English. He also mentions his parent's response to his behavior saying that "my parents thought I was having psychological problems" (Marcel, 3, 2015). Here, Marcel's subjectivity is always involved in action "as a subjective configuration which organizes itself based on ongoing action" (González Rey, 2011, p.8) that is subversive to the environment to

which he lives. Not only do his parents think he is having psychological issues, he also lives in a small town that has few English speakers to converse or interact. Also subversive was how Yari's anger toward her teachers did not discourage her from pursuing English. Instead she got a scholarship which is not a logical, or perhaps, not a common outcome of that type of encounter with second language learning. Also similarly permeable was how Yari changed her possible trajectories that were quite impossible to becoming fluent to completely reversing those odds by getting a scholarship show this concept discussed by González Rey (2011) of "sub-alternates" that embody emotions and are shared that change their situation.

These subversive ways to mediate or "emancipate" forms of existence, as stated by Zinchenko (2002) " begin to create new forms of activities to create the world and not only to reflect it, subordinating to it… precisely the contradiction between consciousness and activity that acts as a driving force of human development" (in González Rey, 2011, p. 10). Another example of changing one's environment was seen in Nilsi reading "every book in her house in English to support her failing English", or Yari getting a scholarship to go to the US to alter the "horrible" English teachers in her environment to be inspired by teacher Cody, pointed out when she says,

> When I arrived in the US, I remember my teacher Cody though, he was so great and he gave me all the fairy tales so he gave me things that I already knew to begin the learning process. He gave me tasks… in these fairy tales to underline verbs … anything to learn the language… but after about a month and his help I began to communicate. (Yari, 3).

These incidents in these narratives point to how the transformation and controls of being poor is mediated by tools in their environments in order to support acquisition into English

showing how these L2 learners transformed obstacles into trajectories that were found, used and created to support English fluency.

Construct Four: Unity of Affect /Intellect

This construct shows that emotional control helps to correct actions adequate to the exigencies of the subjects (Zaporozhets, 1986, p. 283: in González Rey, p. 16). Again, in Marcel's narrative he says,

> I noticed that I was better and more skillful than the rest of my classmates and I use to help them too. I am the first person to learn English… we were a very poor family and also I wanted to get ahead because we were poor... (Personal Interview, Marcel 3, 2015).

Marcel shows metacognitive awareness of his accomplishment that corrects a need he had of getting out of poverty that learning English might solve. Both Yari and Marcel's paths showed combinations of affect and intellect when dealing with their English language paths to achieve their current fluency and status in Panamá; as do Margarita and Nilsi's rocky roads between two languages growing up in a monolingual country. In the latter's' cases, they initially took on learning because of their parent's wishes but later assume their own responsibilities to ignite and support.

Within this construct it must also be noted how Yari goes from extreme anger saying, "My teachers were conductive… I was angry that they were so bad" (Yari, 4, 2015). Also Andi in the pilot reported

> I was frustrated and my class mate usually jokes about it and they laugh at me… and I was angry so I decide I am going to show you something back even if two to three years (Personal Interview, Andi, 6, 2014).

In both cases, Yari and Andi gained emotional control to correct the actions inadequate in their environments. As discussed before, Yari went to the US and had great English teachers, thereby reversing the ill effects of the horrible ones in Panamá, and eventually becoming not only a "very communicative EFL teacher", but also the head of all English language programming in the country. Andi, now out of ESL, did in fact "beat all of those condemning classmates to eventually being a straight A student at the university and exited ESL long before those ridiculing classmates! (See Appendix H for profiles of pilot study participants)

4.5 Analysis Three: Functions of Narrative Analysis

Again, all of the narratives answered these three functions of analysis in their own unique ways borrowed from a study by Johnson and Golombek (2011) who argue the "transformative power of narrative lies in its ability to ignite cognitive processes that can foster teacher professional development" (p. 1). As discussed earlier in section 4.3 , all of the participants joyfully discussed in their "narratives of externalization" how their L2 English trajectories supported and inspired their teaching classrooms. Similar to the aim of Johnson and Golombek (2007), this study too wishes to document ways narrative reflection and engagement fosters teacher development and how it may ultimately bring about productive change in teachers and their practices. As outlined in 2.7 of the dissertation and also as one of the aims of the study done in 2009-2010 in Panamá, ways teacher narrative reflection can be used to support the awareness of their own epistemologies, which in turn supports their own self-efficacy and

actively transforms their stance in the L2 classrooms has been proven as important. In order to elucidate possible findings from the use of this framework, I will use one of the narratives to describe each of the functions of analysis used.

As Marcel was introduced in his vignette, we know that he is tall, handsome, young and currently a successful coordinator for the Panamánian Ministry of Education. From this view, let us analyze his narrative against the three concepts defined in Table 8 below (also found in Appendix D).

First Analysis (A1): Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) - Analysis representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational space to transition into consciousness through: inquiry, reflection, verbalization, to regulate the thinking process (cognition).
Second Analysis (A2): Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) is how the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process.
Third Analysis (A3): Autobiographical Reflection (AR) - Narrative of Externalization (NEX) of their prior language learning experiences, critically analyzing those experiences, and then relating their analyses to their current conceptions of both language learning and language teaching.

Table 8 - Analysis Three

Marcel was so committed to learn the language that he began to practice English in the mirror due to his lack of English suitors to converse. His parents were worried that he was having some type of breakdown. They eventually supported his path; however, this was one mediated tool created and used by his own volition even though he was ridiculed by parents and family members who didn't understand his obsession and self-determination to learn the language. Marcel's active use of mediational tools to transition into fluency, coupled with a subjective predilection for English supported mediational spaces (A1) to transform his environment and do what he needed in order to accomplish his goal of fluency within his Imagined Destinations (ID). He said he actually dreamt of speaking English:

> I always dreamed to interact with native speakers. I imagined myself in a different country imagined me talking to people in English… first it was music and then it got more ambitious and then when I actually could do it then I wanted to go beyond.
>
> (Personal Interview, Marcel 3, 2015).

Marcel continued to describe his situation as a teenager in rural Panamá; he was slightly desperate with few English speakers and inadequate teachers. Even though the teachers were not good, he simply tried a lot on his own. He got a dictionary and started studying vocabulary but it was hard because he had no one to practice with. Marcel here was clearly using his narrative to mediate the relationship he had with English growing up and also to regulate the thinking process to ignite his motivation and his path (Marcel 2, 2015) as discussed in both function A1 and A2.

Not only did Marcel have bad teachers, he also had monolingual Spanish speaking parents that wanted to take him to counseling because he so often sat and spoke to himself in the mirror speaking a language they could not understand to a mirror. Marcel chuckled telling the tale, saying "but because my family was so supportive, it all worked out" (Marcel 5, 2015). Obviously, Marcel's family was a part of his social life that mediated and supported his goals to acquire English; however, the tools he used had to be creatively and self- indulgent; these tools mediated environment to be whatever he needed it to be to gain fluency and eventual success in the language. He told me that he was the oldest child in the family and knew that someday he needed to provide for his parents and younger siblings. He describes,

> I am the first person to learn English… we were a very poor family and my parents only went to grade school and also I wanted to get ahead because we were poor...
>
> (Personal Interview, Marcel 3, 2015)

Here Marcel is positioning himself as poor again, in between reframing his relationship to poverty as a place that created even "more desire" to succeed. His Imagined Destinations within *vivencias* in English drove him to becoming fluent because of his disadvantages, not despite them. Marcel was not less prone, nor less able to learn; on the contrary, he learned because of the *vivencias* to which he was born. Hence, a point that "outsiders" may not be able to see (as discussed earlier) a view that can only be lived and experienced in order to comprehend. This again, interacts well within the concept of self and self-determination as a weapon to control his world and to regulate his thinking process within his recollections as described in A1 and A2.

Marcel attributed his success to his family saying, "especially my mother supported my success in pursuing the path to learning English because she always backed my decisions" and "she was always here even though she didn't know the English" (proof of A2). Marcel also referred to one teacher who inspired him because her accent was so good and "he loved being in class with her" (Personal Interview, Marcel, p. 2) (proof of A1, A2, A3). Other than that, he indicated eloquently there was not a lot of motivation externally in his environment he somehow continued to find paths to learn the language he so desired to acquire. On the other hand, in these examples, Marcel organizes and orchestrates his life in order to gain control over the nature and direction of others' actions within these settings. First, he persuaded his family he was not weird or crazy, and he turned normal tools like a dictionary or a mirror into the magic keys to acquire the language. These tools were described by him when he remembers how he

got a dictionary and started studying vocabulary … "but it was hard because I didn't have anyone to practice with" (proof of A1, A2, A3).

I asked Marcel if he uses these self-proclaimed paths and agencies that we had been discussing with his students, and he very readily and confidently replied—but not with a yes or a no. Rather, he replied with a story, pointing out the power in his autobiographical reflection to externalize his prior language learning into language teaching when he proclaimed,

> I always ask the first question to my students while they learn English -- do they like it? Then I ask them do you? Do you…. watch TV with English subtitles, Do you read English books, on and on until their hands will go down after a while. So I use that as my guide for them to add to their daily lives' stuff they can do each and every day. And they come back to me after a while and tell me now I am doing these things that I recommended and in fact, they are enjoying learning and seeing a difference (A2, A3).

Therefore, whether Marcel was led into this awareness and connection that he declared using as a method in his classroom as a result of the questioning, or whether it had already been activated and acknowledged before, Marcel's own trajectories into English language learning did inspire his students. This autobiographical reflection (A3) clearly relates his language learning experiences to language teaching. Using the narrative as systemic inquiry and in autobiographic detail regulated his path into success as his assets and thus gained immediate control over his circumstances.

One might not clearly see, as the outsider, how these stories of travail and compromise inspired him; however, from my etic point of view I interpret that teacher Marcel, as a fellow Panamánian, someone from a poor family, born in a rural part of Panamá was a representative

member of similar ethnic roots and environment embodying the many angles within the profiles of the students sitting in his classrooms. Teacher Marcel is a role model to his students and he is proud of that very important position (proof of A3). Sharing his *vivencias* in Imagined Destinations, he externalizes his prior learning experiences critically analyzing those experiences and then relating this analysis to his current conceptions of language learning and teaching. His narrative illuminates before, during, and after how he inspires the learners sitting before him and offers them tools of mediation to create their very own Imagined Destinations. From those places, his students are given the opportunity to utilize and control their environments versus go victim to them (inadequate English teachers, poverty, rural, non-English speaking, etc.).

This singular narrative tale gives a picture of Theoretical Framework Three closely, and intimately involves the reader in the importance of narrative reflection for Teacher Education. By reflecting upon his own story, Marcel was able to "ignite cognitive processes" relevant to his professional world as extrapolated from his own reflections of his Journey to Bilingualism.

To conclude Chapter 4 a continuance of examples taken from participant narratives that exemplify the different thematic constructs of analysis are presented in a Table format. As a reminder, thematic construct one is: Imagined Destinations; Subjective Alternatives; Agentive Roles and Unity of Affect and Intellect (in Appendix C). Next, there are further examples of the three Functions of Narrative Analysis used from Johnson and Golombek (2011), which are: Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT); Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE), and, Narrative of Externalization/ Autobiographical Reflection (AR*)* (in Appendix D). All of these functions are explained more extensively in Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 of the dissertation.

4.5.1 Table 5 of Miscellaneous Examples of the Analysis from the Narratives

Function of Analysis	Examples
1 Imagined Destinations (ID) – Possible to imagine another place venturing far beyond boundaries, a assimilating with the help of imagination someone else's historical or social experience and is an essential condition for almost all human mental activity (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b).	*Marcel*: "I always dreamed to interact with native speakers. I imagined myself in a different country imagined me talking to people in English"…
	Tran: "I wanted to be like those girls who helped me in my class – I imagined it"
	Blexi: "I believe that I always liked the language"
	Andi: "When I go back to China, they say, they know everyone will know that I failed and they will say oh because he is playing all the time, he failed"
	Sonia: "When we had vacation I would take those books and I would study those books with my dictionary and to practice I used my sister and I use to stand in front of the mirror… and I would memorize songs too… imagining I could speak the language"
	Blexian: Earlier said, "I always pictured myself in the United States… she further said, I went to the US before I studied, but I knew English because I learned it in the street. I believe that because I liked it and so I always found people and then my former husband was from Norway and so he was my very first English lesson"
2. Subjective Alternatives (SA) - Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González Rey, 2011).	Marcel: "Even though the teachers were not good, I just tried a lot on my own, it was just grammar instruction really I remember I got a dictionary and I started studying vocabulary but it was hard because I didn't have anyone to practice with, we didn't have tourists so I use to practice by myself in the mirror… my parents thought I was having psychological problems "(Marcel 2, 2015).
	Patricia: "Madrid was sending back parents and their kids back to Barbados because he did not want anybody to speak English so you just spoke English at home. My parents thought to keep the language despite the governments saying no English they continued English"

	Yarielis: "The teachers were very conductive but then I got a scholarship to go to a one] year exchange program in the States to Minnesota. I had a terrible time at this time I been 17 I was frustrated and angry with my teachers because they were so bad."
	Andi: "I was frustrating and my class mate usually jokes about it and they laugh at me… and I was angry so I decide I am going to show you something back even if two to three years" Yari: "My teachers were conductive… I was angry that they were so bad"
3. Agentive Roles Played (AR) - Multiple subjective actions that embody emotions and symbolic processes, expectancies that are not cognitive (Moll & González Rey).	Patricia: "I learned Spanish from my classmates… first I learned by communicating and fighting with my peers. Sometimes you learn the bad first"
	Blexi: I went to the US before I studied, but I knew English because I learned it in the street. I believe that because I liked it and so I always found people and then my former husband was from Norway and so he was my very first English lesson. I practiced with him… I was 27.
	Andi: "I didn't know anything about Christianity but as my family is Christian people I will like when I eat with my host family… pray ... I realized that if I want to be a member of the family so I started reading the bible to be close and to improve my English skills"
	Andi: "I was frustrating and my class mate usually jokes about it and they laugh at me… and I was angry so I decide I am going to show you something back even if two to three years"
	Yari: "My teachers were conductive… I was angry that they were so bad"
	Sonia: When we had vacation I would take those books and I would study those books with my dictionary and to practice I used my sister and I use to stand in front of the mirror… and I would memorize songs too…
	Nilsi: But I think what helped me to improve in English was reading because it gave me the confidence to speak so when I was 14 or 15 I started reading all the books in the house.
4. Unity of Affect and Intellect - Unity of Affect & Intellect guarantees control of emotions to correct actions' adequate to the need of the subjects (Moll & González Rey).	Marcel: "I noticed that I was better and more skillful than the rest of my classmates and I use to help them too. I am the first person to learn English… we were a very poor family and also I wanted to get ahead because we were poor"

	Andi: "I was frustrating and my class mate usually jokes about it and they laugh at me… and I was angry so I decide I am going to show you something back even if two to three years"
	Yari: "My teachers were conductive… I was angry that they were so bad"
	Patricia: "Madrid was sending back parents and their kids back to Barbados because he did not want anybody to speak English so you just spoke English at home. My parents thought to keep the language despite the governments saying no English they continued English"
	Marcel: "we were a very poor family and my parents only went to grade school --- I wanted to get ahead because we were poor"
	Patricia: "I learned Spanish from my classmates… first I learned by communicating and fighting with my peers. Sometimes you learn the bad first"
5. First Analysis (A1): Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) - Analysis representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational space to transition into consciousness through: inquiry, reflection, verbalization, to regulate the thinking process (cognition).	Andi: Bible and Mean Classmates
	Patricia: Fighting with peers, parents going against the president's wishes
	Marcel: I got a dictionary and I started studying vocabulary but it was hard because I didn't have anyone to practice with, we didn't have tourists so I use to practice by myself in the mirror… my parents thought I was having psychological problems (Marcel 2, 2015).
	Yari: Scholarship, teacher Cody, pursuing a career in English
	Marcel: Mirror, dictionary, teachers
	Margy/Nilsi: family, books,
6. Second Analysis (A2): Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) - How the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process.	Marcel: Marcel continues to position himself as poor again, however he reframes this relationship of poverty to a place of "more desire" a destination that provided him with more drive to becoming fluent because of his disadvantages.
	Margy: After a time Margy began to cry as though she put it all together in her head or her heart or both. Having suppressed that piece of the story for so long, Margy described how her and her sister really wanted to live with their mom, but that her mom had financial troubles and that living with her dad's abusive 'maltreatment' was an untold secret that she only shared with the chosen few that led her there.
	Sonia: But originally I wanted to study chemistry and my mom asked if I had a backup plan so English

	became my backup.
	Blexi and Sonia: Now people want to learn the language
7. Third Analysis (A3): Autobiographical Reflection (AR) – Externalization of their prior language learning experiences, critically analyzing those experiences, and then relating their analyses to their current conceptions of both language learning and language teaching.	Patricia: Very confidently Patricia talked about how she has "a better comprehension" of her students' process of learning the language. She said, I have a bilingual identity and … I have the value of learning the different languages…
	Yari: "but I decided if I ever became a teacher I would be a good teacher. I am very communicative teacher sand I think they need this and my task is that they can always communicate all basic things and move from there.
	Sonia: "Yes, I tell them if I was able to do that back then and I am from the countryside they can do it too."
	Nilsi: "Well, the students can really be inspired by us and they are young and we can push them to look at the future because they are young and in order to inspire them we must share with them… because then they will trust you to advise them."
	Margy: So I tell my students that nothing should stop you from taking away your dreams… God is always there for you and I try to be an inspiration to them and even though you have struggled coming from a very hard place and poor place … problems… God will always be there for you and he will always take you from where you are into where we want to be

Table 9 - Miscellaneous Examples of Thematic Analysis One

5. Discussions and Conclusions

In the Discussion part of this chapter, the Findings of the study are discussed within relevant areas of scholarship for the purpose of contributing to the ongoing discourse. I begin with a general discussion on the Findings of the research questions that leads into the theoretical, methodological, and the pedagogical contributions of the study leading into a discussion on the implications of the findings for Teacher Education. I then briefly discuss possible limitations and follow-up for future research followed by my Concluding Remarks.

5.1 Discussion

This chapter discusses the *theoretical* insights generated by the current study under the themes that correspond to the categories of analysis in Chapter 4 where the Findings were presented: The Research Questions will be discussed for specific findings regarding the surprises and unexpected outcomes when answering the research questions. Also, a discussion of the differences between participants whose ages of learning the language were in Early Childhood (EC), and those after EC, 0-8 (see Appendix B for RQs), followed in 5.1.1.2 by a brief discussion on similarities and other differences (variations) amongst the narratives; and, finally the transference of the teachers inexhaustible and unique renditions of how their paths to English fluency inspired their students. Next, I discuss Analysis Two that includes Imagined Destinations, Subjective Alternatives, Agentive Roles and the Unity of Affect and Intellect (see Appendix C for the table describing each construct), specifically describing how Imagined Destinations interact amongst the other constructs listed and as were described in greater detail in Chapter 2 and 3. Analysis Three comes next in the reading, which includes the functions of analysis borrowed

from the Johnson and Golombek study (2011): Narrative as a Mediational Tool; Narrative as Systemic Evaluation, and Autobiographical Reflection (see Appendix D for explanations of these functions), which generates discussion of the Findings against the three analyses using narrative to build the knowledge of the teachers journeys to English to support their own L2 learning identities and professional development practices as also discussed in Chapter 2 (2.7). All of these discussions are rooted in finding ways to transform and enhance the professional landscapes for L2 teachers and learners within SLA (again see Appendices C, and D for methods of analyses).

5.1.1 Discussion of Research Questions (RQs) that Informed my Thinking about IDs

From interviewing the Panamánian teachers in examination of the research questions (see Appendix B for RQs), I begin by noting the clarity of the participants' journeys to second language fluency that were evident in both their answers to the online survey (see Appendix A for Survey Preview), and also within their narrative stories. In discussion to answer the research questions, I was most surprised that participants' passionately retold their journeys to English fluency recalling the multiplicity of their agentive roles within their subjectivities, no matter the age of onset into their English trajectories. However, I noticed the participants that learned English in Early Childhood (0-8), although vividly remembering their paths to fluency; participant's memories came from a slightly different place (other than their Imagined Destinations).

Patricia, Nilsi and Margarita's (see 4.2 Vignettes for backgrounds) language trajectories began before school age, indicating their age of second language acquisition on the survey as zero to eight years old (in Panamá you begin school at 8). Beyond the difference in their age of

onset, their bilingual journeys began with English in the home and the role of Spanish was reversed. It is noticeable here, that these three participants went along with their parents' wishes, unlike Moll's (2014) Veronica who "illustrates how a child may come to restrict herself" (that is, self-regulate) and plan her future and the person she will be, by decisions she makes about language. Moll calls this a form of "childhood hegemony" in which she acquiesces to the dominant societies ideologies, versus her family's goals for her, even before she learned the second language (Moll, 2014, p. 98). This was not seen in the three cases from Panamá. This lends me to the realization that furthers personality as a key component in this conversation, as confirmed by González Rey (1999) when he posits subjectivities as always "fluid" and always "deeply singular" (as cited in Moll, 2014, p. 98). It may also show that the stronger the home culture versus the "outside" target culture — the stronger the ideological influences.

As indicated in Chapter 2, the role of the personality and subjectivities of the person also come into play within cultural historical theory. Moll's (2014) Veronica is a perfect example of a personality that shows a different outcome than the Panamánian participants (although Veronica also becomes a successful bilingual speaker). Also, no matter the age of the participants' onset in their second language, being bilingual takes work and is an emotional undertaking. I also observe, the more emotion involved in the bilingual path and, the more occurrences of the unity of affect and intellect the clearer the renditions and mindfulness of participants' paths to L2 fluency as discussed by González Rey. Further important, as stated earlier in the vignettes, Patricia identified the practice of speaking English in her diglossic culture vividly, as shown when she expresses,

> My parents thought to keep their language was to be done and they thought to keep our identity we needed to respect our own first identity… despite the government saying that no English, they still continued English (Personal Interview, Patricia 4, 2015).

The cultural expectations of this practice to keep English as the home language, while learning Spanish outside at school ---along with the emotional configurations attached to it are shown in all three participants' resiliencies to retain both languages even though it was difficult. The diglossia of the black Panamánians' culture recorded in the lived experiences of all three participants continues a practice of keeping English as their first language, learned in the home and Spanish at school with seemingly no questions asked from the children.

Thereby, even though, as narrated in Patricia's interview, continuing to speak English as her dominant language in Panamá when she was a child was inconvenient, it was also potentially dangerous in light of the President's directive to send back to Barbados those who exercised their right to speak publicly a language, other than Spanish. Also seen, was that because the students arrived to school as second language Spanish speakers, their teachers, nor their classrooms, nor the school culture was equipped to deal with their English monolinguality, moreover, the teachers and school did not share in their parents' ideologies to learn Spanish as their L2 in school. In the third case, Margarita's bilingual trajectory put her above the mark in both languages, which fortunately did not have negative ramifications since her school made the decision to put her in advanced courses. In other circumstances, students like Margarita could have been bored if kept in the same grade level subjects. I also noticed how committed all three participants remained at achieving the goals of their parents, despite their difficulties.

Nilsi, who took on mocking cousins because of her inability to develop English proficiency due to her family's move to the countryside (also hard on she and her sister) showed incredible resiliency. Other L2 learners may have disregarded the pursuit of English entirely, or simply given into the societal deficiencies, and discarded the "other" language. The unity of emotions here, intense emotions, feeling frightened, feeling proud, feeling determined, all traced through their stories interestingly enough at these younger ages even though their stories mostly surfaced the wishes of their parents and families. Therefore, the old adage of the earlier you learn a language the easier, is tainted through the lenses of these teachers' narratives within their paths to fluency.

This discussion becomes important when looking at the lack of parental understanding of second language acquisition, especially when the school is fostering a monolingual environment (English only, for example). Often parents go along with the ideologies of the school because they do not understand how L1 literacy facilitates learning the L2. Jim Cummins et al (2000) suggest that encouraging students to continue their native language development while learning their additional languages is beneficial. Regularly, parents assume taking away the first language will help support second language acquisition however, this is not the case. Many skills can be transferred from the first language to the second one. Language identity is also a concern when leaving one language to learn another.

Another question that surprised me was the answers to research question four. As discussed in section 4.3 all of the teachers no matter what the age of onset, found that their L2 learning trajectories to English critically inform their teaching identities and skill in the English classroom. Furthermore, these renditions also inexhaustibly described how the teachers possess

the ability to inspire their students, because of their "non-nativeness" to English. Teachers' prolific stories of why and how they inspire their students because of the methods they used and also the hardships they experienced broadened my view of how a Non Native English speaking teacher not only feels about themselves, but also informs their L2 classrooms. This discussion will be elaborated upon further in 5.4, the Final Discussion.

5.1.1.1 Dynamic Nature of Imagined Destinations: Richness of its Complexity

Another conversation of the dynamic nature of Imagined Destinations is created by the idea of resilience and familial influences. Resilience is a concept related to an individual's positive adaptation in spite of adversity (Luthar, 2006). Familial resilience "advances the idea that families vary in their levels of resiliency and in their strengths or protective factors against negative outcomes" (Orthoner, JonesSanpei, & Williamson, 2004; Patterson 2002: in Marsiglia, 2009, p. 204). In a study examining the relation between family protective factors (familism and family cohesion) with Mexican adolescent youth Marsiglia et al (2009), discuss that

> Resiliency in families—as with individuals—is a process through which family systems and their individual members retain their balance as they confront crises and challenges (p. 204).

Just as family resiliency varies in levels of positive strength to guard against negative outcomes, Imagined Destinations, by virtue of its definition that includes imagination, memory, attention and subjectivities as components of the internal psyche, ***also varies***. The cultural historical origin within the memories of each and every person is unique; consequently, as seen in the teacher narratives, although some common factors interchange, each participants' paths to fluency is as

individual as the participants' names and personalities. González Rey (1999) says that children form their subjectivities but also reconstitute them, using the cultural resources and social processes available to them, which are always fluid and deeply singular. No two children have identical social histories, but instead are "deeply social" for they are always embedded in the dynamics of particular systems of social interaction (Gonzaléz Rey, 1999: cited in Moll, p. 98). As discussed by van der Veer and Valsiner (1991), "Children are not capable of steering their attention towards making use of external means, as they have not mastered their attentional processes and are slaves to external factors," therefore in my cases parents and familial expectations guide them. Therefore, as discussed in 5.1.1 the participants that learned English in Early Childhood (0-8), although vividly remembering their paths to fluency, their memories came from a slightly different place (other than their Imagined Destinations). This variation in gauging Imagined Destinations was shown through the interesting narrations of Patricia, Nilsi and Margy. Familial resiliency must be noted here as an external factor that made a difference.

Of the eight participants in this study, all showed a clear path to English fluency that originated from their subjectivities, and/or familial ideologies with a strong family bond or a diglossic culture that propelled English fluency within their *vivencias* (Patricia, Margy and Nilsi). Marcel discusses his family as his biggest support in his pursuit to learning English even though his parents were monolingual Spanish; Yari pursued a scholarship to study in the US by being, encouraged by her older sister who had received a similar scholarship; and Jeri has the support and encouragement of his church members, his wife and his children. Blexi had a mother who owned businesses which provided Blexi with opportunities to meet English speaking members living in the community. Sonya spoke of the support she received from her husband and children

as well as English teachers she interacted with along the way. Therefore, as stated by Marsiglia (2009) and continued by Hawkins and Weiss (1985), "family cohesion was found to be protective of the goals of the family." Furthermore, according to Hawkins and Weiss, "the individuals reported in the study had very close connections to their families which appears to adhere to traditional cultural norms" (Hawkins & Weiss, 1985: in Marsinger 200, p. 219). Family cohesion was a common strand mentioned in the narratives amongst the eight participants which supports the process from the participants' goal to their successful English learning trajectories.

One final variation of Imagined Destinations comes from the case participant Jeri (see Vignettes, p. 111), who comes from a rural part of Panama. Jeri's age of onset into the English language was in his twenties and his narrative more closely reflects the work of Gardner and Lambert (1972) as discussed in Norton (2013). Jeri's recollection of wanting to learn English was specifically driven for utilitarian purposes. As stated in his vignette, he wanted to be a leader in the church which he *c*urrently serves as minister and then desired a position in the government; both require fluency in English. Norton discusses *instrumental* motivation from Gardner and Lambert as the "desires language learners have to learn a second language" such as "employment, for utilitarian purposes, while *integrative* motivation references the desire to learn a language to integrate into the target community" (Gardner & Lambert, 1972: in Norton, 2013, p. 50). This one variation within the narratives shows that while familial support does buttress participants' English fluency, learning English had not been a part of Jeri's immediate goal within his Imagined Destinations specifically; it was instead, externally located and motivated. However, as one might notice in Jeri's vignette he does always aspire to be in politics.

Perhaps the inclusion of English in his life trajectory began in an Imagined Destination which stemmed from his political motivation rather than a dream to become bilingual.

In conclusion of this section, Imagined Destinations that contain imagination, subjectivities, attention and memory within an individual's cultural historical origin support a process deemed by Vygotsky as a "dynamic system of the psyche beginning within the imagination, set forth through a very specific process of interaction and events within *vivencias*, grounded in culture." As Vygotsky indicated the imagination "takes on a very important function in human behavior and development" for all persons regardless of their nationality, race, socioeconomic position or gender. By the virtue of our birth, we all have the same dynamic system or potential to reach the goals within our imaginations as posited by Vygotsky's conceptualization of imagination that can "venture far beyond social boundaries with the help of our imagination" and we can borrow "someone else's historical or social experience" by virtue of having knowledge of that space that includes our cultural historical origins (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b, p. 17).

Within these variations, the process that stems from participants' Imagined Destinations can be seen as a rich and complex human way of development that contains variability within subjects as unique as individuals' own subjectivities, memories and imagination within *vivencias*. As I grew more aware of learner identities, I came to interpret Imagined Destinations as representing the participants' goals and subjectivities within their imaginations as lines not met, until (unless) activated in participants lived experiences at which time their pursuits (potentially) become fruitful. Also concluded is that the family's support of these "subversive

ideas" assisted the participants in transforming their worlds, once mediated; and secondly, when the ecological construct of familial support is apparent, the outcome is more likely to foster and transform the environment to meet the exigencies of the persons. As taken from Vygotskian theory, language must be unwrapped through historical, cultural, and developmental influences, thereby lending a view that each person, who is learning a language, internally calls upon his or her own perceived places internally, which poses a new trial for teacher education which this study intended to fulfill.

The next discussion of Analysis Two shows a process beginning in Imagined Destinations which follows through the constructs of Agency, Subjective Alternatives, the Unity of Affect and Intellect. This process shows how resiliency in combination with the participants' subjectivities within Imagined Destinations turn potentially dead ends into productive trajectories into second language acquisition and eventual fruitful careers as English teachers, Coordinators, and Supervisors.

5.1.2 Discussion of Analysis Two: Subject, Subjectivities, Imagined Destinations

Analysis Two examines a system found after answering the research questions as described in Chapter 3. This system that begins within the imagination of the participants and includes active agency and self-determination caused a tension in the original pilot study due to unanswered questions within the constructs of Norton's work. These imagined places, coined as, "Imagined Destinations" were defined as a goal (destination) in the minds of the individual that generates potential to organize and orchestrate successful language learners' roads to fluency specifically connected to their emotions and predilections for acquisition that transformed their environments to support successful L2 trajectories. The Imagined Destinations the participants

describe in their stories follow through *vivencias*[i6] that show not only attention to their goals, but also at times, an altering of their situations, which transform into positive spaces of mediation to gain access to their "imagined places" (goals, objectives). These transformations supported their success in English. For example, Marcel orchestrates his desired outcomes transforming his environment by persuading his parents that his behavior to incessantly practice English was normal which in turn facilitates his path; while for Yari – a scholarship and great teachers in the US ameliorated "deficiencies" such as inadequate language learning from poorly equipped English learning environments and teachers – into places that facilitated fruitful learning trajectories by her pursuit and then her acceptance of a full scholarship to an ESL program in Minnesota. Therefore, Imagined Destinations, coupled with *subjective alternatives,* subversive in relation to the dominant, current, social status-- the "ruptures" in the environment explained by González Rey as subjective alternatives, *subversive* in relation to the dominant current social status, showing up as sub-alternates (alternate choices) that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011) were demonstrated within the stories of the participants coherently and seemingly, systematically.

Theoretically, in discussion of temporal dimensions of human development in Vygotsky's work, my interpretation of the concept of the generative nature beginning from participants Imagined Destinations coincide, similarly including memory, attention, imagination, subjectivity and transformation, which may support the reader in understanding IDs more clearly. Memory is discussed by Vygotskian theory according to two lines, *internal* and *external*. In the first phase,

---

[6] Reminder that *Vivencias* in Spanish is identified as a lived experience that shapes someone's character. *Vivencias* are life events that contain emotion. Concept is more extensively explained on page 14.

subjects rely completely on their internal mental processes as we witness the teachers' recollections of their IDs. As discussed by Blexi, Sonya, Marcel and others (as discussed in Chapter 4) there was a "knowingness" they were good at the language, liking the language, and/or feeling an attraction or proclivity toward the language within their imaginations even though they had little exposure to English in their external day to day living. Vygotsky discusses this stage of development as "natural or primitive behavior" that he says is characteristic of pre-school children when they do not use cultural means available to them. This stage is therefore understood as *internal*, and in this study it is seen in the beginning phases of successful second language adult learner's trajectories to successful fluency.

To further this discussion, González Rey's description of "subjective alternatives" is an interpretation of Vygotsky's work on cultural historical theory that also sees "man master[ing] his own mental processes by introducing new, artificial elements into a situation" (in van der Veer & Valsiner, 1999, p. 239) by making choices to mollify deficiencies in the environment through transformations within their worlds. In Yari's story, we notice her taking the deep anger she felt at her "horrible" English teachers full circle by getting a scholarship that eventually ameliorates this deficit in her own ontological record, remembering that by later becoming a good, "communicative teacher" and now a supervisor of English for the President, those "bad" teachers and emotional turmoil she experienced have been truly reconciled. In Blexi's narrative, she began by saying that she "always remembers loving English" to "finding people in her world to speak to" or "going to work on a cruise ship" with English speakers to "marrying a man that's only common language to speak was English" to all of the cases eventually pursuing careers as English Supervisors and Coordinators for the Ministry of Education, shows the eventual

"mastering of mental processes" as discussed by van der Veer & Valsiner (1999, p. 239) in prior chapters. When we notice the creative, new elements and agencies brought forth to each of these unique and individual language learning stories we are witness to active Agentive Roles and the making of deliberate choices to mollify deficiencies in participants' worlds to achieve their goals of English fluency.

Therefore, as seen in Analysis Two, the Unity of Affect and Intellect (function four) was the space where control of the emotions corrected actions adequate to the exigencies of the participants as described within their *vivencias*. As we continue to analyze the stories, we notice the participant's active participation in finding, mediating and/or creating *subjective alternatives*[7] in their environments to support transformations to occur. A very obvious example of this unity was Marcel talking to himself in the mirror, and using dictionaries -- all of which were foreign coming from uneducated parents, a monolingual home environment in a household that did not contain books, or any hint of foreign languages or cultures due to their low socioeconomic condition and rural setting. However, what we do notice in these phases and Stages in Marcel's story is that these externally located behaviors and subjective alternatives clearly began internally as Marcel recalls "always remembering wanting to speak the language in his imagination", to activating a mirror as a tool to learn English. As we examine the Stages of the Mind discussed earlier this participant's Imagined Destination there remains a constant motivator revealing no specific temporal space, but instead this internal idea as a constant throughout his narrative. Those original, internally situated predilections for English that began

[7] Again, subjective alternatives are subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González, 2011).

in Imagined Destinations, despite environments that precluded no positive spaces to foster and develop, deemed generative potential that came from those originally noticed Imagined Destinations leading to a very real idea that unless our L2 learners can begin to imagine themselves interacting in the target language, this internal drive may never be externalized (See Appendix C for the four constructs of the Analysis). This important point is instrumental to L2 classrooms and within Pre and In-service Teacher Education.

Vygotsky's work, although grounded in childhood psychology, was really the study of all human development. A main finding in this study shows how human development that began in teachers' imaginations – when met within *vivencias* as their English language acquisition develops and is mediated over time creates a focus and an attention to the subjects' goals that supports the achievement of the exact goals they had envisioned in their IDs. When defining the participants original goals relayed vividly from their imaginations we can see the process of Vygotsky's work in a theoretical sense. Comparably, as observed in the pilot study and continued in these teacher narratives, the goal is first established within the imagination discussed in Vygotsky's words as the means by which a person's experience is broadened, where the person can imagine a goal (outcome) from another person's recitation (history) and description of what s/he themselves have never directly experienced. The person then is not limited to his/her own "narrow circle and narrow boundaries of his own experience" (Vygotsky 1967/2004, p. 127). And as furthered in Mind in Society that "at a certain point these lines meet, whereupon thought becomes verbal and speech rational" (in *Mind in Society*, 1978, p. 128).

As stated earlier in 5.1.1.2, in my interpretation, Imagined Destinations representing the participants' goals (subjectivities) within their imaginations are lines not met, until activated in

participants lived experiences at which time their pursuits (potentially) become fruitful. As explained by Vygotsky's quotes, imagination has unlimited boundaries. When those goals within their Imagined Destinations meet their *vivencias* through their own generative potential through self-determination the Stages of Mastering Mind are activated lending another tool to be used within Teacher Development so that teachers (like in this study) can reflect upon their own L2 learning trajectories and paths that brought them to their roles as second language teaching professionals. In turn, teachers can be more metacognitively and linguistically aware of cultural historical origins and the power of the imagination coming from Vygotsky's earlier written work.

To further this idea, an important question for SLA is what caused these internal goals to become mediated? Often, people will say, "I always imagined doing that" however, their pursuits were never engaged in their worlds. The difference between them and my participants is that "they" (unsuccessful pursuits/persons) never pursued (activated) the goals "imagined" within their lived experiences. These thoughts that became realities within the minds of the pilot cases and the Panamánian teachers show successful routes to L2 fluency that may be useful when working with second language learners to tap upon.

To further this idea, Zaporozhets (1986) argues that as expressed by Vygotsky, the unity of intellect and emotion helps to regulate the environmental (social) conditions adequately… therefore, we can say that the concept of Imagined Destinations support the correction of actions that are inadequate to the subjects' sense of what is being done with respect to the satisfaction of their present needs and desires. These theoretical frameworks adequately explain the tensions in the pilot study that began in 2014 and that again surface throughout the narrative tales of the teachers' paths to fluency in English and their success as Supervisors and

Coordinators working for the Ministry of Education. These successes, each unique, transformed their environments and created success within a monolingual country struggling to become *Panamá Bilingue*. They are members of a minority of middle class Panamánians to achieve what the President currently issues a directive for the country in order to support the country's economic circumstances. Thereby, important for the L2 learning context: the subjective places and imaginations became (become) as important as the social context for learning and development; person and context become inseparable through subjects' lived experiences.

Therefore, the magnitude of these results may contribute to the literature as proofs and examples of successful stories of bilingualism as compared to unsuccessful ones (only). This dissertation research purposefully only examines agency through successful acquisition to English which are the minority in Panamá.

In sum, the results of this work show the generative potential of Non Native English Speaking Teachers (and the learners in the Pilot) while engaging from their Imagined Destinations -- goals (objectives) in the minds of the individuals that generate their potential to organize and orchestrate successful language learning roads to fluency specifically connected to their emotions and predilections for acquisition. And finally, the results illumine how the externalization of these narratives that include control of symbolic processes stimulated the telling of those stories sufficient to achieving their goals, while serving them in defining their identities as second language learners and teachers.

5.1.3 Discussion of Analysis Three: Functions of Narrative Analysis

As a response to Valsiner's (2009) call urging "cultural psychology to work out and formalize the ways in which its methods can be adequately generated" (p. 30), I offer my first

thematic analysis that found a system following the generative potential of NNESTs paths to L2 fluency. Next, theme two, using the constructs created by Johnson and Golombek (2011), allowing access to further recapitulate the generative nature present within the Panamánian teachers' Imagined Destinations through their narrative retellings, also clearly fits this call from Valsiner. By taking ground in Vygotsky's stages and analysis of imagination as "a completely essential condition for almost all human, mental activity" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b), and by beginning the analysis in the subjects' Imagined Destinations it was easy to observe how the results of the teachers' success in English fluency exploits a view of the specific Agentive roles they played (within *vivencias*) in order to become successful. The results of my inquiry reveal how the teachers' narratives not only supported their development in their language learning worlds, but also how they manifested control of their environments, to regulate their thinking processes transferring to their language learning experiences as teachers in their L2 classrooms. The understanding of how aspects of subject and subjectivity worked together with the social world to influence L2 learning and the experiences of NNES teachers' processes of learning the second language, and from those discoveries, exploring how these mysteries in fact, were integral in planning for the L2 and/or foreign language (FL) learning classrooms was an aim of this dissertation study as outlined in 1.3: Purpose of the Study.

By using narrative inquiry with Panamánian teachers, access to what Benson (2011) calls "language learners' retrospective conceptions of how their language learning developed over the longer term" (p. 165) happened. As a consequence, a broader perspective of individual L2 experiences were seen to be used later in their work as teachers, and specifically used in their classrooms as inspiration to motivate their students. When being asked if the teachers use their

stories in the classroom, teachers relate current conceptions of their own language learning to their students with words and phrases that relay having "a better comprehension" of their students' process of learning the language, to having a bilingual identity, which supports teachers' understanding of their students more comprehensively from a personal point of view. Teachers said,

> "Yes, I tell them (my students) if I was able to do that back then and I am from the country side they can do it too!", *and*
>
> "Well, the students can really be inspired by us and they are young and we can push them to look at the future because they are young and in order to inspire them we must share with them… because then they will trust [us] to advise them." (Personal Interviews, Panamá, 2015)

*See Table 4.5.1, Table 5 for more examples of comments made by the teachers in the study.

Important to note is that all of these statements reveal having the teachers first reflect on the mediation they accomplished, and then moving to "Systemic Evaluation" (*Function 2: How the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process*) they were very easily able to relate their stories to the success of who they are in the classroom as teachers of the same second language and culture. It also supports teachers in feeling empowered due to their abilities to teach and to motivate their students. According to Short and Rinehart (1992) self-efficacy refers to the teachers' perception that they are equipped with the skills and ability to help students learn and are competent to develop curricula for their students. The feeling of mastery, in both knowledge and practice that results in accomplishing desired outcomes, is critical in the teachers' sense of

self-worth and in how much they value the system (in Bogler & Somech, 2004, p. 277). This enhanced view of self and more positive views about teaching… also show detectable changes in teachers' practices and in student learning (Ermeling, 2010). The metacognition teachers gained while stepping back from the hermeneutical process in which they normally engage helped teachers interpret and reinterpret their experiences. By using narrative as a vehicle for inquiry, we can see narrative as a reflective cycle, which can be seen as educative (Dewey, 1902).

As taken from Vygotskian theory, language must be unwrapped through historical, cultural, and developmental influences, thereby lending a view that each person learning a language comes from his or her own perceived places internally, which poses a new trial for teacher education which this study intended to fulfill. As stated by Johnson (2006),

> If one embraces the notion that teacher learning is social, situated in physical and social contexts, and distributed across persons, tools, and activities, then an additional challenge for L2 teacher education is to redraw the boundaries that have typically defined professional development. (p. 213).

Further argued by Johnson and Golombek (2011), the power of the narrative lies in its "ability to ignite cognitive process that can foster teacher professional development… as realized through culture, to legitimate[is] teachers' knowledge generated from teacher inquiry" (p. 504). Hence, this study, from a sociocultural point of view recognizes the concept of self-regulation as tightly linked to context, which supports the self-regulation of learning as it emerges and develops. The functional analysis discussed in Johnson & Golombek's 2011 article uses teachers' narrative activities as tools for teachers' own knowledge-building and professional development practices. The three constructs borrowed from Johnson and Golombek and used for this study were more

closely associated to the actual monitoring of whether teachers were metacognitively aware of their L2 learning experiences, retrospectively; and also established how the eight cases related their historical records to their second language learning classrooms when adapting the function of inquiry to gain insight into their minds and their L2 identities as English learners and teaching professionals – as guided by the research questions.

Throughout this dissertation, these NNES Panamánian teachers explain their language learning trajectories beginning with reflection and verbalization of their Imagined Destinations or the ones originally set forth by their parents' wishes and taken on by them later as English teachers and supervisors for the Ministry of Education. In the third function of analysis teachers critically analyze their own language learning experiences to guide their reflection, which supports them in describing not only their own identities as teachers, but also to critically analyze those experiences to share in their language learning classrooms to support language learning and the identification of their own linguistic identities they formed. Across the cases, it is noticed that the teachers use their own historical records to inspire their students, which leads me to a wider discussion combining the themes of analysis to interconnect these findings to a broader context that will be discussed in the Conclusion of the dissertation. However, let us acknowledge this aim of the study as accomplished and a potential contribution to the literature.

Implications for Methodology, Pedagogy and Teacher Education

This section begins with a discussion on the importance of these methods' in the broader scope of research, followed by a brief overview of pedagogical tools used from Vygotskian

theoretical constructs. Finally, the section ends with a brief discussion on the implications of SCT in Teacher Pre and In-service Education.

5.1.4 Implication for Methodology

Valsiner's (2009) call for the need "to contextualize [cultural psychology's] object of investigation" because context is at the core of culture, shows that "cultural psychology, despite emphasizing the context-dependency of its phenomena has failed to truly contextualize the object of investigation" (p. 30). Here Valsiner calls for a wider version of 'context of the context', "the 'before and after' context" (Valsiner, 2009, p.30).

Therefore, the lens in my research examining the autobiographical tales of the L2 learners' paths to English fluency and later those same learners as successful NNESTs may, in fact deliver what Valsiner is requesting. By deliberately contextualizing the person's (teachers, learners) language learning environments to not only "notice" how the mediation of the social environment interacts with learning throughout successful participants English learning lives, this contextualizing examines the context before, during and after their fluency and success in English, while also consciously contextualizing the objects of investigation to show proof of the generative potential within each context, no matter what the area of the country, gender, or access to the target language (English).

Valsiner calls to "focus on context as a core of cultural psychologies" (Valsiner, 2009, p.30), while González Rey (2011) similarly emphasizes,

> External facts are involved in a self-regulatory process of personality at the moment of one's living a concrete experience or series of experiences. Furthermore, emotion is an expression of the personality's self-regulatory movement facing new experiences (p. 2).

Therefore, as Blommaert (2006), Casanave (2010), Johnson & Golombek (2011) and Valsiner (2009) urge, this work takes precedent in the gathering of information from the "insider" point of view that examines day-to-day "micro-events" as unique. Analyzing both the tension and the conviction of the teachers along their roads to English fluency showing the reader how things that "may not be seen as important, but belong to the implicit structures of people's life" (Blommaert, 2006, p. 684) are essential through the examination of finding out the whys and how's of teachers success in L2 acquisition, which collectively become pieces of their linguistic identity in the L2 classroom.

SLA seeks to advance good pedagogical provisions that will effectively "facilitate learners' assimilation of new systemic knowledge into known knowledge structures" (p. 48). Hall (2002), on the other hand, "doubts that *socio-culturally* informed studies can be easily followed as they offer much different recommendations for improving classroom practices" (Hall, 2002, p. 48). Therefore, as a response to this call and skepticism from Hall, both the methods used and the Findings from this study might be added to SLA literature as facilities to embrace in order to improve L2 classroom practices through the lens of the concept of Imagined Destinations.

In light of the importance of SCT and in Hall's doubts it can be easily followed, structured methods like these can be duplicated to support researchers and teachers in "unwrapping" teacher narratives within the context of their own language learning trajectories, and next, to discern these findings as contributions to be shared and potentially used as tools in both Pre and In-service Teacher Education. As said by Johnson and Golombek (2011) "inquiry into experience enables teachers to act with foresight" in their language learning classrooms (p. 2). Analysis Two and Analysis Three (see Appendix C and D for constructs), when guided by focused research

questions provide systemic ways to evaluate Vygotskian theoretical frameworks through narrative analysis. These methods aim to better understand the generative potential of successful language learners in the field of SLA teacher education and are arguably easy to duplicate in future research.

In the next section, a discussion of how SCT supports pedagogy in the field of second language education is briefly tapped upon. A condensed list of the most popular (essential) SCT pedagogical constructs is displayed in a Table Format for the reader at the end of the section for easy perusal.

5.1.5 Implications of SCT for the Classroom: Pedagogy

So, if we accept the concept of Imagined Destinations and the generative potential within the imagination of our adult learners, what does their learning context (classrooms) look like?

First of all, finding out the background of the participants, and especially why they are in the classroom, is an important finding in this research. What L2 learners and teachers dream and aspire to gain in learning the language, or as in these cases, teach English, is an important consideration for ELL learners. For ELL children, getting to know the families of the students to include the goals the parents have for their children and how those interact within their *vivencias* become important contributions for pedagogical constructs to be used in the L2 environments within a Vygotskian landscape. As Vygotsky stated,

> Education is just as meaningless outside the real world as is a fire without oxygen, or as is breathing in a vacuum. The teacher's educational work, therefore, must be inevitably connected with his [or her] creative, social, and life work.

(Vygotsky 1926/1997, p. 35: as cited in Moll, 2014)

This metaphor used by Vygotsky relaying education outside the "real world" as "fire without oxygen" is a finding of Moll et al (1994, 1995) in the Funds of Knowledge which calls the "deficit model" of student assessment into serious question. . In Moll's work in the 1990's, the Vygotskian concept of lived experience is used as an approach "developed precisely to challenge deficit interpretations of L2 students" (Moll, 2005: as cited in González, 2005, p. 278). This image elucidating how our learners' lived experiences cannot be left out of our classroom ideologies is also reiterated by Lave and Wenger when they purposely ask educators to "consider how the practices of school relate to those outside of school; how schools and classrooms themselves are organized into communities of practice, and what kinds of participation are made accessible to students" (in Zuengler, 2006, p. 51); this is confirmed by the findings in this research.

González, Moll and Amanti's work in the Funds of Knowledge (2005) brings in the "whole child", the family, the culture and the community in order to unwrap and embellish the historical knowledge the child (learner) brings to the classroom – the big bag of jewels that are historically embedded and according to SCT cannot be ignored. Hence, the pedagogy establishing funds of knowledge underlines one way to inform the L2 classroom, or in reality – any SCT classroom understanding of the importance of utilizing the culture and the community of its learners. As discussed by Moll (2015), the idea is for teachers to "appropriate or take possession of these funds and other resources to shape a pedagogy that both connects to students' experiences and engages them academically" (p. 114). Materials designed to support the ritualization of learning and to assimilate the ways that students can internalize advancements through interaction with

symbols from their own cultures and the culture of the target language to which they interact become essential. As discussed earlier, the child's home environment is an essential "pedagogical place" to find the funds available to the child in the home and to transfer them into their school life. Teachers like JoBeth Allen (2015) who uses *Family Dialogue Journals* "to establish relations among students, parent, and teachers" (Allen et al., 2014: in Moll, 2015, p. 115). According to Moll programs that encapsulate "working with others: colleagues, students, family members and community "access resources in order to mediate existing pedagogical constraints and promote desired change" (p. 115). This concept of these types of programs helps teachers develop what Edwards (2005) called "relational agency" to bridge home, school and students (in Moll, 2015, p. 115).

In his book, Moll (2014) discusses alternatives to the disproportion of education referred to as a fire without oxygen when he says,

> As one learns about the social and labor histories of families, one gains from their perspective, an understanding of their historical particulars, their economic grounding, the important lived experiences of adults and children, and their agency in creating new cultural practices to address new needs, all of which generate essential and varied funds of knowledge for family life (p. 119).

Furthermore, in alignment with this research, when we get to know our students and their family histories, the more closely we too support them in the mediation within their own social environments to gain control over the worlds to which they were born, eventually forming and molding the goals from their Imagined Destinations within *vivencias*.

The table below continues to speak to the specific ways teachers are able to facilitate optimal learning according to Vygotskian theoretical constructs essential to learning as described in the table below. The SCT learning environment incorporates some fundamental concepts listed below. First is the concept then the definition followed by the section on the right listing and/or explaining how the concept might be used in the L2 learning environment.

Pedagogical Constructs for the L2 Classroom (Moll, 1995, 2005, 2014, 2015)	
Concept	Definition and Examples
ZPD- Zone of Proximal Development	Vygotsky's (1987) conception of the zone of proximal development (ZPD) "is the distance between the actual developmental level as determined by independent problem solving and the level of potential development as determined through problem solving under adult guidance, or in collaboration with more capable peers" (p. 89).
Examples of ZPD	• Challenging students (through mentorship) one level above their current level of aptitude through coaching and facilitation of learning from peers, an expert, or an adult (computer program, cell phone, etc.). • When students are learning from imitation, they are at their optimal level of learning. Therefore, group work in some forms, brainstorming, modeling, and peer reviews are all classroom practices that reinforce this concept. • Writing down objectives in the planning process, which are then explicitly shared with the learners at the beginning of the class and as a wrap-up at the end facilitates the ZPD.To enhance this process, we might also ask the students to expand upon or even change objectives after examining and discussing them.
Metacognitive skills	Reflecting on one's own thinking and learning, are the hallmarks of the successful learner. When thinking about thinking becomes a critical tool of self-reflection, one has most likely entered a Vygotskian landscape (classroom).
Examples of MS	• K-W-L

	• Brainstorming • Group work • Given objectives and asked to add to them • Reflection of learning, what the students know
Dynamic Assessment.	Similar to the concept of ZPD, dynamic assessment theory focuses on both the interactionist and interventionist approaches in the learning process. In this way of thinking, the instructor focuses less on attempting to get the answer or complete a task and more on supporting the learner's development of cognitive abilities.
Examples of DA	• The assessor prompts the child with hints and references to past learning. For example, the assessor might say, "Did you hear a pattern in the letters?" or, "Is this problem like any other you have seen before?" (Lantolf & Poehner, 2008, p. 37). • The teacher dynamically assesses each student individually or within groups. • Examples of DA look like assessment during the learning process while the student is dissecting and actively involved in achieving the answer, instead of memorizing for a test to regurgitate answers.
Microgenesis/Phlyogenesis/Ontogenesis	According to Vygotsky's genetic law of cultural development, learning that the human race has passed through happens over successive generations (phylogenesis). Vygotsky (1978) calls the learning from infancy "ontogenesis" (p. 224). Human beings remain capable of learning throughout their lives, and the learning process remains tied to social and interactional means, historically.
Examples	• Rituals that children learn through over time
Scaffolding	The promotion of L2 learning and acquisition as interactive and needing coaxing and tools always within that proximal zone of development is the key point in scaffolding. Like a painter that needs a scaffold to paint each new height of a wall or building so too the child's learning should be instigated in order to make sense of the content

	and to be on the next line of knowledge.
Example of scaffolds	• Since successful learning must shift from inter-mental activity to intra- or individual learning, dialogue that directs the attention of learners to key features of the environment and also prompts them through successive steps of problems (scaffolding), is needed in order for the learner to become autonomous. • These tools of mediation support the learner in growing and developing towards learning objectives rather than remaining at the student's current ability like: mother language, tools, artifacts, mentors, prompts, visual media or anything that takes the learner from where they are to the next level. • Montessori Education
Internal speech	Vygotskian idea signifying that learners naturally rehearse language as they learn it. • Independent work in groups, or individually with apparatus children can figure out while teachers observe to "notice" where they are alone vs with a group. • Also a place they can rehearse learning aloud
Examples of Internal Speech	• Teachers formulate tasks that encourage students to practice what they learn by speaking to themselves and aloud • Taping voices, • Chatroom • Practicing with partners • Playing games to review and reinforce inner speech natural to the learner
Parental Programs (Arias & Campbell, 2008, pp. 1-22)	Must include: 1. Implementation of traditional parental involvement programs which are culturally relevant and linguistically appropriate. 2. Funds for the implementation of non-traditional parental involvement programs that reflect a reciprocal involvement in the school/parent community.

	3. Support the professional preparation of teachers who can identify community funds of knowledge for curricular development and school outreach. 4. Support community-based education programs that inform parents about school values and expectations and work with parents to help them become advocates for their children.
Additional Parental Program Outreach	• English as a second language programs for parents to learn English on the weekends, or after school. • Mother Language Programs for the children set up and run by the parents.

Table 10 – Vygotskian Pedagogical Constructs for the L2 Classroom

In continuation of these same lines of reasoning for L2 students, NNESTs must also be considered within these important ideologies located for ELLs if these positions of reasoning and purposes are fulfilled within the context of the second language teacher discussed more conclusively in 5.4 of this dissertation.

5.2 SCT and Teacher Development

Hall (2000) addresses the complexity of teaching second language learners when she says, "Effecting change in our [L2] classrooms will not result from imposing solutions from outside, but from nurturing effectual practices that are indigenous to our particular contexts" (p. 295). As one might predict from the many concepts discussed in this dissertation research, especially in light of Imagined Destinations within *vivencia*s as set forth in previous pages, framing practices specifically under the domain of SCT might be seen as a difficult endeavor because of its fluidity, its uniqueness to each individual, and in consideration of each home

environment (cultural-historical record) needing to be deliberated. As seen in the teacher narratives, although some common factors interchange, for the most part each path to fluency was unique according to the persons' subjectivities in teachers' Imagined Destinations within *vivencias*. Awakened to the multiplicity of learner identities, and the complexity of teacher beliefs, to a sudden awareness of the vitality of macrostructures---social, cultural, political and historical constructs—that shape and reshape the microstructures of our pedagogic enterprise, the obvious exploration of new avenues as set forth must be reconnoitered (Kumaravadivelu, 2006, p.75).

Kumaravadivelu (2006) furthers that the opportunities afforded by post method pedagogies support practicing teachers to develop their own theories of practice, which is another obviously multifarious factor to consider. When realizing the responsibility of dynamic systems versus the one-size fits all approaches of the past, I concur with Hall's statement that imposing solutions from outside will not work, but from nurturing effectual practices that are indigenous to particular contexts that will more closely, in-turn, secure L2 learners success.

On the contrary, as stated by Johnson (2006), unfortunately "most L2 teachers continue to work in institutions in which they, their students and their instructional practices are constructed by the positivistic paradigm that defines good teaching in terms of student performance on standardized tests and conceptualizes learning as [solely] internal to the learner" (pp. 217-218). Therefore, in continuation of this cry for further reflection in teacher research, by using narrative analysis from the 2011 Johnson and Golombek study, coupled with narrative comments made by teachers in 2010 (see Appendix H for narrative comments (2010); teachers' voices when heard are shown to be useful to their L2 jobs and their classrooms

through their narrative autobiographical renditions of their stories to L2 fluency and as results reflective of teachers' opinions from their narrative analysis (Panamá 2010). These results highlight that the use of teacher narrative activities can function "as tools for knowledge-building and professional development practices that are working in consort to transform the professional landscape that constitutes the field of Second Language Teacher Education (SLTE) (Johnson & Golombek, 2011, p.1).

Teachers in my second study hands-down felt their identities as NNESTs and ELLs supported their classroom practices and further inspired their students, discussed as narrative proofs in Chapter 4 (see 4.5.1 for Table 5 of narrative proofs). As this study's findings indicate: the subjective places and imaginations become as important as the social context for learning and development; and, person and context become inseparable through lived experiences, unwrapping and retelling the stories of teachers' desires important to their own contexts and contents is an undeniable right and necessity. We need to acknowledge this if we are truly going to make a difference in Teacher Development in light of what we know based on the findings of successful L2 learners and teachers in this study (alone).

The following section will discuss other important contributions from mine and other contemporaries' research to continue to inform Teacher Development and Education.

5.2.1 Possibilities within SCT Complexities for Teacher Development

Johnson and Golombek (2002) state that, "We have learned how the structure of teachers' beliefs, assumptions, and background knowledge play a crucial role in the classroom decision-making process" and how "language teaching and learning are shot through with values and imbued with moral meaning" (Johnson, 2003, p. 1). Their research sets forth teachers'

journaling and reflection as a way to "get at" their own teacher and linguistic beliefs within teacher professional development and education. By utilizing reflective journals, or as done in my study through reflective questioning guided by the research questions, teachers have the power to self-analyze and develop their own insights to make realizations about their own linguistic identities that affect teaching practices in their classrooms. This self-analysis however, really comes to life via coaching and sharing with fellow teachers in order to "ignite cognitive processes" as emphasized by Johnson and Golombek (2011, p. 3). When we further this to include *Family Dialogue Journals* to create open dialoguing between home, school and community we are supporting our teachers in developing "relational agency" (Moll, 2015) which further expands reflective relationships "to inform practices, but not determine them (p. 115).

Therefore, looking at teachers as users and creators of knowledge with their students and communities, it becomes clear that a combination of collective decision-making must be an interactive process. These triangular interfaces empower teachers as active and essential participants in the cultural mix of their own teacher development. These interactions do not begin or end; they are continuous, flowing, and dynamic. The interactions deemed profitable for the L2 learner then, are also essential to gaining insight into the teachers' identities and their investments in the L2 learning classrooms. Insight into teachers' identities as foreign/second language professionals is essential in the process of teacher development.

As teachers' voices and identities are reflected upon, not only to themselves but also to their cohorts, there will be a knowingness and empowerment within their teaching communities that will transfer to their classrooms. When teachers utilize their own stories within L2 learning pathways these stories can unfold as inspiration to their students. The traditional theory/practice

dichotomy is counterproductive within the Vygotskyan landscape and therefore must be reconstructed.

Praxis, Mentors, Coaches

Therefore, in light of these claims -- the construct of praxis (Freire, 1970) is more suitable for the preparation of teachers because it captures how theory and practice inform one another and how this transformative process informs teachers' work (Carr & Kemmis, 1986; Edge & Richards, 1998; Simon, 1992). Reminiscent of Vygotskian theory, this discussion of mediation and mentorship identifies mentors as tools to support learning with an understanding that abilities are not considered learned until they are observed in independent performance and pushed forward through specific forms of intervention and social interaction between learners (Vygotsky, 1997). As Murdoch (1997) (in concert with the point made by Vygotsky) argues, the teachers' course must reproduce engaged hands-on learning experiences not only for them to produce under the guidance of a mentor (trainer, teacher educator), but also in order to "observe [them] in independent performance…through specific forms of intervention" before the teachers are expected to be able to foster those learnings in their own classrooms, independently.

Optimally teacher development includes Mentors as guides; more popularly called "Coaches" in order to view themselves within the praxis of more seasoned teachers. This widely recognized and effective professional development approach (Teemant, 2014, p. 143) is an effective strategy before the In-service teacher has internalized the content and can reproduce it in their classrooms. Furthermore, practicing concepts learned within professional development

scenarios with fellow teachers as "observers" tends to create a social network by which the teachers learn from one another. This process of practicing concepts in a safe environment also supports teacher confidence and provides interaction as essential and invaluable tools that mediate the teachers' success once they reach their classrooms (Schultz, R., 2007). Also, teacher development ideally should be followed up by the Mentor/Coach into the teachers' world so that feedback in their authentic environments can be given. This mentoring and coaching relationship can be done with the administration, fellow teachers and/or the actual coach/trainer to which the original learnings were taken.

In summation, guidance and opportunity for teachers to practice their knowledge should not only be done within one professional development venue, although this one-time approach often occurs. Follow-up sessions to recheck and to reframe the teachers' development once they have reached their classrooms is important in order to see how much of the workshop (preservice, in-service) information was mastered and transferred in their classrooms. In addition, follow-up sessions by the teacher educator (mentor, trainer) most optimally should be done in the form of observations at the school and in teachers' actual classrooms, so that the gap between theory and teacher praxis, become a steady diet for the novice teacher with a more experienced mentor. Teacher observation and feedback sessions should be dynamic and formative versus formal and punitive. Below, I will discuss ideas of specific ways Teacher Development venues might continue in light of SCT and these research findings as found when in Panamá as an ELF working from 2008 – 2010 (Palumbo, 2011).

Teacher Findings in Panamá ELF Project/ 2009-2010

In a similar vein as aforementioned in the previous section, and within my previous work as an ELF (see 2.9.2 for that description), after training over 2000 teachers in Panamá in the two years between 2008 – 2010, I performed an analysis that triangulated positive LAS proficiency testing results and found within teacher narratives why students gains were significant (.05 change in listening and speaking scores gained) according to the teachers who taught them. The teachers indicated which elements within their Teacher Development sessions made the biggest difference. I argue, especially in light of the findings indicating that both the generative potential and the cultural historical origins of the teachers are significant, that their input into the training process matters. Furthermore, as elucidated in Analysis Three, narrative reflection from teachers embraces the notion that teacher learning is social, situated in physical and social contexts, and distributed across persons, tools, and activities, which was clearly a call from research as "an additional challenge for L2 teacher education" (Johnson & Golombek, 2006, p. 213). Asking teachers the right questions to guide their own quests to find their identities as L2 teachers and learners, which can then lead their own trajectories from a meta-awareness and reflective state within their classrooms might influence the new boundary configurations spoken of by Johnson (2006).

Further stated in Chapter 2, was a call for teacher awareness from an 'active transformative stance' suggesting that people "come to know themselves and their world as well as [become] human in and through the processes of collaboratively transforming the world in view of their own goals" (Stetsenko, 2008, p.471). Shown in both the study done in 2010 with the teachers in Panamá (in 2.9.3) as well as the narrative retellings examined in this dissertation teachers' awareness of their own second language learning experiences unfold when asked the

right questions. Below is a short description of the four suggestions made by the teachers reminiscent of the Vygotskian landscape we aim to create before the Final Discussion. Teachers' comments pointed to the following components as integral to effective teacher professional development within their own reflections of working with a Mentor and Coach over a two year span of time (Palumbo, 2011). They were:

1. Feeling empowered as decision makers within the context of their own classroom in order to accept the strategies they have learned and integrate them accurately and with confidence;
2. Seeing themselves as a model and guide for peers in order to master the techniques they need to develop while in the training scenario;
3. Being empowered to take risks and critically reflect so that they can in turn teach their students how metacognitive thinking works and how it can improve their own learning.

A short description of these four items are described below, first in my words, and then briefly in their own comments.

Teacher as Decision Maker

As discussed above, in a Vygotskian landscape learning with a Mentor (coach) supports the teacher in imagining their own abilities when given consistent opportunities to "practice" skills needed to be transferred to their classrooms within the zone of proximal[8] and distal development[9]. Therefore, a combination of collective decision-making should be an interactive

[8] Zone of Proximal Development: Designed to facilitate analysis in action (Moll, 2014, p.76)
[9] Distal Development: Contains countless intermediate zones of proximal development. The ultimate goal, object of desire (Figure 2.2, Moll, 2014, p. 79)

process between mentor, novice teacher, and their students. Empowerment of the teachers comes about at least in part by carefully modeling and practicing concepts learned within the setting of the training scenario so that teachers learn from one another. This process also lowers the affective filter (Krashen, 1983), and increases teacher confidence and self-awareness. Practicing with fellow teachers was proven to be an invaluable to support the teachers' success once they reached their classrooms (in Schultz, R., 2007) and as they began to see themselves as active participants in their own Imagined Destinations, Agentive Roles were motivated, and friendships were activated (unity of Affect and Intellect).

Teachers as Models and Guides for Each Other

Teacher training must model and guide teachers before they are expected to be independently successful in their classrooms with their students. A poignant example of this strategy: in multiple locations where I was training teachers, a participant would recognize that I was using the sequence and strategies I expected them to learn within the context of their training. And without a doubt and usually without a hand raised, a person will interrupt to say, "Christine, you are doing the (SIOP) Model… you are modeling and using exactly what you want us to do and use… (OMG)… I get it!" Please note that I explicitly tell the teachers to recognize and question everything they see consistently throughout the sessions from the opening. However, in my experience it takes them watching and learning and seeing and doing multiple times to truly "get it."

Teacher as Empowered Individuals Who Consistently Reflect on All Aspects of their Work

As discussed throughout this dissertation, teacher reflection is urged to be included as a part of teacher development. Using teachers' narrative activities as tools for teachers' own knowledge-building and professional development practices supports teachers in monitoring their own beliefs in the classroom as well as identifying their concerns and their progress in their own development. The three constructs borrowed from Johnson and Golombek (2011) were more tightly associated to the actual monitoring of whether teachers were metacognitively aware of their L2 learning experiences, retrospectively. Teachers who understand how to reflect on their own lessons and classes are more likely to support their students in applying these skills. Teachers can promote this reflection by being explicit about the particular learning goals they have set for the class and by guiding the students in setting their own learning goals. It is these reflective skills, or *reflecting on one's own thinking and learning* that is the hallmark of the successful learner. This thinking about thinking becomes a critical tool of self-reflection, which is an important component of teacher development and has been emphasized as an important factor in the success of learning endeavors (Anderson, 2002).

The following narratives taken from the teachers' comments in a survey given in Panamá in 2010 to teachers from different provinces exemplified how empowered they felt as a result of their In-service experiences over the course of working with them over two Fellowships. As the teachers' comments' point out, the positive experiences and respect for their own learning as well as the sharing of activities amongst each other was a variable within the findings that influenced the improved listening and speaking proficiency scores of their students as measured over time. Maybe most importantly is the teachers' ability to critically reflect and consciously

monitor their own progress within their own Imagined Destinations set as personal goals they see for themselves with their own lived experiences.

Survey narrative responses to questions answered by Panamánian Teachers from 2009- 2010
The following narratives taken from the teachers' comments exemplify how empowered they felt as a result of their work with the ELF. As the teachers' comments point out, the positive experience and respect for their own learning as well as the sharing of activities amongst each other as well as their conscious monitoring of their own learning was a variable in the improvement of LAS listening and speaking proficiency scores.
Comment One: "Definitely I have taken activities that I apply for sure in the classroom and they make my classes more engaging due to the students are learning through games or other activities they are not related to. Another aspect is giving feedback to my students every time they try to use English and apply what I teach in the classroom."
Comment Two: "Exchange of different activities among teachers. Talks and seminars to improve our teaching skills and language proficiency (such as pronunciation).
Comment Three: "The way … Christine developed our inner power and leading us to be creative, practical, and competitive and specially believe in ourselves. I feel confident with the model but would like to participate in another training to clear my doubts."
Comment Four: "I have improved my teaching and my command of the language"
Comment Five: "In some cases, I have copied the routines, activities and energy the Fellow has"
Comment Six: •"Other aspect of the trainings that has supported my ability to teach English are the dynamic and games activities, that help students to develop their thinking, listening, speaking, and writing skills, as well as to improve vocabulary, reinforce grammatical structures, and so on." And," Other aspects of the training that are supports my ability to teach English to my students are: Early Bird Activities Transitions (like 5-4-3-2-1) Power listening Ticket in Warm ups Wrap ups Ticket out"
Comment Seven: "They help me to make a wiser use of class time, as well as having in mind the importance of my students doing the talking most of the time. The specific content and language objectives have given me the opportunity to achieve what I expected from the class."
Comment Eight: "I consider that I have improved my ability to teach using the model. The emphasis on developing listening activities, increasing interaction in the target language among students themselves, and the continuous assessment (not only for grading), have been the most relevant aspects that help me to improve my profession. I know that I'm not an excellent teacher, but with the SIOP model I am on the way."

Table 11 - Survey Narrative Responses (Palumbo, 2011)

In sum, Vygotskian theory discusses mediation and mentorship as tools to support learning with an understanding that abilities cannot be considered learned until they are observed in independent performance and pushed forward through specific forms of intervention and social interaction between learners (Vygotsky, 1997). Repeat trainings and follow-up on the same pedagogical models to be learned in an educational context with mentors

and peers, and then follow-up visits to the teachers' classrooms are all important parts of lifelong learning for the teachers. Including teacher reflection as the guiding force within their development, and as decided by them in order to utilize their own cultural-historical origins guides their own learning, driven by their language and teacher identities.

However, with all of these ideas --- methodologically, theoretically and practically setting the stage for what the Vygotskian landscape looks like, feels like and encompasses, one conversation is missing. The next section discusses the main context of this dissertation – the Non Native English Speaking Teachers (NNESTs) and their potential contribution to the SLA field.

5.3 Final Discussions: NNEST Consideration to the L2 Classroom

The final discussion assembles an important conversation, which draws upon a larger argument based on the dissertation's interconnected analyses, which may or may not be obvious to the reader. This fourth view of second language acquisition, I appropriate as *Imagined Destinations* lends an eye to a broader context begun to investigate the L2 learners' trajectories within the concepts of imagined communities, identities and investment. This fourth phase of L2 acquisition further relegates *deficit* perspectives (see discussion of deficit perspectives in 2.8), often ubiquitous in cultural contexts outside of the target language and culture. Principally, the enormous value of teachers that are not only native speakers of the second or foreign language (English) but, more so, the bilingual teachers who come from a different mother tongue than the language they are teaching.

The teachers examined in the dissertation research acquired the target language they teach either simultaneously, bilingually, or otherwise as an additional language. Imagined

Destinations show us how a second language teacher of English might provide better insight, intuition and skills into the L2 classroom because of their lived experiences, *vivencias* that transform from their Imagined Destinations. Evidence to validate the relevance and optimal situatedness of non-native foreign and second language teachers of English were demonstrated within the Findings of this research. Non Native English Speaking professionals who have long been said, NOT to be adequate teachers of the target language (English, Spanish, French, etc.), due to accents and dialectal differences (deficiencies). These proofs, found in teachers predilections for learning English combined with the information of how their identities and trajectories became important sources to their classrooms reveal the power within their *vivencias* as told in teachers' narratives.

When we utilize Vygotskian SCT theory to dismantle "deficit perspectives" and utilize lived experiences as elucidated in this research, it would be a huge oversight not to also recognize NNES teachers as powerful agents and participants in their own L2 success that can be shared to support their students' L2 success. When we look at NNESTs and their L2 students as *Funds of Knowledge* and amply challenge interpretations of L2 students and their Non Native speaking teachers as deficient, or lacking, and instead remember who they are and where they have been within the Vygotskian constructs analyzed in this research, we honor the results of this work.

We also illumine what Peter Medgyes (1994) discusses regarding this often relegated topic, when he says,

> NNESTs have the capacity to be good role models to their students due to their insight into the "other" culture and language, especially in anticipating the road blocks in the L2 learners' environments to which they mutually share.

As he continues, the NNEST can also be seen as a better anticipator of language learning difficulties while having the likelihood of being more sensitive to language learners' needs and better facilitators of language learning as a result of a shared mother tongue. By participation in a shared culture and having achieved success in English, and as demonstrated in this research, their stories can be shared to inspire and motivate their students. Further discussed by Medgyes – these non-native teachers can be effective providers of learning strategies because of their own roads to fluency and the trajectories of their language learning experiences.

In my point of view, and based on the deliberateness of the teachers' stories as being actively used in their L2 English classrooms, in a number of ways these NNESTs reveal the funds of knowledge, the insight, and inspiration available to their students and to the pedagogy they are able to provide-- from their own language learning continuum. Consequently, by teachers' sharing their own life histories into successful fluency with their students, a more tangible representation of which the L2 student may see themselves. In further alignment is the image Vygotsky coins for imagination when he says that within human development we (humans, learners) conceptualize something from another person's narration and description of what s/he him/herself has never directly experienced. Furthermore, they are not limited to the narrow circle and n boundaries of their own experiences (1967/2004). As in the teachers responses to the research questions posited, there is a powerful chance they can become the role models needed to inspire their students to generate their own potentials in similar L2 learning contexts.

When we examine and believe in the power of the human potential to develop from their own imaginations, it is our duty as ESL/EFL professionals to meet our L2 learners there – in their Imagined Destinations, especially from the power of their own stories and voices. Too often, the second culture learner is looked at from a subtractive perspective, which does not synch with the Literature, or the Findings of this research. Programs' advocating for the second culture utilizing Methods like Funds of Knowledge, Mother Language Programming, Green Paper et al we ignite the students' internal imaginations uncovering what they dream to achieve when given the opportunities and when equipped to activate all the right tools in their toolboxes and environment to be exactly what they need it to be with our facilitation.

When we do not recognize the way we frame NNESTs and do not include them as integral pieces of second language learning by honoring the process of second language writing (Harklau, 2000) or any L2 learning (Moll, González, Freire, Kress, Norton) we set them up for failure and the results are the opposite of any goal set for them to succeed.

In summation of this section, the relationship argued by Kanno and Stuart (2011) and found central in the work of Freeman & Johnson (1998) – "to include a deeper understanding of identity formation and development of the teachers", as begun within teachers' Imagined Destinations deems an important factor in the knowledge base of teacher education and development. IDs show the generative capacity of the human potential beginning in their imagination and then actively seeking and transforming within successful language trajectories into success. Narrative reflection as pursued by Johnson & Golombek and used as a Method in this study, shows the transformational power of metacognition within teacher development, and therefore is further urged to continue in Teacher In-service development and education.

5.4 Future Directions and Emerging Themes

The purpose of this study is to foreground subjectivities and Imagined Destinations as a process to examine successful second language learners' paths and trajectories to English fluency. The relevance of the study lies, in part, in the sample itself. A main finding show how human development that began in teachers' imaginations – when met within *vivencias* as participants' English language acquisition developed and was mediated over time: became a focus and an attention to the subjects' goals that supported their achievement. When defining the participants original goals (aims, objectives) relayed vividly from their imaginations, we can see the process of Vygotsky's work in a theoretical sense. This finding advances knowledge in the expected direction that this dynamic system posited by Vygotsky, in fact, exists. Consequently the dynamic nature of Imagined Destinations and the role of the internal system of the psyche by virtue of these findings calls for a wider version of 'context of the context', "the 'before and after' context" (Valsiner, 2009, p.30). Therefore, to enrichen the dynamic nature of IDs comparing these results to persons who deem themselves unsuccessful in their attempts to learn the second language, this process may be further illumined. Since this study only monitors the process from the lens of the successful second language English learner comparing Imagined Destinations within a population of students that did not become fluent, and instead were either distracted within *vivencias*, or that never mediated their internal goals to the external environment, further study on how the generative potential of L2 learners were "overpowered" instead of "empowered" in this process is urged for in order to advance knowledge of the complex and rich nature of IDs.

Another future direction to the study will be to share this work with the Panamanian teachers and to see how they have integrated the identity work accomplished into their jobs as supervisors and coordinators. Progression of how teachers' learnings and insights have supported *Panamá Bilingue* might elucidate further proofs that this type of narrative research that includes self-reflection and monitoring of their own ELL paths to fluency can be used as tools for L2 teacher development. In addition, follow-up visits to instigate further reflection with the same supervisors and coordinators in order to continue the process of "ignit[ing] cognitive processes from the narrative inquiry work" done (Johnson & Golombek, p. 3) is recommended.

An emerging theme of the dissertation research was the uniqueness of the context of the teachers' studied (NNESTs from Panama); therefore, follow-up to this study might include other NNESTs who are not supervisors or coordinators not only to locate IDs; but, also to encourage teachers to use their stories as a part of their language learning classrooms. Also distinctive is that these narrative analyses examine the cases first by focusing on the teachers as language learners, and then transfers those L2 trajectories into their roles as L2 teachers and administrators of English as a foreign language in Panamá. Thus, continuing this quest to measure how Imagined Destinations serve teachers in gauging their own linguistic identities and as stories to share as inspirations in their classrooms was also an important finding of this study that is urged to be duplicated. To further add to the view of IDs and because the bilingual paths of the participants seemed to follow tumultuous paths in the narratives, I think a group of bilinguals who learned English simultaneously from birth may lend an interesting view of the complex nature of the bilingual mind as compared to the participant narratives in my study.

5.5 Closing Remarks

Although these findings cannot be generalized to all Non Native English Speaking Teachers or L2 learners, this study contributes to the existing knowledge positing the process deemed by Vygotsky as a dynamic system of the psyche beginning within the imagination, set forth through a very specific process of interaction and events within *vivencias*, grounded in culture. Recognizing participants coming from their Imagined Destinations was a unique way to show successful learners' paths to English fluency as a process theorized by Vygotsky and interpreted by Gonzalez Rey (2009,2011), Moll (2014),van der Veer and Valsiner (1991, 1999). This view of subjectivities and generative potential within *vivencias r*ecognizes the complexity and richness of EL learners' paths to second language fluency showing the multiplicity of learner identities, and the complexity of teacher beliefs, "to a sudden awareness of the vitality of macrostructures---social, cultural, political and historical constructs—that shape and reshape the microstructures of our pedagogic enterprise…" (Kumaravadivelu, 2006, p.75) that elucidates the importance of the strategies and the resilience teachers used to become successful English language learners. Instead of seeing successful language learners into English from a marginalized place, this research notices the agency and the power that comes from these eight Panamánian teachers' subjective choices and predilections for Imagined Destinations into English (Spanish) that transform within their environments from one place to the next within successful cultural and language acquisition.

Kumaravadivelu's (2006) discussion of the awareness and progress made in the "sociocultural turn" awakens us to the necessity of making methods-based pedagogies more sensitive to local demands. The opportunities afforded by post method pedagogies support practicing teachers to develop their own theories of practice, promoting the benefit of a

dynamic system as compared to the cookie cutter approaches of the past. Since we've learned how the structure of teachers' beliefs, assumptions, and background knowledge play a crucial role in the L2 classroom, as based on the findings with NNESTs, and L2 university students in this study, and how "language teaching and learning are shot through with values and imbued with moral meaning" (Johnson, 2003, p.1), this dissertation not only adds a view of the generative potential of second language learners into fluency, it also adds a new way to monitor Vygotskian theories, beginning with teachers and learners' Imagined Destinations. Furthermore, this research acknowledges how the NNEST adds a perspective to the L2 classroom, potentially not available to a native speaking teacher of their first and only language.

As argued in this investigation, and antagonistic to a deficit perception of culture, this research notices how people use their desires and predilections for English within their cultural historical origins, despite deficit outlooks by "outsiders" who might very likely see those worlds as inadequate. Within the elements of Vygotsky's definition of imagination, and as described from the Panamánian teachers' successful trajectories from their Imagined Destinations, every person regardless of their socioeconomic status, or ethnicity has an equal playing field to create their goals and aspirations within their lived experiences no matter how poor or limited those places may be to an "outsider" (Blommaert,2006). Teacher's subjectivities, born in their imaginations, supported the successful learning and eventual teaching of these eight NNESTs second language. Further explained, due to teachers' subjectivities and proclivities toward L2 learning, when the environment does not provide what is needed, the subject's *subjective alternatives* pose new norms and are considered an option in their environment. Furthermore,

once accomplished by the individual—this force was noticed (activated) because of the internal goal that began in their Imagined Destination ecologically (naturally) evolves.

In an era that is especially challenged to "prepare monolingual and culturally inexperienced Inservice teachers to educate learners who are culturally, linguistically, economically or learning diverse in equitable ways" (Teemant, 2014, p. 136) – considerations set forth through this research add lenses that have not been used in adult second language learners, especially in relationship to NNESTs, often discounted due to accents, or deficit themes. Because this research gives easily observable and logical understanding of how the Non Native English Speaking Teachers and learners contend with, and add insight to, their own L2 learning environments, the findings of this dissertative research enhances an additive view of second language learning as foretold within teachers lived experiences (vivencias) as powerful ways to inspire their ELL students and how to inform their L2 learning classrooms. Recognizing imagination as a concept of all language learners, as posited by Vygotsky as "with equal potential to generate L2 proficiency within their own environments, and further distinguishing imagination as "a completely essential condition for almost all human, mental activity" (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b;in Moll, 2014, p. 194), this look at second language learning of both NNES teachers and L2 learners provides additional material to L2 literature in the twenty-first century as taken from these narrative research findings born in Vygotsyan cultural historical theories within SCT.

This dissertation research celebrates Vygotsky's work and contemporary researchers' interpretation and implementation of Sociocultural Theory over the past two decades. Therefore, in congruence and in gratitude of their pursuit to promote successful language

teaching and learning, continuing to pursue SCT perspectives and approaches in teacher development and second language learning is an obvious route to be continued. An additive versus a deficit or subtractive approach to viewing the L2 student and the NNEST enables us to propagate the cultural historical origins and generative potentials of L2 learners and teachers as assets that complement the second language learning environment because of their own human potential to develop their own success within vivencias originating from their Imagined Destinations. In the language learning worlds shown in these teacher narratives— Marcel, Blexi, Patricia, Nilsi, Sonya, Yari, Jeri and Margy's cultures and environments from their Imagined Destinations are noticed and recognized as resilient, powerful tools to aid in their successful learning and teaching of second languages to be shared with a broader audience with a deliberate aim to make a positive difference in the field of SLA in the twenty-first century.

References

Abedi, J. (2004). Assessment accomodatios for Enlish language learners: mplications for policy based research. *Review of Educaitonal Research, 74*, 1-28.

Anderson, N.J. (2002). The role of metacognition in second language teaching and learning. Washington, SC: ERIC Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics.

Anderson, J.J., & Vandergrift, L. (1996). Increasing metacognitive awareness in the classroom by using think-aloud protocols and other verbal report formats. In R.L. Oxford (Ed.), Language learning strategies around the world: Cross-cultural perspectives (Technical Report No. 13, pp. 3 18. Honolulu: University of Hawaii, Second Language Teaching & Curriculum Center.

Arias, M. Beatriz, and Milagros Morillo-Campbell. "Promoting ELL Parental Involvement: Challenges in Contested Times." *Online Submission* (2008).

Ballantyne, K., G., Sanderman, A., R. & Levy, J. (2008). *Educating English language learners: Building teacher capacity.* Washington, DC: National Clearinghouse for English Language Acquisition.

Blommaert, J. (2007). On scope and depth in linguistic ethnography. *Journal of Sociolinguistics*, *11*(5), 682-688.

Bogler, R., & Somech, A. (2004). Influence of teacher empowerment on teachers' organizational commitment, professional commitment and organizational citizenship behavior in

schools. *Journal of Teaching and Teacher Education, (20)*, 277-289. Elsevier Ltd. Retrieved from Google Link.

Canagarajah, A. S. (1999). On EFL teacher, awareness, and agency. *ELT Journal (53),* 207-214.

Canagarajah, A. S. (2012), Teacher development in a global profession: An auto-ethnography. *TESOL Quarterly, (46),* 258–279.

Casanave, C.P. (2002) *Writing Games: Multicultural case studies of academic literacy practices in higher education*. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

Dewey, J. (1902). The school as social center, *The Elementary School Teacher 3*(2), 73-86.

Doyle, W. (1983). Academic Work. *Review of Educational Research 53*(2), 159-199.

Duff, P. (2012). Identity, agency, and second language acquisition. *Handbook of second language acquisition*, 410-426.

Echevarria, J., Vogt, M.E., & Short, D. (2004). *Making Content Comprehensible for English Language Learners: The SIOP Model (2nd edition)*. Boston, Pearson, Allyn & Bacon.

Esteban-Guitart, M. & Moll, L.C. (2014). Lived experience, funds of identity and education. *Culture & Psychology, 20*(1), 70 -81.

Ferris, D., & Hedgcock, J. (2013). *Teaching L2 composition: Purpose, process, and practice*. Mahwah: NJ.

K. M., & Hill, J. D. (2006). Classroom instruction that works with English language learners. Alexandria, Virginia: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Freire, P., (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: The Continuum International Publishing Group Inc.

Freire, P. (1985). *The Politics of Education: Culture, Power, and Liberation.* CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Freire, P. (2010). *Teaching critical thinking, practical wisdom*, New York and London: Routledge.

Gay, G. (2002). Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice. *Journal of Teacher Education, (2)*, 106-116.

González, N., Moll, L. C., & Amanti, C. (2005 (2005*). Funds of Knowledge: Theorizing practices in households, communities, and classrooms.* New York and London: Routledge.

González Rey, F. (2007).Social and individual subjectivity from an historical cultural standpoint. *Critical Social Studies, (2*), 3-14.

González Rey, F. (2009). Historical relevance of Vygotsky's work: Its significance for a new approach to the problem of subjectivity in psychology. *Outlines, (1)*, 59-73.

González, Rey, F. (2011). The path to subjectivity: Advancing alternative understandings of Vygotsky and the cultural historical legacy. In P. Portes & S. Salas (Eds.), *Vygotsky in 21st Century Society* (pp. 32–49). New York: Peter Lang.

Hall, J. (2000). *Second and foreign language learning through classroom interaction*. Routledge.

Harklau, L. (2000). From the "good kids" to the "worst": Representations of English language Learners' across educational settings, *TESOL Quarterly*, *34*(1) 35 -67.

Harklau, L. (2001). From high school to college: Student perspectives on literacy practices, (33), 33-70.

Ivanic, R., & Camps, D. (2001). I am how I sound: Voice as self-representation in L2 writing. *Journal of Second Language Writing, 10,* 3 – 33.

Johnson K., & Golombek P. (2002). *Second Language Teacher Education: International Perspectives*. New York & London: Routledge.

Johnson, K. (2006). The sociocultural turn and its challenges for second language teacher education*. TESOL Quarterly Volume 40*(1), 235 – 253.

Johnson, K., & Golombek, P. (2011). The transformtive power of narrative in second language teacher education, *Tesol Quarterly, 000*, 1-24.

Kanno, J., & Cromley, J. (2013). English language learner's access and attainment in post-secondary education. *TESOL Quarterly, 47*(1), 89-121.

Kanno, Y., & Norton, B. (2003). Imagined communities and educational possibilities: Introduction. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education, 2*(4), 241 – 249.

Kanno, Y., & Varghese, M. M. (2010). Immigrant and refugee ESL students' challenges to accessing four-year college education: From language policy to educational policy. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education, 9(*5), 310 -328.

Kanno, Y., & Stuart, C. (2011). Learning to become a second language teacher: Identities-in practice. *The Modern Language Journal, 95*, 236-252.

Koschmann, T. (1999). Toward a dialogic theory of learning: Bakhtin's contribution to understanding learning in setting of collaboration. *Computer Support for Collaborative Learning,* 308-311.

Kozulin, A., Gindis, B., Ageyev, V., Miller, S. (2003). *Vygotsky's educational theory in cultural context.* New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Krashen, S.D. and Terrell, T. (1983). The natural approach. Oxford: Perga Long, M., (1985). Input and second language acquisition theory. In Input in second language acquisition. Ed. S. Gass & C. Madden. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House.

Krashen, S. (1987, 1989). We Acquire Vocabulary and Spelling by Reading: Additional Evidence for the Input Hypothesis, *Modern Language Journal, 73*(4), 440–464.

Kress, G. [ioelondonvideo]. (2011, Nov 21). *Gunther Kress, Institute of Education, University of London [*Video File]. Retrieved from www.youtube.com/watch?v=8-yO04u8MHc

Kumaravadivelu, B. (2006). TESOL methods: Changing tracks, challenging trends. *TESOL Quarterly 40*(1), 59 – 81.

Leontiev, A.A. (1983b). The deed as the beginning of personality. In V. Davydov, V. Zinchenko, A.A. Leontiev & A. Petrovskij)Eds.), A.N. Leontiev. Izbrannie psihologicheskie poizvedenija [A.A. Leontiev. Selected psychological works]. (Vol. 1, pp. 381-385). Moscow: Pedagogika.Original work published 1976.

Lucas, T., & Villegas, M. (2013). Preparing linguistically responsive teachers: Laying the foundation in preservice teacher education. *Theory into Practice, 52(*2), 98 – 109.

Manning, M. (2010). Teaching english learners: Building on cultural and linguistic strengths. *English Education*, 248 – 262.

Mantero, M. (Ed.). (2007). Identity and second language learning: Culture, inquiry and dialogic activity in educational contexts. USA: Information Age Publishing, Inc.

Marcus, Anthony. 1999. 'In memoriam Eric R. Wolf', Against the Current 81: 49 Imaginary worlds. The last years of Eric Wolf. *Social Anthropology (2003), 11*, 1, 113–127. 2003 European Association of Social Anthropologists

Marsiglia, F. F., Parsai, M., & Kulis, S. (2009). Effects of familism and family cohesion on problem behaviors among adolescents in Mexican immigrant families in the southwest United States.*Journal of Ethnic & Cultural Diversity in Social Work*, *18*(3), 203-220.

Marti, J. (2002): Education in Latin America: Cramming them in. The Economist. Mexico City and Sao Paolo, n. pp. retrieved October 5, 2011 from http://ecomist.com/articles/pto-.OECD. (2013). Latin American Economic Outlook.

Moll, L., Amanti, C., Neff, D., & González, N. (1992). Funds of knowledge for teaching: Using a qualitative approach to connect homes and classrooms. *Theory Into Practice, XXXI*, 132-141.

Moll, L. (1995). *Vygotsky and Education: Instructional impolications and applications of sociohistorica psychology.*New York: Cambridge University Press.

Moll, L., & Hopffer-Arnot (2005). Sociocultural competence in teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education, 56*(3), 242-247.

Moll, L. (2008). Rethinking resistance. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 35*(1), 126 – 131.

Moll, L. (2014). *L.S. Vygotsky and Education*. Boston: Routledge.

Moll, L. (2015). Tapping into the "hidden" home and community resources of students. *Kappa Delta Pi Record, 51:* 114-117.

Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly: 31* (3), 409-429.

Norton, B. (2001). Non-participation, imagined communities and the language classroom. In M. Breen(Ed.). Learner contributions in language learning. *New directions in Research.* (pp.159-171). London: Longman Pearson Education.

Norton, B., & Kanno, Y. (2003). Imagined communities and educational possibilities: Introduction. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education, 2(*4), 241 – 249.

Norton, B. (2006). Identity as a sociocultural construct in second language education. In K. Cadman & K. O'Regan (Eds.), *TESOL in Context [Special Issue],* 22-33.

Norton, B. (2011). The practice of theory in the language classroom. *Issues in Applied Linguistics, 18(*2),171-80.

Norton, B., & McKinney, C. (2011). Alternative Approaches to Second Language Acquisition, 73-94.

Norton, B. & Williams, C.J. (2012). Digital identities, student investments, and eGranary as a placed resource. *Language and Education, 26*(4), 315-329.

Norton, B. (2013). *Identity and language learning, extending the conversation (2nd ed.).* Bristol, Buffalo, Toronto: Multilingual Matters.

OECD. (2010). *PISA 2009 results: Overcoming social background—Equity in learning oportuniies and outcomes* (Vol. II). Retieved from www.oecd.org/pisapisaproducts/48852584.pdf

Palumbo, C. (2011). *Research in Panamá: Does Teacher Training Make a Difference in Student Learning.* Unpublished manuscript. Universidad de Latina, Panamá City, Panamá.

Pavlenko, A., & Norton, B. (2007). Imagined Communities, Identity, and English Language Learning. In *International Handbook of English Language Teaching, 15*, 669-680.

Portes, A., and Hoffman K. (2003). Latin American class structures: Their composition and change in the neoliberal era. *Latin American Research Reiew: (38),* 41-82.

Quinones, G., &Fleer, M. (2011). "Visual Vivencias":A Cultural-Historical Tool for Understanding the Lived Experiences f Young Children's Everyday Lives. E. Johnson, .J. White (eds.),*Educational Research with Our Youngest,* International Perspectives on Early Childhood Education and development 5.

Reed, I. (2008). Justifying Sociological Knowledge: From Realism to Interpretation*. *Sociological Theory, 26*(2), 101-129.

Ritter, A. (2009). Need for advocacy for english learners. *Bilingual Research Journal, 34(3*), 248-262.

Ruiz, R. (1994). Language policy and planning in the united states. *Annual Review of Appled Linguistics, (14),* 111-125.

Sannino, A., Daniels, H., & Gutiérrez, K. D. (Eds.). (2009). *Learning and expanding with activity theory*. Cambridge University Press.

Schultz, R. (2007). The constructive, destructive, and reconstructive power of social norms. *Psychological* Science, (5), 429-434.

Smagorinsky, P. (2011). Vygotsky's Stage Theory: The Psychology of Art and the Actor under the diection of perezhivanie, *Mind, Cutlure and Activity, 18:* 319-341.

Spear, G., & Mochker, D. (1984). The organizing circumstance: Environmental determinants in self-drected learning. *Adult Education Quarterly, (35),* 1-10.

Stetsenko, A., & Arievitch, I. (1997).Constructing and deconstructing the self; Comparing post-Vygotskian and discourse-based versions of social constructivism. *Mind, Culture and Activity, (4),* 160-173.

Stetsenko, A., & Arievitch, I.M. (2004). The self in cultural-historical activity theory: reclaiming the unity of social and individual dimensions of human development. *Theory & Psychology 14*(4); 475 503.

Stetsenko, A. (2008). From relational ontology to transformative activist stance on development and learning: expanding Vygotsky's CHAT project. *Cultural Studies of Science Education, 3*(2), 471-491.

Tardy, C. (2012). Voice construction, assessment, and extra-textual identity. *Research in the Teaching of English, 47*, 64 – 95.

Teemant, A. (2013). Critical shifts for improving differentiation. TESOL Newsletter, pp.10-11. Retrieved from http://intesol.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/Tesolin-Spring2013.pdf

Teemant, A. (2014). A mixed methods investigation of instructional coaching for teachers of diverse learners. *Urban Education, 49,* (5), 574-604.

Teemant, A Leland, C. & Berghoff, B. (2014). Development and validation of a measure of critical stance for instructional coaching, *Teaching and Teacher Education, (39),* 136-147.

Vagan, A. (2011). Towards a sociocultural perspective on identity formation in education. *Mind, Culture, and Activity, 18:* 43 – 57.

Valsiner, J. (1999). I create you to control me: A glimpse into basic processes of semiotic mediation. *Human Development, 42*, 26-30.

Valsiner, J. (2009). Cultural Psychology Today: Innovations and Oversights, *Culture & Psychology (15),* 5 – 39.

Van der Veer, R. & Valsiner, J. (1991). Understanding Vygotsky: A quest for synthesis. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell. Vygotsky, L. S. (1926/1997*). Educational psychology*. Boca Raton, FL: St. Lucie Press.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1934/1962). *Thought and language.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in thought.* The Development of Higher Psychological Processes. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Vygotsky, L. (1978). *Mind in Society.*Edited by Michael Cole, Vera John-Steiner, Sylvia Scribner, Ellen Souberman. Cambridge Massachusetts, Harvard University Press.

Weedon, C. (1987). *Feminist Practice and Poststructuralist Theory*, MA: Blackwell.

Wenger, E. (1998). Chapter 12. Education. From *Communities of practice: Learning, meaning, and identity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Wolf, E. R. (2001). *Pathways of Power: Building an Anthropology of the Modern World.* Berkeley, CA, USA: University of California Press. Retrieved from: http://www.ebrary.com

Wolf, E. R. (2003). Imaginary worlds. The last years of Eric Wolf. *Social Anthropology, 11*(1), 113-127.

Zinchenko, V.P. (2009). Consciousness as the subject matter and task of pschology. *Journal of Russian and East European Psychology (47),* 44-75.

Zuengler, J., & Miller, E. (2006). Cognitive and sociocultural perspectives: Two parallel SLA worlds? *TESOL Quarterly, 40*(1), 35 – 58.

Zuengler, J., & Cole, K. (2007). Language socialization and second language learning. Chapter 17, 302 – 309.

Appendix

Appendix A: Online Survey; Analysis One

The survey can be previewed by clicking here: Survey Preview.

The preview does not show data collection. As this survey will not collect data, feel free to interact with it as a respondent would.

Appendix B: Research Questions

1. Do teachers discuss Imagined Destinations as a goal or a predilection toward the language they wanted to reach/learn? Did it become a strand that was discussed in their story?
2. What was the biggest obstacle to fluency in English? How did they handle that obstacle(s)?
3. Specifically does age of onset make a difference in their stories? In their memories?
4. Do they feel/think their journey supports their skills in the classroom? Do they use their stories to inspire and teach their students?

Appendix C: Analysis Two - Imagined Destinations (IDs), Subjective Alternatives, Agnentive Roles, Unity of Affect and Intellect

1. *Imagined Destinations (ID)* - Possible to imagine another place venturing far beyond boundaries, a assimilating with the help of imagination someone else's historical or social experience and is an essential condition for almost all human mental activity (Vygotsky, 1967/2004b).
2. *Subjective Alternatives (obstacles) (SA)* - Subversive in relation to the dominant current social status, sub-alternates that embody emotions and are shared (González Rey, 2011).
3. *Agentive Roles Played (AR)* - Multiple subjective actions that embody emotions and symbolic processes, expectancies that are not cognitive (Moll & González Rey).
4. *Unity of Affect and Intellect – (A & I)* - Unity of Affect & Intellect guarantees control of emotions to correct actions' adequate to the need of the subjects (Moll & González Rey).

Appendix D: Analysis Three: Functions of Narrative Analysis

First Analysis (A1): Narrative as a Mediational Tool (NMT) - Analysis representing the tools used in teachers' environments that support mediational space to transition into consciousness through: inquiry, reflection, verbalization, to regulate the thinking process (cognition).
Second Analysis (A2): Narrative as Systemic Evaluation (NSE) is how the teachers use the social to explain the experience through inquiry, reflection, and verbalization to regulate the thinking process.
Third Analysis (A3): Autobiographical Reflection (AR) - Narrative of Externalization (NEX) of their prior language learning experiences, critically analyzing those experiences, and then relating their analyses to their current conceptions of both language learning and language teaching.

Appendix E: Timeline (General)

Timeline of Data Collection and Analysis
October 2014: Survey questions began in Panamá Trainings in October 2014 and again in January 2015. Participants questioned about their Imagined Destinations and journeys to English fluency.
November/ December, 2014: Survey Piloted to 30 Mexican teachers; SLAT PhD International Students (3); Panamánian Teachers (7)
January, 2015: ONLINE SURVEY DISTRIBUTED BEFORE THE TEACHERS ARRIVED and after I left Panamá.
February, 2015: Teachers begin classes: Identity work begins in first class activities.
March, 2015: Online Survey analyzed: Ten cases invited to be interviewed. Eight interviews accomplished
FINAL WEEK: Interviews completed with teachers chosen and agreements signed outside of their classroom schedules. Eight final interviews were done between Feb 12 and Feb 27.
April Forward: Eight cases analyzed against four constructs: survey analysis, research questions, analysis one and analysis two

Appendix F : Pilot Study Participant Table

Pilot Study Information 2014			
Participants	First Language	Country Born	Imagined Destinations/Communities
Tran	Vietnamese	Vietnam	Honor Student/Doctor
Nat	English	Colorado	A Writer
Yado	Indigenous	Mexico	An English Teacher
Mar	Spanish	Mexico	An English Teacher

Andi	Chinese	China	Religion/ To beat his ESL classmates then Native Speakers

Appendix G: Steps of Data Collection and Analysis Table

Steps of Data Collection and Analysis	
Preliminary Work	
Step One:	Pilot Study done in 2014
Research Design	
Step Two:	Findings from that study began the query to formulate new Research Questions with a different audience and context. See Appendix B for RQs
Step Three:	Online Survey created guided by the research questions
Step Four:	Online Survey is piloted with different groups of NNES teachers from Mexico, Panamá, Turkey, Pakistan and Oman
Step Five:	Online survey is ameliorated according to the results of the pilots
Data Collection and Analysis	
Step Six:	Online survey is distributed to the Panamánian Teachers
Step Seven:	Online survey is analyzed quantitatively and used to support the choices of the interviews
Step Eight:	Interviewees are invited to join the interviews: 12 sent; eight responses
Step Nine:	Interviews performed with the eight participants
Step Ten:	Transcribed the interviews from the audio recordings in Word format
Step Eleven:	Content analysis of interview transcriptions done first to answer the research questions,
Step Twelve:	Examined the narratives according to the ages of onset into the second language,
Step Thirteen:	Created short vignettes of the participants
Step Fourteen:	Systematically answered the research questions comparing them to the narrative analysis
Step Fifteen:	Both Analysis Two and Analysis Three are theoretical positionings that came from the elaboration on findings I obtained from answering the four research questions. Two different analysis were formulated: the first based on readings of Cultural Historical Theory predominantly taken from my own construct of Imagined Destinations and the other three taken mainly from González Rey (2011) (Analysis Two), and next, a contruct to gauge if Narrative Analysis was a useful construct to demonstrate the theoretical positioning taken from Johnson and Golombek (2011) narrative analysis done in their own study (Analysis Three).
Step Sixteen:	Continue to examine the narratives against the Research Questions eventually mollifying RQ1, and deleting RQ 2 and 3. I kept RQ 1 (mollified), RQS 4, 5 and 6 from the original questions (See Chapter 3 for explanation).
Step Seventeen:	Examined the narratives against Analysis Three (see Appendix C)
Step Eighteen:	Examined the narratives against Analysis Four (see Appendix D)
Step Nineteen:	Formulates the hypothesis based on the Findings

Appendix H: Panamá Survey Responses (2009-2010)

Results of Panamánian Testing of Students During Fellowship: 2009-2010
The results of the final LAS testing indicated that a change had occurred in the listening and speaking proficiency of the students tested. The following are the results that came from the testing tabulations and background information sent to the statistician that was hired to do the calculations. The teacher survey was sent after the final analysis of the LAS proficiency test scoring was completed. For the purposes of this paper, questions one, three, four and five are given below. Question 2 was omitted because it lends itself to other analysis not covered in this paper. The question is given first, followed by the answer from the analysis. The feedback reflecting the change in listening and speaking was reported to the teachers in two subsequent trainings before I left, first in July, and then again in August, 2011.
Questions and Answers to Study done in Panamá: 2009- 2010
Question 1: On average, did students learn (especially in listening and speaking?
Answer to Question 1: Both listening/speaking and reading/writing scores were significantly greater than 1, indicating that on average, students learned. Listening/speaking scores were significantly higher than reading/writing scores. Question 3: Did listening/speaking and reading/writing scores differ based on where a child was in Panamá? Answer to Question 3: There was not a significant effect of region of Panamá on listening/speaking scores. There was a trend level effect of region on reading/writing scores. Evaluation of the marginal means indicated that Veraguas scored higher on reading/writing than Chiriquí, but Central Panamá did not differ from either region.
Question 4: Did performance of male and female students differ?
Answer to Question 4: There were no differences in listening/speaking scores between male and female students. Similarly, there were no gender based differences in reading/writing scores. This question reflects on teacher uniqueness or variability in teaching practices. As a random sample of students were chosen to the best of our ability, however all regions were sampled except Coclé due to a time constraint and also because the same students from the first testing needed to be tested a second time.
Question 5: For students, for whom we have data at multiple time points, was there an improvement in listening/speaking or reading/writing?
Answer to Question 5: There was a significant effect of time of test on listening/speaking scores, such that on average student's scores improved over time. Similarly, students' reading/writing scores also improved over time. Gender was also considered as a variable to see if males and females improved similarly from Time 1 to Time 2—they did.
Our first testing included 121 and the second one included 108 because of this reason. Of the 108 students, 31 were from the original testing done for English for Life, hence the comments over time.

Appendix I: Questions and Results of Study Done prior to this Study in Panamá (2009-2010)

Survey narrative responses to questions answered by Panamánian Teachers from 2010
As the teachers' comments point out, the positive experience and respect for their own learning as well as the sharing of activities amongst each other as well as their conscious monitoring of their own learning was a variable in the improvement in the listening and speaking proficiency scores of the students.
Comment One: "Definitely I have taken activities that I apply for sure in the classroom and they make my classes more engaging due to the students are learning through games or other activities they are not related to. Another aspect is giving feedback to my students every time they try to use English and apply what I teach in the classroom."
Comment Two: "Exchange of different activities among teachers. Talks and seminars to improve our teaching skills and language proficiency (such as pronunciation) really helped me a lot".
Comment Three: "The way … Christine developed our inner power and leading us to be creative, practical, and competitive and specially believe in ourselves. I feel confident with the model but would like to participate in another training to clear my doubts."
Comment Four: "I have improved my teaching and my command of the language"
Comment Five: "In some cases, I have copied the routines, activities and energy the Fellow has"
Comment Six: •"Other aspect of the trainings that has supported my ability to teach English are the dynamic and games activities, that help students to develop their thinking, listening, speaking, and writing skills, as well as to improve vocabulary, reinforce grammatical structures, and so on." And," Other aspects of the training that are supports my ability to teach English to my students are: Early Bird Activities Transitions (like 5-4-3-2-1) Power listening Ticket in Warm ups Wrap ups Ticket out"
Comment Seven: "They help me to make a wiser use of class time, as well as having in mind the importance of my students doing the talking most of the time. The specific content and language objectives have given me the opportunity to achieve what I expected from the class."
Comment Eight: "I consider that I have improved my ability to teach using the model. The emphasis on developing listening activities, increasing interaction in the target language among students themselves, and the continuous assessment (not only for grading), have been the most relevant aspects that help me to improve my profession. I know that I'm not an excellent teacher, but with the SIOP model I am on the way."